2018

Changes in CO2 during the Ocean Anoxic Event 1d indicate similarities to other carbon cycle perturbations

Jon D. Richey  
*Texas State University-San Marcos*

Garland R. Upchurch  
*Texas State University - San Marcos*

Isabel P. Montanez  
*University of California, Davis*

Barry H. Lomax  
*The University of Nottingham*

Marina B. Suarez  
*The University of Texas at San Antonio*

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/natrespapers

Part of the Natural Resources and Conservation Commons, Natural Resources Management and Policy Commons, and the Other Environmental Sciences Commons

https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/natrespapers/913

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Natural Resources, School of at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Papers in Natural Resources by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.
Changes in CO₂ during Ocean Anoxic Event 1d indicate similarities to other carbon cycle perturbations

Jon D. Richey a,*,1, Garland R. Upchurch a, Isabel P. Montañez b, Barry H. Lomax c, Marina B. Suarez d, Neil M.J. Crout e, R.M. Jokeckel e, Greg A. Ludvigson f, Jon J. Smith f

a Department of Biology, Texas State University, 601 University Dr., San Marcos, TX 78666, USA
b Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California, Davis, 1 Shields Ave., Davis, CA 95616, USA
c The School of Biosciences, Division of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences, The University of Nottingham, Sutton Bonington Campus, Sutton Bonington, Leicestershire, LE12 5RD, UK
d Department of Geological Sciences, The University of Texas at San Antonio, 1 UTSA Circle, San Antonio, TX 78249, USA
e Conservation and Survey Division, School of Natural Resources, Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, and University of Nebraska State Museum, The University of Nebraska-Lincoln, 3310 Holdrege St., Lincoln, NE 68583-0996, USA
f Kansas Geological Survey, The University of Kansas, 1930 Constant Ave., Lawrence, KS 66047, USA

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received 11 September 2017
Received in revised form 16 March 2018
Accepted 17 March 2018
Available online 5 April 2018

Editor: D. Vance

Keywords:
stomata
mid-Cretaceous pCO₂
Ocean Anoxic Event
carbon cycle perturbation
Lauraceae

ABSTRACT

Past greenhouse intervals of the Mesozoic were repeatedly punctuated by Ocean Anoxic Events (OAEs), major perturbations to the global carbon cycle and abrupt climate changes that may serve as relevant analogs for Earth’s greenhouse gas-forced climate future. The key to better understanding these transient climate disruptions and possible CO₂-forced tipping-points resides in high-resolution, precise, and accurate estimates of atmospheric CO₂ for individual OAEs. Here we present a high-temporal resolution, multi-proxy pCO₂ reconstruction for the onset of mid-Cretaceous (Albian–Cenomanian Boundary) OAE1d. Coupling of pCO₂ estimates with carbon isotopic compositions (δ¹³C) of charcoal, vitrain, and cuticle from the Rose Creek Pit (RCP), Nebraska, reveals complex phasing, including a lag between the well-documented negative δ¹³C excursion defining the onset of OAE1d and the CO₂ increase. This lag indicates that increased CO₂ or other C-based greenhouse gases may not have been the primary cause of the negative excursion. Our study reveals a pCO₂ increase within the interval of the negative δ¹³C excursion, reaching a maximum of up to ~840 ppm (95% confidence interval —307 ppm/+167 ppm) toward its end. The reconstructed magnitude of CO₂ increase (~357 ppm) is similar to that of Late Cretaceous OAE2 but of smaller magnitude than that of other major carbon cycle perturbations of the Mesozoic assessed via stomatal methods (e.g., the Toarcian OAE [TOAE], Triassic–Jurassic boundary event, Cretaceous–Paleogene Boundary event). Furthermore, our results indicate a possible shared causal or developmental mechanism with OAE1a and the TOAE.

© 2018 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Archives of the greenhouse climate system are punctuated by the sporadic occurrence of ocean anoxic events (OAEs) of regional to global extent (Schlanger and Jenkyns, 1976). OAEs were caused by increased organic preservation and/or productivity, leading to enhanced accumulation of marine organic matter as carbon-rich black shales (Jenkyns, 2010). The prevailing model for OAE initiation is CO₂-forced greenhouse warming due to volcanism (Barclay et al., 2010), methane hydrate release (Hesselbo et al., 2000), or thermogenic methane release (McElwain et al., 2005), coincident with changes in weathering and ocean circulation via feedbacks (Robinson et al., 2017). OAEs are further characterized by significant perturbations to the global carbon cycle recorded by ¹³C-enrichment of the marine and atmospheric carbon reservoirs reflecting high rates of burial of ¹²C-enriched organic carbon (Jenkyns, 2010). The positive C isotope excursions can be preceded by brief ¹²C-enrichment of the marine and atmospheric carbon reservoir, providing a chemostratigraphic signature of these events. Because the change in the atmospheric carbon reservoir is transferred to the carbon isotopic composition of plants as they assimilate atmospheric CO₂, these events are recorded in the δ¹³C of plants tissues and plant-dominated bulk
organic matter (Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006), allowing chemostratigraphic correlation to terrestrial sections that preserve individual OAEs. A potential complication to chemostratigraphic correlation is that the negative excursions can mask the OAE-defining positive excursion or themselves be masked by the positive excursion, which can lead to considerable variation in the isotopic expression of OAEs (Jenkyns, 2010). Because of these caveats, both stratigraphic and geochemical evidence is used to define and correlate OAEs.

OAE1d (the Breitstrofer Event, ~100.5 Ma) was originally defined as a regional sub-OAE, but its occurrence in the Atlantic, Tethys, and Pacific oceans argues for its inclusion in the list of global OAEs (Robinson et al., 2008; Wilson and Norris, 2001). This perturbation to the carbon cycle is archived in the δ¹³C records of planktonic foraminifera (δ¹³C_foram) (Wilson and Norris, 2001), bulk sediment/marine carbonate (Bornemann et al., 2017; Gambacorta et al., 2015; Petizzo et al., 2008; Robinson et al., 2008), terrestrial bulk organics (δ¹³C_ bulk), and fossil charcoal (δ¹³C-char) (Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006). Though considerable variability exists between δ¹³C curves for OAE1d, most records document a long-term positive δ¹³C excursion (~0.5–2‰) (Bornemann et al., 2017; Gambacorta et al., 2015; Petizzo et al., 2008; Robinson et al., 2008; Wilson and Norris, 2001). Moreover, a few OAE1d δ¹³C records reveal a short-term negative δ¹³C excursion (~0.5–3‰) at the onset of OAE1d and preceding the longer-term positive excursion (Bornemann et al., 2017; Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006; Robinson et al., 2008; Wilson and Norris, 2001). This short-term negative δ¹³C excursion has been interpreted as the release of ¹²C-enriched carbon. Similar to other OAE events of the Mesozoic and early Cenozoic, the long-term positive excursion of OAE1d is interpreted to record increased marine productivity and enhanced organic matter burial in response to global warming and the collapse of upper water stratification (Wilson and Norris, 2001). In contrast, there are Tethyan sections that show no evidence of organic-rich sediments or the carbon isotope excursion that normally characterizes OAE1d (Luciani et al., 2000).

Reconstructions of atmospheric pCO₂ during Mesozoic OAEs (Barclay et al., 2010; McElwain et al., 2005; Naafs et al., 2016) have focused on OAE2 (~93 Ma), OAE1a (~120 Ma) and the Taracuan OAE (TOAE; ~183 Ma), with no estimates for OAE1d. Estimating pCO₂ during past carbon cycle perturbations is essential to refining our understanding of anthropogenic climate change. In particular, if the input of CO₂ into the system can be estimated at a high temporal resolution for OAEs for which independent estimates of global temperature are available, then such studies have the potential to constrain climate sensitivity (i.e. the temperature rise resulting from a doubling of CO₂).

A well-recognized approach to reconstructing paleoatmospheric CO₂ is the inverse relationship between stomatal density (SD) and index (SI) and atmospheric CO₂ (Woodward, 1987). These empirical methods have been used extensively to reconstruct CO₂ levels in the Cretaceous (see compilation in Li et al., 2014). Stomatal density, however, can be greatly affected by environmental factors related to leaf size because SD expresses stomatal frequency in terms of leaf area (Lomax and Fraser, 2015). SI mitigates this limitation given that it expresses stomatal frequency as a percentage of total leaf cells. Despite this, SI-based CO₂ estimates are associated with considerable uncertainties (10s to 100s ppm) because they rely on species-specific transfer functions inferred from nearest living relatives (McElwain et al., 2005).

Given the possibility of functional differences between modern and fossil plants and, thus, differences in response to changing pCO₂, estimates are considered more reliable if the targeted fossil species are calibrated to extant members of the same species (i.e. so-called “living fossils”) (Lomax and Fraser, 2015). When this is not possible, estimates made using modern calibrations are considered “semi-quantitative”. Recently, Franks et al. (2014) introduced a mechanistic model based on the universal leaf gas-exchange relationship and carbon isotopic discrimination in fossil species to reconstruct atmospheric CO₂. This approach is independent of closest living relatives and, thus, CO₂ estimates are arguably unaffected by species-specific responses to environmental conditions.

Here we develop a multi-proxy CO₂ time-series for OAE1d that presents pCO₂ estimates for the onset of the event of higher temporal resolution than previously published OAE records. We apply existing empirical-based transfer functions in order to evaluate different calibrations used to translate stomatal index into pCO₂ estimates (Barclay et al., 2010; Kürschner et al., 2008), as well as apply newly collected stomatal characteristics and fossil cuticle δ¹³C values of Pandemophyllum kvacekii (Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990) to the recent mechanistic CO₂ model (Franks et al., 2014). We also use empirical estimates from three transfer functions to generate a consensus empirical pCO₂ curve and analyze all pCO₂ estimates (empirically- and mechanistically-derived) via LOESS analysis. The resulting consensus CO₂ record is compared to a newly integrated δ¹³C curve developed using charcoal, vitrinite, and cuticle and previously published δ¹³C values from RCP (Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006). Correlation of the new terrestrial-based record to marine δ¹⁸O and δ¹³C time series for OAE1d (Wilson and Norris, 2001) is used to provide new insight into the relationship between CO₂, climate, and marine carbon perturbation during OAE1d.

2. Geologic setting and chronologic constraints

The study site, Rose Creek Pit (RCP; Fig. 1), is an inactive clay pit that exposes fluvial-estuarine sediments deposited on the eastern margin of the Western Interior Seaway (Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006). Palynological analysis indicates the presence of the Albion–Cenomanian boundary (ACB) at RCP by the recovery of definitive Upper Albian palynomorphs (Disaltrianulisporites perplexus and Podocarpidites multesium) in the lower part of the section and Lower Cenomanian palynomorphs (Foveogleichenidites confessus and Artiopollis indivisus) towards the top (Fig. 2; Gröcke et al., 2006). Gröcke et al. (2006) correlated the RCP δ¹³Cbulk and δ¹³Cchar record to a marine δ¹³C_foram time series developed for Ocean Drilling Project (ODP) site 1052, Blake Nose, western Atlantic Ocean (Wilson and Norris, 2001). Using down-hole neutron porosity, the Blake Nose core was orbitally tuned, revealing ~19 and ~23 kyr precession cycle and a ~100 kyr eccentricity cycle signals, which they used to calculate a total duration for OAE1d of ~280 to 500 kyr (Gröcke et al., 2006; Wilson and Norris, 2001).

A ~0.5 to 3 million year (Myr) depositional hiatus occurs across the ACB at Rose Creek Pit, as indicated by the lack of the positive δ¹³C excursion observed in the δ¹³C_foram time series (Fig. 3a–b; Gröcke et al., 2006). The missing OAE1d positive δ¹³C excursion is confirmed at other proximal localities (Fig. 3b; Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008). The unconformity has been correlated to the Dakota Formation D₂ sequence boundary, interpreted to record a global regression at the ACB (Koch and Brenner, 2005). Gröcke et al. (2006) hypothesize that the sea level low-stand during OAE1d inferred from the marine record correlates with a well-developed paleosol at RCP (Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008).

RCP preserves an abundant record of plant macrofossils and dispersed cuticle of Lauraceae and other vascular plant families. The systematic affinities of the RCP angiosperm leaf and cuticle flora are well-established by a combined study of its foliar architecture and cuticular anatomy (Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990), permitting leaf macrofossil species to be recognized from fragmented dispersed cuticle. Dispersed cuticle at RCP is preserved in many of
the horizons of OAE1d, allowing us to evaluate changes in $p$CO$_2$ during that event.

3. Methods

3.1. Sampling

The RCP section was measured and bulk sediment samples were collected at 0.3 m intervals throughout ~9 m of exposed section (Figs. 1–2). Stratigraphically lower samples were collected from the same location in the pit as those of Gröcke et al. (2006), but due to weathering, samples above 4.5 m were collected from a laterally adjacent outcrop face. Because of this change in location (Fig. 1), the upper 2 m in this study shows some differences in facies thickness to the upper portion of the Gröcke et al. (2006) measured section (Fig. 2). Individual samples were restricted to a 2.5 cm thickness of sediment to provide a uniform sample thickness and minimize time-averaging of calculated CO$_2$ and $\delta^{13}$C estimates. For each sample, ~0.3 to 1 kg of sediment was placed in 10% hydrochloric acid (HCl) overnight, rinsed until a neutral pH was obtained, and covered with a saturated solution of sodium pyrophosphate and $\sim$10 ml of 30% hydrogen peroxide until fully disaggregated. Charcoal, vitrain, and cuticle were isolated by top sieving through a combination 500 and 90 μm mesh. All cuticle slides, bulk samples, and liquid-preserved residues are reposited at the Denver Museum of Nature and Science (DMNS locality 127).

3.2. Carbon isotope stratigraphy and analysis

Gymnosperm charcoal ($\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{gym}}$) and vitrain ($\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{vitr}}$) (black, glassy, coalified plant material; Fig. 3c) were combined with previously published $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{char}}$ and $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{bulk}}$ measurements (Gröcke and Joeckel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006; Fig. 3b) to build an integrated organic carbon isotope ($\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{org}}$) time series for RCP (Fig. 3d). Salinity, which can influence the $\delta^{13}$C signal of plants (Guy et al., 1980), is a particular concern at the RCP locality because of the...
documented marine influence (Retallack and Dilcher, 1981). Paleoenvironmental analysis of RCP indicates that while angiosperms grew in and around the depositional environment and, therefore, dominate the leaf flora (Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990), gymnosperms inhabited higher ground such as levees and the dry floodplains of the hinterland (Retallack and Dilcher, 1981). Because of this, we elected to use gymnosperm charcoal exclusively for this study given that gymnosperm wood, and therefore charcoal, were not exposed to the possible high salinity environment of RCP during growth, negating the potential influence on its $\delta^{13}$C signature.

Each charcoal sample was inspected under a stereomicroscope to separate gymnosperm and angiosperm charcoal. Sorting by type was not possible for vitrain because it does not preserve anatomy (Scott, 2010). The smallest fraction of gymnosperm charcoal and vitrain (~90 μm-sized fragments isolated via sieving) were concentrated and homogenized for analysis. This was done because it has been suggested that homogenized organic matter from a sufficiently large area (e.g. charcoal transported to the depositional environment of RCP, likely representing a watershed-sized area) represents a regional $\delta^{13}$C signal, dampening local environmental effects (Ando and Kakegawa, 2007), and so that the signal would not be dominated by a single large charcoal fragment. Charcoal and vitrain samples were placed in 3M HCl to remove carbonates and heated to 60 °C to remove pyrite (Robinson and Hesselbo, 2004). $\delta^{13}$C values were measured for isolated charcoal and vitrain at the University of Texas-San Antonio using a Costech Elemental Analyzer coupled with a continuous-flow isotope ratio on a ThermoFinnigan Delta + XP mass spectrometer. External precision, based on repeated analysis of standards, is ±0.1‰. The resulting RCP isotopic curve was correlated with existing $\delta^{13}$C records for RCP and nearby cores using stratigraphic position and correlation of distinct sedimentary markers (Fig. 2). In-line with earlier work, we have used the age model created by Wilson and Norris (2001) but adjusted all absolute ages to reflect the currently accepted age of the ACB of 100.5 Ma (Ogg et al., 2016).

Cuticle for isotopic analysis ($\delta^{13}$Ccut) was collected from the unmacerated cuticle that remained following stomatal analysis. Cuticle samples of the targeted species were rinsed in 3M HCl to

---

**Fig. 2.** Comparison of the section from Gröcke et al. (2006) and the composite section measured during this study. Gray brackets indicate stratigraphic features used to correlate between sections. Red line is inferred location of the Albian-Cenomanian Boundary in Gröcke et al. (2006). For the section from this study, the symbols are arranged to indicate the relative abundance of the features; stars indicate locations of geochemical (black) and cuticle samples (gray) for CO2 reconstruction. (Please refer to the web version of this article to view more detailed colorized figure(s).)
3.3. Paleo-CO$_2$ reconstruction

Dispersed cuticle was macerated, when necessary, in various combinations of 10% chromium trioxide, household bleach, and/or sodium pyrophosphate prior to mounting for stomatal analysis. The target species for generating paleo-CO$_2$ estimates was *Pandemophyllum kvacekii*, an early member of the family Lauraceae (Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990). This species is common throughout the section, locally abundant (up to 25% of cuticle isolated from individual samples), and easy to identify (Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990). Cuticle was photographed and analyzed to calculate SI ($= S/\left(15 + E\right)$ * 100; where $S$ is number of stomata and $E$ is the number of epidermal cells including guard cells) and SD ($= S/\left[\sqrt{S+E}\right]$). For SI, when possible, a target of 5000 counted cells was used, because this is the number of cells at which point variability in measurements stabilized. For each sample, an effort was made to isolate a single large cuticle fragment, such that 5000 cells could be counted from it, to completely minimize time-averaging of the pCO$_2$ signal. When this was not feasible, additional cuticles were measured until the 5000 cell quota was reached and the average of all *P. kvacekii* cuticles counted in each sampling interval was used.

*Pandemophyllum kvacekii* has a suite of specialized cuticular features found in Lauraceae, most notably brachyparacytic stomata with scale-shaped cuticular thickenings, and has venation comparable to that of the extant genera *Hypodaphnis* and *Eu-sideroxylon*, which have a basal position in molecular phylogenies of Lauraceae (Barclay et al., 2010; Chanderbali et al., 2011; Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990). Individual species within Lauraceae have been used to measure SI and estimate pCO$_2$ across the Cenomanian–Turonian Boundary (OAE2) (Barclay et al., 2010) and the Cretaceous–Paleogene Boundary (Steinhaardt et al., 2016), as well as for the Miocene (Kürschner et al., 2008). Published empirical transfer functions derived from modern and fossil Lauraceae species were used to estimate CO$_2$ concentrations from our SI data (Barclay et al., 2010; Kürschner et al., 2008). Kürschner et al. (2008) derived an equation to predict Miocene CO$_2$ by characterizing the stomatal response of herbarium specimens of *Laurus nobilis* and *Ocotea foetens* to modern changes in CO$_2$. Be-
cause their target species (extinct Laurophyllum pseudoprinceps) had no close modern equivalent, they cross-calibrated the stomatal response of that species with Miocene CO₂ levels inferred from three extant plant species, resulting in the following equation: CO₂ = −46.011 * SI + 993.37. No equation was derived to express error for the Kürschner et al. (2008) equation. Because of this, we calculated the error in estimates made using this method by inserting SI ±1 standard error of the mean into the equation.

Two additional transfer functions were defined by Barclay et al. (2010) using herbarium specimens of Hypodaphnis zenkeri and the L. nobilis data of Kürschner et al. (2008). For L. nobilis: CO₂ = (−168.39 * ln[SI]) + 790.93 and for H. zenkeri: CO₂ = (−27.447 * SI) + 559.67. Barclay et al. (2010) derived separate ±95% confidence interval (CI) equations to estimate the error in the statistical relationship between SI and CO₂ for modern species. For L. nobilis: −95% CI = (−9.3347 * SI) + 467.28 and +95% CI = (0.9177 * [SI]²) − (42.578 * SI) + 777.21. For H. zenkeri: −95% CI = (−10.279 * [SI]²) − (132.43 * SI) − 64.375 and +95% CI = (19.634) * [SI]²) − (4011.5 * SI) + 23418.

As previously mentioned, a limitation of the SI method of pCO₂ reconstruction is the species-specificity of the stomatal response to pCO₂ and the need to use closely related modern equivalents. This is not possible with the extinct target species P. kvacekii. In order to combat the “semi-quantitative” nature of these estimates, we built a consensus CO₂ curve based on all empirical estimates. To accomplish this, the CO₂ estimates obtained using the three transfer functions were resampled 10000 times from a distribution defined by the observed means and confidence intervals. The confidence intervals were skewed, especially for H. zenkeri, therefore a number of distributions were considered (including skew normal, gamma, and asymmetric Laplace, among others). Ultimately, an asymmetric double exponential distribution was used because it was found to give the best agreement between observed means and confidence intervals.

In addition, we assigned the individual curves quantitative statistical weights according to their position in the phylogeny of Lauraceae relative to that inferred for Pandemophyllum (Chanderbali et al., 2001). Extant species that nest well within the phylogeny of Lauraceae, high above the basal branches, were given the lowest weight because they are assumed to be the most anatomically and physiologically different from Pandemophyllum. Therefore, L. nobilis estimates were given the lowest statistical weight (0.15) because of that species’ position high in the phylogeny of Lauraceae (Chanderbali et al., 2001). Conversely, modern species that occupy a basal position within the phylogeny of extant Lauraceae phylogeny were given the highest weight because they are assumed to be more anatomically and physiologically similar to Pandemophyllum. Thus, H. zenkeri estimates were given the greatest statistical weight (0.6) (Chanderbali et al., 2001). L pseudoprinceps estimates were given an intermediate weight (0.25) because the transfer function is based on two modern genera of Lauraceae (L. nobilis and O. joetens) cross-calibrated with fossil genera and historical CO₂ concentrations (Kürschner et al., 2008). Even though the transfer function is based on two of the more derived species in the phylogeny of Lauraceae (Chanderbali et al., 2001), we think that the cross-calibration with historic CO₂ warrants its intermediate weighting.

More recently, Franks et al. (2014) introduced a mechanistic stomatal model for estimating paleo-CO₂ as an alternative to species-specific calibration curves. The model links the classic photosynthesis model (Farquhar et al., 1980) to anatomical and geochemical parameters that are readily recovered from the plant fossil record. Together, these parameters are used to derive estimates of plant performance due to optimization of plants to prevailing atmospheric CO₂. Stomatal size and number and the proportion of leaf area occupied by stomata are used to calculate maximum stomatal conductance (gₑ(max)) to CO₂, and thereby, operational stomatal conductance (taken as a fraction of gₑ(max)). This is combined with the other components of conductance (leaf boundary layer and mesophyll conductance) to give total operational conductance to CO₂ diffusion from the atmosphere to the site of carboxylation. Cuticle δ¹³C values are used as a proxy for leaf δ¹³C, given the negligible difference in their values from whole leaf tissue δ¹³C for most species (Royer and Hren, 2017), in order to estimate c₁/c₃ (the ratio of internal CO₂ to atmospheric CO₂) and, from this, determination of CO₂ drawdown and carbon fixation. These data are subsequently combined with the calculated assimilation rate (Aₑ) to estimate/calculcate atmospheric CO₂ via the following equation: Atmospheric CO₂ = Aₑ/(δₑ-carbon(11 − c₁/c₃)).

A sensitivity analysis of Franks et al. (2014) model by McElwain et al. (2016) indicates that the model is robust with respect to several important ecophysiologica/environmental parameters, but is particularly sensitive to the prescribed photosynthetic rate (McElwain et al., 2016). We parameterized the mechanistic model using measured stomatal traits and cuticle δ¹³C and a sensitivity analysis was carried out with a particular focus on A₀ (Tables s1 and s2). One set of CO₂ estimates was made using the prescribed A₀ (12) for woody angiosperms from Franks et al. (2014). A second set of CO₂ estimates was made following the methods outlined in McElwain et al. (2016). Using the vein density (Dᵥ) of P. kvacekii (8.78; Feild et al., 2011), we utilize the equation that describes the relationship between Dᵥ and gₑ(max) (gₑ(max) = 27.574(Dᵥ²) − 93.365(Dᵥ) + 512.84) and the scaling relationship between gₑ(max) to theoretical maximum assimilation rate (tAₑ(max)) for L. nobilis (tAₑ(max) = (4.25 logₑ(gₑ(max)) − 12.48) (McElwain et al., 2015) to calculate a P. kvacekii-specific A₀ of 19.48. Most likely, this value represents an overestimation of A₀, but the use of the prescribed value (12) and the calculated value of 19.48 represents the range of possible values.

All stomata-based pCO₂ estimates were combined with those derived using the mechanistic model to generate a consensus pCO₂ curve using a locally weighted polynomial regression (LOESS) program (PAST freeware: https://folk.uio.no/ohammer/past/). For this analysis, a 0.1 smoothing parameter was used to access the temporal variability in pCO₂ estimates.

4. Results

4.1. Geochemistry

Temporal variability in δ¹³Cₑ, δ¹³Cₑₑ, and δ¹³Cₑₑₑ observed in this study is congruent with previously published δ¹³Cₑₑ and δ¹³Cₑₑₑ curves for RCP and the surrounding area (Gröcke et al., 2006) (Fig. 3b-c). Average pre-excursion δ¹³C from δ¹³Cₑₑ and δ¹³Cₑₑₑ isolated across highway 15 from RCP (below −5 m; Fig. 1) is 7.02 ± 0.00‰ (Gröcke et al., 2006). Below the floor of the pit, δ¹³Cₑₑₑ drops to −25.2‰ in the 3 pt. moving average before rising back to pre-excision values seen below −5 m. Above the pit floor (0 m), the integrated δ¹³Cₑₑₑ curve delineates a ∼3‰ negative excursion (∼3.0–3.3 m), reaching a δ¹³Cₑₑₑ minimum of −26.3‰ at 1.2 m (Fig. 3d). The new integrated δ¹³Cₑₑₑ record further confirms that the subsequent positive δ¹³Cₑₑₑ excursion seen in most marine records for OAE1d (Bornemann et al., 2017; Petrizzo et al., 2008; Robinson et al., 2008; Wilson and Norris, 2001) is missing (Fig. 3d), as was previously documented for RCP (Gröcke and Joekel, 2008; Gröcke et al., 2006). In this interval (above ∼3.3 m), δ¹³Cₑₑₑ values return to pre-excision values. For the remainder of the record, δ¹³Cₑₑₑ values fluctuate around pre-excision values.

Our analysis verifies the findings of previous paleoecological studies of RCP (Retallack and Dilcher, 1981; Upchurch and Dilcher,
that gymnosperm charcoal dominates isolated charcoal from RCP, despite the fact that angiosperms dominate the leaf macro-fossil and dispersed cuticle assemblages (Upchurch and Dilcher, 1990). It is probable that gymnosperm charcoal was transported to RCP by streams because charcoal floats, takes a great deal of time to waterlog, and has dispersal distances much greater than that of leaves (Scott, 2010). In addition, while angiosperm charcoal ($\delta^{13}C_{\text{ang}}$) mostly agrees with $\delta^{13}C_{\text{gym}}$ and $\delta^{13}C_{\text{pit}}$, where they co-occur, for two samples $\delta^{13}C_{\text{ang}}$ is $\sim 1.6\%e$ more negative (SAM 1) and $\sim 0.8\%e$ more positive (SAM 15) than the average of $\delta^{13}C_{\text{gym}}$ and $\delta^{13}C_{\text{pit}}$. While we cannot attribute this to any individual environmental factor, we take this increased variability in $\delta^{13}C_{\text{ang}}$ relative to $\delta^{13}C_{\text{gym}}$ and $\delta^{13}C_{\text{pit}}$ as confirmation that excluding $\delta^{13}C_{\text{ang}}$ from the integrated $\delta^{13}C$ curve is justified. Although we were able to isolate charcoal and vitrain throughout the measured RCP section, we were unable to recover cuticle above 5.35 m (with only one sample above 4.5 m, Fig. 4). Similarly, the sandstones that form the bottom of the pit are barren of dispersed cuticle. Thus, our CO$_2$ reconstruction is constrained temporally to the interval of the negative $\delta^{13}C$ excursion and the return to pre-excision values, excluding the interval of the positive $\delta^{13}C$ excursion (Fig. 5c–d).

4.2. Empirical CO$_2$ estimates

Empirical CO$_2$ estimates based on stomatal transfer functions using extant or extinct laureaceous species show moderate variation, with most of the increase in CO$_2$ captured by the 95% confidence intervals (Fig. 4b). Estimates based on $L$. nobilis rise from 431 ppm (+35/−43 ppm) at 0 m to a high of 512 ppm (+67/−94 ppm) at 3.3 m (Fig. 4b; Table S2). Estimates based on $H$. zenkeri rise from 326 ppm (+25/−7 ppm) at 0 m to a high of 416 ppm (+365/−69 ppm) at 3.3 m (Fig. 4b; Table S2). Estimates based on $L$. pseudoprinceps rise from 602 ppm at 0 m to a high of 752 ppm at 3.3 m (Fig. 4b; Table S2). All the empirical CO$_2$ estimates follow the same general trend, rising slightly from 0 to 0.6 m, remaining relatively stable during the majority of the negative $\delta^{13}C$ excursion, then rising to a maximum between 2.7 to 3.3 m, before falling to concentrations that are slightly lower than pre-excision values (Fig. 4a; Table S2).

The taxonomically weighted consensus curve, developed using the SI-based CO$_2$ estimates of all laureaceous species, is most closely aligned with results from the $L$. nobilis equation, even though $L$. nobilis nests high within the phylogeny of Lauraceae (Fig. 4c). That the consensus curve tracks most closely the $L$. nobilis estimates reflects the influence of the low estimates of CO$_2$ based on $H$. zenkeri, which has the effect of drawing down the consensus curve such that is tracks $L$. nobilis.

4.3. Mechanistic CO$_2$ estimates

Mechanistic estimates calculated here show a good deal of variation depending on the input parameters, as has been observed in previous studies (McElwain et al., 2016). Mechanistic estimates derived from different estimates of atmospheric $\delta^{13}C$ (from $−7.31\%e$ to $−8.41\%e$) vary by $\sim 45$ to 180 ppm, with the greater variation
seen at times of high pCO2 (inferred from Sl and SD). Raising the reference CO2 assimilation rate (A0), from the prescribed value of 12 to 19.48, derived in this study from vein density resulted in a variation of ~110 to 500 ppm with, the greatest variation seen at times of highest pCO2. However, the use of both values of A0 is justified because of the high vein density of Pandemorphylum, the range of A0 values used encompasses higher values cited for related fossil Lauraceous species (up to 14; Franks et al., 2014), and the use of the higher value is intended to represent a range of possible values. Furthermore, for many of the estimates at inferred times of low CO2, the empirical estimates are completely encompassed within the mechanistic estimates, implying that they are equally valid.

Temporally, the mechanistic CO2 estimates follow the same trends of the empirical proxies, with significant overlap between mechanistic and empirical CO2 estimates, especially at times of low CO2 (Fig. 4d, Table S2). CO2 estimates at 0 m range between 464 and 805 ppm, depending on input parameters, and rise at 2.7 m to a maximum CO2 of 1032 to 1598 ppm. CO2 subsequently falls to the lowest concentrations of the record (336–603 ppm). Notably, for the interval of highest CO2 concentration estimated using the mechanistic model (2.7 m), the mechanistic estimates are substantially higher (by up to 1000 ppm) than the empirical based CO2 estimates.

5. Discussion

5.1. Empirical vs. mechanistic estimates

If it is assumed that the mechanistic model is an improvement over taxon-specific stomatal-based empirical methods based on the aforementioned arguments, then our results are consistent with the previous finding that Sl and SD saturate above ~700 ppm in angiosperms (Kürschner et al., 1996). However, an alternative explanation is that this saturation is due to problematic transfer functions that have not been calibrated for high CO2 environments (and in particular, based on plants grown under elevated CO2 in growth chambers). For example, using the L. pseudoprinceps equation

Fig. 5. Comparison of chemostratigraphy of RCP and nearby cores (Göcke and Jöeckel, 2008; Göcke et al., 2006). LOESS consensus curve based on empirical and mechanistic CO2 estimates, and published δ13C and δ18O time series (Wilson and Norris, 2001). The blue dashed line is the inferred location of the ACB in Göcke et al. (2006) and Wilson and Norris (2001). (a) δ13C from thermocline dwelling species and sea surface dwelling species isolated from ODP Site 1052, Blake Nose, western Atlantic redrawn from Wilson and Norris (2001). (b) δ18O from thermocline dwelling species and sea surface dwelling species isolated from ODP Site 1052, Blake Nose, western Atlantic redrawn from Wilson and Norris (2001). Trendlines in a) and b) are 100 kyr to infinity fit. (c) Scatterplot of combined organic matter δ13C (δ13C_foram, δ13C_13C_g, δ13C_Cbl, and δ13C_Ck) from RCP and surrounding region. The green line is a 3 point moving average. (d) Combined empirical and mechanistic CO2 estimates for P. kvacekii. The solid line is the locally weighted polynomial regression (LOESS) fit of the data (0.2 smoothing). Dashed lines are bootstrapped 2.5% and 97.5% errors.
5.2. Comparison to other CO₂ estimates and paleoclimate indicators

The pattern of change in pCO₂ and the pre-CO₂ excursion background levels estimated in this study are consistent with several indicators of mid-Cretaceous paleoclimate and inferred atmospheric CO₂ levels. Retallack (2009), in his radiometrically-dated compilation of CO₂, temperature, and precipitation estimates from paleosols and cuticles collected in the southwestern United States, found that the generally dry and warm environment inferred from the Cedar Mountain Formation, Utah, was disrupted at ~99 Ma by a geologically brief instance of hot and humid climate with high precipitation attributed to OAE1d. Anomalous precipitation and temperature estimates were further attributed to rapid environmental change during OAE1d based on a leaf margin and area analysis of the Soap Creek Flora of the Cedar Mountain Formation (Arens and Harris, 2015). If the timing of the hypothesized rapid environmental change and the resulting anomalous precipitation and temperature estimates truly coincide with OAE1d, those results could be indicative of the rapid increase in pCO₂ during the OAE1d negative δ¹³C excursion reconstructed in this study.

Recent compilations of mid-Cretaceous CO₂ estimates compare favorably with those generated in this study. Estimates from pedogenic carbonates indicate CO₂ levels between 352 and 1100 ppm around the ACB (Li et al., 2014; Ludvigson et al., 2015). Stomatal and plant isotope-based estimates for the overall mid-Cretaceous interval suggest CO₂ concentrations ~2 to 5 times pre-industrial levels (i.e. 275 ppm) (Aucour et al., 2008; Hawthor et al., 2005; Li et al., 2014; Passalia, 2009). Notably, a compilation of all published pCO₂ estimates for the ACB is based on five different proxy methods (i.e. stomatal, pedogenic carbonate, liverwort and alkenone δ¹³C, and foraminiferal δ¹³C) and LOESS analysis of that data suggest a mean CO₂ concentration of 898 ppm (range 529–1351; Foster et al., 2017). Background, pre-CO₂ excursion levels presented here (440–575 ppm, Fig. 5d) and individual estimates calculated in this study (Table S2) fall well within the range of the aforementioned published CO₂ estimates (265–1351 ppm).

The reconstructed range in atmospheric CO₂ prior to and after the CO₂ spike at the end of the negative δ¹³C excursion is less than the CO₂ threshold (~<800 ppm) for the initiation of Late Cretaceous Antarctic glaciation under conditions of cool summer orbit and high Antarctic elevation (Flögel et al., 2011), based on GENESIS version 3.0 with liquid cloud properties tuned to a modern anthropogenic atmosphere. This raises the possibility that the large sea level changes documented for OAE 1d and other intervals of the mid-Cretaceous (Koch and Brenner, 2009; Weisert and Lini, 1991) were glacioeustatic. The critical CO₂ concentration for the initiation of glaciation, however, may have been well below 800 ppm given the influence of paleogeography, palaeotopography, and moisture source availability (Ladant and Donnadieu, 2016), potential for elevated levels of atmospheric methane (Beerling et al., 2011), and the uncertainty of the physical properties of pre-anthropogenic liquid clouds (Upchurch et al., 2015).

5.3. Comparison to attributes of other OAEs

The range over which CO₂ fluctuated during OAE1d reconstructed in this study (~357 ± 150 ppm, Fig. 5d) is comparable to that documented for the Late Cretaceous OAE2 (150–600 ppm) (Barclay et al., 2010), but smaller in magnitude than that estimated for other OAEs using the empirically derived SI method. These include the Cretaceous–Palæogene Boundary (up to 2000+ ppm; Beerling et al., 2002), TOAE (750–1750 ppm; McElwain et al., 2005), and Triassic–Jurassic Boundary (400–2000 ppm; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2011), though these estimates have yet to be reassessed using the mechanistic stomatal model. Moreover, estimated CO₂ inferred from compound-specific and bulk-rock δ¹³C values indicate a change through OAE1a of 600 to 1400 ppm, although with considerable uncertainty (Naafs et al., 2016). The similar magnitude increase in CO₂ during OAE1d indicated by this study (from 483 ppm to 840 ppm; Fig. 5d) suggests an increase in radiative forcing of ~2.63 W/m² and an average global temperature increase of ~2.0°C, assuming a global climate sensitivity of 0.8°C for each W/m² forcing (Houghton et al., 2001; Rohling et al., 2012).

Our reconstructed pCO₂ record during OAE1d and inferred increase in radiative forcing suggest that OAE1d was an event on par with OAE2. This is notable because OAE2 is an unquestionably global event that caused a dramatic change in Earth system processes (Jenkyns, 2010). However, our calculated change in temperature (~2.0°C) is well below the pronounced rapid temperature change estimated for OAE2 (~4°C; Jenkyns, 2010) and additional evidence of temperature change during OAE1d is equivocal. An increase in sea surface and thermocline temperatures of ~1°C at the beginning of the negative δ¹³C excursion of OAE1d (Fig. 5a) is inferred from foraminiferal δ¹⁸O time series (site 1052, Blake Nose, western Atlantic Ocean; Wilson and Norris, 2001), although subsequent analysis of the same data suggests a larger increase in temperature, coincident with the onset of the positive δ¹³C excursion (Petrizzo et al., 2008). In addition, δ¹⁸O- and nanofossil-based sea-surface temperatures (SSTs) for OAE1d from the Vocontian Basin, France, indicate sea-surface warming at the end of the negative δ¹³C excursion (Bornemann et al., 2005). While some δ¹⁸O curves show negative shifts, possibly indicative of increased temperatures (Robinson et al., 2008), others show no change in δ¹⁸O, and therefore, inferred ocean temperatures, through the OAE1d interval (Bornemann et al., 2017; Gambacorta et al., 2015). These data, and the paucity of temperature estimates from outside the North Atlantic, make our estimates of temperature change challenging to evaluate.

Despite this, inferred changes in ocean temperature preceding OAE1d and other attributes of the event suggest similarities to other OAEs. Prior to the increase in temperatures associated with the onset of the negative δ¹³C excursion, reconstructed SSTs in the western tropical Atlantic during the mid-Cretaceous (Wilson and Norris, 2001) suggest a long-term increase in thermocline temperatures and synchronous decrease in SSTs. These changes in temperature culminated in the breakdown of ocean stratification and the onset of black shale deposition (Fig. 5a) suggesting that initiation of black shale deposition also preceded the onset of the subsequent positive δ¹³C excursion. The temporal lag between the onset of black shale deposition and the peak of the positive δ¹³C excursion, as well as cooling of the water column before OAE1d followed by warming of the deep ocean, is observed in other proximal OAE1d localities (Bornemann et al., 2005; Petrizzo et al., 2008).

The breakdown of water stratification during OAE1d is similar to that hypothesized for OAE1a, where changes in nanofossil abundance indicate a similar loss of stratification, possibly due to warming of intermediate waters (Erba, 2004; Wilson and Norris, 2001). In addition, both the early Toarcian OAE (TOAE; ~182 Ma) and OAE 1a (~120 Ma) are characterized by a pronounced, but brief negative δ¹³C excursion followed by a more prolonged positive δ¹³C excursion, which lags behind black shale deposition (though, again, considerable variability exists between individual sections that preserve these events) (Erba et al., 1999; Hesselbo et al., 2002; Wilson and Norris, 2001). This is in contrast to the contemporaneity of black shale deposition and the positive δ¹³C excursion for other OAEs (Robinson et al., 2017).

In addition to these previously noted similarities between OAE1d and the TOAE and OAE1a (Erba, 2004; Wilson and Norris, 2001), our work documents that the maximum rise in pCO₂ occurs well into the negative δ¹³C excursion and that it postdates
the breakdown of ocean stratification and the onset of black shale deposition delineated by Wilson and Norris (2001) (Fig. 5). This out-of-phase relationship between change in CO2 and geochemistry has been found in CO2 reconstructions of both the TOAE (McElwain et al., 2005) and OAE1a (Nafis et al., 2016). This conclusion provides additional evidence of common causal and developmental mechanism underpinnings OAE1d, OAE1a, and the TOAE.

Both OAE1a and the TOAE have long been associated with volcanism in the form of large igneous provinces (ILPs). Likewise, OAE1d (~100.5 Ma) broadly coincides with the eruption of the central portion of the Kerguelen Plateau LIP (Site 1138; weighted mean age of 100.41 ± 0.71 Ma; Duncan, 2002). Analogous to OAE1a, the decrease in water column stability inferred from the convergence of surface- and intermediate-water foraminifera δ18O values (Fig. 2a) could have been driven by warming of intermediate waters and a loss of water column stability with increased hydrothermal activity (Wilson and Norris, 2001). This conclusion, however, requires an unidentified mechanism to transport heat generated by the Kerguelen Plateau LIP to the north Atlantic. Although it is possible that widespread incorporation of continental crust into the Central Kerguelen Plateau was a source of 13C-depleted carbon to the ocean and atmosphere and the source of the spike in CO2 described in this study, there is little evidence for crustal contamination within the portion of the Kerguelen LIP that coincides with OAE1d (Frey et al., 2002). Given the aforementioned comparisons, we hypothesize that the similar characteristics shared between OAE1d and the TOAE and OAE1a suggest common causal and/or mechanistic linkages between the processes underpinning these events and that the common causal mechanism could be LIP volcanism.

6. Conclusions

The high temporal resolution and multi-proxy CO2 reconstruction presented in this study represents the first CO2 estimates generated for OAE1d. This CO2 reconstruction elucidates the temporal relationship between atmospheric CO2 and the carbon cycle perturbation across the onset of OAE1d and the Albian–Cenomanian boundary. Our findings indicate that the negative δ13C excursion, which characterizes OAE1d, cannot be simply explained by changes in atmospheric CO2. Moreover, the new estimates of background and maximum CO2 during the negative δ13C excursion, which characterizes the onset of OAE1d, are in broad agreement with other mid-Cretaceous CO2 reconstructions and indicators of mid-Cretaceous paleoclimate. Our estimates also provide additional evidence of marked similarities in the development and behavior of OAE1d to OAE1a and TOAE and suggest a possible cause of LIP volcanism. Finally, this study further documents that the use of dispersed cuticle and improved stomatal based methods have the potential to provide high-resolution reconstructions of changes in atmospheric CO2 during major Earth system perturbations.

Acknowledgements

We thank the DeBoer family for access to RCP. J.D.R was supported by National Science Foundation award EAR1148897 to IPM (University of California, Davis [UCD]), a National Science Foundation Graduate Research Fellowship under Grant #DGE-1144466 (Texas State University) and 1148897 (UCD), a Texas State University Thesis Research Support Fellowship, and a UCD Graduate Research Mentorship Fellowship.

Author contributions

G.R.U. and J.D.R. designed the study and collected the bulk sediment samples. R.M.J. coordinated fieldwork and assisted in the integration of the work presented here with prior results. R.M.J., J.J.S., and G.A.L. measured the stratigraphic section at RCP, which was corroborated by later work by J.D.R. J.D.R. processed samples, analyzed the data, and was the principal author of the manuscript. M.B.S. and I.P.M. provided facilities for the preparation of samples and carbon isotope analysis. G.R.U., M.B.S., I.P.M., and B.H.L. contributed to interpreting results and the writing and editing of the manuscript. N.M.J.C provided help with statistical analysis. R.M.J., J.J.S., G.A.L., and N.M.J.C. provided comments and suggested edits to the manuscript.

Appendix A. Supplementary material

Supplementary material related to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2018.03.035

References


