Winter 2008

The Pageant of Paha Sapa An Origin Myth of White Settlement In The American West

Linea Sundstrom
University of Oklahoma

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly

Part of the Other International and Area Studies Commons

https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly/1400

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Quarterly by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.
As a literary work initiated and directed by a committee of women, The Pageant of Paha Sapa captures the zeitgeist of the post-frontier era through the eyes of the influential women of one small town. Like all origin myths, this script presented the current populace as the rightful heirs of the place and its resources, having won them through persistence, struggle, and divinely ordained destiny. The pageant's message was that "civilizing" influences had transformed the former Indian paradise and frontier hell-onto-wheels into a respectable modern community. This theme of social evolution was typical of the larger pageant movement; however, unlike the eastern towns, Custer, South Dakota, could not draw on its past for moral authority. The town began as a mining camp, with the rootlessness and disorder of any western gold rush town, compounded by conflicts with Indians trying to drive the white trespassers from their reservation lands. History as expressed in Custer's pageant leaped from primitive perfection to historic chaos to a modern, orderly community. Modifications to the script and performance over the years imply points of tension between the local women's early post-frontier origin myth and new views of frontier history at mid-twentieth century.

**RURAL REFORMS OF THE PROGRESSIVE ERA**

The postsettlement years in the western United States were a time for towns to reflect on their short and often checkered histories. With the challenges of frontier life behind them, townspeople sought legitimacy through stories of their founders. During the first decades of the twentieth century, townspeople
performed these stories, mythic or real, in colorful historical pageants. In performing and witnessing the historical dramas, cast and audience internalized their local story and awoke to their town's role in the march of progress.

During the rise of the Progressive Era at the turn of the twentieth century, politicians and activists from a wide range of political, educational, economic, and geographic backgrounds embraced the idea that government could institute social reforms that would promote equality, social harmony, and morality. Along with a concern for the rights of workers, children, and women, progressives sought to improve the lives of individuals of all classes through outdoor recreation, communal activities, and exposure to the fine arts. Among the tangible results of this movement were public parks and playgrounds, public murals, settlement houses, and youth organizations.1

Progressives worried that American society was disintegrating in the cities and rural areas alike. In 1909, President Roosevelt’s Commission on Country Life reported to the U.S. Senate on the status of rural society in America. According to their report, rural society was failing. In the East, this was attributed to rural people moving to the cities and to the dehumanizing effects of industrialism,2 but in the West it was blamed largely on the self-reliant attitude of the homesteaders. “Self-reliance being the essence of [the homesteader’s] nature, he does not at once feel the need of cooperation for business purposes or of close association for social objects.”3 In the words of historian Jonathan Raban, “the fear was that the plains were filling up with self-reliant misanthropes, undereducated, irreligious, lacking in all the developed social impulses that are required for a functioning democracy.”4 One advocate of social reform attributed the “crusty individuality” of the westerners to the need to wrest “something savage” from the land by individual struggle to temper it for civilization.5

On the heels of the 1909 report, government agencies, churches, and social reformers proposed a series of programs to socialize and educate rural people toward community cohesion. In *The Country-Life Movement*, L. H. Bailey proposed that a sense of community could be cultivated through sports leagues, songfests at the local schoolhouses, and performance of historical pageants.6 Bailey and other progressives promoted such programs to inculcate community spirit in excessively independent westerners, whom they perceived as lacking social cohesion.7

**THE PAGEANT MOVEMENT**

Production and performance of historical pageants proved to be a popular aspect of the progressive movement in the West. Proponents anticipated several benefits of local historical pageants: wholesome activity for children and adults, a sense of community pride and cooperation, opportunities for leadership and socializing, and increased tourism and settlement.8 Proponents envisioned the pageants as wholly homegrown enterprises; even if the town pageant committee rented some costumes or commissioned a professional writer or historian to create a script, the pageant was to be “an expression of the life of a community portrayed by members of that community.”9 Pageant organizers should invite every local resident to participate, although, as will be seen, they did not always follow this rule.10 An implicit but important purpose was to create and dramatize origin stories for the young towns—in the words of one pageant promoter, “to make [local] history live in the minds and hearts” of community members.11 Like all origin stories, these served to legitimate the presence of the current population by mythologizing its real or imagined history. Pageants were to entertain, educate, and inspire by presenting the ideals of the past in a colorful, active form easily grasped by children and immigrants.12 Pageants should lead to personal and social improvement. The town pageant should be a “lighted torch of inspiration for nobler living.”13 Pageants also sought to counter the backwardness and isolation of rural communities by embedding their stories within the larger national history and geography.14
The American pageant movement (some would say mania) reached an apex in the years immediately preceding World War I, but persisted until midcentury in many places, particularly in the South and West. In the years after World War I, women's clubs staged pageants to raise funds for community centers. In the West, the postwar pageants also attracted tourists seeking a taste of frontier history. The pageant movement would become a lens into the anxieties and hopes of a new American century, originating at the intersection of American progressivism, British anti-modernism as expressed in the Arts and Crafts movement, nostalgia for classical ideals, the installation of allegorical murals and sculpture in public spaces, the expressive dance movement of Isadora Duncan, and popular realization that the American frontier was closed.

In the western boomtowns, pageants had to negotiate an uncertain bridge between the moralistic, community-building theme of the eastern pageants and the realities of a chaotic and often immoral early history. Scriptwriters could not simply imagine a more orderly history, because tourists now demanded that the performed West match that of dime novels and Wild West shows. A town that failed to embrace its lawless past, whether mythic or real, would not attract this new and lucrative kind of visitors. In 1929, Deadwood, South Dakota, began its Days of '76 historic parade and Wicksburg, Arizona, its Days of '49 pageant. The Helldorado play soon followed in Tombstone, Arizona. In enacting scenes from movie westerns, including stagecoach holdups, Indian attacks, and shootouts, these western pageants were far removed from the mainstream pageant movement with its allegory of human progress and veneration of past morality. By 1924, the town of Buffalo, Wyoming, was reenacting its lawless past complete with barroom and dancehall scenes in an explicit rejection of feminism, temperance, and other progressive ideals. Unlike the eastern pageants, these tourist shows tended to depict the past as a series of discrete events, and not episodes of social evolution.

The need to mediate conflicting ideals of communalism and individuality, reckless adventure and community-building, the exciting past and the peaceful but comparatively dull present, and Wild West myth and classical moral allegory produced a unique kind of historical pageant—one that blended social reform with raucous entertainment and turned community endeavor toward glorification of a violent and selfish past. In attempting to reconcile these discordant ideas, the western pageant used the symbols of womanhood and Indianess—in contrast to the white male world—to symbolize extremes of virtue and vice that bore little relation to historical fact. In this, the western pageant followed a tenet of the larger pageant movement: "the pageant will lose its best lessons if we depend upon facts alone for our material."

The Pageant of Paha Sapa

One such program, the Pageant of Paha Sapa, formed an important part of community life in Custer, South Dakota, from 1923 to 2000. Custer had started as a gold rush town in 1875 after a reconnaissance mission led by Lt. Col. George Armstrong Custer announced finding gold in the Black Hills. The town sprang up a few miles from the initial gold strike. The Black Hills and all surrounding territory were part of a vast reservation set aside for the Lakotas, known as the Great Sioux Reservation; thus, both Custer's expedition and the prospectors were trespassing on Indian land. At first, U.S. Army troops attempted to expel miners from the area, but by the summer of 1875, they gave up this mission. The lack of territorial status or military protection left Custer and the later Black Hills gold rush towns in lawless limbo. Those entering the town during early gold rush days were overwhelmingly male, young, and transient. Although no exact figures are available, most scholars place Custer's population in 1875 at about 10,000. When richer gold strikes were reported the following year in Deadwood Gulch and other parts of the northern Black Hills, the town of Custer was nearly abandoned.
The typical gold rush town had many saloons, gambling dens, and "sporting houses," a few mercantiles, and large amounts of substandard rental housing. Other early enterprises included newspapers and theaters. In 1877, the U.S. government coerced the Lakota tribes into relinquishing the Black Hills, through a policy of "sign or starve." The 1890 census gives Custer's population as 790. It dropped to 509 by 1900 and rebounded to hover around 600 in the 1920s and 1930s. By this time, the town had evolved as a ranching community, with significant employment in mining, logging, and the U.S. Forest Service. Tourism, which would come to dominate the town's economy, was just getting started in the 1920s.

To commemorate the town's history, the Custer Commercial Club commissioned Millie Heidepriem in 1923 to write a script for an annual pageant. Heidepriem, the daughter of Custer pioneers, held a master of arts degree in education from the University of Chicago and taught at Black Hills State Teacher's College. The Custer Women's Civic Club provided an outline on which Heidepriem was to base the script. A Women's Club committee conceived a pageant encompassing town history from the moment of creation through the Black Hills gold rush, continuing through the formal establishment of the town, with a tableau at the conclusion that brought the story up to the modern era. Typical of pageants of the era, the Pageant of Paha Sapa comprised a series of historical episodes broken up by allegorical interludes and followed by a finale bringing together the entire cast for a patriotic display. The pageant had three episodes: the first covering the period up to non-Indian entry into the area; the second covering the history of the gold rush, Indian wars, and establishment of the town; and the third presenting a procession of individuals representing community, church, and school. Symbolic interludes followed the first and second episodes.

**AGE, GENDER, AND RACE IN THE PAGEANT CAST**

Divisions of roles and production tasks by gender were part of the pageant from its earliest days, but these began to change during its last years in the 1980s and 1990s. Racial and class divisions also changed over time, with the pageant participants becoming less racially diverse and more economically diverse over time. Despite these changes, the script stayed largely the same throughout its history.

The Custer Women's Civic Club staged the pageant for most of its history. Not surprisingly,
FIG. 2. Women on horseback portraying allegorical figures, Pageant of Paha Sapa, 1933. Courtesy of Jessie Y. Sundstrom Historical Collections, Custer, SD.

it contained many roles, both on and off stage, for women, teenage girls, and young children. In later years, women who had participated as little girls and teenagers staged the pageant. Women’s production tasks were recruiting cast members, teaching the dances to the children and teenagers, providing piano music for rehearsals, sewing costumes, and supervising children during the performance.

Most of the women’s and children’s roles occurred in the First Episode, before the onset of history proper. Young girls played the parts of flowers, sunbeams, stars, butterflies, and birds. Teenage girls performed more complex dances as the storm, winds, rain, rainbow, dawn maidens, wood nymphs, butterfly queen, and gold fairy queen. Other teenage girls cast as flower queens and green bug queens led groups of younger children. While the flower queens danced with their young charges, the green bug queens mostly babysat the tiniest boys cast in the part of green bugs, grasshoppers, and frogs. Young women participated as the sun, moon, the messenger of the Great Spirit, and as members of the sunflower brigade. Somewhat older women participated as pine trees. The oldest female participants formed a living flag during the Third Episode. A few other parts for women occurred in the Third Episode: homemaker, Statue of Liberty, and one or more local teenage “princesses” (Miss Custer and Miss Gold Discovery Days). The Second Episode had very few women’s parts. One or two young girls and a woman played the parts of members of a family attacked and killed while traveling in the area during the gold rush days; another woman played Annie Tallent, the first white woman to enter the Black Hills. During the 1960s, dancing girls were added to a gold rush saloon scene. The dancehall girls performed

the same can-can dance in a local tourist show, simply moving their act to the pageant.29

Additional children’s roles were available to boys. Boys up to the age of five or six participated in the First Episode as the aforementioned bugs, with the next oldest groups taking the roles of skunk, chipmunk, and rabbit. Middle-sized boys were gold trolls, and the oldest boys portrayed wolves, bears, and bison. As teens, boys would join the men in portraying cavalrymen and miners.

In contrast to women and children, men participated most in the Second Episode. The storied Seventh Calvary—for whose leader the town was named—made two entrances, one as the 1874 Black Hills Expedition and a second as military forces attempting to control both miners trespassing on the Great Sioux Reservation and the Indians themselves. This allowed an unlimited number of horsemen to participate. Large numbers of men were needed to portray miners, saloonkeepers, ruffians, and a vigilante mob for the hanging scene. The earlier performances of the pageant included a depiction of a cattle roundup, again featuring men. The only role for men in the First Episode was that of three individuals, shirtless, feathered, and painted, in the role of “primitive man,” and one or two woodcutters whose entry marked the end of the First Episode and the beginning of history proper.

The three-part structure of the pageant reflects a common European view of time as comprising an ahistorical, remote period, followed by a historical period, with a third, present period conflated with the future. The script presents an essentially Judeo-Christian view of the remote past presented in the First Episode. The pageant began with a narrator announcing the creation of the Black Hills by the Great Spirit. The pageant organizers altered the script in the 1950s to include verses from Genesis, but noted that the script had from the start “followed the Biblical order of creation.”30

The cast members for the First Episode were concealed behind an arbor that extended along an open hillside. The first to emerge from
the arbor was the Great Spirit’s Messenger, a woman dressed in white robe and wings, who then called forth one by one the sun and sunbeams, moon and stars, dawn maidens, trees and wood nymphs, wind and rain, storm, rainbow, flower groups (rosebuds, crocuses, bluebells, sweet peas, tiger lilies, shooting stars, and daisies), butterfly queen with the younger butterflies, wasps, and birds, the sunflower brigade, the bugs, frogs, and animals, and the gold fairy and gold trolls. Each character or group performed a dance, except for Sun and Moon and the tiny tots who accompanied them as sunbeams and stars, who simply bowed or curtseyed to the Messenger. The boys’ groups did not have a formal dance, but they cavorted down the hill to music. The gold trolls were provided with little bags colored gold, pink, or black to represent the gold and other minerals that would lure whites to the Black Hills. They mischievously tossed these bags about the hillside, after their queenly leader cart-wheeled and danced across the hillside.

Fig. 4. Shooting star flowers and their queen, Pageant of Paha Sapa, 1995. Photo by Linea Sundstrom.

The First Episode brought together women, teenage girls, small children, and pre-contact Indians (identified by the narrator as “primitive man”) to portray a world that was unsullied, virginal, innocent, and essentially feminine. This episode presented Indians as childlike, passive, and timeless until the white man arrived to impose history and progress upon them. A promotional history of the pageant published locally in 1956 stated that “the American Indian, like the ancient Greeks and Norse, made up in his childlike, imaginative mind fanciful tales and legends which explained satisfactorily to him the workings of the universe.” The First Episode ended with two or three white men, woodcutters, wandering into the Indians’ sacred Black Hills with axes in hand. They pantomimed cutting the trees—played by women—causing them to fall dead or wounded to the ground. At this juncture, the “primitive” men sank from view behind an arbor and the entire cast of women and children walked slowly and sadly back up the hill to disappear behind the pine arbor. Their part in the performance was over. Here the story places the destruction (not to say rape) of the forests before the discovery of gold. In reality, gold miners, not loggers, depleted the forests, as trees were harvested
for flumes, mine timbers, and stamp mills. The Woodcutter stands for all economic progress, and the inevitable deflowering of the wilderness, but it is difficult to explain why this figure and not that of a gold miner was chosen to represent destruction of the wilderness. Perhaps the severing of the living trees from their roots was thought a better metaphor for the wrestling of resources from the land. While the miner takes away lifeless minerals, the woodcutter kills a living forest.

As with many county history books compiled by local committees and historical societies, the pageant defines history as beginning with permanent white settlement in the area. As a symbolic hint of the excitement to come, the interlude between the First and Second episodes featured four dyed horses and riders costumed completely in blue, green, red, and gold, respectively representing Adventure, Romance, Danger, and the Lure of Gold. In later years, a fifth rider costumed in buckskin leggings and a magnificent war-bonnet represented the Great Spirit. Women played the first four roles, but the Great Spirit was a man. The Second Episode reenacted historical events in a way that privileged white males. Men appeared as explorers, fighters, prospectors, adventurers, criminals, vigilantes, and builders. Only two or three women appeared. The first represented Annie Tallent, a white woman who accompanied her husband into the Black Hills with an illegal party of prospectors. The Black Hills were part of the Great Sioux Reservation at the time, and treaties explicitly forbade trespass by outsiders.

An enactment of an Indian attack on a family traveling by covered wagon provided one or more female roles as victims. Although most historical evidence suggested that white bandits committed the robbery, the pageant described the event as an Indian attack, not mentioning that the family was trespassing on Indian land at the time. Sometimes another woman participated as a servant or daughter. The script required at least one woman victim to satisfactorily portray the event. Including more was desirable not only for accuracy, but to stress the barbarity of the "massacre." When a woman appeared in the role of the family's servant, pageant organizers made no attempt at historical accuracy by placing an African American woman in this role. Since no more than one or two African American families lived in the county, this would have been difficult to accomplish without resorting to blackface makeup. That does not explain the omission, however, because in later years whites painted themselves a coppery red to play Indian roles.

The Second Episode moved the story from timeless and essentially feminine to historical and essentially male. The story line emphasized the largely male makeup of the gold camps and highlighted violent events that punctuated the early days of settlement. After a few men pantomimed panning for gold, discovering a few of the little golden bags scattered by the gold trolls, the tedious and generally disappointing work of prospecting and mining was ignored. Instead, the story turned to a barroom shooting and the subsequent lynching of the perpetrator. The script also included an Indian attack or two, with pistol-wielding frontiersmen expelling the Indians. In the real history of Custer, the lynching was a moment of mob violence in the days after the gold rush. Organized Indian attacks actually never happened. Although not representative of the town's real history, these events made the show more exciting for tourists seeking the cachet of frontier adventure. The Second Episode also featured dancehall girls in the stereotypical "bad woman" role. The narration mentioned town building, but practically no action portrayed this longer, but apparently duller, aspect of local history.

Originally, the Second Episode began with a reenactment of Indian village life, including several dances and "ceremonials." By 1960, pageant organizers removed these scenes, apparently because Lakota Sioux from the Pine Ridge Indian Reservation were no longer willing to participate. The last reference I found to the Indian section of the pageant was in 1956. Both men and women were featured in this
scene, the women setting up a tipi camp and the men conducting a peace council. The 1927 program indicates that Indians originally were involved in much of the Second Episode. After the village scene, they enacted a council concerning white intrusion into the Black Hills. The earlier performances also had Indians attacking covered wagons and surrounding the fledgling town only to be repulsed by the settlers. A large Indian council concerning the Black Hills did take place in 1859. However, there is no record of an organized Indian attack on the town of Custer. Although the organizers described the Second Episode “as nearly accurate historically as it possible to make it,” conflicts with Indians were first exaggerated and then largely omitted from the script. In later performances, the narrator explained that Indians rarely visited the Black Hills except to cut tipi poles and hunt. Although both Indian accounts and archaeological data have shown this to be false, the view was commonly held at the time and was often cited as a justification for the U.S. government takeover of the Black Hills.

An interlude between the Second and Third episodes featured a man and woman dressed as Indians (“brave and princess”) on horseback, enacting a love scene to the strains of the immortal “Indian Love Call.” The song, at least, was obviously a later addition to the pageant, because the song was written in 1924 and popularized in the movie Rose-Marie, a love story about an opera singer and a Canadian Mountie. It appears in the program for 1941, but not that for 1927. Besides the opportunity to showcase a local soprano and a pair of saddle horses, this addition is puzzling, as it interrupts the transition from the timeless, feminine, and static world of the Indians’ Black Hills to the historical, masculine, and rapidly changing world that followed the white man’s entry into the area. It threw the audience back into the former, vanished world of pre-contact Indian life. At the same time, it presented a safe, stereotyped view of Indians that apparently appealed to tourists.

Because the historical part of the story, the Second Episode, is largely immoral—from the illegal trespass of Custer’s expedition and the gold seekers to the vigilante justice of an essentially lawless frontier town to the dancing floozies—it is up to the Third Episode to recast the town’s history in a morally favorable light. This happy ending implies that the seemingly morally perfect present justifies the immoral events of the past—even as it romanticized those acts of violence, lawbreaking, and sexual exploitation of women.

The Third Episode brought the story up to present and hinted at a rosy future for the town. This part of the pageant was a promotional tableau. One by one, prominent members of the community entered: a man dressed in clerical robes to represent Church; a teacher representing Education; and a young mother and a child or two representing Home; Miss Gold Discovery Days and Miss Custer, each accompanied by two young pageboys as trainbearers, representing the town of Custer; Miss South Dakota, if available, representing State; and a serviceman representing Nation. The earliest performances also featured a procession of representatives of all the local organizations, including the Commercial Club, American Legion, various lodges, Boy Scouts, Camp Fire Girls, and in 1927 the Ku Klux Klan. This episode ended with the matrons of the community dressed in gowns and caps of red, white, or blue, forming an enormous living American flag on risers near the dance platform. A woman dressed as the Statue of Liberty mounted the same riser from which “primitive man” had surveyed the virginal Black Hills; in a flowing gown of red, white, and blue, she sang the national anthem while holding her torch aloft. Thus ended the Pageant of Paha Sapa, the territory now thoroughly civilized, modern, and integrated into the larger American story. In a final note, the entire cast then reassembled on the hillside so that tourists and proud parents could approach for close-up photographs. This “Grand Finale” produced an odd juxtaposition of flowers,
trees, rainbow, Statue of Liberty, Living Flag, Gold Fairy Queen, and community pillars.

POINTS OF TENSION: RACE, CLASS, AND VIOLENCE

Racial tensions between Indians and whites in the United States escalated during the 1960s and 1970s, culminating in race riots in the town of Custer in 1973 and the American Indian Movement takeover of the nearby reservation town of Wounded Knee a few weeks later. The civil rights movement had raised awareness of racial issues, and Americans had begun to question formerly accepted practices and attitudes.

Although during the early years of the pageant the Custer Women’s Civic Club contracted with Lakota Sioux Indians from nearby Pine Ridge Reservation to participate in the pageant, their participation dwindled and finally stopped altogether in the post-World War II period. Throughout this time, the Sioux tribes were attempting to get redress through the U.S. court system for the illegal taking of the Black Hills in 1877. Whether this was the cause of escalating racial tension is difficult to establish; however, the off-reservation towns, including Custer, increasingly gained a reputation as places where Indians were neither safe nor welcome. At the same time, a debate arose among reservation Indians concerning the propriety of performing for tourists. Although some leaders felt it was important to expose the dominant culture to Indian traditions, and to provide a source of income for families, others found the practice of dancing for tourists degrading. Gradually, the practice fell off and Indians ceased to be a part of the pageant. Whites took on the Indian roles in the performance, made up in copper skin paint, “war-paint,” and wigs. Whether intended or not, this presented a caricature of Indians of a sort that many Indians and non-Indians alike find offensive. In addition, as noted, the killing of the local family was routinely presented as an Indian attack, despite historical evidence that the perpetrators were white bandits. In spite of these obvious points of contention, the Indian community simply ignored the pageant after they stopped participating in it, rather than voicing objections to it. This contrasts with the “Song of Hiawatha Pageant” in Pipestone, Minnesota. There, Indians increasingly declined to participate in what some considered a caricature of their culture. In 1970, a group of Indians protested the Hiawatha pageant by disrupting the performance with jeers and foot-stamping, by taking over the stage, and by breaking some of the props. It was typical for whites to play Indians in American pageants. Indian roles were often played by Boy Scouts, Camp Fire Girls, or members of a fraternal organization called the Imperial Order of Red Men. One prominent member of the pageant movement ruefully noted that “America has never done the Red Man justice; it remains for her pageantry to finish him off completely.” A group of Minnesota Ojibwa offered to play the Indian roles in the huge St. Louis pageant of 1914, but pageant organizers refused them. The Ramona Pageant in Hermer, California, featured an all-white cast playing Indians and Mexicans.

Whether white arrogance or Indian protest, or simply a lack of communication, led to the exclusion of Indians from the white pageants, the result was that Indians had no say in how pageants presented the past. The reasons for whites taking over Indian roles in the Pageant of Paha Sapa and Minnesota’s Song of Hiawatha Pageant are not clear, but one factor that stands out is that whites controlled the story and performance. While Indians might have been initially welcomed to play out a white version of Indian history (peaceful villages, terrifying attacks on whites), they were not invited to help script these pageants. That role fell to committees drawn from social clubs or cliques whose membership dues or rules excluded lower-class and Indian members of the communities. The Pipestone community and the National Park Service both viewed the demonstrators who disrupted the Hiawatha Pageant in 1970 as outsiders, people who did not belong to, and who misunderstood, the local community
and had no legitimate stake in the performance. For example, town leaders insisted that the pageant was simply an interpretation of a famous American poem, in which Indians and Indian concerns were merely an aside.

The *Pageant of Paha Sapa* also minimized the role of African Americans in local history. Although Annie Tallent was the first white woman in the Black Hills, she was not the first non-Indian woman to venture into the area. That distinction would go to Sarah Campbell, an African American servant of one of the cavalry officers on the 1874 Black Hills Expedition. Although both Tallent and Campbell became residents of the Black Hills, only Tallent's story is included in the pageant. The less-empowered personage of Campbell—triply disadvantaged by race, servitude, and sex—is omitted, although she later succeeded financially with her own mining stables.

The *Pageant of Paha Sapa*, like other works of Western fiction and history, asserted that the history of the region began with white conquest of Indian lands. In this popularized view of the West, white settlers believed that "this country was a new country, and a new country had no history." In this view, Indians, along with the Indian world, simply vanished once the armed struggle for sovereignty was over. This is certainly the case in the *Pageant of Paha Sapa*, despite the fact that Indian families have always made up a portion of Custer's population. Pageant promoters explained that "the real history of the Black Hills begins with the coming of Custer's expedition in 1874."

Robert Hine has noted that class was a pervasive, but disavowed, aspect of small towns in the western United States. Town councils tended to be dominated by the wealthier citizens and existed largely to promote the businesses they owned. Membership in and leadership of churches, lodges, and civic organizations also was largely a function of class, although to some extent it was less important which groups a family subscribed to than how many. Fraternal lodges and business clubs in particular concentrated influence in the hands of the most prosperous members of the community, who promoted one another's interests to the extent possible without cutting into their own profits. The anonymity of the voting process ensured that blackballing could continue without the organizations ever having to own up to classicism or racism. Poverty was otherwise ignored or blamed on those in its grip. Typical of western communities, "few believed that there were rigid classes in the small town; to point them out was un-American; any description of poverty was bad for business."

The *Pageant of Paha Sapa* depended on the Women's Civic Club and the Chamber of Commerce (or its predecessor) for its organization and funding. This meant that business owners and members of those groups who could afford the time and money for such endeavors had charge of its performance. Nevertheless, a spectacular show required involvement of a large portion of the community, and the more participants the better, especially in the early scenes that featured groups of children. It is unlikely that pageant organizers turned away any child who could make it to the rehearsals. Costumes were provided, so the families bore no expense for their children's participation. The roles for teenage girls were fewer and more selective, although there was always room for more male horseback riders to play cavalrymen. The roles of Homemaker, Church, and School, however, were reserved for members of families with a history of involvement in the pageant and, by default, those with connections to the Chamber of Commerce or Women's Civic Club. In other words, the egalitarian ideals of the national pageant movements were sometimes difficult to follow given the realities of class in the communities in which they were staged. Many were called to participate, but few had a say in the script or casting.

**Gender Tensions and the Cult of True Womanhood**

With the rise of the pageant movement, women took on new roles in community celebrations. They began planning and scripting...
community events, rather than merely providing decorations and refreshments. Women wrote or directed many, if not most pageants. At the same time, women's dramatic roles mostly comprised domestic scenes and allegorical figures.

Custer, like other western mining and cattle towns, had to evolve from a collection of highly independent, transient, and frequently lawless men to something closer to the Victorian-era American ideal of a safe, lawful, and settled community of families. In other words, the town had to transform itself from a frontier Wild West mining camp to a stable, middle-class, family-oriented community or at least project an image of having accomplished this transition. One means to this end was for townspeople to embrace what historians have called the "cult of true womanhood" in place of the frontier ethos of every man for himself.

According to this idea, which gained currency in the mid-nineteenth century, women were naturally more moral and religious than men. It was up to women to guide the community toward high moral standards by working tirelessly to support their families, churches, schools, and cultural institutions. White femininity represented "virtue, domesticity, and ennobling influences." The prostitutes implied by the dancehall girls in the Second Episode were replaced by the images of unsullied maidenhood and motherhood (Miss Gold Discovery Days, Homemaker) in the Third Episode. As expressed in the pageant, churches and schools replaced the saloons and bawdy houses of the early days of white settlement. The "good woman" stereotype thus neatly replaced that of the "bad woman." It can be argued that men's roles were similarly transformed by the appearance of a white clergyman in the Third Episode; however, this man can hardly be said to represent the role expected of all men, whereas that of Homemaker was intended as a model for all women.

The historical portion of the Pageant of Paha Sapa did not address this transition. Instead it presented these changes as a fait accompli in the closing episode. The pageant presented this transformative process, unlike the process of white entry into the Black Hills, not as a historical event so much as an inevitable triumph of morality and civilization over both the childlike existence of "primitive man" and the unrestrained and impulsive atmosphere of the masculine frontier world. This origin myth simply skips over a transition that would otherwise be difficult to mythologize.

In sum, the Pageant of Paha Sapa neatly presents the prevailing moral view of the post-frontier era in a matrix of age and gender divisions. The first of these, equated to childhood, portrays the area and its aboriginal inhabitants as primitive, childlike, and naive. It is also portrayed as essentially feminine and virginal—ready for the taking. The First Episode shows the resources of the Black Hills in a kind of innocent, timeless limbo, awaiting the day when the white man arrives to initiate the area into the harsh realities of economic progress. The arrival of the white woodcutters at the end of the First Episode signals the end of innocence: neither the uncorrupted natives nor the uncorrupted wilderness appear again. The Second Episode can be equated to adolescence, with its recklessness, rebelliousness, selfishness, and raging sexuality. Since none of these characteristics fits the virgin/mother ideal set for womanhood, both the characters and the tenor of the script are thoroughly masculine. It could be considered a visit to what Susan Armitage terms "Hisland"—the stereotyped view of western history as involving only men and primarily violence. For example, the narrative omits those women prospectors, homesteaders, and business owners who did have a place in local history. The Third Episode equates to a period of maturity. Here women appear as homemakers and community builders. The temptress of the Second Episode is gone, banished by the civilizing force of virtuous wives and mothers. Mothers and wives have at last tamed the town and given it order and decorum. It is not that womanhood has replaced masculinity as the driving force, but that womanly virtues have gently steered manly ambitions for personal and economic
gain toward a form that permits formation of community.

**THE PAGEANT AS ORIGIN MYTH**

An origin myth exists to explain and legitimate a people's territory and way of life. It tells how a people got to where they are today. It presents an account of history that provides a foundation for community and, sometimes, a justification of conquest. Most origin myths begin with a formless void or a world that has fallen into chaos. The people are created or emerge from another world, they travel to their new homeland, overcome a series of obstacles usually through violent confrontation of nonhuman beings, and renew or acquire the rudiments of their culture. In the *Pageant of Paha Sapa*, non-Indians arrive first as woodcutters and soon after as prospectors. These "original" people overcome conflicts with the U.S. government and Indians and survive the transience and lawlessness of the gold rush era, ultimately forming a modern community. Although this story echoes that of the typical eastern pageant in presenting social change as the inevitable result of progress, it does not present progress as seamless and peaceful. The demand for Wild West entertainment provided an incentive for the *Pageant of Paha Sapa* to stick more closely to the facts of a violent and uncertain history of white settlement.

The strongly gendered nature of the *Pageant of Paha Sapa* belied the reality of life in an economically and geographically marginalized community. The clear gender lines of the pageant were blurred when one entered the real-world economic realm. The reality was that few families could afford for wives and daughters to stay at home full time. Most women worked for wages as teachers, clerks, nurses, secretaries, motel workers, music teachers, or fire lookouts. Many helped run family ranches or other businesses. The rodeo queen perhaps represents the ideal of western womanhood more closely than the women depicted in the pageant—she must be attractive and feminine, with ruffled blouses and long, curly hair, but she must also be able to ride, rope, and brand as the situation might demand. Wives helped in all aspects of family ranches and business, and in the absence of a male head of household, widowed landowners and business owners took on the male role. Although the wives of some salaried workers, especially those in federal jobs and those of doctors, lawyers, and dentists, could forgo fulltime work, in most families, men, women, teenagers, and even preteens worked outside the home or on the ranch. Women community builders may have allowed men to take credit for establishing churches and schools, but they certainly were not as passive in these and other endeavors as their portrayal in the pageant implied. Like other western women, the wives of ranchers, miners, loggers, and merchants were motivated not by ethereal ideals of civilization but by the practical need for institutions such as schools and mutual aid societies that would bring order and security to their communities.

The middle-class ideal depicted in the pageant also was rarely met in a town where most incomes were seasonal and highly dependent on capricious weather, cattle markets, and tourism trends. As late as the 1960s, a few families were still living in houses with dirt floors and no indoor toilet. Tourism and forestry buffered the town's economy somewhat from the depopulation that occurred throughout the Dakotas and eastern Montana from 1910 onward; however, abandoned homesteads dotted the landscape in the Black Hills as elsewhere in the region. The population of western South Dakota had jumped from 57,575 in 1905 to 137,687 in 1910, when many Indian lands opened to white settlement. Following severe drought in 1910-11, regional population dropped to 120,151 by 1915.
Although increased demand for mineral products and cattle during World War I boosted the local economy, the winter of 1919-20 began a rapid slide into economic depression. A severe winter crippled the cattle industry, leaving three-quarters of ranches in South Dakota unable to meet their debt payments in 1921. Military demand for minerals and cattle plummeted. The stock boom of the 1920s did nothing to improve the state's economy. By 1926, some 175 banks in South Dakota had closed and the deposit guaranty fund was $43 million in debt. By 1934, the stock market crash, drought, grasshoppers, and dust bowl conditions left western South Dakota severely depressed, and 71 percent of banks in the state had failed. Between 1921 and 1935, the price of farmland had fallen from $71.39 per acre to $18.65. Cattle prices had dropped by two-thirds. In 1931, the Red Cross was called in to distribute emergency food aid in the western counties. In 1934, nearly 40 percent of state residents were on general assistance, the highest level of any state or region in U.S. history.70

Throughout the years of economic hardship, the pageant kept to a story of optimism: the establishment of a proper town following the perilous days of the gold rush had pushed all obstacles aside and cleared the path for a peaceful and prosperous future.

OTHER WESTERN HISTORICAL PAGEANTS

The Pageant of Paha Sapa was just one of many similar local historical pageants. Many of these followed the same structure: beginning with a timeless primeval land inhabited by nature spirits, showcasing the events of early white settlement, and ending with an optimistic view of the future of the local community or state. In North Dakota, influential Country Life Movement advocate Alfred Arvold promoted local historical pageants, even providing a template for a pageant called The Land of the Dakotahs that each community could adapt to its particular history.72 Arvold advocated such productions as a means of community self-expression that would inculcate community pride and interest, especially among young persons. He recommended that North Dakota form a committee of pageantry to “select matter from the main incidents enacted in [each] particular community and county pageant and weld it into a great drama, The Land of the Dakotahs.”73

The later Pageant of Dakota-Land, written for the seventy-fifth anniversary of Dakota Territory in 1936, begins with “The Wilderness: Beginnings of the White Man's Conquest,” comprising two acts: “The Red Men of Dakota-land, Children of Earth and Sun” and “Envoys of the Great Father: Lewis and Clark, Explorers.”74 This is followed by an interlude, “Under the Flag and the Cross: The White Man's Responsibility for the Indian's Future.” The Indian story is permanently put to rest in scene 2 of episode 2: “The Lost Hunting Grounds: The Indians Confined to Reservations.” Like the Pageant of Paha Sapa, it begins with dancers representing elements of nature—in this case, the mountains, prairies, and Missouri River—with a view of the land as virginal and untrammelled. A young woman playing the role of “Dakota” recites, “Wait on for what? My virgin heart gives thanks / For all wild beauty which benignant Fate / Has spread for me, Dakota.”75 The interlude presents Columbia, holding a flag, and a Missionary, holding a cross, who stand one on each side of a little Indian boy, promising in florid verse to attend to his people's welfare in the face of white greed and conflict. Again, Indians appear as childlike, passive, and lacking any part in the future of the community. Dakota recites: “Nothing may halt the white man's conquering tread. / My children of the sun, does this portend / Eclipse of promise on Columbia's lips? / Henceforth we bow to the inevitable.”76 This theme is reiterated in “Lost Hunting Grounds,” as Strike-the-Ree says to his fellow Yankton chief, “We were not able to resist the powerful white men. It is not wise for the antelope to paw the earth when he faces the mountain lion.”77 Then follow scenes of the gold rush, the era of big cattle, and a threshing bee in a prairie community, again portraying women only as the civilizing influence of otherwise rugged
settlements. The pageant ends with a paean to the state as the “Bread of Life” of Dakota: religion, education, and the arts (with the metaphorical ennobling of wheat farming). At the finale, Dakota calls forth the “primal spirits of Dakota-land” and all the actors that follow, while a speaker recites the epilogue, a poetic call for vision, courage, faith, and community spirit.

As in the East, other western pageants of the era similarly began with a depiction of the natural world, devoid of humans and history. The Kansas Historical Pageant, presented in 1917, also opens with a scene of uninhabited wilderness. A series of “aesthetic interpretations” represented the Spirit of the Wilderness: dances of the sandstorm, the buffalo grass and prairie flowers, the grasshoppers, the snow, and a Kansas sunset. A pageant presenting the history of Chicago in 1921 also opened with a depiction of nature: “the spirit of the dunes, the prairie, and the lake in a symbolic dance.”

The opening scenes of these pageants conflate concepts of nature, primitiveness, lack of progress, Indianess, and femininity. This is paradoxical at one level, because in 1920s South Dakota, Indians were remembered as a real military threat. The U.S. government had subdued the Lakotas, not through military action but only by withholding rations from the followers of uncooperative leaders until starvation forced them to capitulate. Whites certainly did not view individual Indians as effeminate or powerless; panic had gripped white communities during the Ghost Dance scare only thirty years before. Instead, it appears that pageant writers equated the so-called primitive, timeless state of Indian culture (itself a white myth) with a natural, primordial episode from which real history would emerge. As Donald Worster has noted, viewing the Indian as simply another part of nature made the conquest of both seem a natural and inevitable process. Killing the primitive—landscape, bison, and Indian—was a noble enterprise according to this view of history, one that would bring a lasting peace, prosperity, and fulfillment to the region. Less nobly, living as a stranger in a land far from civilization gave prospectors license to exploit and damage the land without blame. The young, transient populations in the gold rush towns simply took what they could and left. Over 60 percent were between twenty and thirty years old, and the mining camps emptied as quickly as they had filled up once the easy diggings were exhausted. Four out of five initial settlers left within six years. But they were nevertheless the pioneers who paved the way for civilization proper.

Most of the pageants distinguish the primal Indian who forms a part of the natural backdrop from the historic Indian who actively opposed white trespass. The eastern pageants excluded or minimized any references to Indian-white conflict; the Indians simply came forth to sign a treaty and gracefully bowed out of the scene. Three of the pageants distort the historical record to portray historic Indians as warlike savages. The Pageant of Paha Sapa, as noted earlier, depicted Indians murdering a settler family and attacking the town of Custer. In the Kansas Historical Pageant, Indians attack and wound Coronado. Their rabble-rousing leader is strangled at the foot of the Spaniards’ cross. Later in the play, Indians attack freighters along the Santa Fe Trail. The Lebret Historical Pageant, held in 1925 in Qu’Appelle, Saskatchewan, portrayed three events in Canadian history: the landing of Champlain, the explorations of La Verendrye, and the arrival of the missionary, Father Hugonard, on the Qu’Appelle fifty years later. The hundreds of Indians included in the production enacted a battle, and the three white men, anachronistically, entreated the Indians to adopt peaceful ways. In the absence of female characters, either as representing virginal nature or the civilizing influences of proper society, this play simply placed whites and Indians on opposite sides of the civilization divide, with the bizarre result that three Frenchmen, who actually never occupied the same space or time, tame the whole of Native Canada. The Chicago festival play, performed in 1921, included an enactment of the “Massacre of 1812” in which Indians attacked “settlers, women, and children” in a “heroic but hopeless battle.”
Contrasting the Indians of nature with the Indians of history added another layer of legitimacy to white settlement. If the Indian would not willingly bend to white male dominance and insisted upon acting in a “warlike,” manly way, then what choice did the settlers have but to protect their wives and daughters from these hyper-male savages?89 Most of the pageants include an “Indian war dance” within the historic scenes. In the Chicago pageant, the “War Dance of the Pottawatomie” immediately preceded scene 4, in which “the Indian has gone and a thriving city marks the site of his hunting camps.”90 The Kansas Historical Pageant included a war dance that was to threaten Coronado’s attempt to christianize the local Indians.91 A pageant performed by the youth of the Boulder (Colorado) Training Academy also featured a war dance.92 The Wisconsin Tercentennial Pageant included a scalp dance in the “Forest Primeval” scene, which included “primitive people” in their village. The finale was the enthroning of “Wisconsin Past, Present, and Future,” surrounded by various allegorical and historic figures, with the stage direction “Indians lurk in the background among the trees of the forest.”93 The original Pageant of Paha Sapa included an Indian war dance in the Second Episode. Thus, the Indians were viewed as moving from primal, feminine, natural, and innocent to historic, masculine, savage, and criminal. Neither case presented them as fully human; rather, the innocent child of nature is replaced by the bestial savage of history.

These stories mirror the frontier myth that characterizes American literature and cinema from The Virginian on.94 This stereotypically masculine myth emphasizes “the encounter with wilderness, the excitement of danger and challenge, the violent act of confrontation and commitment, the final slow surrender of freedom to advancing civilization.”95 Perpetuated in the dime novels and early moving pictures, the heroes were often as violently savage as the Indians they vanquished, but this violence was considered necessary to birthing a safe and peaceful America.

Perhaps because of the commercialism of tourism promotion, the western pageants were less openly political than their eastern counterparts. Pageants had been staged in the East to engender sympathy for striking workers, to oppose U.S. entry into World War I, to promote women’s suffrage, and to promote black nationalism.96 The Pageant of Paha Sapa and other western pageants were fundraisers for community projects but had no explicit political agendas.

**INDIAN-AUTHORED HISTORICAL PAGEANTS**

The view of history as masculine, with women entering the story to bring culture and refinement only after the struggles of early settlement were over, obtains in nearly all the historical pageants, whether written by men or women. By contrast, the view of Indians as a vanquished and vanishing race appears consistently in pageants penned by whites, but not in five examples written and directed by Indians and another written by Métis.

The first of these, initiated in 1927, was written and directed by none other than Nicholas Black Elk, the Oglala spiritual leader famous later as the source for Black Elk Speaks and The Sacred Pipe.97 Several Lakota families participated in the pageant, generally referred to as Duhamel’s Pageant, first held in Rapid City and later at a cave developed as a tourist attraction. The pageant was a collaboration between Black Elk and Alex Duhamel, who owned the cave as well as a department store in downtown Rapid City. For Duhamel, the pageant brought more tourists to his businesses; for Black Elk, it was a way to educate whites about Lakota culture.98 Duhamel was a civic leader whose family wealth had begun with raising cattle on leased reservation land. The Duhamel store sold Indian craft items, displayed Indian artifacts, and was decorated with Indian murals of the Little Bighorn fight. While it is unclear whether the pageant was Duhamel’s or Black Elk’s idea, Black Elk had full control over its content.99 Nearly the entire performance illustrated Lakota religious
practices, including a pipe ceremony, a Sun Dance, a healing ceremony, and a funeral. Cast members camped on Duhamel’s property near the cave; apart from one morning and one evening performance, they were free to enjoy the Black Hills summer. The pageant reflects Black Elk’s heartfelt mission to promote religious understanding between the races. His motives likely were political as well, given that under the Indian Religious Crimes Code all of the ceremonies enacted in the pageant were illegal. This act was in effect from 1883 to 1933, when it was only partially repealed.100 The pageant ran from about 1927 to 1957.

In 1951, South Dakota senator Francis Case proposed a pageant to commemorate the centennial of the 1851 Fort Laramie Treaty. This treaty established territories for each of the tribes in what would become Dakota Territory but did not remove any of the territory from Indian possession. It was probably the last agreement that did not result in a diminution of Indian land holdings until the so-called Indian New Deal of the 1930s. Lakota leaders Frank Ducheneaux and Harold Shunk wrote and directed a reenactment of the treaty council. It was performed on the Cheyenne River Indian Reservation in 1951.101 It opened with a typical day at Fort Laramie, with an Indian stealing a horse from under the nose of the night herder, emigrant wagons passing by, and a Pony Express rider galloping in. The next section of the performance brought in over 100 Indians from the Lakota reservations, young boys riding bareback and the entire camp in traditional garb riding in, pulling travois laden with tipis and household goods. A tipi camp was quickly assembled. Next, the Shoshones arrived (played by Lakota), which nearly precipitated a fight with their traditional Lakota enemies. The fight averted, the Indian women and soldiers erected an arbor under which negotiations would take place. The Crows arrived in all their finery, followed by Father DeSmet and Agent Culbertson bringing in the northern tribes. Next, the various leaders signed the treaty. While awaiting the promised gifts, the Indians passed the time with dances, stories, and horse races. The pageant ended with the distribution of the gifts and a discussion of the importance of the treaty in promoting intertribal peace.

Frank Ducheneaux wrote the script for a second treaty reenactment, also held on the Cheyenne River Indian Reservation. This commemorated the 1868 Black Hills treaty, which reserved established the Great Sioux Reservation. This pageant also included an old-time Indian encampment.102 The rather long, spoken dialogue was based on actual treaty negotiations. Performers played the roles not of generic or symbolic Indians and white men, but of actual historical figures. The script
called for thirty-seven Indian and nine white performers, each playing a specific person involved in treaty negotiations. When the script deviated from historical fact in combining several negotiation sessions into one event, a narrator pointed out the discrepancy.

A more explicit attempt to show historical events from the Indian point of view was a pageant written by Crow historian Joe Medicine Crow in 1964. This reenacted the Battle of the Little Big Horn, as well as other events in Great Plains history that led to that epic conflict. Medicine Crow's script emphasized the broken treaties and threats to the Indian way of life that led up to the Indian wars of the 1870s. He did not vilify Custer, but simply took him off center stage, literally and figuratively. The script omitted present-day racial issues. It ended with a statement that those who fought on both sides of the battle contributed to the establishment of the American democracy that all citizens now enjoy. Like many of the white pageants, it ended with a patriotic display and the national anthem. The theme was reconciliation. 103

These pageants took the form of historical reenactments, devoid of the elements of origin myths found in the Euro-American authored pageants. There was no attempt to recast events into a morality tale; instead, events were portrayed as they actually happened.104 The Duhamel Indian pageant came somewhat closer to a morality play in promoting intercultural understanding, but nevertheless was an enactment of actual Lakota practices, not an origin story or modern myth.

In contrast to these Lakota and Crow Indian pageants, a 1940 pageant written and directed by the Yankton Dakota ethnographer Ella Deloria was specifically intended as an origin myth. A rural North Carolina group self-identifying as Indian had struggled for a half-century to gain federal recognition as a tribe. Because the state constitution recognized only whites and blacks, the Lumbee, as they came to be known, essentially had no status under either state or federal law. Working under commission to the Farm Security Administration and the Office of Indian Affairs, Deloria hoped to bolster Lumbee identity and group cohesion through staging a pageant titled Robeson County Indians, Pembroke, North Carolina: The Life-Story of a People (later Strike the Wind).105 This pageant followed the pattern of alternating historic tableaux and symbolic interludes used in the white town pageants.

The image of the "quester" tied together the remote and historical aspects of Lumbee identity. Initially an Indian vision quester, this seeker is later portrayed as a modern scholarly researcher tracing the group's cultural history. Historic scenes portrayed the possible Atlantic seaboard origin of the Lumbee, French Huguenots encountering the Lumbee in 1703, construction of the first school for Lumbee children, and a scene illustrating the Lumbee struggle with legal recognition. Late tableaux highlighted areas of progress: community organizations such as the Red Cross and Boy Scouts, public health and educational facilities, and Lumbee enlistment in World War I. The pageant ended with a celebration of "Home, Country, and God," and more specifically, a successful public housing program funded by the Farm Security Administration.106 This pageant was intended specifically to counter the idea that Indians were extinct or irrelevant to modern life. In an interesting turn, the pageant organizers refused whites any parts, including those of white settlers. If whites could stage plays and dress up as Indians, they reasoned, then Indians could dress up as whites in Indian plays.107

These pageants depict Indians not as passive victims but as active players in important historical events. In addition, these performances allowed elders to show children how things were done in the old days and to exhibit their skills in horsemanship, traditional arts, and community organization. The Indian-authored pageants are the most historically accurate of those examined for this study. They are reenactments of actual events or traditions rather than social commentaries that
belatedly mythologize whites’ right to take over the Indian country. Except for the Lumbee pageant, these were not origin stories. The western Indians already had origin stories that placed them in the landscape. More important to them was remembering the historical events that led to their current disenfranchised status. In the case of the Lumbee pageant, the Indians used the pageant to legitimate their own identity as citizens of Pembroke County, North Carolina, and to assert their legal status as Indians.

A pageant written and performed in the Métis community of Pembina, North Dakota, in the late 1950s provides a notably different perspective. The author and most performers in this pageant were of mixed French-Indian or Scots-Indian ancestry. Here the story begins with the French-Canadian explorer La Verendrye entering the stage to the sound of an Indian drum. He, his men, and Indians, both men and women, pantomime their first meeting and subsequent trading. One of the Frenchmen leaves and returns with his French Canadian bride, the first white woman in the region. The Indian women welcome her warmly and all dance to Indian drums and French tunes. Soon the Scotsman Thomas Douglas enters and establishes the colony of Selkirk, a Métis trading community that would evolve into Pembina and surrounding hamlets. Girls in Scotch and Irish costume dance as the narrator notes that “the Scotch, the Irish, the French, the Swiss, and the Indians intermarried; a new type of people developed.” The pageant continues on this theme, bringing in Germans, Icelanders, and Scandinavians, all living peaceably together and contributing to the ethnic mix of the community. In one scene an Indian woman offers a piece of Indian bread to a little Swedish girl, who accepts it after reciting a Swedish table grace. In the finale, Miss North Dakota joins the cast to the strains of the North Dakota hymn. Here we see Indians neither as primitives nor as adversaries, nor as strictly historical figures, but as equal and important members of the larger community.

THE DECLINE OF HISTORICAL PAGEANTS

By 2000, the population of Custer had slowly increased to 1,860, of which 96 percent were white, 1.6 percent were Indian, and 1.5 percent were listed mixed-race Indian and white. The town had 825 households, including 492 with children under the age of eighteen. Of 1,502 people over the age of sixteen, approximately 62 percent were in the labor force, including 59 percent of females aged sixteen and older. Only 2.2 percent of the population age sixteen and older was listed as unemployed in 2000. Falling below the federal poverty level in 1999 were thirty-four families (6.7 percent of the population). By 2000 all houses had complete plumbing facilities, although twenty-six still lacked telephone service.

Ironically, it is the qualities that early-twentieth-century reformers sought to inculcate in the western towns that have hastened the decline of many of the historical pageants. The Pageant of Paha Sapa had its last performance in 2000. Interest in participation had dwindled, especially among adults, and audiences shrank to almost nothing. Several factors led to the abandonment of the pageant. First, increasing numbers of teens and preteens were working at wage jobs during the summer, leaving them little time for pageant practices and performances. Second, a new generation of business owners had come in from the outside, often as franchisees of national hotel and fast-food chains. They existed largely outside the traditional “booster” class and had little stake in allowing their employees time off to participate in community activities. The local economy had become more strongly tied to the national economy and shared in its prosperity. The 1990 and 2000 census data show a poverty rate in Custer County about the same as that of the United States as a whole. Third, local and tourist interest in long historical productions declined. While many small towns continue to stage gunfights in the early evening to lure tourists to their downtown shops, these performances are very brief. In the age of television and video games, vacationers simply seem
not to have the attention span to sit through a two- or three-hour amateur performance. Tourists opt instead to sit in air-conditioned comfort at a hillbilly music show or a water ski show and seem not the least bothered by the generic nature of such entertainments. Fourth, those who kept the pageant going in its later years tended to be those who had performed in it as children and wished to give their own sons and daughters the same opportunity. But managing and participating in the event no longer held particular status in the community. It was no longer tied to membership in the Women’s Civic Club or any other class-based organization. The Women’s Civic Club, faced with declining membership, turned the pageant over to the local Chamber of Commerce in 1958. The women who took over production of the pageant did not gain social status in producing the pageant as their mothers’ and grandmothers’ generations had done. Most of them had less leisure time to devote to producing the pageant than had the previous generation. The teenagers chosen for important roles were selected more for availability than talent, and the status of these roles diminished as well. Organizers simplified the choreography so that the dances required less ability and practice. Lastly, both children and adults increasingly took their social cues from mass media. Teenagers in particular were more likely to be ashamed than proud of their town’s quaint aspects. With no web of community boosters to promote the pageant, it slipped into obscurity.

Strikingly, the class, gender, and race boundaries that once characterized the Pageant of Paha Sapa broke down as participation dwindled. Men participated as trees and members of the Living Flag, both formerly the exclusive purview of women. Little girls played animals and gold trolls alongside little boys. Participation began to hinge more on children’s desire to participate than the adults’ insistence they do so to keep up the parents’ standing in the community. Adults participated more out of a sense of tradition and nostalgia than from the misplaced notion that the pageant would bring streams of well-moneyed tourists to town. Today’s Pageant of Paha Sapa would require a Fourth Episode, one in which the stalwarts of community—church, home, and family—are replaced by something exemplifying the uniformity of American society, perhaps a Dance of the Cellular Phones, or a Living TV Screen. Having created an origin story to justify and solidify its existence, and to place its class, race, and gender divisions in an idealized light, the community has abandoned its mythical history in an era of worldwide social homogenization. In this sense, the original mission of the pageant movement to promote social cohesion and a sense of belonging to the larger society has become obsolete not through social reform efforts, but through the commercialism the original pageant proponents denounced.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The informed criticisms of editor Chuck Braithwaite and two anonymous reviewers are gratefully acknowledged. Karen Ducheneaux Nitzschke provided a copy of the 1868 Fort Laramie Treaty Centennial pageant scripts and related her experiences as a participant in the 1851 Treaty pageant. Jessie Sundstrom provided useful information on Custer history and local attitudes toward the Pageant of Paha Sapa. Julien Wiley commented helpfully on drafts of the paper. Nancy O. Lurie brought to my attention Ella Deloria’s participation in the pageant movement. I took part in the Pageant of Paha Sapa from the ages of three through eighteen, in the roles of sunbeam, star, rosebud, crocus, bluebell, sweet pea, tiger lily, shooting star, dawn maiden, wind, and rain, with a few later appearances as a pine tree. I thank the pageant ladies who worked hard to create a production of which their community could be proud.

NOTES

2. Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 71-79.
13. Halsey, Historical Pageant, 321; Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 4-5.
15. Regarding the popularity of the American historical pageant movement, see news notes in the Mississippi Valley Historical Review; Moore, “Making a Spectacle,” 89; Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 113, 231; Baltz, “Pageantry and Mural Painting.” Pageants initiated at midcentury include the highly allegorical Cavalcade of Wisconsin (Ethel Theodora Rockwell, A Century of Progress: Cavalcade of Wisconsin, A Pageant Drama Based on Research in Wisconsin History [Madison: Wisconsin State Centennial Committee, 1948]) and most of the Indian-authored pageants discussed later in this paper.
18. Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 14.
25. The agreement that took the Black Hills out of Indian ownership and control was famously declared invalid in a 1980 Supreme Court ruling; however, the proposed remedy was monetary compensation for mineral resources taken from the Black Hills rather than return of the land itself (United States v. Sioux Nation of Indians, 448 U.S. 371 [1980]). The tribes have thus far refused to accept payment. The escrow account now stands at around $700 million.
26. Sundstrom, Custer County History, 100.
27. Halsey, Historical Pageant, 323; Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry.
28. Scripts and programs for the Pageant of Paha Sapa and related clipping file, 1881 Courthouse Museum archives, Custer, SD.
29. This play, “The Hanging of Fly-Specked Billy,” was written and produced by a local citizen, Carl Wiehe, who employed local teenagers and young adults to play the various parts. Wiehe’s theater consisted of bleachers and a set depicting the frontier town of Custer in a vacant lot with an enclosure made to resemble a stockade. Before the play and at intermission, Lakota Sioux dancers from nearby reservations performed traditional dances.
31. For a discussion of British uses of female figures in allegorical depictions of colonies and indigenous peoples, see Dominic David Alessio,


33. The use of women to represent “unmolested nature” is seen in other pageants, such as the Centennial Pageant of Brockington, Massachusetts (Suzanne Cary Gruver, The Book of the Pageant of Brockington [City of Brockington, MA, 1921]).

34. Sundstrom, Custer County History, 32.

35. For the theme of white women as victims of Indian attacks in this period, see Sarah Carter, Capturing Women: The Manipulation of Cultural Imagery in Canada’s Prairie West (Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1997).


37. Sundstrom, Custer County History.

38. Pageant of Paha Sapa clipping file, 1881 Courthouse Museum archives, Custer, SD.

39. In the Black Hills, the Ku Klux Klan largely focused on anti-Catholic activities; the organization was active from 1922 to 1927. See Charles Rambow, “The Ku Klux Klan in the 1920s: A Concentration on the Black Hills,” South Dakota History 4 (Winter 1973): 63-81. Interestingly, the KKK representatives and the Catholic Altar Society both appeared in the 1927 Pageant of Paha Sapa, although the Knights of Columbus did not participate.

40. For Indian attitudes on performing for white audiences, see Philip J. Deloria, Playing Indian (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1998).


43. Halsey, Historical Pageant, 332; Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry 114; Nicholas, “Wyoming as America,” 442; Deloria, Playing Indian, 132-36.

44. Virginia Tanner quoted in Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 114.

45. Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 178.

46. Deloria, Playing Indian, 132.

47. Gaul, “Discordant Notes.”


54. Hine, Community on the American Frontier, 149.


56. Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 39.

57. Halsey, Historical Pageant, 332; Moore, “Making a Spectacle,” 90.

58. Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 136. A notable exception was the Woman Suffrage pageant, which portrayed women in various career roles (Moore, “Making a Spectacle”).


60. Carter, Capturing Women, 205.


63. See Glenda Riley, “Proving Up”; Katherine Harris, “Homesteading in Northeastern Colorado, 1873-1920: Sex Roles and Women’s Experience,” in

64. Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 139.
65. Family histories included in Sundstrom's Custer County History show that a substantial majority of women worked outside the home or managing ranches throughout the community's history. Occupations mentioned include teacher, minister or missionary, nurse, nanny, tailor or seamstress, weaver, store owner-operator, mica processor, store clerk, and musician. One family made it through their first winter in Custer (1896) by the father and three daughters panning for gold (p. 400).


69. The 1960 census lists 600 houses in the town of Custer as lacking indoor toilets; these include 26 “sound” units and 140 “deteriorating.” It is not clear whether summer homes were included; however, the vast majority of occupied houses in the town were occupied year-round.


71. Schell, History of South Dakota.

75. Hanson and Durand, Pageant of Dakota-Land, 10.
76. Hanson and Durand, Pageant of Dakota-Land, 17.
77. Hanson and Durand, Pageant of Dakota-Land, 20.
78. For example, the Brockington, MA, Centennial Pageant (Gruver, Book of the Pageant of Brockington); the Southampton, Long Island, pageant (Halsey, Historical Pageant, 326), the Thetford, MA, pageant (Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 84); the Saratoga, NY, Why America Is Free pageant (Halloran, “Text and Experience,” 10); and several Wyoming pageants (Nicholas, “Wyoming as America,” 442).


82. Hine, Community on the American Frontier, 73.
83. Those seeking additional insight into the attitudes of the prospectors will note that many of the mines that these men quickly exhausted and abandoned were given female names: the Alice, Coletta, Daisy, Esmerelda, Etta, Fannie, Flora E., Gentle Annie, Hester A., Isadorah, Katie, Lucy, Maggie, Mary, Pansy, Queen, Ruby Belle, Silver Queen, and Winnie F., to name just a few successful claims (Black Hills Mineral Atlas, South Dakota, Part I, Bureau of Mines Information Circular 7688, Bureau of Mines Staff, Region 5, U.S. Department of the Interior, 1954).
85. For the pervasiveness of these white stereotypes of Indians, see Deloria, Playing Indian, and Berghofer, White Man's Indian.
86. Examples are the 1948 Cavalcade of Wisconsin (Rockwell, Century of Progress), the 1921 Brockton, MA, Centennial Pageant, (Gruver, Book of the Pageant of Brockington); the Southampton, Long Island, pageant (Halsey, Historical Pageant, 326), the Thetford, MA, pageant (Glassberg, American Historical Pageantry, 84); the Wisconsin Tercentennial pageant (Louise Phelps Kellogg, Under Three Flags: Wisconsin Tercentennial, 1634-1934 [Madison: State of Wisconsin, 1934]).
88. Chicago Association of Commerce, “Festival Play.”
89. For the protection of white women’s virtue as justifying the subjugation of Indians, see Carter, Capturing Women.
90. Chicago Association of Commerce, “Festival Play.”
91. Anonymous, “Kansas Historical Pageant.”
102. Frank Ducheneaux, 1868 Fort Laramie Treaty Pageant, manuscript from Frank Ducheneaux papers, Ducheneaux Memorial Chapel, Cheyenne River Indian Reservation, South Dakota; Karen Ducheneaux Nitschke, personal communication, 2004.
104. Linenthal, “Ritual Drama.”
106. For a description of the Lumbee pageant, see Appalachian State University manuscripts finding guide, available at http://linux.library.appstate.edu/lumbee<8<DELO001.htm.
108. Historical pageant script, 28, Henrietta Pat Christopher Papers, University of North Dakota Library archives division, Pembina County.
109. It is likely that Indians were undercounted, because many families were enumerated on the reservations where they were enrolled to maintain their eligibility for various kinds of aid.
110. Ironically, some residual status obtains for those who had participated in the pageant in the years before its decline, as those people still tend to be selected as marshals for a parade that forms another part of the town celebration.