

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Entomology Papers from Other Sources

Entomology Collections, Miscellaneous

1998

What Mosquitos Smell These Days

David A. Carlson

US Department of Agriculture

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/entomologyother>



Part of the [Entomology Commons](#)

Carlson, David A., "What Mosquitos Smell These Days" (1998). *Entomology Papers from Other Sources*. 7.
<http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/entomologyother/7>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Entomology Collections, Miscellaneous at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Entomology Papers from Other Sources by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

proved and ready for use as a pest management tool (e.g., the strain of Bt used in Vancouver), will the public accept it, its cost, and the probability that it will not provide total elimination of the pest? In several chapters, Winston portrays a range of biologically based methods that are currently being used for controlling pests such as cockroaches and rats in urban dwellings, geese and other birds at airports, coyotes in the suburbs, weeds in lawns, codling moths in apples, and insects in greenhouses. The methods are components of an integrated pest management approach and include habitat management, production and release of natural enemies of pests, production and release of sterile males intended to outcompete feral males as mates for feral females, repellants, attractants and disruptants that affect pest behavior, and transgenic plants expressing Bt genes that encode insecticidal proteins. Most of these methods were developed through expensive research aimed partly at allaying public outcry against harsh pesticides and at being more environmentally friendly. Yet most have yet to be adopted, if at all, on more than a highly limited scale.

To learn why the adoption of biologically based pest management alternatives to conventional pesticides has progressed so slowly, Winston visited or interviewed various practitioners in Canada and the United States who have used such alternatives in real-world settings. In addition to the paradox of wavering or nonsupportive public opinion, Winston found that other major stumbling blocks have been economic considerations, industry resistance, poor communication by professionals to the public, and government regulation. Although regulatory constraints are easing, US government support for translating hopeful findings of basic research on alternatives to pesticides into application in agriculture and other arenas remains limited. Largely by default, this undertaking has fallen principally to private industry.

Winston rightly emphasizes that economic concerns continue to drive the kinds of choices private industry makes when investing in research and application of future pest-con-

trol technologies. He shows that pesticide manufacturers have little incentive to reduce sales of pesticides in the United States below the current annual value of nearly \$9 billion. Substituting organophosphate and carbamate insecticides with new and safer toxins and marketing seeds of transgenic plants containing Bt toxins are the primary ways that big industry foresees its future in pest management over the next decade or two. Only small businesses, many of which have gone bankrupt in their efforts, are currently involved in producing and promoting alternatives to pesticides and transgenic plants. Managers and spokespersons of such businesses were quick to point out to Winston that their businesses are marginal because alternatives cost more, act more slowly, are more complicated to use, and are specific only to one or at most a few kinds of pests. As Winston repeatedly underscores, the bottom line has been and continues to be that farmers and other users prefer inexpensive, quick, and simple solutions to pest problems, even at a recognized environmental cost.

Will impending consequences of the FQPA motivate pesticide users in the United States to consider more seriously the adoption of biologically based alternatives? Perhaps, but progress in this direction may be too slow. In the final chapter of *Nature Wars*, Winston suggests that extensive use of pesticides reflects the lack of an encompassing ethic rooted in stewardship of the environment. He pleads for less emphasis on a sanitized world without pests and proposes a set of principles as a pest management ethic: "chemical pesticides should be the last method used for pest control, not the first; pest control should aim to manage pests, not eradicate them; only pests doing substantial damage should be managed, and only when their damage approaches an economically significant threshold" (p. 176).

Some of Winston's specific recommendations for turning these principles into reality include increasing the amount of government influence to educate, regulate, and tax; shifting some academic research toward more practical ends; establishing incentives for the adoption of biologically based technologies; and better

educating the public about the true value of adopting alternatives. All of these principles and recommendations are timely and well conceived. One hopes that they constitute something more than wishful thinking and in fact will serve as guideposts during the needed transition from pesticide-based to biologically-based technologies for pest management.

As a teacher of concepts and practices of integrated pest management to university students and farmers, and as a practitioner of pest management in apple orchards, I found that I could intellectually and experientially identify with nearly all of the themes and examples invoked in *Nature Wars*. I did have a few minor quibbles; for instance, the status of some of the alternatives to toxic pesticides (for example, the sterile male release program against codling moth) is not as grim as Winston implies. Also, Winston could have chosen to look beyond North America, toward western Europe, where new policies and laws in some countries are truly speeding widespread transition from pesticide- to biologically-based approaches to pest management. However, Winston is right on the mark in his assessment of impediments to broader adoption of pesticide alternatives in North America.

Nature Wars is written in a clear and convincing fashion, and it is readily accessible to lay readers and professionals alike. I highly recommend this book to anyone with an interest in pests, pesticides, and environmental stewardship.

RONALD J. PROKOPY
Department of Entomology
University of Massachusetts
Amherst, MA 01003

WHAT MOSQUITOES SMELL THESE DAYS

Olfaction in Mosquito-Host Interactions. Gregory F. Bock and Gail Cardew, eds. John Wiley & Sons, Chichester, UK. 1996. 342 pp., illus. \$90.00 (ISBN 0-471-96362-3 hardcover).

The CIBA Foundation sponsored a symposium on olfaction in mosquito-host interactions in London (31 Oc-

tober–2 November 1995) at the suggestion of John Hildebrand, of the University of Arizona. Given my own interest in this topic, I was curious about the resulting volume, to which some of the major workers in the field contributed.

The book introduces some of the active scientists in the field of chemical-oriented entomology. As one who was repeatedly “cited but not invited,” I will try to point out the strengths of the book rather than of the research per se. This volume is well organized, well prepared, and nicely presented, with no apparent errors. The book allows both the novice and scientists well versed in this field to catch up with some of the recent mosquito attractant efforts.

The text begins with discussions of biology, mosquito control, ecology, behavior, and genetics, and then moves to olfactory control of behavior. I found the olfactory theory somewhat heavily focused on *Drosophila* and moth presentations; this focus may be a function of the organizer’s interests or of the “coming philosophy” that was described at a 1991 meeting of the Entomological Society of America by the late eminent mosquito scientist, George Craig. Craig lamented that it had become difficult for mosquito workers to obtain support from US granting agencies such as the National Institutes of Health because of increased funding of scientists studying *Manduca* and pressure from malaria vaccine advocates on traditional medical entomology funding sources.

Later parts of the book discuss the sensory physiology of the carbon dioxide receptor and the effect of carbon dioxide on antennal receptors. The reader is introduced to modern olfactometer systems as devices to measure mosquito behavior. A useful discussion is reported after each presentation, in which meeting participants point out particularly appropriate or inappropriate aspects of olfactometer use. It is well known that each type of olfactometer has good and bad points, yielding data that are biased by factors that are guessed at and minimized, but are not obvious. The trickiness of olfactometer use will become apparent to readers sensitive to nuances of the “art” of doing science.

Chemical background covering the early years before the modern era (1968–1998) is covered in several chapters, with numerous citations of the seminal paper by Smith et al. (1968), which described lactic acid as a critical part of the mix of attractive volatiles produced by human skin, together with carbon dioxide. Several series of olfactometer experiments with *Aedes aegypti* are described that derived from Smith’s effort, and other reports are cited that use the Smith paper as a paradigm. Perhaps this means that copying of good mosquito experimental efforts is common.

I was particularly interested in descriptions of new analytical chemistry results on human odor compounds, but only two papers address this area. Descriptions of the next step in determining what mosquitoes smell—preparative separation chemistry—were also sparse, although this technique is a necessary part of experiments to integrate separation of chemical compounds with a useful, reproducible bioassay. Descriptions of olfactometer bioassays are presented that follow the wind-tunnel/dual-port olfactometer versus Y-tube olfactometer methods and the two camps of many-whole animal assays versus videotaped single-animal assays. The olfactometer camp was formerly arrayed against the antennal electrophysiology camp. It is therefore refreshing to read of the efforts of Alan Cork (p. 71) and of Martin Geier, Hinrich Sass, and Jürgen Boeckh (p. 132) that now integrate wind-tunnel, olfactometer, and electroantennographic detection techniques to approach host odor problems.

This book also has illustrative studies that point out the difficulty in sorting chemicals into bits by gas chromatography or HPLC, and then reassembling the bits into something attractive to mosquitoes. This problem is not like moth pheromone chemistry, for which identifiable classes of compounds can be attacked. The discussions point out confusion in many areas, in that it is complicated to sort out stimulus/response when testing ephemeral water-soluble compounds. For some analytical problems, therefore, gas chromatography may not provide a

ready answer, and other modern analytical techniques may be better for identification. Also, without useful quantification, the chemist has problems providing release rates from formulations to be deployed in the field for these difficult compounds.

Unfortunately, there was no presentation of new work on animal odors. Curiously, human host odor bioassays of only two species of mosquitoes were described, *A. aegypti*, which is the white rat of medical entomology, and *Anopheles gambiae*, the African malaria vector. Perhaps whole-animal bioassayists are reluctant to move to new insect models, a point made by an attendee at one of the discussions covered by this volume.

A thoughtful summary by Willem Takken discusses essential kairomones (olfactory cues; p. 302) that must eventually be correlated with mosquito species, age, and physiological stage to understand host attraction and, ultimately, zoophilic versus anthropophilic female responses. In the summary, Pickett expresses the hope that information expected over the next 4 or 5 years can be applied to successful mosquito control strategies. However, in the nearly 3 years since the meeting that gave rise to this book, I have heard of failures in the field with some of the chemical attractants discussed in the book, but I am aware of no dramatic breakthroughs.

In any case, the hope is that knowledge of mosquito–host interactions may be employed in future mosquito control strategies. Interestingly, behavioral scientists who propose to work with mosquitoes generally find it difficult to find support in the United States, but support by the European Union/Community and Bayer AG was cited by several attendees.

DAVID A. CARLSON
US Department of Agriculture,
Agricultural Research Service
Center for Medical, Agricultural,
and Veterinary Entomology
P.O. Box 14565
Gainesville, FL 32604

Reference cited

Smith CN, Smith N, Gouck HK, Wiedhaas DE, Gilbert IH, Mayer MS, Smittle BJ, Hofbauer A. 1968. L-lactic acid as a fac-

tor in the attraction of *Aedes aegypti* to human hosts. *Annals of the Entomological Society of America* 63: 760-770.

NEW TITLES

- Advances in Historical Ecology.** W. Balée, ed. Columbia University Press, New York, 1998. 429 pp., illus. \$65.00 (cloth).
- Bioelectronics Handbook: MOSFETs, Biosensors & Neurons.** M. Grattarola and G. Massobrio. McGraw-Hill, New York, 1998. 410 pp., illus. \$89.50 (cloth).
- The Biotech Century: Harnessing the Gene and Remaking the World.** J. Rifkin. Jeremy P. Tarcher/Putnam, New York, 1998. 271 pp., illus. \$24.95 (cloth).
- The Birder's Bug Book.** G. Waldbauer. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 1998. 336 pp., illus. \$27.95 (cloth).
- Ethics Into Action: Henry Spira and the Animal Rights Movement.** P. Singer. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Lanham, MD, 1998. 192 pp., illus. \$22.95 (cloth).
- Evolution of Tertiary Mammals of North America. Vol. 1: Terrestrial Carnivores, Ungulates, and Ungulate-like Mammals.** C. M. Janis, K. M. Scott, and L. L. Jacobs, eds. Cambridge University Press, New York, 1998. 691 pp., illus. \$260.00 (cloth).
- HPLC in Enzymatic Analysis.** 2nd ed. E. F. Rossomando. Wiley, New York, 1998. 451 pp., illus. \$149.95 (cloth).
- Identification and Expression of G Protein-Coupled Receptors.** K. R. Lynch, ed. Wiley-Liss, New York, 1998. 222 pp., illus. \$125.95 (cloth).
- If a Lion Could Talk: Animal Intelligence and the Evolution of Consciousness.** S. Budiansky. The Free Press, New York, 1998. 256 pp., illus. \$25.00 (cloth).
- Intellectual Property Rights and Biodiversity Conservation: An Interdisciplinary Analysis of the Values of Medicinal Plants.** T. M. Swanson, ed. Cambridge University Press, New York, 1998. 271 pp., illus. \$24.95 (paper).
- Neural Organization: Structure, Function and Dynamics.** M. A. Arbib, P. Érdi, and J. Szentágothai. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1998. 257 pp., illus. \$60.00 (cloth).
- Our Cosmic Origins: From the Big Bang to the Emergence of Life and Intelligence.** A. Delsemme. Cambridge University Press, New York, 1998. 322 pp., illus. \$24.95 (cloth).
- Salamanders of the United States and Canada.** J. W. Petranka. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, DC, 1998. 587 pp., illus. \$60.00 (cloth).
- The Story of Interferon: The Ups and Downs in the Life of a Scientist.** K. Cantell. World Scientific Publishing, River Edge, NJ, 1998. 239 pp., illus. \$22.00 (cloth).
- Tropical Moist Forest Silviculture and Management: A History of Success and Failure.** H. C. Dawlins and M. S. Philip. Oxford University Press, New York, 1998. 358 pp., illus. \$110.00 (cloth).
- New York, 1998. 131 pp., illus. \$45.00 (paper).
- Macroevolution: Pattern and Process.** S. M. Stanley. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, MD, 1998. 332 pp., illus. 29.95 (paper).
- Plant Life in the World's Mediterranean Climates: California, Chile, South Africa, Australia, and the Mediterranean Basin.** P. R. Dallmah. University of California Press, Berkeley, CA, 1998. 257 pp., illus. \$29.95 (paper).
- Swallow Summer.** C. R. Brown. University of Nebraska Press, Lincoln, NE, 1998. 371 pp., illus. \$16.95 (paper).
- The Temptations of Evolutionary Ethics.** P. L. Farber. University of California Press, Berkeley, CA, 1998. 222 pp., illus. \$16.95 (paper).
- Terrestrial Ecosystems in Changing Environments.** H. H. Shugart. Cambridge University Press, New York, 1998. 537 pp., illus. \$39.95 (paper). □

NOW AVAILABLE IN PAPERBACK

- Amazon Journal: Dispatches from a Vanishing Frontier.** G. O'Connor. Plume, New York, 1998. 378 pp., \$13.95 (paper).
- The Beekeepers Handbook.** 3rd ed. D. Sammataro and A. Avitabile. Cornell University Press, Ithaca, NY, 1998. 190 pp., illus. \$24.95 (paper).
- Drosophila: A Practical Approach.** 2nd ed. D. B. Roberts, ed. Oxford University Press, New York, 1998. 389 pp., illus. \$60.00 (paper).
- Ecoregions: The Ecosystem Geography of the Oceans and Continents.** R. G. Bailey. Springer-Verlag, New York, 1998. 176 pp., illus. \$39.95 (paper).
- From Where I Sit: Essays on Bees, Beekeeping, and Science.** M. L. Winston. Cornell University Press, Ithaca, NY, 1998. 171 pp. \$14.95 (paper).
- Lysosomal Cysteine Proteinases.** 2nd ed. H. Kirschke, A. J. Barrett, and N. D. Rawlings. Oxford University Press,

Index to Advertisers

CID, Inc., 882
German American Academic,
957
Institute for Science, Cover 3
Lane Science Equipment,
970
Nature Publishing, Cover 4
Oxford University Press, 955
Percival Scientific, Inc., 899
Pennsylvania State Uni-
versity, 967
Star Publishing Co., 898
University of California Press,
885