

2005

*Review of Social Stories: The Magazine Novel in
Nineteenth-Century America and Blue Pencils and
Hidden Hands: Women Editing Periodicals,
1830–1910*

Melissa Homestead

University of Nebraska - Lincoln, mhomestead2@Unl.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/englishfacpubs>



Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#)

Homestead, Melissa, "Review of *Social Stories: The Magazine Novel in Nineteenth-Century America* and *Blue Pencils and Hidden Hands: Women Editing Periodicals, 1830–1910*" (2005). *Faculty Publications -- Department of English*. 53.
<http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/englishfacpubs/53>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the English, Department of at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications -- Department of English by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

analyses of work by Murfree, Smith, Miles, and Cooke. Although at moments in earlier chapters I wanted Engelhardt to do more to distinguish between a writer's characters and that writer's narrator, particularly in her critique of Rebecca Harding Davis, in these two chapters she manages to capture the power of even those narratives with which I was unfamiliar. Engelhardt's careful rereading of Murfree resists critical clichés about the Tennessee writer and stresses the complexity of her portraits of Appalachia. For example, she argues that Murfree's *His Vanished Star* explores "how the mountains are being sold to absent landowners [and] how a community might resist development it does not want" (108). Smith, Engelhardt claims, writes poetry about "women loving mountains, women exploring alone, and local women defining themselves" within a turn of the twentieth century black feminism that contributes to our ability to see all of Appalachia

(129), not just its white citizens, and Engelhardt includes enough of Smith's lyrics to introduce the reader to this poet. Her analysis of Cooke's *The Power and the Glory*, a remarkably fast-paced and modern novel, engages gender, race, and class in its portrait of an ecological feminist model for the mountains. Finally, Miles's "ecological feminist manifesto" from *The Spirit of the Mountains* becomes the strongest critique of the negative effects of tourism and the "capitalist boom" for Appalachian women (153).

Sadly, of these four texts, only *The Power and the Glory* is readily available in reprint edition, thanks also to Engelhardt's work as its editor. Now her critical advocacy for a region and its people in *The Tangled Roots of Feminism, Environmentalism, and Appalachian Literature* helps to fill in the gaps in our knowledge of Appalachia and to include Appalachian women, really for the first time, in our conversations about our American ecological future.

Social Stories: The Magazine Novel in Nineteenth-Century America. By Patricia Okker. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2003. 202 pp. \$37.50.

Blue Pencils and Hidden Hands: Women Editing Periodicals, 1830–1910. Edited by Sharon M. Harris. Foreword by Ellen Gruber Garvey. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 2004. 320 pp. \$45.00.

Reviewed by Melissa J. Homestead, *University of Oklahoma*

Patricia Okker's study of serialized novels published in nineteenth-century American magazines is elegantly conceived and executed. Beginning her chronological case studies with the serialization of Jeremy Belknap's *The Foresters* (1787) in the *Columbian Magazine*, Okker takes as her central analytic framework the relationship between parts and whole, considering both the relationship of parts of magazine novels to the whole magazine in which they appear and the connection of individuals to the whole collectivity of American nationalism(s). The *Columbian Magazine*, for instance, published the U.S. Constitution alongside an installment

of *The Foresters*, and in his novel, Belknap sought to demonstrate "the extent to which the Indians served as a common enemy to unify the disparate colonists" into the new republic (53). In the national motto of *E Pluribus Unum* (out of many one) that serves as an organizing principle of Okker's study, magazines, serial novelists, and readers contest and variously define "the many" and "the one." Applying this flexible rubric to a broad range of authors and magazines, Okker takes a truly integrated approach to nineteenth-century American literary study, addressing intelligently and subtly the works of authors who are men and women, and black

and white. She compares William Gilmore Simms's serialization of *Katharine Walton* in *Godey's* (1850) and *The Sword and the Distaff* in Charleston's *Southern Literary Gazette* (1852) with Martin Delaney's serializations of two different versions of *Blake* in the *Anglo-African Magazine* (1859, 1861). This seemingly odd pairing of pro-slavery Southern nationalist with anti-slavery proto-Black nationalist discourse demonstrates how, in an increasingly segmented periodical market, Simms and Delaney attempted to forge like-minded communities of readers in critical opposition to a strong, centralized U.S. nationalism. Rebecca Harding Davis wrote both for "high" and "low" magazines, but Okker's chapter on Davis and the function of realist fiction in the post-war period challenges the received wisdom that this created a split authorial personality. Okker finds instead that in all of her works, Davis sought to engage "national" audiences with current "national" topics. Through an analysis of *Waiting for the Verdict's* publication in the *Galaxy*, she finds that like Simms and Delaney, Davis "shares a commitment to difference, but unlike them, she remains hopeful that such differences could be honored within a national identity" (132).

I admire Okker for jumping into relatively uncharted waters and elegantly theorizing about what she finds there. However, her framing of the project and the definition of her object—"the magazine novel"—is somewhat problematic. In her introductory chapter, for instance, she maps out some of her claims by analyzing the serial dynamics of *Uncle Tom's Cabin* in the *National Era* (1851–1852) and *The Hidden Hand* in the *New York Ledger* (1859), emphasizing the give-and-take between authors and readers in novels both written and read serially. This give-and-take is central to her claim that magazine novels were "social stories." Yet the *Era* and the *Ledger* are *weeklies*, not *monthlies*, as are almost all of the magazines featured in the ensuing case studies. In addi-

tion, while there is evidence that Stowe and Southworth produced their novels as they were serialized and shaped what they produced in a dialectic with readers and editors, such evidence is lacking in several of her case studies. Indeed, Simms's correspondence with Sarah Josepha Hale strongly implies that he was "shopping" completed novel manuscripts to editors rather than writing them in monthly installments. Finally, some of the differences Okker finds between novelists and novels seem engineered (in reverse) to make them fit into variations on the "one and many" theme. For instance, why is a historical novel by Ann Stephens about court politics during the English Restoration necessarily detached from debates about American politics in the 1840s?

While Okker sometimes sacrifices the heterogeneity of her primary materials to the book's overall design, *Blue Pencils & Hidden Hands* suffers, as do many multi-author, edited essay collections, from the opposite problem—the volume contents are extremely heterogeneous, and they often share only a few connections. In her foreword, Ellen Gruber Garvey surveys the scholarship (or lack thereof) on women as editors and periodical editing and attempts to describe and define the actual work of editing. In her introduction, Sharon M. Harris explains the volume's organization and her distribution of the essays (all case studies) under the categories "Apprenticeship," "Editing as Impetus," and "Career Editors." Some of the essays are in dialogue with previous works, such as Okker's *Our Sister Editors: Sarah J. Hale and the Tradition of Nineteenth-Century American Women Editors* (1995) and Garvey's *The Adman in the Parlor: Magazines and the Gendering of Consumer Culture, 1880s to 1910s* (1996). However, many of the essays are solo performances not in conversation with one another or with a defined body of scholarship. Furthermore, the title of this book and Garvey's foreword lead one to expect analyses of the specific editorial labor of women's "hidden hands," but most of the essays

focus on women editors' *writings* published in their periodicals (i.e., *editorials*). That is, they do not focus on the actual work of *editing*, which might involve managing a periodical's financial affairs, corresponding with authors, and taking the "blue pencil" to manuscripts. Still, many of the essays usefully draw attention to women who have escaped the attention of literary and publishing history or to aspects of the careers of women authors that have been ignored. Furthermore, the heterogeneity of approaches is a strength as well as a weakness. The volume contains essays by scholars from the fields of cultural history, journalism history, and composition and rhetoric. And essay subjects include schoolgirl editors at Boston Latin High School, society women editing special "women's edi-

tions" of newspapers, Ann Stephens at the *Portland Magazine*, Miriam Frank Leslie at *Frank Leslie's Chimney Corner*, Frances Wright at the *Free Enquirer*, Marianna Burgess editing the *Indian Helper* at the Carlisle Indian School, Pauline Hopkins at the *Colored American Magazine*, Lucy Stone at the *Woman's Journal*, Caroline Kirkland at the *Union Magazine*, Mary Louise Booth at *Harper's Bazar*, and Kate Field at *Kate Field's Washington*.

American literary history has yet to take full account of periodicals, and these two volumes should spur scholars of American women's writing to mine these rich materials. Spend some time with periodicals—what you find may challenge your preconceptions about the relationship of women to the publicity of print.

Approaches to Teaching Gilman's "The Yellow Wall-Paper" and Herland. Edited by Cynthia J. Davis and Denise D. Knight. New York: Modern Language Association, 2003. 198 pp. \$37.50/\$19.75 paper.

Charlotte Perkins Gilman and Her Contemporaries. Edited by Cynthia J. Davis and Denise D. Knight. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2004. 251 pp. \$55.00/\$24.95 paper.

Reviewed by Beverly A. Hume, *Indiana University–Purdue University at Fort Wayne*

The essays collected in these two volumes, edited by Denise D. Knight and Cynthia J. Davis, provide not only useful critical insights but also pedagogical and secondary resources for educators and students with specialized or developing research interests in the writings of Charlotte Perkins Gilman. Although the earlier collection deals explicitly with pedagogical issues in relation to two of Gilman's most discussed literary texts, both collections illuminate cultural and intellectual issues relevant to Gilman scholarship.

In *Approaches to Teaching Gilman's "The Yellow Wall-Paper" and Herland*, part one ("Materials") offers a ten page summary of issues raised by different textual editions, further reading materials for students, which have been

successfully used by educators, and suggestions for readings and teaching aids. Part two, "Approaches," is divided into four sections. In the first section, five critics address ideological, interdisciplinary, and pedagogical issues raised by Gilman's works in the classroom; in the next three sections, an additional sixteen authors address such issues in specific relation either to "The Yellow Wall-Paper" or to *Herland*. The multiple and diverse critical voices effectively reflect the pedagogical and critical approaches that have been taken to these texts.

Among the more useful pedagogical essays in the first section are those by Denise D. Knight, who addresses biographical issues relevant to "The Yellow Wall-Paper," and Mark W. Van Wienan, who assesses Gilman's socialism, which