

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)

Libraries at University of Nebraska-Lincoln

2021

Evaluation of Resources, Services and Systems of TEVTA College Libraries in Punjab

Ayub Aslam

University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan, ayubi143@gmail.com

Arslan Sheikh

COMSATS University Islamabad, Islamabad, Pakistan., arslan_sheikh@comsats.edu.pk

Shamshad Ahmed

University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac>



Part of the [Library and Information Science Commons](#)

Aslam, Ayub; Sheikh, Arslan; and Ahmed, Shamshad, "Evaluation of Resources, Services and Systems of TEVTA College Libraries in Punjab" (2021). *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 5508.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/5508>

Evaluation of Resources, Services and Systems of TEVTA College Libraries in Punjab

Abstract

Purpose

This study aims to evaluate the resources, services and system of TEVTA libraries in the Punjab. A total of 40 libraries are established in TEVTA colleges in Punjab. In order to evaluate these libraries, their physical, information resources, services, systems and staff was main considerations of this study.

Methodology

This study was quantitative in nature; therefore, to achieve the objectives of this study a self-structured questionnaire was designed and distributed among the respondents. The data were collected from the librarians through an online questionnaire designed in Google forms. The collected data was analyzed through SPSS software version 21.

Findings

The findings of this study reveal that a majority of the TEVTA college libraries are really lacking in physical resources, information resources, technology, staff, funding and infrastructure. The libraries have limited printed collections which are mostly out dated. While the services which depend upon efficient resources are also not up to the mark. A vast majority of the libraries are operating manually and some of which are run by non-professional staff. A vast majority of these libraries are really lacking in computers, printed journals, magazines, eBooks collection, internet, Wi-Fi, access to E databases and HEC digital library. Moreover, insufficient library staff, unavailability of professional librarians and less attention of the higher management towards libraries are some major problems faced by the TEVTA libraries.

Conclusions

This study concludes that the overall condition of TEVTA college libraries is poor. A majority of the libraries are lacking in infrastructure facilities, information communication technology, information resources and services, staff and funding. Therefore, it is highly recommended that higher authorities should pay attention towards libraries. They should properly finance TEVTA libraries so that they may better manage and enhance their services and resources.

Introduction

A well-established library is a necessary part in all academic institutions. This study evaluated the resources, services and systems of libraries existing in government colleges of Technologies (GCTs) working under TEVTA. There are nearly 40 GCTs in Punjab. This study intended to investigate the status of physical resources including general facilities and infrastructure, information resources, human resources library systems or library software's, library services and problems which nowadays the librarians face in their libraries. In oxford dictionary evaluation meaning is making of a judgment about the amount, number, value of something; assessment. Song, Yang, Zhou, Wan & Wu (2016) defined that library evaluation is a comprehensive process to measure library resources for an institution accreditation, effectiveness, excellence for learning. He further defined as library evaluation is the continuous practice of evaluating library services, resources, library hall and other spaces to determine the impact of library. The term evaluation gives similar meanings to assessment as to judge, or to assess something in order to its needs and qualities. Evaluation research can assess the value and effectiveness of library resources and services. Though many studies have focused on evaluation of resources and services yet the present study is unique as it

provides an in-depth analysis of resources, services provided in the libraries of government colleges working under TEVTA in Punjab. It is, therefore fills a research gap by bringing to the fore front the issues concerned.

Statement of the problem

There are a range of factors regarding growing concerns that threaten the sustainability of libraries. Therefore, the evaluation of libraries is an inevitable process for their survival. Evaluation determines the quality of resources, services, and general facilities that an organization/department offers to its prospective users. One of the most important reasons of library evaluation is to judge its services. The purpose of evaluation is to identify the homogenous issues and problems. In light of these problems and issues a compressive framework for reshaping the library services can be designed. A comprehensive literature on evaluation of libraries has been published in the world especially in developed regions e.g. Europe, America and Australia etc. Some studies have also been conducted on evaluation of different types of libraries in Pakistan such as special, medical, law, academic, and public libraries. However, the literature lacks regarding the evaluation of the library services and resources in TEVTA sector. Therefore, there is a need to assess the library resources and services of the colleges in TEVTA. This study is an effort to fill this gap in the literature.

Objectives

The objectives of this study were as follows.

- To evaluate the physical resources of TEVTA libraries.
- To identify the status of information resources of TEVTA libraries.
- To identify the status of digital and online resources of TEVTA libraries.
- To know the status of available library services of TEVTA libraries.
- To identify the application of library systems or softwares in TEVTA libraries.
- To identify those problems that library professionals are facing in their libraries.
- To make recommendations for improvement in TEVTA libraries.

Review of Literature

Definitions and Concepts of Library Evaluation

In Cambridge dictionary the term “evaluation” means that to judge or calculate the quality, importance, amount or value of something. The word evaluation gives alike meanings as assessment, analysis, or examination. Library evaluation is executed mostly by the Librarian, researcher or by the evaluation committee constituted by the institute. Ameen (2010) stated that there is several national and international literatures define long discussions on evaluation, assessment, outcome or accountability of library resources and services. The word evaluation is more famous in American literature and assessment in the British. It is obvious that all types of services are subject to evaluation due to massive amount of money consumed on resources. Lakos and Phipps (2004) described that library evaluation is undertaken by librarian to know the user’s needs, in order to improve library facilities or services and resources. In libraries successful library evaluation is rely on the existence of a 'regular routine of assessment' in the library. All library staff must be joined in the assessment process and to improve customer service.

Tian and Zhang (2018) expressed the concept of input-output efficiency for library evaluation in order to achieve library efficiency. The authors applied the concept of library efficiency. They used mathematical model to evaluate the library. The authors analyzed library circulation, interlibrary loan, user access, reference, document delivery. The authors

found that this method of research focuses on the efficiency of library under different situations, and discussed more about improving the micro management of library.

Hemmat (2016) conducted a study for evaluating the quality of libraries in Hamadan University of Medical Sciences. They applied descriptive and cross-sectional study. The researchers assessed that the service activities in libraries of Hamadan University of Medical Sciences, is in the process of improvement. However they suggested that these libraries should take effective actions for management of human resources, employee assessment and improvement of their effective performance. Aforo and Antwi (2012) carried a research to evaluate the performance appraisal system in the KNUST and GIMPA libraries in Ghana. The objective in the study was to examine the procedure and transparency of the library performance. The authors identified that for evaluation of libraries; there must be focus on physical resources and services as well as motivations, promotion, study leave, and commendation to library staff for better library systems. The authors revealed that performance appraisal systems in the study were satisfactory however there were some flaws which could be improved. The authors recommended that professional trainings, job description or working manual should be included in the process of evaluation. The authors revealed that majority of the staff did not find enough motivation and feedback on their performance yet they were expected to perform better.

Evaluation of Physical Resources of Library

The purpose of evaluation of physical and information resources is to examine that whether relevant information material is available for users to access with ease with evaluation of services means whatsoever facilities libraries can provide to their users or visitors according to their tacit and non needs and personal needs. The evaluation of libraries includes the evaluation of book collection, services, facilities, skills of professional staff, and user's perceptions about the library.

Ogbuyi and Okpe (2013) assessed users' satisfaction about resources and services of four private university libraries in South West Nigeria Babcock University, Covenant University, Lead City University, and Redeemer University. The purposes were to assess the degree of the usage of university library resources and services. The authors found that the users were satisfied with the library resources. However users showed their grave concern regarding the services provided by the libraries. This study recommended that funds should be made available regularly to the library for better provision of resources and services to users.

Nkamnebe, Udem and Nkamnebe (2014) evaluated the use and accessibility of resources in the Paul University Library. They found that users were satisfied with the services and facilities provided in the library. Further, the results of the study showed that students use library in their exams period more as compared with normal routine. They recommended that library should organize orientations and exhibitions programs for the students. They emphasized on the inclusion of a course work regarding library usage in the university curriculum to attract students.

Sunday, John, and Tijjani (2019) conducted a study on Niger State Library Complex in Minna. The objectives of study were to assess the physical condition of the library building and opinion of the staff on the condition of the library. They identified that many users are not fully satisfied with the library services and library staff required trainings to improve the services for the users. They found that that there are no current books for use in the library. The users complained that the library is not equipped with new technology like internet services, and sometimes the staff closes the library complex before the official closing time.

Evaluation of Information Resources in Library

Sohail and Ahmad (2017) carried out a study to examine the information resources to fulfill the needs of their library users. He analyzed that from circulation and information services in both online and off-line manner. The found the results of providing library services such as, SDI, CAS, DDS, reference services required to be improved.

White and Haddow (2018) presented a mixed methods study. They emphasized to maximize funding to ensure that the material in collections match particular needs of their library's users. They found that libraries could not avail various expensive information resources to meet the user's needs due to financial stringencies and low budget allocated for libraries. They concluded that systematic approach for collection assessment is imperative. They applied both quantitative and qualitative techniques for data collection due to diversity of items in collection.

Tanwar and Kumar (2019) emphasized in his study that it is essential for the management to assess and determine the exact nature of user's demand. The author asserted that results of the study can help the librarian for acquisition of resources and provide deep insights for collection development policy of library. This study also laid emphasize on collection evaluation in relation to goals and objectives of library.

Deepa, Bhattacharya, Ganguly and Goswami (2019) the researchers evaluated print as well as electronic resources of TERI's Library and Information Centre (LIC). The objectives of the study were to increase maximum benefits provided in the library for users within minimum costs or budget by the management of the quality of the library resources. The authors analyzed the library resources, access, costs, and, subject area coverage, and frequency of use, citations, direct and indirect benefits to users. They found that 85 percent of book collections and 63.5 percent of journals were found to be useful for the researchers. They recommended that books and journals which were not in use identified for weeding to optimize library space for new library collections.

Evaluation of Library Services

Sheikh (2014) evaluated the library services of COMSATS institute of information technology library with the perspective of the users. His findings were quite in favor of the library staff, as the CIIT library was not deficient in quality of library services and users were satisfied with various aspects of library services.

Mokhtar, Shaifuddin, Yu, Saman and Baba (2018) carried out a study that showed the importance of measurement and evaluation practice within the perspective of library services. They investigated the user's views toward library facilities and services and showed the results that measurement and evaluation help the libraries to construct strategic planning for library. They recommended that the results of evaluation of their study can be used as good proof for altering the current library services for the benefits of users.

Tenopir, Mays, and Kaufman (2010) the author determined the value of a library's services. They suggested that libraries must demonstrate their value in measurable ways that are meaningful to funders and administrators. He identified that measuring the value of services and products helps librarians make decisions to deliver best services their users. The results of this study showed that there is a great need for similar assessment and value calculations for various areas of the library. He revealed that in reality, most libraries will not have the time or resources to do comprehensive evaluations regularly.

Khan, Khan and Hassan (2017) explored the service status of special academic libraries of Southern Punjab, Pakistan. The authors emphasized that the development of the library and its services must be evaluated from time to time in order to bring continuous improvement and qualitative change in the overall functioning of the libraries. The authors collected data through questionnaire survey from library users of special academic libraries; distributed 160 questionnaires were in the different institutes of Southern Punjab. The return

response rate was 75%. They revealed that library users are not satisfied with library services e.g. reading material, circulation, reference and e-services. They also found that libraries of Southern Punjab are facing many problems. They recommended continuous measurements of libraries is essential for better library services from the institutes, provision of e-library services and hiring of qualified and trained library staff.

Status of the Use and Application of Library Software

Vijayakumar and Sheshadri (2019) carried out a research on the application of artificial intelligence and computer technology that enhance quality of library services and resource management. They investigated that application of new technological and modern systems help to perform the different library activities such as people's records, budget, collection development, scheduling etc. They identified that applications and systems are useful for user services, such as ready references and information storage & retrieval services. They also identified the usefulness of application of artificial components in library services acquisition, classification and cataloging, indexing of periodicals, online public access catalogue (OPAC) that helps the librarians to evaluate the library collections and improve the quality of library services.

Adetunji and Oladokun (2019) examined the library systems at Lead City University, Ibadan in their study. The authors analyzed the major use and problems of library software in order to manage information resources. Majority of the respondents indicated that library is their major source of information. They also identified that few respondents were not allowed to use services such as internet access and online databases that could enrich their learning. They suggested there should develop right policies and structures to deliver library services to students in a fast and easily accessible manner by the help of library new systems.

Lau (2018) assessed the library and applied various assessment tools to evaluate library services and programs. The author applied various surveys to measure or evaluates library services such as such as Google Analytics, LibAnalytics, LibQUAL, Qualtrics, SurveyMonkey, and OCLC Sustainable Collection Services for assessments. The researcher suggested training programs, literacy workshops, increasing study spaces in library, reducing noise, revising the library website, adjusting the collection service policy, upgrading and purchasing more equipment and seats, increasing funding to add more titles and access tools, and improving communication with the faculty and students and to evaluating user perceptions and needs. However the results of this study showed that respondents expressed their dissatisfaction over the inadequate access to study rooms.

The authors suggested that the management should grant incentives for librarian to enhance their skills encourage the librarians to participate in activities apart from their routine tasks. The management and staff must involve assessment activities so that they can understand the library user's demands when doing research.

Digital Resources Evaluation of Digital Services of Libraries

Sinha and Kumar (2012) described the evaluation of e-resources, their types and features in their study. The authors identified the e-resources. They revealed that e-resources are easily accessible to users and also revealed the significance of e-resources in libraries and concluded that evolution e-resources electronic resources help the librarian to provide latest information as required by library users so they emphasized that evaluation of e-resources is one of the important tasks of the librarian. They revealed that e-resources in library bring positive changes in the library resources and its services and save the time of the user in searching required documents among the books, journals. Consortia have reduced the cost of subscribing materials e-resources within limited budgets.

Tripathi and Jeevan (2011) stated in their study to evaluate using criteria, facilities and services provided by digital libraries in India. They assessed the library, computers, and digital services. They identified that improving their features, retrieval efficiency and usability. They revealed that most of the libraries are making a good effort, constantly trying to improve the facilities however that are facing restrictions. They suggested improving their library digital resources which was not so adequate. The authors also suggested that institutions should be fully aware of the open access to enhance the institution's growth.

Behera and Singh (2011) analyzed acquisition, retrieval and storage of collections in digital libraries. The authors analyzed reproduction, medium, multiplication, manipulation, transmutation and usage of collection in digital libraries. They identified that librarian focus less on selection criteria of resources, content of information and copyright issues standards, creation of metadata, provision of browsing and searching. They found that the unavailability of content is increasingly becoming a problem for digital libraries and types of content such as text, audio, video, pictures, and file formats were not managed adequately. The authors revealed that several issues related to storage capacity and access is still in infancy. They emphasized that availability of digital resources requires leadership, planning, and expertise in the field. They also revealed that evaluation of digital libraries is difficult task as compare to traditional libraries

Asghar and Shafique (2012) conducted a research of service evaluation in special libraries of Bahawalpur. The aim of the study was to know the status of resources, services and staff in the Quaid-e-Azam Medical College library (QMC), Government College of Technology library (GCT) & University College of Engineering & Technology library (UCET) at Bahawalpur. This was a comparative study in its nature. She revealed that evaluation of library enables the better acquisition resources of resources.

Research Methodology

The methodology of this study was quantitative in nature. A questionnaire was designed for the data collection and distributed among the target population in electronic and printed form. The questionnaire was designed after consulting the previous research studies and in consultation with the supervisor. Data was collected by using a self-structured questionnaire. The subjects of this study were all male and female librarians to explore level of usefulness of resources and to explore the service quality of the college libraries of TEVTA in Punjab. All librarians working in GCTs in Punjab were the targeted population. The collected data from the survey was analyzed by using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences software (Version-21).

The population for this study included Govt. Colleges of Technology in the Punjab. Only the colleges in government sector which fall under TEVTA are the part of population in this study. The list of government colleges of Technology of TEVTA in Punjab was taken from official website of www.tevta.org.pk on 14.10.2020 and added in appendix of this study. There are 40 libraries in the colleges in Punjab in TEVTA at the time of data collection. Most of the questionnaires were filled out by the respondents through online Google Survey Forms. A few participants were unfamiliar with the Google forms, so they were called and data was collected through mobile phone calls. The collective number of respondents (response rate) was 40 (100 %). The researcher sent repeated reminders to the respondents which produced good effects on response rate. The respondents were reminded repeatedly through phone calls and WhatsApp to get their response.

For data collection a questionnaire was used as to instrument in this study. The researcher went through related literature to create the tool. This research tool was consisted of nine sections; first one section consisted of demographic information; second section consisted of questions about physical resources of libraries, third section discussed the

information resources, fourth section digital resources of libraries, fifth section library services and section six library systems or software's, section seven human resources, section eight problems faced by the librarians and last section consisted on suggestion from respondents. Five point Likert scale was also developed in this questionnaire. Last one was open ended question for the descriptive data collection was given at the end.

Results, Data Analysis and Discussion

Respondents Demographics

The first section of the questionnaire was consisted of the respondents' demographic information and six questions were incorporated in it. Table 1 demonstrates the breakdown of the characteristics of individual respondents.

Table 1

Respondents by Gender

Gender	Frequency	Percent
Male	31	77.5
Female	9	22.5
Total	40	100.0

Table 1 shows the frequency distribution of participants by gender that forty librarians participated in the survey. Males were in majority with the margin, i.e. (31, 77.5%), while females participants were (9, 22.5%). It was also found in the survey that the technology colleges for women mostly have female librarians.

Table 2

Qualification of respondents

Max Qualification	Frequency	Percent
BLIS/MLIS/BS	22	55
MPhil(Library Science)	4	10
PhD(Library Science	0	0
Degree other than LIS	14	35.0
Total	40	100.0

Table 2 depicts that the majority of the respondents were MLIS, 22 (55%), while MPhil in library science respondents were only 4 (10%) and there was no PhD in library was found. The result revealed that majority of librarians working are MLIS master in library and information science. On the other hand the 14 (35%) employees in colleges who are given additional charge of library they were not library professionals but running library.

Table 3*Respondents by age group*

Age	Frequency	Percent
21-30 Years	9	22.5
31-40 Years	8	20.0
41-50 Years	16	40.0
51-60 Years	7	17.5
Total	40	100.0

Table 3 describes the respondent's level of age was also incorporated in the survey. The division of respondents in above Table by age groups demonstrates that the majority of the respondents were from the age group 41-50 which were 16 (40%). 9 (22.5%) falls in the age group of up to 20 years while the age group of 31-40 years was 8(20%). Respondents by age group 51-60 were 7(17.5%).

Table 4*Experience of Respondent*

Experience	Frequency	Percent
1-10 Years	17	42.5
11-20 Years	11	27.5
21-30 Years	7	17.5
31 and Above	5	12.5
Total	40	100.0

In the above Table 4 the respondents were asked about their experience as a librarian. The analysis describes that respondent's experience as librarian 1-10 years was (42.5%) in majority and experience group 1-10 is the lowest experience. The librarians who have experience more than ten years but less than twenty years are 11(17.5%). Whereas the level of highest experience more than 30 years found lowest response 5(12.5%).

Table 5*Professional status*

Status	Frequency	Percent
Professional Librarian	20	50
Non Professional	6	15
Additional Charge of Library	14	35.0
Total	40	100.0

In the above Table 5 the questions were asked in order to know whether there is professional librarian or non-professional staff in the libraries of TEVTA colleges. The results showed that little more than half percentage of the library staff was professional working in GCT libraries. Non-professional is 6 (15 %) while college teaching staff who were given additional

charge of library was 14 (35%). If we combine non-professional staff and additional incharges of libraries it will be almost equal to professional librarians. In other words if professional librarians are 20 in TEVTA colleges 50% colleges are deprived from professional librarians.

Physical Resources

The second part of the study was designed to evaluate physical resources of libraries in colleges of TEVTA. Ten questions were asked to the respondents in this section of the study. In study physical resources included building, infrastructure and general interior facilities which were provided to libraries.

Table 6

Separate building available for library in your college

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	31	77.5
No	9	22.5
Total	40	100.0

In the above Table 6 question was asked whether there is separate building for library in college. From 40 respondents 31 (77.5) stated that there is separate building in the college for library and 9 (22.5) respondents reported that there is no separate building for library.

Table 7

The furniture available in your library is adequate

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	30	75.0
No	10	25.0
Total	40	100.0

According to the analysis showed in above Table 7 that 30 (75 %) libraries had adequate library furniture, 10 (25%) libraries had not adequate library furniture, or the condition of library furniture is poor.

Table 8

Discussion rooms are available in the library

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	21	52.5
No	19	47.5
Total	40	100.0

In Table 8 questionnaire the question statement “discussion rooms are available” in the library for students was asked. Table 2.3 represents that 19 (47.5%) colleges did not have discussion room in the library while 21 (52.5%) had discussion room in library for the students.

Table 9*Adequate printed books are available in the library for students*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	35	87.5
No	5	12.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 9 shows that there are 35 (87.5) libraries from 40 which have adequate printed books in the library for students. While there were also 5(12.5) libraries in TEVTA colleges that contained no adequate printed books or the books are not adequate.

Table 10*Current library building is adequate to accommodate the users*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	29	72.5
No	11	27.5
Total	40	100.0

In the above Table 10 that shows the collected data by respondents that there were 29(72.5%) libraries able to accommodate the users in library hall users while 11(27.5%) libraries have not sufficient space to accommodate the users in the library.

Table 11*Library is air conditioned*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	12	30.0
No	28	70.0
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 11 describes that there were only 12(30%) TEVTA colleges that have air conditioned libraries. But majority of colleges libraries 28(70%) were not provided the air condition facilities for student and staff.

Table 12*Security system installed to avoid theft of library material*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	6	15
No	34	85.0
Total	40	100.0

According to above Table 12 the data analysis shows that majority of libraries in TEVTA were not facilitated to security system to avoid theft of library material. The result shows that

only 6(15%) libraries availed the security system to secure library books and other assets whereas 34 (85%) are not required to be installed a security system to avoid the theft and loss of resources.

Table 13

Electronic databases of books and journals are available

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	21	52.5
No	19	47.5
Total	40	100.0

The Table 13 revealed that more than half 21(52.5%) of colleges libraries were providing the electronic databases of books and journals to students and 19(47.5%) participants responded non-availability of electronic databases.

Table 14

Electricity back up is available for power failure

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	23	57.5
No	17	42.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 14 shows that 23(57.5 %) libraries were provided backup for electricity in case of power failure to continue library activities. While 17(42.5%) libraries were not provided electricity backup in case of electricity load shedding.

Information Resources

Information resources are most important resources in the library for users. Without information resources no library can provide the services thus the main objective of any library could be to possess the information resources. As the information resources are important evaluation of information resources is also important. This section consisted on all the information resources including printed and non-books, serials, magazines, journals and newspapers etc. The numbers of available information resources in libraries were analyzed in this section of the study

Table 15

Number of books

	Frequency	Percent
1-2000	9	22.5
2001-5000	8	20.0
5001-10000	10	25.0
10001-20000 and Above	13	32.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 15 shows that there were 9(22.5%) libraries which have maximum 2000 number of books and 8(20%) libraries consisted of 2001 to 5000 maximum books. The libraries which have 5001 to 10000 number of books are 10 (25%). Majority of libraries having books from 10001 to 20000 and above were 13(32.5). it is concluded that 13 libraries possess maximum books. As above stats 27(67%) libraries could not avail books more than 10000. The research objectives to evaluate the library's collection but more appropriately mere increase in number of books are not meant. The quality, currency, relevancy and format is also

Library collection

The section of library collection includes books

Table 16

Number of EBooks

	Frequency	Percent
1-2000	10	25
2001-5000	6	15
5001-10000	0	0
10001-20000 and Above	0	0
Total	40	100.0

The table-16 describes that 10 (.25%) libraries have stored only 1-2000 EBooks. And there were only 6 (15%) libraries had collection 2001-5000 EBooks in their libraries. While no library have EBooks more than 5000. However, there was no library that could have EBooks more than 10000 in numbers.

Table 17

Number of Journals available

	Frequency	Percent
None	35	87.5
1-2	4	10
3-5	1	2.5
6-9	0	0
10-12	0	0
More than 12	0	0
Total	40	100.0

The table 17 shows that more than third forth of total libraries were not providing any journal for the students. Whereas 4(10%) libraries were providing 1-2 journals. 1 (2.5%) libraries had subscribed 3-5 journals and minimum 2(5%) No library was providing more than five journals.

Table 18*Number of Magazines available*

	Frequency	Percent
None	35	35
1-2	05	12.5
3-5	0	0
6-9	0	5
10-12	0	5
More than 12	0	7.5
Total	40	100.0

The Table 18 shows that 35(87.5%) of total libraries had not provided any magazine for the students. Whereas only 5 (12.5%) libraries were providing only 1-2 magazines.

Table 19*Number of Urdu Newspapers available*

	Frequency	Percent
None	05	12.5
1-2	35	87.5
3-5	0	0
6-9	0	0
10-12	0	0
More than 12	0	0
Total	40	100.0

The above table 19 describes that 5(8 %) libraries didn't provide any newspapers at all. While Majority of libraries 35(87.5%) were providing 1-2 Urdu newspapers in library. 10 (25%) No libraries were providing more than 2 Urdu newspapers.

Table 20*Number of English Newspapers available*

	Frequency	Percent
None	05	12.0
1-2	35	87.5
3-5	0	0
6-9	0	0
10-12	0	0
More than 12	0	0
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 20 describes that 5(12.5 %) libraries didn't provide any English newspapers at all. While Majority of libraries 35(87.5%) were providing 1-2 English newspapers in library. No library was providing more than 2 English newspapers.

Digital Equipment

The equipment is also meant for evaluation in the study.

Table 21

Computers are available in library for students

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	13	32.5
No	27	67.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 21 shows that there were 27(67.5%) libraries that have computers. Whereas 13(32%) libraries were not provided any computer for users.

Table 22

Wired Internet facility is available

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	20	50
No	20	50
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 22 shows that there were 20(50%) libraries that have the facility of internet in the library. Out of forty there were 13(32.5%) libraries were not provided internet facilities in the library.

Table 23

Wi-Fi facility is available

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	10	25.0
No	30	75.0
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 23 shows that only 10(25%) libraries were attaining the WIFI facility in the library premises. But 30 (75%) libraries were not provided internet in the library.

Table 24

E-databases are available

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	8	20
No	32	80

Total	40	100.0
-------	----	-------

The above Table 24 shows that only 8(20%) libraries were having E-database in the library while 32(80%) libraries didn't have any E-database in the library.

Table 25

HEC digital library is accessible

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	4	10
No	36	90
	19	47.5
	40	100.0

The above Table 25 shows that only 4(10%) people have out total 40(100%) were interested to access digital library of HEC. HEC library a good source of information for students depends on devices and internet services provided in the library. The above analysis shows that there were only 4 colleges in TEVTA which initiated HEC digital library accessible in the library. While majority of college libraries have no access to HEC digital library.

Table 26

Books in PDF format are available

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	16	40
No	24	60
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 26 demonstrates that there were only 16(40%) libraries have collected PDF books availability on the hand 24 colleges did not collect the PDF books for students in library.

Table 27

(CDs) material is available

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	12	30
No	32	70
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 27 describes that there were 12(30%) libraries in colleges that were providing CDs as a source of information to their students. While 32 libraries didn't provide CDs material in the library.

Table 28*Other necessary equipment e.g., scanner, printers etc. are available*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	26	65
No	14	35
Total	40	100.0

In the above Table 28 The questions were also asked except than information resources in order to evaluate libraries in all respects. The above table shows that there 26(65%) libraries that have necessary equipment's like scanner printer. On the other hand there were also 14(35%) libraries that had not the basic equipment in the libraries to continue routine works.

Table 29*Security measures e.g. RFID is installed*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	1	2.5
No	39	97.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 29 shows that there was only one library that had installed RIFD in library to secure the information and other resources from theft. While on the other hand 39% libraries RFID is proven technology that allows for item identification in addition to item security.

Table 30*Library Services*

Rank	Library Services	Mean	Std. Dev.
1	Reference services	3.80	.823
2	Circulation of books	3.73	.751
3	Providing photocopy/ printing services	3.65	.921
4	Book bank services are available for library users	3.58	1.152
5	Documents scanning services	3.53	.987
6	Electronic Document Delivery services	3.43	1.010
7	Providing Selective Dissemination of Information services	3.30	.992
8	Providing Current Awareness Services (CAS)	3.28	1.132
9	Bibliographic services	3.20	.966
10	Online Public Access Catalogue (OPAC) services	3.15	1.189
11	Information literacy /orientation	3.13	1.042
12	Resource sharing with other libraries	3.13	1.114
13	Indexing and abstracting	2.98	1.074

14	Providing inter library loan (ILL) services	2.93	1.185
----	---	------	-------

Scale: 1=Strongly disagree, 2=Disagree, 3=Neutral, 4=Agree, 5=Strongly agree

The data given in Table 30 shows that Reference services provided in the library highest score (mean = 3.80) was ranked first. While “circulation of books” as library services” was ranked as 2nd with mean 3.73 on the basis of respondents’ data about books issue and return in libraries. It is clear from the above analysis that reference services by different libraries are better and highest as compared to other means of other library services. The services of photocopy/printing and document scanning services provided by libraries with means exceeding 3 as compared in the analysis. In the above table the both the means book bank services and CAS services and is also exceeded 3 as showed in the data analysis. As compare to all the means ILL services means (2.93) found lowed. The data given in above Table ranked 9th shows that “bibliographic services” was ranked as 3rd with mean 3.20 on the basis of respondents’ perceptions about bibliographic services. OPAC as library services was on 7th rank shows means (3.15) is less than means of Electronic Document Delivery Services (3.43) and SDI services (3.30). Indexing and abstracting services was (mean = 2.98) shows that librarians need to improve this services in the library.

Automation of the library

In the study the question whether your library is automated or not was asked the main objective of this question was to know the categorically the status of library.

Table 31

Your library is automated

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	12	30.0
No	28	70.0
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 31 shows that there were less than half 12(30%) respondents’ responded report that they had automation of the library and 28 (70%) libraries had not automation of the library they had been running the libraries with manual practices.

Table 32

Which software is implemented?

Library Software	Frequency	Percent
None	28	70
LIMS	7	17
Insignia	0	0
Virtua VTLS	1	2.5
Koha	2	5
WINISIS	1	2.5

Any other	1	2.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 32 shows that there were 28(70%) libraries that had not implemented any software in their libraries. Majority of libraries were working with manual practice in the libraries of TEVTA colleges. Only 7 colleges have implemented LIMS software out of 12 libraries. When the question was asked by respondents about the use of library software response showed that no library was using Insignia whereas Virtua VTLS and Koha were implemented by 1(2.5%) libraries. The category of use of any other software except mentioned in the survey was also included the response was 1(2.5%).

Problems which librarians are facing

For evaluation of libraries the questions were added in order to assess the physical, information resources. To make the holistic evaluation the section 7 is about the problems which librarians were facing relating to libraries and about themselves was also added to achieve the objectives of research. The questions related to library professional, available staff, financial support were asked in the survey

Table 33

A single library professional is able to run the whole library

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	17	42.5
No	23	57.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 33 showed that less than half number of librarians 17 (42.5%) responded that only a single library professional is sufficient to run a library. Majority of librarians 23(57.5%) were agreed that a library cannot be managed properly by a single librarian.

Table 34

Para Professional staff or Library clerk is also working with professional librarian

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	19	47.5
No	21	52.5
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 34 showed the frequency of librarians who responded for the availability of supporting staff in library. The results showed that only 19 librarian with less than fifty (47%) were provided Para professional staff or clerk is provided in the library to assist library professional in library activities. But more than 20(52%) librarians replied that were not provided any supporting staff in the library they were managing the library solely.

Table 35*Library supporting staff e.g. attendant are available*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	27	67.5
No	13	32.5
Total	40	100.0

In the above Table 35 the questions were asked to know the availability of the library staff provided in the library. The result shows that 27 (67%) respondents replied that there were provided attendants in library, while 13 (32.5%) libraries had no provision of attendant.

Table 36*Does your library have appropriate funds?*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	12	30.0
No	28	70.0
Total	40	100.0

The Table 36 shows that the question was asked to the respondents that government providing appropriate funds libraries. They provided the information that government doesn't provide any funds or grants for libraries separately. Sometimes, college's heads use pupil fund for purchasing of books for libraries.

Table 37*Does your college administration easily fulfill demands of different items needed for library?*

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	16	40.0
No	24	60.0
Total	40	100.0

The above Table 37 shows that there were only 16(40%) librarians who agreed that college administration easily fulfill demands of different items needed for the library. While 24(60%) responded that they were not provided basic items for library to continue library activities.

Table 38*Problems faced by librarians*

Rank	Statement	Mean	Std. Dev.
1.	Lack of write-off policy for library collection	3.70	1.091
2.	Discriminatory behavior on part of higher authorities with the college librarian	3.55	1.061
3.	Lack of financial resources	3.55	1.085
4.	Lack of human resources	3.45	1.085
5.	Lack of information resources	3.43	1.083
6.	Lack of appropriate building for the library	3.03	1.271
7.	Inactive college library committee and its inadequate support to the library	3.43	.984

Scale: 1=Strongly disagree, 2=Disagree, 3=Neutral, 4=Agree, 5=Strongly agree

In the above Table 38 question “lack of appropriate building for library was ranked first result showed lowest mean (3.03) as compare to the calculated means of other statements in the same table. The question on 2nd rank was “lack of human resources was asked the analysis of this statement showed mean (3.45) almost similar to the means of statements ranked 4th (3.43) and 5th (3.43). The statements of the questions second last and last analyzed found means respectively (3.55) and (3.70) higher as compared to other statements.

Discussion and Conclusions

This study disclosed that many college libraries of TEVTA have their own building. However in the newly established colleges the libraries are situated at the upper portion of the college main building. Almost all the libraries possess adequate furniture but it has become old and needs repair/replacement. Respondents said that according to the administration point of view, library furniture is provided only once at the time of college establishment. In old colleges the library furniture is very poor and broken. In new colleges although the furniture is new but quality is very poor. It is found that maximum college libraries possess books in print form. Few libraries are struggling to follow latest digital or virtual trends in the libraries. It was also identified that a majority of libraries especially newly established libraries are able to accommodate maximum users. However few libraries which are not able to accommodate the users only provide the circulation services.

Air-conditions has become the basic demand of every library user all over the world. While the data collected from the respondents shows that almost all college libraries are not equipped with ACs facility. Libraries are also lacking in application of technologies, like RFID technology is not implemented in all TEVTA libraries. Not a single library is availing the facility of appropriate back up of power. All the libraries in TEVTA colleges at least have good number of books, however, only few libraries possess EBooks collection. A majority of the libraries do not subscribe to printed journals, and magazines, however, the newspapers for the students and staffs are available in Urdu and English languages.

It is very disappointing that a majority of the libraries are deprived of even a single computer. In many colleges the facility of Internet and Wi-Fi services is not available. First, it was identified that most of the librarians are not provided computers and internet facility so they were unable to automate libraries. Secondly, from authorities there is no initiative to

automate libraries. Library automation is optional choice for librarian. Auditors prefer to inspect manual handwritten documents. In most of the TEVTA college libraries only one librarian is alone responsible to manage the whole library. Various types of activities are performed by librarians. Single librarian deals more than 500 students strength. It was also reported that librarian is not only alone managing whole library but also performing other extra duties assigned to him by the administration.

It was also disclosed that English newspaper is subscribed by the libraries due to the instruction of accreditation authorities in order to increase proficiency of users in English. The printers were not available in library. It is inscribed in TEVTA rules to provide Para professional staff or library clerk to work with professional librarian in the library. But in real practices no such posts are advertised or recruited. While to manage library is team work, too many duties can only be performed if many staff work together. However in some post of librarians were advertised recently but were cancelled later due to unknown reasons. Hence many libraries are being managed by teaching staff. The evaluation of libraries shows that professional librarian is an integral part of library but in many college libraries in TEVTA the non-professional staff was working in place of the professional librarians.

There is no regular annual budget for libraries. It is common once the resources and books are provided at the tile of library establishment again no budget for maintenance and repairing is provided. It is disappointing that administrations hardly bother to comply with the basic demands of librarians. Many requisitions are just delayed due to lack of interest of the administration. It is very embarrassing situation that more than half of staff is non-professional and nonqualified in libraries. Majority of libraries are run by the teaching staff that is incapable of managing library operations in a proper manner.

National progress is contingent on education and research and libraries are mainly responsible to provide quick access to information to all masses of the community. It is a fact that the libraries with better resources and service can better facilitate their users. Although, projects to evaluate the services and resources have undergone by library scholars to uplift the services of different categories of libraries yet, the area of resources and services of GCTs libraries was an un-touched. Therefore, the researchers choose this research topic. This study concludes that the overall condition of TEVTA college libraries is poor. A majority of the libraries are lacking in infrastructure facilities, technology, information resources services, staff and funding. It is highly recommended that higher authorities should pay proper attention towards libraries. They should properly finance TEVTA libraries so that they may better manage and enhance their services and resources. Moreover, the job structure and promotions procedure of TEVTA librarians also need proper concentration of the higher authorities.

Recommendations

The following recommendations have been derived from the findings of this study.

- It is recommended that there should be allocation of funds for purchase of computers, printers, scanners and other ICT related accessories for libraries.
- The facility of uninterruptible power backup in shape of, UPS, generators, or battery storage systems should be provided in all TEVTA libraries.
- Remaining vacant seats of library staffs should be filled in order to achieve maximum output from libraries.
- Regular renovation of library buildings, repairing of furniture and other infrastructure must be made on regular bases.
- Implementation of air conditioning system in TEVTA libraries can increase their usability.

- Security is one of the major challenges being faced by the library professionals. Therefore, serious measures need to be taken to avoid the theft of library materials. The use of RFID reduces the amount of time required to perform circulation. RFID makes library smarter. This is latest technology to be used in libraries to avoid theft of materials.
- The EBooks make the learning process more interactive and engaging. EBooks have become more popular than printed books as that they are much more accessible. The comprehensive collection of EBooks is most probably the result of personal interest of librarians. So it is the duty of librarian to build a collection of EBooks.
- It is recommended that all libraries should acquire magazines and journals to fulfill the current information needs of users.
- Libraries must provide more newspapers to help the students to develop their daily reading habits. Students who learn by using newspapers become more active citizen as adults.
- Attendants must be deputed in all libraries to perform dusting of books, shelving and display of books, newspapers, arrangement of chairs, tables, opening and closing of library.
- Libraries should be equipped with Wi-Fi services in their premises.
- The TEVTA librarians should focus on the automation of their libraries.
- Access to the HEC National Digital Library should be provided in all TEVTA college libraries.

References

- Adetunji, A. O., & Oladokun, T. A. (2019). Evaluation of the availability and use of information resources and services by sandwich students: a case study of lead city university, Ibadan, Oyo state. Evaluation.
- Aforo, A. A., & Antwi, K. A. A. (2012). Evaluation of the performance appraisal systems in KNUST and GIMPA libraries. *E3 Journal of Business Management and Economics*, 3(8), 301-306.
- Ameen, K. (2010). The culture of collection evaluation in Pakistan. *Library Philosophy and Practice*. (e-journal). 455. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/455>
- Behera, J. K., & Singh, S. P. (2011). Problems and challenges of collection development of Indian libraries in Digital Era-An Assessment. *Researchers World*, 2(1), 133-143.
- Deepa, N., Bhattacharya, P. K., Ganguly, S., & Goswami, A. (2019). Qualitative and quantitative efficacy measurement of TERI library and information centre resources: A case study. *Library Management*.
- Hemmat, M. (2016). Quality evaluation of library services in Hamadan University of Medical Sciences based on European Foundation for quality management model (EFQM). *Journal of Health Administration*, 18(62), 52–63.
- Khan, A. M., Khan, N. M., & Hassan, M. U. (2017). Appraisal of Special Academic Libraries in Southern Punjab: A survey of users. *Pakistan Library & Information Science Journal*, 48(1).
- Lakos, A., & Phipps, S. E. (2004). Creating a culture of assessment: A catalyst for organizational change. *Portal: Libraries and the Academy*, 4(3), 345–361. doi:10.1353/pla.2004.0052
- Lau, C. C. S. (2018). Assessing and improving library services at Georgia Southern University. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, (e-journal). 1993. <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/1993>
- Mokhtar, W. N. H. W., Shaifuddin, N., Yu, H., Saman, W. S. W. M., & Baba, N. (2018). The importance of measurement and evaluation works in academic libraries. *International*

- Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 7(3), 363–377. doi:[10.6007/IJARPED/v7-i3/4373](https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v7-i3/4373)
- Nkamnebe, E. C., Udem, O. K., & Nkamnebe, C. B. (2014). Evaluation of the use of university library resources and services by the students of Paul University, Awka, Anambra State, Nigeria. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, (e-journal). 1147. <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/1147>
- Ogbuiyi, S. U., & Okpe, I. J. (2013). Evaluation of library materials usage and services in private universities in Nigeria. *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*. Kuwait Chapter of the Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review, 2(8), 33–41. doi:[10.12816/0001225](https://doi.org/10.12816/0001225)
- Sheikh, A. (2014). Quality of CIIT library services and users' satisfaction: A survey of students, faculty and staff members. *Libri*, 64(1). doi:[10.1515/libri-2014-0005](https://doi.org/10.1515/libri-2014-0005)
- Sinha, P., & Kumar, M. (2012). Internet literacy skills and internet usage patterns to access e-resources by Assam university library users: an evaluative study. *Sinha, Manoj Kumar*, 010-026.
- Sohail, M., & Ahmad, S. (2017). Use of electronic resources and services by faculty members and students of Fiji National University. *DESIDOC Journal of Library and Information Technology*, 37(3), 165–171. doi:[10.14429/djlit.37.3.10567](https://doi.org/10.14429/djlit.37.3.10567)
- Sunday, John, & Tijjani. (2019). Evaluation of maintenance of Niger state library complex Minna, Nigeria. *International Journal of Research in Advanced Engineering and Technology*.
- Tanwar, S., Tyagi, S., & Kumar, N. (Eds.). (2019). *Multimedia big data computing for IoT applications: Concepts, paradigms and solutions*, 163. Berlin: Springer.
- Tenopir, C., Mays, R. N., & Kaufman, P. (2010). *Lib Value: Measuring value and return on investment of academic libraries*. Available at https://trace.tennessee.edu/utk_infosciepubs/50/
- Tian, L. Z., & Zhang, A. C. (2018, April). A review on studies of library efficiency evaluation by using DEA method. In *International Conference on Education Reform and Management Science (ERMS 2018), 2018* (pp. 213–220). Atlantis Press.
- Tripathi, M., & Jeevan, V. K. J. (2011). An evaluation of digital libraries and institutional repositories in India. *Journal of Academic Librarianship*, 37(6), 543–545. doi:[10.1016/j.acalib.2011.08.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acalib.2011.08.012)
- Vijayakumar, S., & Sheshadri, K. N. (2019). Applications of artificial intelligence in academic libraries. *International Journal on Computer Science and Engineering*, 7, 2347–2693.
- White, H., & Haddow, G. (2018). User-focused mixed methods approaches to assess collection. *IFLA Proceedings*.
- Song, J., Yang, F., Zhou, Y., Wan, S., & Wu, H. R. (2016). QoE evaluation of multimedia services based on audiovisual quality and user interest. *IEEE Transactions on Multimedia*, 18(3), 444-457.