10-1-2010

Re-considering Trafficking in Human Beings

Kiril Sharapov
Glasgow Caledonian University, kiril.sharapov@gcu.ac.uk

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/humtrafconf2

Part of the Inequality and Stratification Commons

http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/humtrafconf2/16

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Human Trafficking Team at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Second Annual Interdisciplinary Conference on Human Trafficking, 2010 by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.
Re-considering Trafficking in Human Beings

Dr Kiril Sharapov, Glasgow Caledonian University

‘The number of victims trafficked to Europe might be hundred thousand yearly’ (Europol 2010)

Introduction

Dr Kiril Sharapov
Lecturer in Sociology, School of Law and Social Sciences, Glasgow Caledonian University
Kiril.Sharapov@gcu.ac.uk, 0141 331 8387

Current research: Trafficking in Human Beings: public opinion and factors of supply

Previous research:
Scottish Resource Centre for Women in SET: equality in employment
PhD (Politics, University of Glasgow): post-war reconstruction in Kosovo
Pearson Peacekeeping Centre (Canada): gender, human rights and post-conflict recovery
Structure of the presentation

Discussing:
- THB as the matter of sexual exploitation of victimized 'women and children' (Enloe 1990, 1991) ==> understanding THB as a matter of demand
- Demand for trafficked labour: ideology and practice of neo-liberal globalised capitalism + discourses of otherness and belonging, consumption and globalisation
- Outcomes of a pilot study of how students (GCU, social sciences) understand trafficking
- Larger study: Central European University + charities in Ukraine (subject to funding)

1. Introduction: normative and interpretative approaches in understanding trafficking as a matter of demand

THB as a response to the new economic ideology and practice: commodified labour + commodified sexuality + capitalist imperative to reduce costs, expand markets, consume and produce = globalised sex industry (Jeffreys 2009) & expansion of capital into new markets and new resource bases

Responding to THB: normative approach (human rights as the key referent) + interpretative approach (who, why, in what contexts, in response to what factors of demand) = THB as a function of hierarchies of 'race', class and gender
Vignette 1: What is neo-liberal capitalism?

**Neo-liberal capitalism**: ‘materialistic utilitarian anthropology’

**Humans**: autonomous rational subjects who act solely to maximise their individual self-interest, i.e. their economic possessions.

**The maximisation of economic wealth = human well-being = happiness**

Possessions = consumption

**Neo-liberal capitalism**: open market + free trade

**Methods**: enforcing market liberalisation, deregulation of the economy, individualistic consumer-oriented market

Harry Targ (2006), Challenging Late Capitalism, Neoliberal Globalization, & Militarism

1. Introduction: normative and interpretative approaches in understanding trafficking as a matter of demand

**Standard accounts of THB**: focus on victims, trafficking routes, prosecution, conviction rates, rehabilitation.


**Analysis of THB: factors of demand and supply ARE integral**

**Scope of THB**: people trafficked to be exploited + institutions and individuals who exploit labour ⇒ focus on issues of exploitation and forced labour
Vignette 2: Palermo Protocol's Definition of Trafficking

"Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.

Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs... The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth [above] shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth [above] have been used.

2. Exploited prostitutes or ‘internationally shared resources’: how to measure and understand trafficking?

Achilles Heel of THB: lack of (reliable) data, feminist ‘culture wars’, variety of perspectives on THB ⇒ a set of deterministic narratives

The term ‘Trafficking in Persons’: misleading as it places ‘...emphasis on the transaction aspects of a crime that is more accurately described as enslavement’ (UNDOC 2009, p.6).


Predominant perspective:
- understanding and acting from the standpoint of women (and sometimes men) trafficked into exploitation
- negative stance towards prostitution: all trafficking = prostitution, all prostitution = sexual exploitation

Public opinion: some people from certain places are victims and, at the same time, foreign agents of immigration threat and moral decay. They are exploited by other people, who traffic them and, in the process, generate considerable profit.
Vignette 3: Prostitution and Trafficking: ongoing ‘wars’

Prostitution and trafficking – the anatomy of a moral panic

Nick Bilton
The Guardian, Thursday 9 October 2009

A police officer finds a bag of women during a raid. Photograph: John Stillwell/Press Association

There is something familiar about the tide of misinformation which has swept through the subject of sex trafficking in the UK, if not through exactly the same channels as the nauseating torrent about Saddam Hussein’s weapons.

In the story of UK sex trafficking, the conclusions of academics who study the sex trade have been subjected to the same treatment as the sanitised reports of intelligence analysts who studied Iraq weapons – stripped of emotion, stretched to their most alarming, possible meaning and tossed into the public domain. There, they have been picked up by the media who have invested them even further to stories which have nothing to do with the original findings.

It’s the same old story. As E. P. Thompson memorably put it, “when the bodies begin to disappear, the axioms begin to multiply.”

Vignette 4: Exploited workers or ‘internationally shared resources’

Philippines: migrant women - ‘overseas Philippine investors’ and ‘internationally shared resources’ (Eisenstein 2009, p. 159)
2. Exploited prostitutes or ‘internationally shared resources’: how to measure and understand trafficking?

THB: linked to a range of broader issues:
- reconfiguration of the state and gender regimes
- changing labour regimes
- changing regimes of work and care
- changing patterns of consumption nationally and globally
- neo-conservatism
- racism
- body politics

Theorising from the perspective of CONSUMERS: curbing demand + raising critical consciousness

Palermo Protocol: a deed + the use of improper means + the purpose of exploitation

Problematic: requirement of the international movement + failure to recognise the ‘ad hoc’ nature of THB (Guinn 2009).

The requirement to cross border: obfuscates the relations of dominance and subordination

Destination countries:
- focus on illegal migrant ‘prostitutes’ = no direct challenge to men/demand for sexual services
- focus is on illegality of farm or construction workers = no direct challenge to ‘anything goes’ approach in minimising costs

Countries of origin:
Countries-suppliers of commodified labour: THB contributes to employment, national income and economic growth (Lim 1998)

International border crossing: is forced labour here more grave and serious than forced labour there? (especially if used in outsourced industries)
Vignette 5: Exploited workers or ‘internationally shared resources’

2006:
Filipino remittances - US$12.8 billion, above 10 per cent of the GDP.
The Philippines: the world's third highest remittance-recipient country after India and Mexico (Pernia 2007).

3. Trafficking as a function of demand

New globalised 'consumer' agendas: expanded factors of demand that underpin the traffic in people for exploitation

Factors of demand: operate on an economic and social continuum – need to be challenged/addressed as a whole

Factors of demand:
- Competitive pressures to reduce production costs
- Growing consumer demand for products and services at low cost and with quick delivery
- Sub-contracting, outsourcing and downward pressure on wages
- Feminisation of labour
- Tendency of nationals to refuse employment in low-paid low-skilled jobs
- Sexualisation and commodification of female bodies
- Neo-colonial processes of 'Othering': hierarchies of race, ethnicity, class and gender + economic inequalities + failed promise of international human rights and 'development'
- Absence of effective international legal framework
- Corruption of immigration and customs officials
- Lack of public awareness of trafficking and exploitative labour
- Low-risk and high-profit nature of trafficking
Vignette 6: reducing THB to the issue of criminality and EU security

The 2009 EU ‘Stockholm Programme’: a 5-year plan on justice and home affairs in the EU

THB, terrorism, illicit drug trafficking, computer crime listed under ‘CRIME’

Narrow criminological approach to trafficking adopted in UK/EU

4. Normalisation of demand for cheap labour and lack of understanding of factors of demand

Nexus between demand and supply:
- **Demand meets supply directly**: purchase of sexual services, reliance on domestic services etc.
- **Almost unnoticed**: indirect benefits - lower consumer prices: forced labour here (UK) and within the context of outsourced industries

Not all cheap goods and services are produced with the involvement of labour trafficked into the UK. **However**: evidence - agriculture, construction, and even care – industries that cannot be outsourced.

**Supply-transit-demand chain**: *not about the economic vulnerability of people in the countries of origin but the impunity of those who exploit them, and their continuing ability to benefit from such exploitation*
Vignette 7: ‘Swedish Example’


2010:
Stockholm (1.3 m inhabitants): about 200 people engaged in street prostitution

Amsterdam (750,000 inhabitants): 20,000 and 35,000 prostitutes (Claude 2010, pp. 13-14).

Data on outsourcing prostitution?

5. Not Seeing is Believing?

ILO: more than 12 million people are working in conditions of forced labour globally, including the UK (TUC 2007, p. 10).

The invisibility of 12 million slaves:
- Trafficking for forced labour only was not universally criminalised until recently
- Trafficking for forced labour: conflated with trafficking for sexual exploitation

However, not just about visibility: ‘otherness’ of others and their lack of power (allows) + the growing demand for services and goods (motivates) + globalisation and neo-liberal capitalism (normalises).
Vignette 8: ‘Swedish Example’???

2008 Trafficking in Persons Report (US Department of State 2008):

‘Boys and young men from the United Kingdom were trafficked to Sweden for the purpose of forced labour; these victims were forced to work on construction sites, lay asphalt, do yard work, and perform other odd jobs’.

6. The impact of globalisation and the legitimacy of ‘Othering’

Globalization: process of impoverishment and disenfranchisement of many hundreds of millions of people by international corporations seeking a cheap and docile labour force and a high return on their investments (Eisenstein 2009, p. 18).

Global processes: new forms of power and control → draw on the divisions of gender, racial and geographical inequality → create new forms of risks and insecurity ⇒ ‘Others’.

Trafficked people: ‘them’ rather than ‘us’ ⇒ non-British, non-citizens, non-white (even if they are)

The increase in the number of trafficked people and recent economic trends:
- Capital and productive capacities can be moved between countries and continents
- ‘Feminisation’ of the labour force: low-paid low-skilled jobs making a female labour force more profitable
- Dismantling of the traditional welfare systems

Some jobs/sectors cannot be outsourced to low wage countries: ‘Low wage labour is taken in’. (Duvell 2006: 32)
6. The impact of globalisation and the legitimacy of ‘Othering’

**Outsourcing:** requires massive mobilisation and movement of people to service the outsourced industry

**The massive flows of people:**
‘desire to travel, see the world, make money and accept whatever jobs are available along the way’ (Laura Agustin 2007, p. 2)

vs.

devastating impact of structural adjustment on small business owners, workers, small farmers, and peasants (Eisenstein 2009, p. 144)

**Internal movement of people:** servicing low-waged outsourced industries - ‘outsourcing’: helps consumption at a low cost

---

**Vignette 8: Internal Movements of People**

China:
massive migration of peasants from agricultural land - uprooted by developers and drawn into factory work: live in shantytowns under conditions of extreme exploitation (Kwong 2006)
(Eisenstein 2009, p. 36).
Vignette 9: Between a rock and a hard place

The Guardian, Randeep Ramesh, 13 February 2007

**Between a rock and a hard place - how UK patios rely on child labour. Huge sandstone quarries are fuelling landscaping boom on the cheap**

**Paying the price**

82: The daily wage in pence earned by Naresh, 12, for breaking up slabs

100: The number of "gitti" Naresh breaks up in a day, about one square metre

£35: The amount 100 gitti will fetch in a British garden centre

2000: The amount, in rupees, one worker paid to get a job (£23)

2000: The amount, in rupees, many workers earn in a month

400: Thousands of tonnes of rock mined in Rajasthan in a year

---

7. Trafficking for sexual exploitation

Prostitution: range of standpoints and perspectives.

**Recent decades:** commodification of a narrow range of sexuality: “raunch culture” (Levy, Female Chauvinist Pigs 2005)

Sexual freedom = liberation and equality? Enables the normalisation of sex trade: prostitution ≡ globalised, industrialised and integrated into the international political economy

**Global changes in economy:** body as a marketable product

**Before:** prostitution ‘…the very core of the female’s condition which reduced woman to c....’ (Millett 1975, p. 56)

**Now:** prostitution - a function of profit-making turning women into, in Jeffrey’s words, ‘industrial vaginas’ (2009, p.7) – ‘...the centre of a business organized on an industrial scale’.

**Trafficking for sexual exploitation:** just one indicator of how subordination of ‘Others’

**The diversity of contexts:** fragments the collective image of the ‘Other’ into a variety of vulnerabilities: on the account of race, ethnicity, age, gender, sexuality, social class, family status, religious beliefs.
Vignette 10: China and prostitution

China: anywhere between 10 and 20 million of prostituted women, with the industry of prostitution estimated to account for 8 per cent of the Chinese economy (Zhou 2006 cited in Jeffreys 2009, p. 5).

8. Consuming

**Consumerism:** ‘...describes a society in which people formulate their goals in life partly through acquiring goods that they clearly do not need for subsistence or for traditional display’ (Stearns 2001: iv).

**Pasi Falk:** modern consumer is (re)defined as an economic factor

**The economic system:** economic system dependent not just on the three factors of production – capital, labour and land (nature) but on the four: **consumerism takes a primary position** (Falk 1994: 107).

**Consumer choices:** making them political to enable consumers to weigh social value

Consumption ➞ a question of values; values ➞ issue of knowledge and awareness.
Knowing

**The larger project:** explore how THB is understood and perceived by the general public in the countries of origin, transit and destination

**Pilot research:** the knowledge of trafficking by social sciences students at GCU

**Method:** online anonymous questionnaire, rate of 26%

**Outcomes:** not representative but provide an insight

---

How familiar are you with the following types of trafficking?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Trafficking</th>
<th>Very</th>
<th>Somewhat &amp; only heard</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THB for sexual exploitation</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THB for labour exploitation</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THB for organ harvesting</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THB for domestic servitude</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Can it happen here (in Scotland)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THB for sexual exploitation</th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>69%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THB for labour exploitation</th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THB for organ harvesting</th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THB for domestic servitude</th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Who is/can be/become a trafficked person?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal immigrants from non-visa countries</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal immigrants from visa countries</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illegal immigrants entered voluntarily (smuggling)</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Forced entry</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internally trafficked</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very &amp; somewhat likely</th>
<th>A little &amp; not likely</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anyone</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Links between consumerism and low-paid labour

Majority agreed:
- UK is a highly consumerist society;
- There is a link between desire for cheaper goods and services and demand for low-paid labour
- As a society we are collectively responsible for generating demand for low-paid labour

However: only 28% agreed that they could be individually and personally responsible for generating such demand.

Who is responsible?

Governments in countries of origin (72%) and in countries of destination (45%): not doing enough to stop the trafficking:

Criminal networks and organized crime: 70%
Factors of demand: 24%
Do you think that you need to know more about what trafficking is and what to do in case you suspect someone is a victim?

93% agreed

In Conclusion

Trafficking in Human Beings:
- Part of the larger system of exploitation of bodies and labour of others for the benefit of capitalist economies driven by consumption
- Reflects the working of the power relations of the neo-liberal capitalist dominance
- Reflects deep philosophical and practical contradictions between sustainability, respect for human rights and capitalism’s mode of production
- Is a symptom of the larger system of globalised exploitation of gendered and radicalised labour.
- Cannot be eliminated on a symptomatic level
- A long lasting solution: tighter state regulation of labour practices and critical consciousness among members of the general public attuned to local socio-economic and political contexts
Thank you and Questions

Thank you!!

kiril.sharapov@gcu.ac.uk

0141 331 8387