University of Nebraska - Lincoln
DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Journal of the National Collegiate Honors Council --Online Archive | National Collegiate Honors Council

10-1-2008

Editorial Matter for Volume 9, Number 2

Ada Long
University of Alabama - Birmingham

Dail Mullins
University of Alabama - Birmingham

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/nchcjournal

Part of the Higher Education Administration Commons

Long, Ada and Mullins, Dail, "Editorial Matter for Volume 9, Number 2" (2008). *Journal of the National Collegiate Honors Council --Online Archive.* Paper 70.
http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/nchcjournal/70

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the National Collegiate Honors Council at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of the National Collegiate Honors Council --Online Archive by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

JNCHC

Journal of the National Collegiate Honors Council

A PUBLICATION OF THE NATIONAL COLLEGIATE HONORS COUNCIL

Honors and Academic Integrity

Journal Editors

Ada Long

Dail Mullins

University of Alabama at Birmingham

The National Collegiate Honors Council is an association of faculty, students, and others interested in honors education. Executive Committee: Hallie Savage, President, Clarion University of Pennsylvania; Lydia Lyons, President-Elect, Hillsborough Community College; Kate Bruce, Immediate Past-President, University of North Carolina-Wilmington; John Zubizaretta, Vice-President, Columbia College; Bonnie Irwin, Secretary, Eastern Illinois University; Rolland W. Pack, Treasurer, Freed-Hardeman. Executive Director: Cindy Hill, headquartered at University of Nebraska-Lincoln. Board of Directors: Patrice Berger, University of Nebraska-Lincoln; Sara Brady, Hillsborough Community College; John Britt, Lee College-Texas; Deborah Craig, Kent State University; Hesham Elenagar, Northern Arizona University; Sarah Fann, University of North Carolina-Wilmington; Annmarie Guzy, University of South Alabama; Gregory Lanier, University of West Florida; Will Lee, Texas A&M University; Kathy A. Lyon, Winthrop University; Jay Mandt, Wichita State University; Shane Miller, West Virginia University; Roxanne Moralez, Texas State University-San Marcos; Rosalie Otero, University of New Mexico; Ruth Randall, Johnson County Community College; James Ruebel, Ball State University; Richard I. Scott, University of Central Arkansas; Bob Spurrier, Oklahoma State University.

© Copyright 2008 by the National Collegiate Honors Council
All rights reserved.
ISBN 978-0-9796659-5-0
ISSN 1559-0151

Editorial Policy

Journal of the National Collegiate Honors Council is a refereed periodical publishing scholarly articles on honors education. The journal uses a double-blind peer review process. Articles may include analyses of trends in teaching methodology, articles on interdisciplinary efforts, discussions of problems common to honors programs, items on the national higher education agenda, and presentations of emergent issues relevant to honors education. Submissions and inquiries should be directed to Ada Long at adalong@uab.edu.

Deadlines

March 1 (for spring/summer issue); September 1 (for fall/winter issue)

Journal Editors

Ada Long (University of Alabama at Birmingham, Former Honors Director and Emerita Professor of English) and Dail Mullins (University of Alabama at Birmingham, Former Associate Honors Director and Emeritus Associate Professor of Curriculum & Instruction, with Ph.D. in Biochemistry); Managing Editor, Mitch Pruitt (Wake Up Graphics); Production Editor, Cliff Jefferson (Wake Up Graphics)

Editorial Board

Cheryl Achterberg (Nutrition), Dean of the College of Human Sciences, Iowa State University; William A. Ashton (Psychology), Director of the Honors Program and Assistant Professor in the Behavioral Sciences Department, York College, City University of New York; Gary M. Bell (Early Modern British History), Dean of the University Honors College and Professor of History, Texas Tech University; Bernice Braid (Comparative Literature), Professor Emerita of English, Advisor to the Provost, and Director of the Core Seminar Program, Long Island University-Brooklyn; D. Bruce Carter (Psychology), Associate Dean, College of Human Ecology, Syracuse University; Joan Digby (English), Director of the Honors Program and Merit Fellowship, Professor of English, C. W. Post Campus, Long Island University; Ted Estess (English), Dean of the Honors College and Professor of English, University of Houston; Jim Ford (Philosophy/Religious Studies), Director of the Honors Program and Associate Professor of Humanities, Rogers State University; Jay M. Freyman (Ancient Studies), Associate Professor and former Director of the Honors College, University of Maryland, Baltimore County; Nancy Davis Johnson (Psychology), Associate Professor of Psychology, Queens University of Charlotte; John Korstad (Biology), Professor of Biology and Honors Program Director, Oral Roberts University; Jane Fiori Lawrence (History of American Higher Education), Vice Chancellor, University of California, Merced; Dennis Patrick Leyden (Education Finance; Economics of R&D), Director of the Lloyd International Honors College and Associate Professor of Economics, The University of North Carolina at Greensboro; George Mariz (History), Professor of History and Director of the Honors Program, Western Washington University; David N. Mowry (Philosophy), SUNY Distinguished Teaching Professor, Chair of the Editorial Board of SUNY Press, Honors Program Director, Plattsburgh State University; Rosalie Otero (English), Director of the Honors Program, University of New Mexico; Anne Ponder (English), Chancellor, University of North Carolina Asheville; Jeffrey A. Portnoy (English), Interim Director of the Honors Program and Professor of English, Georgia Perimeter College; Rae Rosenthal (English), Director of the Honors Program and Professor of English, The Community College of Baltimore County Essex Campus; Rusty Rushton (English), Assistant Director of the University Honors Program and Adjunct Lecturer in English, University of Alabama at Birmingham; Hallie Savage, Honors Program Director and Professor of Communication Sciences and Disorders, Clarion University of Pennsylvania; Samuel Schuman (English), Chancellor Emeritus, the University of Minnesota, Morris, and Interim Dean of the Faculty, University of North Carolina Asheville; Ricki J. Shine (American History), Associate Director of the Calhoun Honors College and Director of Major Fellowships, Clemson University; Stephen H. Wainscott (Political Science), Director of the Honors Program, Clemson University; Len Zane (Physics), Former Dean of the Honors College, University of Nevada, Las Vegas

CONTENTS

Call for Papers 5

Submission Guidelines. 5

Dedication to Richard James Cummings 7

Editor's Introduction
Ada Long 9

Forum on "Honors and Academic Integrity"

Honors, Honor Codes, and Academic Integrity: Where Do They Converge and Diverge?
D. Bruce Carter 15

Academic Dishonesty and the Culture of Assessment
Emrys Westacott 21

Speeding is Okay and Cheating is Cool
Alison Schell Witte 29

Plato among the Plagiarists: The Plagiarist as Perpetrator and Victim
Richard England 35

Authenticity in Marco Polo's Story and in Honors Student Research: An Aside from the Early Renaissance
Bill Knox 39

Research Essays

On Training Excellent Students in China and the United States
Ikuo Kitagaki and Donglin Li 45

Honors Admissions Criteria: How Important Are Standardized Tests?
Raymond J. Green and Sandy Kimbrough 55

Is Student Participation in an Honors Program Related to Retention and Graduation Rates?
Charlie Slavin, Theodore Coladarci, and Phillip A. Pratt 59

About the Authors 71

NCHC Publication Order Forms 74

Cover image designed by Ada Long and Dail Mullins with help from Wake Up Graphics and with apologies to Abbie Hoffman

Call for Papers

The next issue of *JNCHC* (**deadline: March 1, 2009**) invites research essays on any topic of interest to the honors community.

The issue will also include a Forum focused on the theme "Social Class and Honors." We invite essays of roughly a thousand words that consider this theme in the context of your campus and/or a national context.

Questions to consider might include: Do honors programs reflect the diversity in social class of their home institutions? Should they? Do honors programs reflect America's social hierarchy? Should they? Is a focus on issues of social class important in the honors classroom and curriculum? Are honors programs designed to provide upward mobility, and, if so, is that a worthy goal? Is diversity in social class a benefit to honors, and should it be a goal in admissions? Do honors admissions criteria implicitly discriminate against lower- or working-class students? How does the relationship between social class and race affect honors programs? How do differences in social class affect the extracurricular life, residential living, or service components of honors programs? Do scholarship programs in honors exacerbate or ameliorate differences in social class? Do study abroad programs increase discrimination based on social class? How do service learning programs help and/or hinder awareness of class issues?

Submission Guidelines

We accept material by e-mail attachment. We do not accept material by fax or hard copy.

The documentation style can be whatever is appropriate to the author's primary discipline or approach (MLA, APA, etc.), but please avoid footnotes. Internal citation to a list of references (bibliography) is preferred; endnotes are acceptable.

There are no minimum or maximum length requirements; the length should be dictated by the topic and its most effective presentation.

Accepted essays will be edited for grammatical and typographical errors and for infelicities of style or presentation. Authors will have ample opportunity to review and approve edited manuscripts before publication.

Submissions and inquiries should be directed to Ada Long at adalong@uab.edu or, if necessary, 850.927.3776.

DEDICATION

RICHARD JAMES CUMMINGS

For an issue of *JNCHC* focused on "Honors and Academic Integrity," Dick Cummings is an obvious choice for our dedication. He has been a stalwart and important leader in honors at his home institution—the University of Utah—as well as in the National Collegiate Honors Council for most of the past five decades. After serving as the honors advisor in his home department—Languages and Literature—for two years and later serving for one year as Associate Director of the university-wide program, Dick became Director of the Honors Program at the University of Utah for twenty-five years (1970-1995). During that time, he was a long-time member of many key NCHC committees, including the Executive, Conference Planning, Portz Grant, and Finance Committees. He planned the annual conference in Salt Lake City in 1986, was President of the NCHC in 1987, chaired the Nominating Committee in 1988, and, starting in 1993, co-chaired with John Grady the *ad hoc* and later standing Committee on Assessment and Evaluation, which produced the Basic Characteristics of a Fully Developed Honors Program. Dick has written numerous articles for honors publications, made regular presentations at honors conferences, and served frequently as a professional consultant. The courses he has taught in honors include Humanities: The Intellectual Tradition of the West, Existentialism, Theories of Art, and Theories of Decadence. Dick's association with art has remained a constant in his life; as Professor Emeritus, he devoted much of his time to painting as well as to reading and travel. However, no one who knows Dick—at least in the NCHC—would associate Dick Cummings with decadence! He has been ever a steady, reliable, courteous, professional, and genial colleague as well as leader, a man who represents the ideal of academic integrity, and we dedicate this issue of JNCHC to him with gratitude for his decades of service to the National Collegiate Honors Council.

Editor's Introduction

Ada Long
University of Alabama at Birmingham

While cheating and plagiarism and other forms of academic dishonesty have perhaps always been topics of concern in education, the discourse on such subjects has taken on new urgency and sometimes shrillness in the past two or three decades. Text messaging, googling, Wikipedia, and sundry other technological capabilities have changed the academic arena for both students and faculty. At the same time, pressures to get into a graduate or professional school, win a national fellowship, maintain an undergraduate scholarship, or meet the retention requirements of an honors program are keener than ever for students, and faculty face similarly increased pressures to publish research, earn tenure, get promoted, or secure a grant. The combination of enhanced technologies and increased competition has produced a cultural context where issues of academic integrity are generating a new kind and level of worry.

In response to this worry, *JNCHC* is featuring in this issue a "Forum on Honors and Academic Integrity." The following Call for Papers was sent out to the NCHC membership:

> We invite essays of roughly a thousand words that consider issues of academic integrity in the context of your campus and/or a national context. Should honors be honorable? Do honors programs and colleges have a special mandate to ensure honesty and integrity? Do honors programs experience unique problems related to academic integrity? Do honors students labor under exceptional pressures that threaten academic integrity? Should honors programs have honors codes that are distinct from those of the institution? Is plagiarism more widespread now than it was before the Internet? Is the concept of plagiarism becoming archaic in the Internet Age? What are the implications of services like Turnitin.com, which convey an inherent assumption that students are cheaters? What impacts have plagiarism and attempts to detect it had on teaching and learning in honors?

Included with the Call for Papers was a lead essay by D. Bruce Carter of Syracuse University, and the Forum begins with his essay.

Carter's essay—entitled "Honors, Honors Codes, and Academic Integrity: Where Do They Converge and Diverge?"—argues that academic integrity is the cornerstone of education and that, without it, the entire enterprise of teaching and learning loses its credibility and value. Carter discusses the perceived rise in plagiarism and other forms of cheating by students and also by faculty, with falsification of data being an especially vexing problem. Academic excellence cannot be equated with moral excellence, Carter contends, so we cannot expect honors students to be less vulnerable to temptation than other students. They may even be more vulnerable given the pressures to achieve in an honors environment. Honors administrators may thus need to exert exceptional efforts to promote academic integrity.

At the same time the Call for Papers was sent out on the NCHC listserv, an article appeared in the *Chronicle of Higher Education* (16 May 2008) entitled "The Future of Plagiarism." The editors contacted the author—Emrys Westacott of Alfred University—through Paul Strong, then honors director at Alfred and contributor to the most recent issue of *JNCHC*, and invited Westacott to contribute to the *JNCHC* Forum. His invited essay—"Academic Dishonesty and the Culture of Assessment"—is a provocative and compelling argument that academic dishonesty is a symptom and consequence of an educational culture that values "assessment over enjoyment, outcomes over experience, appearances over reality." Westacott contends that students, faculty, and administrators at all levels of education have put tests, grades, and outcomes assessment at the center of education, displacing wisdom, love of learning, or appreciation of truth and beauty. Given this displacement, we should not be surprised that shortcut strategies like Kaplan courses and CliffsNotes become a viable option for our students and can easily slide into other shortcuts like plagiarism or falsified lab results. Westacott sees honors programs as an antidote to this cultural trend, but we may need to reflect on how well we are living up to his high opinion of us. We would be wise to use his essay to help shape our future discourse on assessment, academic integrity, and the culture of honors.

In an argument that nicely complements Westacott's, Alison Schell Witte of Glenville State College contextualizes and humanizes the issue of cheating by comparing it to speeding. In "Speeding is Okay and Cheating is Cool," Witte posits seven rationalizations that most of us use to convince ourselves that speeding is okay, and for each she provides an analogous excuse that students might use for cheating. Her object is not to defend cheating but to understand it and also to demonstrate that rationalizing bad acts is a trait common to students, faculty, and people in general. We thus might be a bit less inclined to see students as unlike us in the behaviors we criticize.

The final two essays in the Forum address the issue of how faculty should deal with the problem of academic dishonesty. In "Plato among the Plagiarists: The Plagiarist as Perpetrator and Victim," Richard England of Salisbury University provides a background for the concept of plagiarism, distinguishes between types of unintentional and intentional plagiarism, and argues that expulsion of intentional plagiarists is a benefit not so much to the academic community as to the offending students, who might then learn to seek "an honest relationship with learning."

In an essay that focuses primarily on prevention rather than punishment, Bill Knox of Western Illinois University argues that teachers should provide classroom environments where academic dishonesty is not a temptation. In "Authenticity in Marco Polo's Story and in Honors Student Research: An Aside from the Early Renaissance," Knox provides some historical background on the difficulties of authenticating sources of written texts, and he then offers seven specific suggestions of ways faculty can avoid having to question the authenticity of student papers. Given a technological and cultural climate that can promote inauthenticity, Knox contends that strategies to deter it make more sense than punishing it.

In addition to the "Forum on Honors and Academic Integrity," this issue of *JNCHC* includes three significant new contributions to research in and on honors.

Ikuo Kitagaki and Donglin Li of The Research Institute for Higher Education at Hiroshima University, motivated in part by a move toward starting honors programs in Japan, have done a comparative study of honors education in the two countries where it has been most prolific. "On Training Excellent Students in China and the United States" is a response to the increasing global competition in advanced research and thus the accelerating need for high levels of student training; Kitagaki and Li see the international growth of honors programs as an important means to meet this need and are interested in finding the best strategy for national development of honors programs. They compare the evolution, focus, curriculum, requirements, and student services of honors programs in China and the United States. Among their findings, they point out the more broad-based curricula and greater emphasis on service and leadership in the U.S. and the stricter retention standards and foreign language requirements in China. The authors will use their comparative study to help design honors education in Japan, and their work—along with previous *JNCHC* articles on the development of honors in Chile and the Netherlands—will help readers in the U.S. and elsewhere design and reflect upon their own honors programs.

One difference between China and the United States that Kitagaki and Li describe is the uniform admissions requirement in China based on a standardized national test whereas admissions requirements in the U.S. often

employ multiple and/or different criteria. In "Honors Admissions Criteria: How Important Are Standardized Tests?" Raymond J. Green and Sandy Kimbrough consider this vexed question of how best to predict college success and thus what criteria to use in establishing admissions requirements for an honors college. In a statistical study of incoming freshmen in the Texas A&M University-Commerce Honors College, they have found no significant correlation between the first-year GPA and either the SAT or ACT, but they have found a strong correlation between the high school and college GPA. Their study seems to affirm that, at least in the United States, not relying exclusively on standardized national test scores makes good sense.

Another crucial question for all honors administrators is how we can prove that honors programs are successful in educating their students. Charlie Slavin, Theodore Coladarci, and Phillip A. Pratt—in "Is Student Participation in an Honors Program Related to Retention and Graduation Rates?"—have made an important contribution to the limited amount of quantitative research available on key goals of honors programs. They have done a five-year statistical analysis that compares honors students with cohorts of nonhonors students who have equivalent SAT scores and high school GPAs at the University of Maine. Their findings suggest a relationship between honors participation and one-year retention but not (so far) four-year graduation. We hope that these authors will do further longitudinal studies and that other honors administrators will pursue studies similar to those reported in all three research essays in this issue of *JNCHC*.

About the Authors

D. Bruce Carter is Associate Professor of Psychology, Associate Dean of the College of Human Ecology, and former Director of the Honors Program at Syracuse University. He is a former member of NCHC Board of Directors and serves on the Publications Board. His research interests focus most broadly on social and personality development across the lifespan and particularly on gender issues and identity development processes.

Theodore Coladarci is Director of Institutional Research at the University of Maine, where he also is Professor of Educational Psychology. He did his graduate work at Stanford and has been at Maine since 1983.

Richard England is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Bellavance Honors Program at Salisbury University, where he has taught introductory critical thinking and writing courses almost every fall since 2000. As a historian of science, he writes and reads mainly about Darwinism and the relations between science and religion in the nineteenth century.

Raymond J. Green is Director of the Honors College at Texas A&M University-Commerce. He earned his Ph.D. in social psychology from Rutgers University and his B.A. from Drew University. His research interests range from understanding the function of stereotypes to predicting student success, with plenty of stops along the way.

Sandy Kimbrough is Assistant Department Head of Health and Human Performance and Assistant Professor at Texas A&M University-Commerce. She is a member of the Honors College committee, and her research interests include sport psychology and pedagogy.

Ikuo Kitagaki is currently a professor at Hiroshima University. He has been involved in human science, educational technology in higher education, technology literacy, science of laughter, and so forth. He is a staff member of the Research Institute for Higher Education and is included in Who's Who in Science and Engineering, MARQUIS, USA, 2006. He serves on the Editorial Advisory Board of the Advances in Web-Based Learning (AWBL) Book Series (USA).

Bill Knox, Professor of English & Journalism, has been Director of the Western Illinois University Centennial Honors College for two years, after nine previously on honors committees and in half-time honors administration. In honors courses, he has supervised student research projects with topics ranging from environmental sustainability to dystopian literature.

Donglin Li is an administrative research assistant of the Research Institute for Higher Education, Hiroshima University. He earned his Ph.D. in education from Hiroshima University. His research interests are in sociology of education and higher education.

Phillip A. Pratt is Associate Director of Institutional Research at the University of Maine, having served in that capacity for the past twenty years. He completed his graduate work at the University of Maine after having earned degrees from Dartmouth College and the University of North Florida.

Charlie Slavin is Dean of the Honors College at the University of Maine. In a previous life he was on the mathematics faculty, having earned degrees at Princeton and Wisconsin. However, he always is careful to point out the substantial difference between mathematics and statistics.

Emrys Westacott is Professor of Philosophy at Alfred University in Western New York. In addition to a range of standard philosophy courses, he has taught courses on frugality and on happiness as part of the honors program. His current research is on the ethics of everyday life.

Alison Schell Witte is Assistant Professor of Nursing at Glenville State College and former Coordinator of the Glenville State College Presidential Scholars Program. She has a B.S.N. and M.S. from the University of Maryland and a D. Litt. et Phil. in Health Studies from the University of South Africa.