2006

Black Goose's Map of the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache Reservation in Oklahoma Territory

William C. Meadows
Missouri State University

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly
Part of the Other International and Area Studies Commons

http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly/71

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Quarterly by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.
BLACK GOOSE’S MAP OF THE KIOWA-COMANCHE-APACHE RESERVATION IN OKLAHOMA TERRITORY

WILLIAM C. MEADOWS

Plains Indian cultures have left numerous forms of Native drawings in the form of painted and drawn clothing, robes, tipis and tipi liners, shields and shield covers, calendars, ledger books, religious and historical drawings, and maps. Native drawings of geographic features are distinguished from other forms of drawings by their focus on the concept of territory rather than on occasional individual features such as a hill or river. Native maps predate European contact and are recorded for every major region of North America.1 Although most extant Native maps are from the Plains and Arctic regions and date to the nineteenth century, others range from 1540 to 1869.2 De Vorsey and Harley demonstrate that nearly every major North American explorer through the late nineteenth century used geographic information and/or maps obtained from Native inhabitants of their respective areas.3

American Indians drew maps for a variety of purposes: to illustrate and enhance oral accounts of noteworthy events; for astronomy and religion (Pawnee); to record travel routes and related information; as messages to report successful hunting (Passamaquoddy); to leave as travel directions for others (Upper Mississippi Valley, Great Lakes); to serve as mnemonic devices in recounting migration routes and tribal and religious histories (Southern Ojibway); as evidence in land disputes with neighboring tribes (Iowa); and to instruct outgoing war parties heading into new or distant areas (Comanche).4 Indian-made maps also often reflect the current political state between Indian nations and between Indian and non-Indian groups.5 Early white trappers, traders, explorers, and military
personnel regularly sought information on interior lands, travel routes, and inhabitants, and commonly noted the accuracy of Native-drawn maps. As geographic works produced by Natives familiar with these areas, such maps held obvious value in terms of competition in the fur trade.  

Previous publications on Indian maps have often focused on Plains Indians. Ewers discusses the value of using Native drawings and maps in studying various aspects of Plains cultures. While several Northern Plains maps exist, there are few Southern Plains examples, especially for the Kiowa, Comanche, and Plains Apache.  

This article focuses on efforts to enforce allotment on the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache (KCA) Reservation through the 1887 General Allotment or Dawes Act and the 1892 Jerome Commission, and a map drawn by Chaddlekaung-ky (Black Goose), a Kiowa man. Dating to between 1893 and 1895, this is the only known Kiowa map and one of a relatively few extant Southern Plains Indian maps. The map depicts the KCA Reservation in Oklahoma Territory and contains over 160 geographic locations, many with associated pictographs drawn in ledger style that date from 1833 to 1893. Documentary and cartographic data indicate that the map was consciously drawn with a political agenda, which was to demonstrate Kiowa occupation of these lands and to use in resisting the implementation of forced allotment and the opening of the KCA Reservation in violation of the 1867 Medicine Lodge Treaty. This scenario led to the landmark legal case of Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock in 1903.  

Native maps were inscribed, painted, modeled, drawn with charcoal, and carved in or on skin, bone, stone, wood, mats, and birch bark scrolls. Some were kept in medicine bundles. Maps were often made of more ephemeral materials including soil, silt, snow, wood ash, sticks, stones, corn kernels, or combinations of these materials, indicating that they were intended for immediate use and not for long-term reference. Natives were usually concerned with the information itself rather than with the maps as artifacts or any concern in preserving them. Thus, Native maps were “transitory illustrations for the oral documents” and “pictures of experience” more than cartographic records of finite geography.  

Most extant maps made by Indians were in response to a need or request of a European. The concept of making a map as an item of material culture to preserve information and periodically reuse it was rare. As Rundstrom notes for the Inuit, the act of mapmaking was more important than the actual map. Consequently, there has been little Native emphasis on preserving maps, and because non-Indians were concerned more with information than the Native maps themselves, most tended to transfer the information to maps of their own style, thereby making transcripts rather than preserving the originals.  

Typical of most nonprofessional maps in general, Ewers noticed several basic characteristics of Plains Indian maps: they are drawn to scale based on travel per day and not solely on linear distance; they include what the cartographer considered as important to the subject at hand and thus do not contain every geographic detail; and they reflect the visual nature of Plains geography with mountains included to take bearings from in terms of location and direction in traveling and not representing all respective formations. In most Plains picture writing, the events portrayed were considered far more important than the surrounding geography.  

Although scholars often emphasize the topological nature of Indian maps and their lack of precise “accuracy” compared to modern maps, there are exceptions. Lewis notes that “the cartographic component . . . along the route was perfectly intelligible to those with a knowledge of the area, but variable scale, stereotyped representations of features, and disregard for direction resulted in patterns quite unlike those on a modern topographic map.” Belyea notes that Amerindian maps, typical of most informally drawn maps, are best understood as just that—maps drawn by, intended to
be used by, and interpreted by Indians familiar with the ecological and cultural makeup of a given region, and not in terms of western European cartographic conventions as most scholars have tried to interpret and use them in their own geographical scheme and goals. Like all cartography, Indian mapping often “does not represent geographical knowledge in absolute terms, but is instead conventional and culture specific.” As Warhus describes, “Distance, direction, and orientation were part of traditional knowledge. They were part of one’s ‘mental map,’ and a graphic system was not needed to express them.” Consequently, some authors fail to focus on the larger cultural and political significance of Indian maps.
The Jerome Agreement and Allotment

Throughout the mid-1800s the Kiowa homeland centered on the area of present-day western Oklahoma, western Kansas, the Texas and Oklahoma Panhandle, and the adjacent portions of New Mexico and Colorado. In 1867 the Kiowa signed the Medicine Lodge Treaty, confining them to the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache Reservation located in the southwest corner of Indian Territory between the present-day Washita and Red rivers from 1867 to 1901. Although the Kiowa initially continued to range far beyond this area, in 1875 they were forced to surrender and to formally accept permanent residence within the reservation boundaries.

Law enforcement soon became a problem, as the Kiowa had no formal police or court system. Indians were being taken off the reservation and tried in Texas for crimes committed by or against them in Indian Territory and later Oklahoma Territory, and no Kiowa spoke fluent English at this time. The complex American legal system was difficult for Indians to navigate and was seen as a highly inequitable system that essentially left Indians to the mercy of a foreign court and culture. The Court of Indian Offenses and the Indian Police were soon introduced to address this situation. Authorized by the secretary of the interior from 1883 to 1901, the Court of Indian Offenses involved a number of court systems ranging from agents acting as justices of the peace, to agent-selected judges, to elected officials. In May of 1888, Special Agent E. E. White appointed Quanah Parker (Comanche), Jim Tehuacana or Towakanie Jim (Wichita), and Lone Wolf (Kiowa) as judges. After the court first met that September, other Kiowa objected, as Lone Wolf was now both a chief and a judge. By February of 1889 Black Goose, who had been serving as an agency policeman, replaced his brother Lone Wolf as judge.23

Most Anglos felt that Indians, despite being forced to give up most of their original lands and settle on small reservations, still retained too much land and were not using it “appropriately.” In the 1880s, pressures to acquire and open additional lands for Anglo settlement and to accelerate the process of assimilating Indians into mainstream Anglo lifestyles led to new legislation to acquire their lands. For the Southern Plains tribes, Article 12 of the 1867 Medicine Lodge Treaty stated that any future land cessions required the consent of at least three-fourths of the adult male Indians. In 1892 the Cherokee Commission met with the Kiowa, Apache, and Comanche to persuade them to sign the Jerome Agreement. This stipulated that all tribal members would receive a 160-acre allotment of their selection to be held in trust by the government for twenty-five years, whereupon it would then be given to the individual owner as a fee simple title. All excess or non-allotted land was to be sold by the government at $1.25 per acre. The government also agreed to pay $2 million to draw 5 percent interest annually in the United States treasury.

Although the commission believed it had secured enough signatures to pass and implement the agreement, subject to congressional approval, by late October of 1892, only 456 of the total population of 2,786 members of the three tribes had signed the Jerome Agreement.24 As evidence of false translation, false signatures, and illegal coercion were proven, many Kiowa began to change their minds. When Lieutenant Colonel James F. Randlett was appointed agent at the KCA Reservation in 1899, he anticipated a highly divided community but instead found a widespread and united body against the Jerome Agreement, noting that to open the reservation at that time would be a “calamity.”25

Settlers and their advocates began encouraging congressional ratification of the Jerome Agreement as early as 1892. When the agreement was presented to the Senate for ratification in 1899, the number of signatures obtained was less than the required quorum, which the secretary of the interior pointed out. Although the Kiowa and their lobbyists managed to delay the act for eight years, the Jerome Agreement was finally ratified by Congress in June of 1900,
forcing allotment upon the KCA Reservation. Lone Wolf soon after filed a bill of equity on the grounds that the Jerome Agreement, with signatures obtained through fraud and misrepresentation, had violated the articles of the 1867 Medicine Lodge Treaty. Known as Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock, the ensuing case was decided by the U.S. Supreme Court in 1903, which found in favor of the U.S. government.26 "The opinion of the court was that (1) the Indian had only the right of occupancy but that the fee was in the United States; (2) Indian occupancy could be interfered with or determined by the government; (3) the propriety of such action toward the Indian was not open to inquiry in the courts."27 The principle of plenary power, that Congress can make and break its own treaties, laws, and decisions when it chooses to, was firmly set regarding Indian law. Consequently Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock is "one of the most cited cases in all of federal-Indian law."28

As two of the staunchest Kiowa opponents against the implementation of the Jerome Agreement of 1892, Lone Wolf and Black Goose sought to prevent forced allotment upon the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache Reservation. Black Goose's testimony that "we want our land as it is" succinctly reflects his and the group's stance on the issue.29 As Indians continued to be asked to produce maps for Europeans and observed how they used them, they soon came to realize that maps were a powerful image and a means to define and assert place, identity, and ownership of land. Some accounts suggest that Indians may have begun to use maps as a means to try to define territory in their relations with non-Indians.30

THE BLACK GOOSE MAP

Chál-kó-gái or Black Goose was born in 1844 to Audle-ko-ety (Aul-kó-ét-jè or Big Black Hair) and Pau-gei-to (Vau-ga-jau-ì or Pursuing Them Along A River), and was enrolled at the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache Agency as Chaddle-kaungy-ky. He was a full brother to Black Turtle, Mam-me-da-ty (who received the name Cuì-fá-gàui or Lone Wolf in 1874), Ho-va-kah, and Ta-ne-quoot. They comprised a large and influential Kiowa family from the western part of the KCA Reservation. Black Goose was of the last generation of Kiowa to experience the pre-reservation equestrian lifestyle. Although first listed on the 1881 tribal census as Chaddle-kaunky or Black Crane, Black Goose is the correct translation of his name.31 During the 1880s and 1890s Black Goose resided in his brother Lone Wolf's camp between the forks of Elk Creek, just south of present-day Hobart, in Kiowa County, Oklahoma. Black Goose died early in 1900, as he does not appear on the June 1900 census, and as Agent James F. Randlett nominated Apeahtone on May 7, 1900, to replace Chaddle-kaungy-ky as judge, who was by then deceased.32

The map of the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache Reservation drawn by Black Goose identifies numerous rivers, mountains, camps, and noted historical and ceremonial sites with...
pictographic drawings. Four images have handwritten captions. Black Goose drew this map for use by attorneys concerning the boundaries of the KCA Reservation, specifically the case of U.S. vs. Texas (de Corilloco jurisdiction). An inscription on the upper right or northeast corner states, “Drawn by Judge Chad-dle-Kaung-Ky for R. E. L. Daniel, Anadarko, O.T.” (Oklahoma Territory). Many Plains Indian drawings and maps contain name glyphs, typically a small pictograph placed above a profiled head of an individual and connected by a line that served to identify an individual; however, some drawings omitted the connecting line, including some Kiowa works. Above this inscription is the image of the head of a long-necked bird (92), typical of Plains Indian name glyphs used as pictographic “signatures” during this time, especially in ledger art. The associated bird’s head clearly identifies Black Goose. Collection data for the map states, “W. C. Shelley, Washington, D.C. presented by W. C. Shelley, June 17, 190_.” An old card in the collections reads: “De Greer [? Greer County].” William C. Shelley was one of several Washington lawyers representing Lone Wolf in 1901.

The 1892 Jerome Agreement was presented to Congress for ratification in 1899 and was ratified in 1900. Because Black Goose died in early 1900, it is inferred that the map was drawn during the 1890s. A letter from Mr. Robert Daniel to John P. Harrington in the National Anthropological Archives provides a more precise date of manufacture: “Some years ago I presented to Mr. W. C. Shelley, Attorney for the K & C [Kiowa and Comanche] about 1895-96, a picture map of that Reservation, made on cloth, by Chaddle Konkey, a Kiowa Indian. Mountains and streams were designated by animals, birds, historical events, etc. instead of written words.” This account and the presence of what appears to be Rainy Mountain School (built in 1893) on the map suggests that it was made between 1893 and 1895. Although the exact date James Mooney acquired the map is unknown—he was known for allowing some items to lie around his office for extended periods before filling out the associated acquisitions paperwork—museum records indicate that it was accessioned on December 19, 1904.

The map consists of a square muslin cloth measuring 90 centimeters in width with numerous images drawn in black pencil, many of which are filled in with colored pencil. Most of the mountains are colored green. Bally Mountain and the mountain to its northeast are colored tan, and a few smaller hills are colored black. The map is framed by four identifiable geographic forms: the Washita River to the north, the Red River to the south, the eastern edge of the Wichita Mountains on the east, and the edge of the Texas Panhandle to the west. Large rivers (Washita, Red, North Fork of the Red River) are colored green on the map. In between are numerous streams and mountains, many with associated pictographs for identification. These images consist of four main forms: streams, mountains and hills, residence bands or camps, and locales of notable historical events. The latter form includes varied cultural events involving religion, intertribal warfare, Anglo military forces, and subsistence activities. Many of the finer details in the pictographs (human, flora and fauna, material culture) and the four handwritten labels require magnification to clearly see them.

The use of pictographic symbols to label locations is well established in Plains Indian cartography. Lone Wolf’s camp (86) is identified by a small square with short, radiating stubble-like lines and an associated label reading “Chief Lone Wolf’s Camp.” Similar symbols across the map correlate with areas where many Kiowa resided during the reservation period and later took allotments near one another. Many of these concentrations continue as contemporary Kiowa communities. Lone Wolf’s camp is depicted with the largest such camp symbol on the map, perhaps indicative of political influence rather than total population. Some of these glyphs correlate with where prominent individuals (Stumbling Bear, Ahpeahtone, Sitapatah, Lone Wolf) established their homes.
prior to allotment. While these glyphs may indicate some of the first Anglo-style homes built for ten tribal leaders in 1877, the label “Chief Lone Wolf’s Camp” suggests that they are probably intended to represent reservation bands associated with a prominent leader residing in that vicinity. Notable historical events are represented by pictographic images of people, battles, Sun Dance lodges, and other symbols associated with specific locales. These depictions refer to specific well-known events in Kiowa history that date from 1833 to 1893.

IDENTIFICATION AND INTERPRETATION OF SPECIFIC SITES

The principal of upstreaming, or the direct historical approach in archaeology, is useful to interpret this map. I began with the most recognizable geographic and historical features, and used these to identify others and their related cultural and historical significance. Because the context of why the map was made and the area it represents is documented and easily recognizable, most of the map is relatively easy to interpret. Overall the map is both extremely thorough and accurate. A total of eighty-nine streams and tributary branches, fifty-three mountains and hills, fourteen camps, and fourteen locales of notable historical events (some associated with identifiable mountains, streams, or other locales) are depicted. At least forty-two locations are associated with pictographs and are thus inferably identifiable. Four locales include handwritten labels in pencil and in English: “Navajo Mt.” (63), “Goat Mt.” (61), “Original Wichita Mts.” (66) and “Chief Lone Wolf’s Camp” (86). These locales aid in identifying others.

The “Original Wichita Mts.” are also identified with the depiction of an Indian man wearing an Anglo-style jacket, an erect eagle feather, tattoos over his lower face and chin, and standing above a cluster of three mountains. The Wichita were known to have adopted Anglo clothing earlier than many of the surrounding tribes, and one of the Kiowa names for them (Tho-cut-gâu or “Tattooed Faces”) comes from the prevalence among them of this practice. The Kiowa originally called only a small portion of the present-day Wichita Mountains by that name, which this map indicates as the cluster around Stewart Mountain, Soldier’s Peak, and probably adjacent King Mountain.38 The single mountain on the south side of the river (52) is probably
Byrd Mountain. This locale correlates with the historic Wichita Camp near Devil's Canyon visited by the United States Dragoons and depicted by George Catlin in 1834. Today the entire range from Lawton, Oklahoma, westward is collectively called the Wichita Mountains. Known as “Mountain That Is Looking Up” or “Mountain That Is Lifting Its Chin” by the Kiowa, Mount Sheridan (64) is distinguished from the other mountains by a rectangular shape and a prominent uplifting point similar to pictographs used to represent other named bluffs in Kiowa calendars.40

Other locales can be identified by combining Kiowa historical sources, sources on military history, United States Geological Survey (USGS) 7.5-minute topographic maps, which provide a precise record of all existing geographical forms for comparison, and my own research in Kiowa ethnogeography.41 Due to numerous Kiowa pictographic calendars ranging from 1832 to 1941, the rich Kiowa ethnographic record can be placed in chronological order. Consequently, most of the locales on the map can be identified, correlated with multiple independent sources, and in many cases linked to precisely dated historical events. Several streams and mountains with associated pictographs correlate with the precise location and name still used by the Kiowa. Examples include a hog for Hog Creek (13), a hawk for Hawk Creek (11), a red-colored saddle above Saddle Mountain (62), a yellow-green prickly pear atop a mountain for Prickly Pear Mountain (65), and a prairie dog for Prairie Dog Eating Creek (24).

Noted Historical Events

Several historical events can be identified through comparing their location and associated pictographs in relation to other sites. Several of these sites involve intertribal events. One image depicts a headless torso, three decapitated heads, and an intact corpse strewn around a male warrior in the act of decapitating a standing Kiowa woman whom he holds by the hair (81). Blood graphically streams from the victims. This scene depicts the Osage massacre of some 150 Kiowa in 1833 at what became known as Cutthroat Mountain. The Osage man wears a roach or crest hairstyle and an erect eagle feather. The major adjacent mountains are also accurately depicted.

An Indian male wearing a quiver and holding a bow and arrow in his hand marks Navajo Mountain (63), named by the Kiowa after discovering a member of this tribe watching them from this locale. The Navajo is identified by the style of his red face paint and his red hair tie that holds his hair in a single bundle. Hairstyles are a common means of indicating tribal affiliation in Plains Indian pictography.42 The image of an Indian man two streams below the junction of the North Fork of the Red River and Sweetwater Creek (39) matches precisely the location where the Kiowa killed a party of forty-eight Cheyenne Bow String Society members in 1837.43 This individual wears braided hair, a bone whistle on a necklace, and has been shot with an arrow, indicating his demise. In the southwest portion of the map is a man wearing a long breechclout and holding a rifle upward (45). Blue smoke from the gun’s barrel indicates that it is being fired into the air and may denote a warfare context.

Religious Activities

Several images depict religious activities. Two Sun Dance lodges (82), colored green to represent their attached foliage, correlate with the locations of the 1869 and 1870 ceremonies along the North Fork of the Red River near the junction of Sweetwater Creek.44 On the east-central branch of Stinking Creek is a bison skull near a tree with attached offerings (89). Although lacking a Kiowa or modern English name, its image and location match an account of a Kiowa offering site recorded by Hugh L. Scott from Iseeo in the 1890s, entitled “Buffalo Tree.”

Out on the big flat east of Vomit Creek and east of Man Who Stands in the Middle is a place . . . that is a Buffalo Tree. One year the
Sun Dance was made below Poor Buffalo’s on the Washita in the big bend opposite the high pointed bluff and they set out to kill the buffalo for the Sun Dance and they killed the buffalo there. And some time afterwards a woman had a dream in which she saw a buffalo who told her to come out on that flat and when she saw some bones there they would be his. And when she woke up she went there where the dream told her and there was a mesquite tree growing among the bones of the Sun Dance buffalo. That is the buffalo’s spirit and the Kiowa make presents to it sometimes.45

Magnification of the image shows a tail feather of a mature golden eagle suspended from the west side, a rectangular blue cloth or flag, and what may be a cloth strip and an offering.

On the North Fork of the Red River is a small tributary stream associated with the image of a half red and half blue or black blanket with attached decorations (87). At first glance one might think it represents the attempt by Retained His Name A Long Time ( Jáudêkāw), who took the name Bison Bull Coming Out (Páutępje), to bring back the bison in the summer of 1882. He used a large red blanket trimmed with appended eagle feathers. This occurred in the large bend on the Washita River between present-day Carnegie and Mountain View, Oklahoma.46 The location of this image probably represents the messianic movement of Paingya (Vjūigāí or In The Middle), a former disciple and successor of Bison Bull Coming Out, who attempted to restore the land and bison and eradicate the whites in 1888. In The Middle established his camp on upper Elk Creek near Lone Wolf’s camp where he received many blankets and horses as gifts from adherents.47 As Bison Bull Coming Out’s successor, In The Middle may have adopted his use of the decorated blanket in his rituals. Although not accurately reflected in this map, the distance between the North Fork of the Red River and upper Elk Creek in this area ranges from nine to twelve miles.

Similar to translating Plains Indian personal names, the context—the basis or reference behind a name—is also essential in understanding and translating place names. The stream in the southwest corner of the map is identified with a short-eared owl (44), which refers not to the actual bird itself, but to a man whose medicine came from a mythical form of this animal. The Kiowa called this stream Ájéqjēvāw (Mythical Owl Idol’s Creek). Ájē is a term for a medicine owl in Kiowa lore, and the stream was so named for a man named Ájēq who carried such an idol in a shoulder pouch and who died there. This stream is present-day Buck Creek, which joins the Red River in Jackson County, Oklahoma (Mooney 1898:392).48

Several camps can be tentatively associated with known Kiowa groups, such as Lone Wolf’s camp (86). Many members of this area took their allotments just south of present-day Hobart in the forks of Elk Creek. The camp at the base of Prickly Pear Mountain (65) is most likely that of Stumbling Bear. The camp near the mouth of Jackson Creek (34) is located near the present-day Mount Scott Kiowa Church and probably represents those
Kiowa who took allotments near Meers. The two camps on the west side of Canyon Creek (25) are probably other families associated with the Meers area. The camp west of these is probably that of Frizzlehead, who resided along what was recently renamed Frizzie Head Creek (37) between Meers and Saddle Mountain. Other bands along Soldier, Gawkey, Cedar, and Rainy Mountain creeks are still reflected by concentrations of allotments in these areas. The two camps on the east and west sides of the mouth of Stinking Creek (31) probably represent Ahpeahtone's camp and Afraid Of Bear's camps, respectively. Two camps near the mouth of Rainy Mountain Creek (23) represent Kiowa bands in that area, one of which was probably Big Tree's. The camp on the south side of the mountains (near 54) probably represents Quanah Parker's camp along West Cache Creek.

Anglo Interactions

Other images depict interactions with Anglos. An armed soldier in a blue uniform represents Camp Radziminski along Otter Creek (84), an army camp from September 23, 1858, to December 6, 1859. It was originally located on the left bank of Otter Creek near the present town of Tipton but was moved several miles upstream in November of 1858, then moved again to the east or right bank of Otter Creek in March of 1859, four miles northwest of present-day Mountain Park.49 This image appears to represent the final location of the camp.

Along the western edge of the map is a vertical dotted line (91) running north to south, then turning northeast until it meets the Washita River (2). Oriented with adjacent streams and landmarks, the vertical portion of this line clearly marks the Texas-Indian Territory border.50 The location of Mythical Owl Idol's Creek (44) also confirms the identification of this line as the Texas-Oklahoma Territory state line. The diagonal extension of the line clearly represents the top of the reservation boundary as it continues to the Washita River northwest of present-day Rainy Mountain Creek and Mountain View. In reality, the actual reservation line ran from a point on the Washita River due west until it met the North Fork of the Red River. Altered directions are not unusual, as some Native maps are extremely accurate in terms of scale and direction in some parts while less so in others, and as modifications to include adjacent areas are known.51 As the Washita River formed the northern border of the reservation and the map, the area to the northwest of the reservation boundary has been compressed to facilitate its inclusion on the map.

Just west of the Oklahoma Territory-Texas line and north of the North Fork of the Red River is a young bison bull beside a wooden corral consisting of two horizontal rows of linear rails held up by crossed vertical x-shaped posts (85). This image appears on the west side of a small tributary of the North Fork of the Red River just west of Sweetwater Creek. Located in the eastern edge of Texas, this probably represents Fort Elliott, which operated from 1875 to 1890. Commercial bison hunting in Kansas occurred from 1872 to 1881. Late in the summer of 1873 the Mooar outfit, led by J. Wright and John W. Mooar, established the first of several bison-hunting camps on the South Canadian River and was followed by several other outfits. A stockaded outpost known as Adobe Walls was established as a headquarters for hunters along the Canadian. After fending off a large force of Indians on June 27, 1874, the hunters abandoned the post.

Other images reflect negative impacts brought about by Anglo contact, especially the reduction of bison. By the mid-1870s the Southern Plains herds had been reduced to such an extent that some years a bison could not be found to acquire its hide for the center pole for the annual Sun Dance, in turn leading to two messianic movements to restore the bison and the old way of life.52 The prairie dog (24) along the west fork of Rainy Mountain Creek references an incident in the 1870s when a nearly starving band of Kiowa were forced to kill and eat numerous prairie dogs along this
stream. Alice Marriott recorded an account of this stream in 1935 from Mrs. Tsatoke, who was born in 1867: “Prairie dogs were eaten; there is a creek named Prairie-Dog-Eating-Creek. After a heavy rain, ditches were dug and the water allowed to flood the holes and drown the dogs out.”

On the south side of the Washita River, a circle of small erect posts with a taller central pole (83) represents the “Sun Dance When They Left the Poles Standing.” While building the lodge for the 1890 ceremony, news of troops dispatched from Fort Sill to stop the ceremony caused the tribal encampment to disperse, leaving the partially constructed lodge standing.

**Missing Locales**

Although most prominent geographic locales are included on the map and can be identified by their associated pictographs, certain aspects are noticeably absent. Foremost, the map clearly reflects the post-Medicine Lodge Treaty reservation located between the Washita and Red rivers and the eastern edge of the Wichita Mountains to a north-south line east of the Texas state line. Other locales for which the Kiowa have place names in the adjacent parts of northwest Oklahoma and Texas are absent. The map also emphasizes Native designations, omitting many of the then-largest existing Anglo forms. As of 1898, five mission schools, three government boarding schools, a government day school, and other government buildings were all established on the reservation. The Kiowa Agency at Anadarko (1879), Fort Sill (1869), and various Christian churches and missions such as Methvin (1890) and St. Patrick’s (1892) near Anadarko and Elk Creek (1893) are all absent. A rectangular image with a single line through its middle (90) at the northeast side of Rainy Mountain (71) is probably Rainy Mountain Boarding School and/or possibly Boake’s Trading Post, the first of which was adjacent to the school. A similar image is located on the south side of what appears to be Lime Creek (29).

Like Lean Wolf’s Hidatsa map, Black Goose’s map depicts many noted historical events but omits most of the Kiowa’s troubles such as the attack on the Indian agency and their confinement at Fort Sill in 1874-75, as well as diseases, killings, and other Anglo-induced problems. While the last attempted Sun Dance of 1890 is depicted, the two primary Kiowa Ghost Dance camps are not. As only a few Ghost Dances (1890, 1894, 1895) had been held by the time this map was made (ca. 1895), it may not have been viewed as a firmly established event meriting inclusion in the map. The map appears to focus on the Kiowas’ lengthy occupation and use of the region, reinforcing the concept of Kiowa ownership and perhaps symbolically representing their preference not to have an Anglo presence in the region.

While the camps of the Kiowa, and possibly the Apache, are clearly marked, most of the area inhabited by the Comanche contains no images denoting residence camps or stream names. The map also appears to emphasize those Kiowa residing in the western part of the reservation, especially Lone Wolf’s camp, of which Black Goose was a member. There are more pictographic labels for streams and mountains in the western part of the reservation than for the eastern region. In addition, several streams and sites of noted historical events on the western portion of the map are located outside the reservation boundary. Black Goose was undoubtedly more familiar with this part of the reservation than with others. Nevertheless, this map is an outstanding representation of the KCA Reservation by an individual who had spent much of his life within this area and was intimately familiar with the overall geographic, demographic, and historical makeup of the region.

**Accuracy and Style**

Although the Black Goose Map is accurate in terms of scale and direction, some inaccuracies should be noted. Most notably the Washita River, which bends sharply to the north-northwest at Mountain View, is presented here as continuing in a more east-west direction. Consequently, all upper tributary
streams above this point are also inaccurate in terms of location and direction, probably due to the constraints of the square piece of cloth on which the map was drawn. Similar geographic distortions reflecting the imposition of rectangular paper on Indian cartographers are known.\textsuperscript{56} Reflecting the purpose for which the map was drawn, the area inside the reservation was clearly emphasized over the area outside it. The tributaries of Stinking Creek are similarly presented in a more east-to-west direction than their true southeast-to-northwest courses. The absence of Kiowa communities around present-day Hog Creek (13), Saddle Mountain (62), and Stecker, Oklahoma, which were well established by 1885, may reflect an omission or occasional camp mobility prior to allotment.

The Black Goose Map differs from Northern Plains Indian maps in its style of presentation. Maps drawn by Poor Wolf (Hidatsa) in 1880 or 1881 and one by an Assiniboine in 1853 are drawn in a rather rudimentary and stick-image fashion, compared to other drawings of war deeds from the same time and by the same artists and others.\textsuperscript{57} Black Goose’s map more closely resembles the ledger-book style of imagery common throughout the Southern Plains by the late 1860s and similar to but more realistic and with more attention to detail than other Northern Plains maps such as Crazy Mule’s map.\textsuperscript{58} This may be due to variations in each artist’s level of skill in drawing, as well as the purpose behind the maps, as those previously mentioned were intended to show travel routes, while the Black Goose map is clearly intended to represent long-term demographic and cultural affiliation within the reservation area. Poor Wolf also provides a very detailed realistic drawing, and there are Northern Plains maps of equal skill and detail.\textsuperscript{59} Scholars should perhaps begin to look at different types of maps in relation to their emphasis in style and content, such as warfare accounts, travel, and demography.

Several images of Indians in distinct dress and hairstyles—Wichita (66), Navajo (63), Osage (81), Cheyenne (39)—a uniformed non-Indian soldier (84), Sun Dance Lodges (82-83), a horse saddle (62), and various animals are drawn in ledger and not stick-figure fashion. Several animals are also drawn in realistic two-dimensional detail: an owl (44), goat (61), hog (13), hawk (11), bald eagle (46), snake (69), prairie dog (24), two turkeys (21, 41), and two bison (47, 85). These images contain great detail, such as the saddle, stirrups, and belt on the saddle at Saddle Mountain, the prominent snout and curly tail on the hog at Hog Creek, the detailed plumage and ears of the long-eared owl on Mythical Owl Idol’s Creek, the horns and beard on the goat on Goat Mountain, the fork-tongued and striped snake associated with Blue Mountain, the distinct profile of the prairie dog, and the distinct coat and beard on the adult bison bull in contrast to the younger bison near the corral. Black Goose also distinguished the trees he drew. While those on Trail Creek contain more pointed tops (12), those on upper Little Elk Creek (11) exhibit more rounded tops, perhaps indicative of their species.

The form and meaning of some images are presently unrecognizable. Clusters of possible grass or smaller flora are found along the tributary of Little Elk Creek (11), near the head of the Elm Fork of the Red River (19), and along portions of Stinking (31), Oak (48), and other (49-50) creeks. Two locations along the Elm Fork of the Red River depict a single round object and a cluster of small oval objects, perhaps prominent rock outcrops. These images do not resemble those with attached loops depicting fortifications, breastworks, and enemy killed as found in other Plains drawings and maps.\textsuperscript{60} The cluster of six small four-pointed items near the mouth of Sweetwater Creek (9) resembles a formation of birds in flight. On the south side of the Washita River is a black pod-like image with a green tuft on the top that contains a very faint red arrow through it (50). These images undoubtedly held some cultural significance, perhaps a resource location or where some noteworthy event occurred, but are now unknown. Although most of the images are clearly linked to locales and events known on a tribal basis, others may represent events that held importance on personal, family, or
residence band levels, similar to how Kiowa pictographic calendars changed from tribal to more community-based events in the 1890s.

The map also appears to have been an ongoing work, as there is evidence of several changes or corrections in the form of erased and in some instances moved or redrawn images. The Washita River (2) from east of Hog Creek to present-day Mountain View was originally drawn in a fairly straight line like the Red River, erased, and then redrawn to include numerous bends. In other locations clusters of flora were erased, as seen along a western tributary of the creek with the pod-like object near its mouth, and on the tributary of Little Elk Creek (11), where a cluster of taller objects, probably trees, were erased and replaced with a cluster of smaller items with larger leaves. Whether these “corrections” were made by Black Goose or through consultation with tribal members, they suggest an effort to ensure a more accurate depiction of the area.

CONCLUSION

The Black Goose map is an important contribution to a growing number of Plains and American Indian maps, especially as a rare example of a Kiowa and Southern Plains map. In its geographical focus on the 1867 to 1901 KCA Reservation in Indian and later Oklahoma Territory, it is a regionally important map. By combining stylized geographical features, realistic place-name glyphs, and pictographic representations of noted historical events, with ethnographic and historic sources on Kiowa culture, modern geological survey maps, and ongoing field research, the Black Goose map permits a considerable amount of identification and interpretation. Although of more recent manufacture, this map is similar to others Plains maps and reflects the ledger style of drawing of the late 1800s. Although a considerable portion of the map is fairly accurate in terms of general locations, it emphasizes topology (representation of conceptual relationships of places to one another) rather than Euclidian topography (scale representations of distances as measured in spatial units, rather than in travel time or other criteria). Other distinctly American Indian characteristics include an extensive use of pictographs to identify classes of places (camps, Sun Dance encampments, mountains) and place names (Saddle Mountain, Hog Creek), the use of more than one directional scale or orientation on a single map, and the inclusion of events as well as places. While many Plains maps focus on a specific event or time, the Black Goose map spans at least sixty years, with many images containing extraneous detail. Although the map reflects some Euro-American influences through the use of muslin and colored pencils and a shift from hide to ledger-book-style drawing, it retains the Native style of pictography for recording information.

Similar to other Plains maps, this map also reflects an exceptional grasp of geography even by Western standards. When carefully analyzed, the Black Goose map conveys several distinct features of Kiowa life in the 1890s. First, the map has a distinctive geographical and historical focus. Spatially it focuses on the post-1867 KCA Reservation area. Temporally it contains identifiable events from the 1833 Cutthroat Gap Massacre to the building of Rainy Mountain Indian Boarding School in 1893. While not every event of this period is depicted, many major events are, demonstrating how geography, history, and meaning are inexorably linked in Indian place making.

Second, and more important than the identification of and cultural and historical correlation of many of the locales depicted, is the map’s political purpose, to demonstrate the Kiowa’s historical longevity and rights to their land. Harley provides evidence for ideological transformation in Native mapmaking in Mesoamerica and Peru whereby Natives began “making maps in support of their claims to land from which they had been dispossessed.” Because the context of the Black Goose map is known—as a means to resist implementation of the Dawes Act—it allows one to examine it for signs indicative of resistance to further American dispossession through the process
of allotment. The wide range of locales and themes depicted on the map reflects a lengthy cultural and historical occupancy. This symbolic and political stance is further indicated more through what is not on the map than through what is in the map. The map emphasizes a Kiowa rather than an Anglo presence, as almost all non-Indian institutions are absent. Combined with Black Goose's testimony that “we want our land [left] as it is,” the map's context becomes clear—to demonstrate the Kiowa occupancy, use, and inferably their cultural and political attachment to the land. As Harley observes for other Native maps, a change in context from depicting territorial control to territorial resistance did not result in fundamental changes in the format and style of mapping.

Rundstrom notes that Inuit mapping represents an important form of environmental mimicry. Similar to imitating animals in hunting techniques, mapmaking “simultaneously reflected and reinforced other aspects of the culture.” Mapmaking symbolized and reified their attachment to the land, while providing important forms of intracultural and intercultural communication with others. In drawing this map, Black Goose demonstrates his environmental, historical, and cultural knowledge and ties to the area, which are communicated both intraculturally (Kiowa efforts to prevent allotment) and interculturally (Black Goose's emphasis to present Kiowa over Anglo use of the land). As Rundstrom notes for the Inuit, “Mapping as an innately intracultural action thus became a significant means of constructing accurate map artifacts for intercultural communication.”

Third, the map depicts a Kiowa viewpoint of the KCA Reservation in the 1890s. Fourth, in presenting a somewhat Elk Creek-centric format, it clearly focuses on events from that area outward, as a member of that camp drew it. Yet this view also conveys a degree of temporal accuracy in that this area contained much of the strongest opposition to the Jerome Commission from the influence of Lone Wolf, Black Goose, and others. Thus the map symbolically depicts to some degree an accurate view of not only the demographic, but also the political power base and climate of the time. Fifth, this map reflects an ethnographic focus and function in that while it concentrates on the Kiowa residing along Elk Creek to some degree, it depicts other Kiowa settlements and major historical and geographic locales that held meaning for all Kiowa. Thus, while some Indian maps are more biographical in nature in focusing on the activities of an individual, this map is more ethnographic as it focuses on Kiowa culture and history in general.

As Plains Indian life changed in the late 1800s, so did Plains Indian mapmaking. Animal skin, which had become scarce, often gave way to cloth, muslin, canvas, and paper, while crayons and pencils replaced paint. Several maps from the late 1800s reflect a shift in focus from traditional territories and warfare to new activities such as government scout service, massacre sites, travel, and even commissioned work.

The Black Goose map differs from the more numerous Northern Plains maps in some aspects of how place is depicted. While most maps cover a much larger area (e.g., the Iowa Non-Chi-Ning-Ga's map, the Oto Geor-Schu-Wy-Ha's map, Miguel's Southern Plains-West Gulf Coast map, the Northern Cheyenne Crazy Mule's maps of the Upper Missouri Country and the Missouri Basin, and the Mandan Sitting Rabbit's map), the Black Goose map provides more detail within a smaller area, similar to but still more detailed than Amos Bad Heart Bull's (Oglala Sioux) map. In terms of flora, fauna, and humans, the Black Goose map is much more realistic than the Assiniboine and Poor Wolf maps. In terms of artistic style, elements of Sitting Rabbit's map and Crazy Mule's maps are similar to and in some instances surpass Black Goose's map in quality of individual drawings but contain less variety and fewer images overall. Finally, the Black Goose map contains a wider range and greater depth of cultural and historical events.

Though the Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock case was lost, the Black Goose map represents a
Reservation in the late nineteenth century just
map produced in ledger style with overall
rare example of a Kiowa and Southern
prior to forced allotment, a watershed event
of the map and the changes it represents also
correlate with Black Goose's life (c. 1844-99),
Apache communities forever. The very nature
and thus visualized. The Black Goose map
uses many, and in several cases more, pictographic notations than
many other maps studied thus far. In using
oral traditions and the invisibility of spatial
tives requiring pages of written text and/or
post-1867 reservation. Finally, the map stands
against a cartographic background, it depicts
Kiowa cultural heritage, their demographic
and their attempts to preserve their
existing land base at the turn of the twentieth
century.

NOTES

My thanks to Candace Greene (Smithsonian
Institution), Mr. Kenny Harragarra (Carnegie,
OK), and the peer-review readers for Great Plains
Quarterly for commenting on drafts of this article.

1. G. Malcolm Lewis, “Indian Maps,” in Old
Trails and New Directions: Papers of the Third North
American Fur Trade Conference, ed. C. M. Judd and
A. J. Ray (Toronto: University of Toronto, 1980),
110, uses the term “cartographic device,” as varied
forms of this type of artifact were not drawn to
scale, constructed according to particular projec-
tions, or consistent in representing all phenomena
in a given class above a given threshold size. But as
Barbara Belyea points out in “Amerindian Maps:
The Explorer as Translator,” Journal of Historical
Geography 18 (1992): 267-77, Lewis, like most schol-
ars of Indian maps, view their composition through
a comparison and expectation of European and not
Native cartographic patterns.

2. Robert A. Rundstrom, Douglas Duer, Kate
Berry, and Dick Winchell, “Recent Geographical
Research on Indians and Inuit in the United States
and Canada,” American Indian Culture and Research

3. Louis De Vorsey, “Amerindian Contributions
to the Mapping of North America: A Preliminary
View,” Imago Mundi 30 (1978): 71-78; J. Brian
Harley, “Rereading the Maps of the Columbian
Encounter,” Annals of the Association of American
Geographers 82, no. 3 (1992): 522-42.

4. Colonel Richard L. Dodge, Our Wild
Indians (Hartford, CT: A.D. Worthington and
Company, 1882), 552-53; De Vorsey, “Amerindian
Contributions;”; G. Malcolm Lewis, “The Indigenous
Maps and Mapping of North American Indians,”

5. Louis De Vorsey, “Amerindian Contribu-
tions,” 75-76.

6. Lewis, “Indian Maps.” For summaries of
the current understanding and body of works
on indigenous North American cartography, see
Mark Warhus, Another America: Native American
Maps and the History of Our Land (New York:
St. Martin's Press, 1997); G. Malcolm Lewis, ed.,
Cartographic Encounters: Perspectives on Native
American Mapmaking and Map Use (Chicago: Univer-
sity of Chicago Press, 1998); G. Malcolm
Lewis, “Maps, Mapmaking, and Map Use by Native
North Americans,” in The History of Cartography
vol. 2, book 3, Cartography of the Traditional African,
American, Artic, Australian, and Pacific Societies, ed.
David Woodward and G. Malcolm Lewis (Chicago:
University of Chicago Press, 1998), 51-182; and
Rundstrom et al. “Recent Geographical Research.”

7. Garrick Mallery, “Pictographs of the North
American Indians: A Preliminary Paper” in Fourth
(Washington, DC: Government Printing Office,
1886); and “Picture-Writing of the American
Indians,” in Tenth Annual Report of the Bureau of
American Ethnology (Washington, DC: Government
Printing Office, 1893); John C. Ewers, “The Making
and Uses of Maps by Plains Indian Warriors,” By
Valor and Arms
11. Ledger-book art is a style of Plains Indian pictographic drawing focusing on scenes of warfare, religion, hunting, and other cultural events. Originating on robes, tips, and other items of hide, these and other images began to be drawn on sheets of paper in the 1860s. The name "ledger art" stems from the popularity of using blank ledger books for such drawings.
13. Warhus, Another America, 58.
16. Ewers, "The Making and Uses of Maps of Maps by Plains Indian Warriors," in Plains Indian History and Culture. Rundstrom, in "Cultural Interpretation of Inuit Map Accuracy," shows that Inuit maps are not only highly accurate, but that they reflect cultural values in the form of the highly developed levels of observation and memory in Inuit behavior and thought. That is, "values embodied in other institutions are implicit in cartographic artifacts" (156-57).
17. Warhus, Another America, 186.
18. Lewis, in "Indian Maps," 15, and "Indian Maps: Their Place in the History of Plains Cartography," 92, provides similar observations.
22. Warhus, Another America, 35.
23. William T. Hagan, Indian Police and Judges (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1966), 130; W. D. Myers to the Commission of Indian Affairs, Feb. 18, 1889, Kiowa Court File, Oklahoma Historical Society, Oklahoma City, OK.
29. Ibid., 35.
30. Warhus, Another America, 4-5, 43.
31. Kiowa Tribal Census, 1881, p. 333, Oklahoma Historical Society, Oklahoma City, OK. The Kiowa terms for the wild and tame goose are cāu (s/d) and cāu-gāu. The Canadian goose is known as cāl-thā (s/d) and chāl-thā-māu (l) (lit. white belted). The crane or great blue heron is known by the term pi-qōp-je (s/d) and pi-qōp-čaut (l). Note: s/d/t stand for single, duel, and tripugal forms in Kiowa (Parker McKenzie, personal communication, n.d.). From these terms Black Goose appears to be the correct name form for Chaddle-Kaungy-Ky. William L. Merrill, Marian Kaulaity Hansson, Candace Greene, and Frederick J. Reuss, A Guide to the Kiowa Collections at the Smithsonian Institution, Smithsonian Contributions to Anthropology, No.
40. (Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1997), 428, list Tsadalkonzha, Tsadalkonka, and Tsadalkongya as variations of the name. Kiowa linguist Parker McKenzie also translated the name as Black Goose.


34. Merrill et al., Guide to the Kiowa Collections, 42.


38. Older Kiowa called the mountains west of the pass at Cooperative the Wichita Mountains, and those east of this pass the Apache Mountains from the Apache's preference for camping around them. This confirms the earlier description of the Wichita Mountains. Personal correspondence, Parker McKenzie to author, February 19, 1998.


41. Mooney, "Calendar History of the Kiowa Indians"; Nye, Story of Old Fort Sill; William C. Meadoods, Kiowa Ethnography (Austin, University of Texas Press, in press).


43. Mooney, "Calendar History of the Kiowa Indians," 271-72, 419.

44. Ibid., 326-27.


Vâuígá is probably the short name form of Kçaúigá, denoting Right In The Center or Middle. He was born in 1843.

48. Male and female Kiowa personal names were based on this creature.


50. The Western Cattle Trail, the only trail to cross the KCA Reservation, crossed at Doan's Store on the south side of the Red River and west of the mouth of the North Fork of the Red River, then ran to Fort Supply and on to Dodge City (John W. Morris, Charles R. Goins, and Edwin C. McReynolds, Historical Atlas of Oklahoma, 3rd ed. [Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1986], map 46). Thus this line represents the Texas-Oklahoma Territory Line and not the Western Cattle Trail.

51. Lewis notes in "Indian Maps": "There the cacique reached the edge of the deerskin and swung what would seem to be the Red and Arkansas rivers clockwise through almost ninety degrees in order to accommodate them" (15).


53. Po-e-to-mah (Mrs. Tsatoke) and lole MacElhaney to Alice Marriott, July 10, 1935. Alice Marriott's Kiowa Field Notes, 1934-36, Western History Collections, University of Oklahoma, Norman.

54. The easternmost mountain southeast of the Buffalo Tree contains a series of small linear marks in the center of its base but is unrecognizable despite magnification. Although it may represent a stand of timber, it is in the immediate vicinity where the three Kiowa boys froze to death on January 9, 1891, and may refer to that incident (Mooney, "Calendar History of the Kiowa Indians," 360-61).

55. Warhus, Another America, 188.

56. Lewis, "Indian Maps: Their Place in the History of Plains Cartography," 97, 100.


58. Fredlund et al., "Crazy Mule's Maps."


61. Lewis, "Indian Maps" and "Indian Maps: Their Place in the History of Plains Cartography";


68. Ibid.


70. Lewis, "Indian Maps: Their Place in the History of Plains Cartography," 94, 99, 101 (Miguel's map); Fredlund et al., "Crazy Mule's Maps," 6-7; and Thiessen et al., "Sitting Rabbit 1907 Map". The Black Goose Map provides more detail within a smaller area, similar to but still more detailed than Amos Bad Heart Bull's (Oglala Sioux) Map (Lewis, "Indian Maps: Their Place in the History of Plains Cartography," 96).


73. This map also contributes to ongoing work in Kiowa ethnogeography in aiding in the identification and confirmation of specific locales and indigenous place names through ongoing ethnographic research (Meadows, Kiowa Ethnogeography).