1983

Miocene Burrows of Extinct Bear Dogs: Indication of Early Denning Behavior of Large Mammalian Carnivores

Robert M. Hunt Jr.

University of Nebraska-Lincoln, rhunt2@unl.edu

Xue Xiang-Xu

Northwestern University

Joshua Kaufman

Nebraska State Museum

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/geosciencefacpub>

Part of the [Earth Sciences Commons](#)

Hunt, Robert M. Jr.; Xiang-Xu, Xue; and Kaufman, Joshua, "Miocene Burrows of Extinct Bear Dogs: Indication of Early Denning Behavior of Large Mammalian Carnivores" (1983). *Papers in the Earth and Atmospheric Sciences*. 541.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/geosciencefacpub/541>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Department of at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Papers in the Earth and Atmospheric Sciences by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

Miocene Burrows of Extinct Bear Dogs: Indication of Early Denning Behavior of Large Mammalian Carnivores

Abstract. *Partial skeletons of four species of extinct carnivores have been found in their dens excavated in the floodplain of an early Miocene ephemeral braided stream at Agate Fossil Beds National Monument, Nebraska. Bear dogs (Carnivora: Amphicyonidae) were the principal occupants; their den dimensions and body size are similar to those of living wolves and hyenas. Discovery of this predator community extends the record of denning behavior of large mammalian carnivores to the early Miocene, 20 million years ago.*

Relatively complete fossil skeletons of mammals preserved directly in their ancient environment provide insight into mammalian paleoecology. We report the discovery of a 20-million-year-old den complex (1) with partial skeletons of four species of extinct Miocene Carnivora. The remains, found in burrow fills over 30 m² in the floodplain of an early Miocene ephemeral stream, are an unusual occurrence in the fossil record (2).

The discovery extends the age of denning behavior of large terrestrial Carnivora to the early Miocene. It also indicates that amphicyonid carnivores (the dominant mid-Cenozoic land Carnivora) used dens and that denning was within the capability of many if not all amphicyonids, since species from two widely divergent lineages were found in separate dens (3). Furthermore, the skeletons in the den complex suggest that the dens were used in protection and care of the young and as shelter for adults; to our knowledge they provide the only evidence known in the Tertiary fossil record for the occupation of a den by a succession of carnivore species. The Agate den complex represents one of the oldest known burrow systems (4).

The history of this ancient predator community can be reconstructed from the size and form of the burrows, the ages of the carnivores (established by the degree of eruption and wear on teeth), the condition of the skeletons, and the nature of sediment fill. The form and large size of the burrows, similar to burrows of living large canids and hyaenids, suggest their construction or remodeling by the largest terrestrial carnivores of the early Miocene, the amphicyonids or bear dogs. The bear dogs found in the dens resemble wolves in size and certain skeletal features, but are not closely related. The bear dog *Daphoenodon superbus* is represented by at least six or seven individuals, and a rare temnocyonine bear dog by one skeleton. A juvenile, a mature adult, and at least three old individuals of *Daphoenodon* can be identified from dental evidence. Skeletal features indicate that the remains of one or

two other individuals, which are not represented by teeth, are adults. Although old individuals possibly died in the dens through normal attrition, the deaths of the juvenile and young adults in the burrows must have been premature and probably sudden. The partial disarticulation of all skeletons in the burrows and bite marks on some bones show that there was sufficient time for decomposition and scavenging of carcasses to take place before sediment burial.

In addition to bear dogs, the dens contained remains of small canid and mustelid carnivores. Because simultaneous occupation of a den by more than one species is uncommon among living Carnivora, the presence of more than one kind of fossil carnivore in these dens suggests they were used by a succession of species, that the smaller carnivores were occasional prey of the larger bear dogs, or both. However, the presence of only a few herbivore bone fragments within the burrows indicates that prey carcasses were infrequently taken into the dens, thus the small carnivores were probably den occupants.

The dens (Fig. 1) occur in an area 5 by 6 m in quarry 3 on Beardog Hill, Agate Fossil Beds National Monument, Nebraska. Carnivores burrowed into a stream channel fill of tuffaceous white fine-grained sandstone (Upper Harrison beds, Arikaree Group). Only 150 to 300 m north of the dens, this same sandstone contains the dense bone deposits of early Miocene rhinoceros, chalicotheres, and entelodont, which were found at the national monument early in this century (5, 6). Thus the dens must postdate deposition of the principal Agate bone bed. The time that elapsed between formation of the great bone bed and the dens was probably brief in the perspective of geologic time, since fragments of the same carnivore species found in the dens have also been found in the bone bed (6, 7). These carnivores have short temporal ranges of at most a few million years. We suspect that the dens were emplaced only weeks to a few years after the Agate bone bed was deposited.

Den dimensions approximate those of wolves, coyotes, and hyenas today (8). Den 1 (Fig. 1) contained two nearly complete skeletons of the bear dog *Daphoenodon superbis*, an adult female and juvenile male (9). The den has slightly inclined (burrow A) and nearly vertical (burrow B) entrance tunnels about 70 cm apart that lead down about 1 m to a pit that probably once contained the main den chamber (10). The entrance tunnels are preserved in vertical section (Fig. 2); slope erosion had removed part of these and the other burrows at the site, revealing burrow walls and internal sandy fill. As preserved, internal diameters of burrow A range from 15 to 46 cm, and from 30 to 66 cm for burrow B. Burrow B ascends into a 70-cm thick paleosol, but no surface opening has been identified.

Den 2, slightly more than a meter from den 1, contained the partial skeleton of a temnocyonine bear dog that was scattered through a laminated fine sand which fills the northeast end of the den. The bones, mostly disarticulated, occur through a vertical distance of 45 cm. Leading southwest from the skeleton is a passageway (burrow C) 2 m long that appears to have been continuous with the burrow housing the carnivore. The passageway, which is exposed in a nearly horizontal section by slope erosion, has a maximum diameter of 80 to 90 cm at the northeast end, narrowing to 40 cm, and ending in a terminal lobe about 50 cm wide, much like lobes seen in coyote burrows (8). The burrow floor is gently inclined to the southwest about 15 cm/m.

Den 3, less than a meter from den 2, is the least defined of the burrow systems; it includes a partial skeleton of an aged *Daphoenodon superbis* that is scattered at one level in 0.5 m² of burrow fill, and a passageway (burrow D) 30 to 55 cm in diameter exposed in horizontal section and apparently pointing toward the *Daphoenodon* skeleton. Whether the laminated fine-grained sandy fill surrounding the aged bear dog was in continuity with the fill of burrow D is not certain, since the intervening area has been recently eroded.

The sedimentary infill of all burrows is primarily a soft uncemented gray tuffaceous silty sand, frequently thinly laminated in layers about 1 mm thick that conform to the contours of the burrow. The gray burrow fill contrasts in tone with the white stream channel sandstone that forms the burrow walls. In burrows A and C, the thin laminae are grouped in sets; the direction of inclination of these sets indicates that the den filled progres-

sively by sediment influx through the burrow mouth. In burrow B, 10- to 20-cm-thick layers of homogeneous fine sand are separated by a 25-cm-thick rubble of poorly sorted sand and subangular sand pebbles, suggesting rapid fill-

ing, with breakdown and incorporation of part of the burrow wall. Although we are not able to determine the exact amount of time required for infilling, the nature of syngenetic sedimentary structures shows that the process was episod-

Fig. 1. Plan map of early Miocene carnivore dens, quarry 3, Agate Fossil Beds National Monument, Nebraska. Stipple pattern indicates Miocene burrow fill of fine-grained sand that also surrounds bear dog skeletons. Dashed lines indicate den boundaries as of July 1982 (dens 2 and 3) or where a boundary is uncertain (Peterson's den 1). Excavation grid is in square meters.

Fig. 2. Den 1 burrows (Fig. 1) of extinct bear dog *Daphoenodon* exposed in vertical Miocene sandstone cliff. (A) Burrow A; (B) burrow B; (C) presumed location of Peterson's den chamber; and (D) early Miocene paleosol. Hammer length, 28 cm.

continuous; yet the general homogeneity of the infill suggests that we are not dealing with much time, perhaps weeks to a few years.

Four species of carnivores, represented by about 11 individuals, have been found in the three dens: the bear dog *Daphoenodon superbus*, the unnamed temnocyonine bear dog, a small canid *Phlaocyon annectens*, and the mustelid *Paroligobunis simplicidens*. Two species of bear dogs were found by us in place in the burrows: the aged *Daphoenodon* in den 3 and the adult temnocyonine in den 2. Because of the proximity of these dens to an early Miocene braided stream (11), flooding of the burrows is the most likely cause of death of younger animals.

In summary, this unusual site appears to represent a den complex of early Miocene amphicyonid, canid, and mustelid carnivores that was developed during an unknown time interval in the channel floodplain of a wide, shallow, ephemeral stream which was subject to intense periodic floods, probably seasonal in nature. *Daphoenodon* was the principal occupant of the dens, but other bear dogs, canids, and mustelids used them for shelter, and *Daphoenodon* females probably used the dens to care for their young. Before the den complex was buried by stream sediments, floodwaters may have drowned juvenile and young adult bear dogs (including a mother-cub pair) in their dens. The carcasses decomposed in the burrows and were disturbed by scavengers and additional floods. As shifting episodic streamflow resulted in channel migration over the dens, ash-rich sediment gradually filled the burrows, thereby preserving a remarkable association of young, mature, and aged extinct Carnivora.

ROBERT M. HUNT, JR.
Department of Geology, University of
Nebraska, Lincoln 68588

XUE XIANG-XU
Department of Geology, Northwestern
University, Xian, Shaanxi, China

JOSHUA KAUFMAN
Nebraska State Museum,
Lincoln 68588

References and Notes

1. The age of the den complex is determined from two volcanic tuffs, Sioux County, Nebraska: (i) Agate Ash, about 10 m stratigraphically below the dens and main Agate bone bed, 21.3 million years, KA sample 481 [J. Evernden *et al.*, *Am. J. Sci.* **262**, 145 (1964)]; (ii) Eagle Crag Ash [location: W½, NW¼, SW¼, SE¼, section 27, T.32N, R. 56W], either stratigraphically above or about the same level as the dens, dated at 19.2 ± 0.5 million years (1 standard deviation), fission track (zircon) by R.M.H.
2. E. Riggs [*Fieldiana Geol.* **8**, 59 (1942); *ibid.* **9**, 69 (1945)] reported finding partial skeletons of two small carnivores, each found separately in the burrows of fossorial rodents, early Miocene, Harrison Formation, Sioux County, Nebraska,

in 1906. They were not in burrows of their own making. R. J. Emry (personal communication) has discovered bones of two individuals of the small early Oligocene canid *Hesperocyon*, as well as bones of many smaller mammals, probably prey of the canid, in an early Oligocene burrow in Wyoming. He believes that the burrow was occupied by, but probably not excavated by, *Hesperocyon*.

3. See M. Voorhies, in *The Study of Trace Fossils*, R. Frey, Ed., (Springer-Verlag, New York, 1975), p. 336.
4. Older vertebrate burrows that contained resident fossil mammals are those of extinct fossorial rodents [O. Peterson, *Mem. Carnegie Mus.* **2**, 139 (1905)], early Miocene, Harrison Formation, Sioux County, Nebraska. These burrows preserved not only rodents but also two carnivores (2). Somewhat older Oligocene burrows (3) from the Brule Formation, Nebraska, did not contain mammal bones.
5. O. Peterson, *Ann. Carnegie Mus.* **3**, 487 (1906); *Mem. Carnegie Mus.* **4**, 41 (1909); *ibid.* **7**, 399 (1920); W. Holland and O. Peterson, *ibid.* **3**, 189 (1914).
6. R. Hunt, *Am. Mus. Novit.* **2506** (1972).
7. O. Peterson, *Mem. Carnegie Mus.* **4**, 206 (1910).
8. D. Mech, *The Wolf* (Univ. of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, 1970), p. 120; J. Grinnell *et al.*, *Fur-Bearing Mammals of California* (Univ. of California Press, Berkeley, 1937), vol. 2, pp. 509–511; H. Kruuk, *The Spotted Hyena* (Univ. of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1972), pp. 242–247.
9. On basis of development of living wolves (8), the juvenile den 1 *Daphoenodon* is 6 months to 1

year old, since its canines are in final eruption, and long bone epiphyses are still unfused. In wolves, permanent canines are about half erupted at 6 months; epiphyses fuse about 1 year from birth.

10. The adult and juvenile *Daphoenodon* were found in 1905 by O. Peterson [(7); *Ann. Carnegie Mus.* **4**, 51 (1907)], who discovered and named quarry 3 and reported from it three or four other individuals of *Daphoenodon*, a small canid, and mustelid. Despite the number of carnivores and the absence of herbivores, Peterson did not identify the site as a den complex. To determine why only carnivores were found, we relocated Peterson's original site. By screening topsoil at the most probable locality at Beardog Hill in September 1981, we found a proximal *Daphoenodon* tibia that fit a bone fragment collected by Peterson in 1905. In Fig. 1, quarry 3 could have been limited to meter squares B–D 5–6, an area of 6 m², where the bone fragment was found.
11. R. Vicars and J. Breyer, *J. Sed. Petrol.* **51**, 909 (1981).
12. We thank A. J. Banta, J. Rapier, R. Todd, and W. Taylor, National Park Service, for support and access to Agate sites; B. Van Valkenburgh for information on dens; A. Boucot, J. Fagerstrom, P. Freeman, B. Ratcliffe, M. Dawson, R. Tedford for manuscript review. Fieldwork funded by NSF grant INT-8117703 to R.M.H. and X.X. and by National Geographic Society funds to R.M.H.

* 7 October 1982; revised 20 December 1982