2018

Kasb-e-Hunar (Skilled Enclave)

Adil Iqbal

University of St Andrews, adildesign.contact@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/tsaconf>

Part of the [Art and Materials Conservation Commons](#), [Art Practice Commons](#), [Fashion Design Commons](#), [Fiber, Textile, and Weaving Arts Commons](#), [Fine Arts Commons](#), and the [Museum Studies Commons](#)

Iqbal, Adil, "Kasb-e-Hunar (Skilled Enclave)" (2018). *Textile Society of America Symposium Proceedings*. 1084.
<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/tsaconf/1084>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Textile Society of America at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Textile Society of America Symposium Proceedings by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

The Social Fabric: Deep Local to Pan Global

**Textile Society of America 16th Biennial Symposium
Vancouver, Canada — September 19-23, 2018**

Published in *Textile Society of America Symposium Proceedings 2018*

Presented at Vancouver, BC, Canada; September 19 – 23, 2018

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/tsaconf/>

Copyright © by the author(s).

Kasb-e-Hunar (Skilled Enclave)

Adil Iqbal

adilidesign.contact@gmail.com

Kasb-e-Hunar (Skilled Enclave) is a sensory film showing a visual documentation of *Shu* (woollen cloth) making and short interviews with an elderly artisan community from the village of Madaklasht, Northern Pakistan. It invites the audience in to engage with the past and present and seeks to provoke conversations about the future and the responsibilities we have, given past mistakes. The film was made over three weeks of anthropological fieldwork in Shishi Koh Valley, Chitral, Northern Pakistan. The film investigates the cultural significance of woollen craft skills, exploring memories relating to handiwork and the challenges of globalization. It shows the value of traditional skills and indigenous knowledge passed from preceding generations. The film underlines the importance of skilled hands and the knowledge and wisdom attached to them. It provides local narratives from scholars and community elders, enabling them to communicate and explore themes of nostalgia, memory, tradition, and skill. They talk about how they value craft and skill and how deeply rooted were the traditions of spinning and weaving and other wool work in the folk heritage of Chitral. This generates a sense of nostalgia and yearning for times gone by. From washing the sheep in the local spring water to carding, teasing, spinning and weaving together with all the tools and instruments indicate its own unique technique and vocabulary.

In this reflexive paper I will discuss various issues relating to my fieldwork and the process of using audio-visual. During my fieldwork I visited local homes, interviewed artisans, collected oral testimonies through audio and visual recording. The data was collected through participant observation, with emphasis on detailed interviews with the elderly artisan community, however, my interviews were more like a relaxed conversation over several cups of *chai*.

I am inspired by Maurice Merleau-Ponty's phenomenological approach to perception and intentionality of consciousness, where he proposed that "to see is to have colours or lights before one, to hear is to encounter sounds, to feel is to come up against qualities."¹

I am not a practiced filmmaker, but as a visual artist, I was able to appreciate the significance of skilled hands as "more people need to better understand what goes into making and see how much of it is personal."² Richard Senett has argued that "language is not an adequate 'mirror tool' for physical movements of the human body,"³ as it is only through "combined study of the imaging of craft and crafting of the images"⁴ that open up new perspectives and hence "enable our eyes to do the thinking about material things."⁵ I have attempted to interweave the sensuous and phenomenological engagement between hand and skill through audiovisual methods, which these authors, and I too argue, can be more effective, comprehensive and successful than purely producing text.

1. Merleau Maurice Ponty, *Phenomenology of perception*, (London, Routledge, 1962), 4.

2. Daniel Charny, *Power of making: the importance of being skilled*. (London, V&A Publishing and the Crafts Council, 2011), 8.

3. Richard Senett, *The Craftsmen*, (Yale University Press, 2008), 95.

4. Ann Sophie Lehmann, "Showing Making: On Visual Documentation and Creative Practice", *Journal of Modern Craft*, (2012), 20.

5. Richard Senett, *The Craftsmen*. (Yale University Press, 2008), 95.

Hunarmand Hoost (Skilled Hands)

In Chitrali society, the concept of the ‘skilled hand’ has always enjoyed a high status. In particular, women skilled in handicrafts have been held in high regards. Until the mid 1970s, when educational facilities were minimal and jobs related to academic qualifications were not available, the hand skill was the only way of judging the merit of a lady.

This will be demonstrated in the example below:

A skilled woman was called ‘*Hunarman*’ and she was praised in an uncommon sentence saying “*Har Chamuto tan hunar,*” *every finger of her hand has its own skill.*

I used this proverb in the beginning of the film where I show a close up video shot of a group of women knitting, followed by hands of an elderly artisan named Gul Bibi who is 95 years old. She was one of the few elderly artisans still alive and during my conversation she mentioned that “...in marriage proposals skilled hands were traditionally preferred to unskilled hands.”

As an embroiderer, she taught knitting and embroidery to many women in the village. She further mentions “...*an instructor of art and craft is regarded equal to one's father or mother.*” All these points reinforce the way skilled hands are embedded within their local culture and I wanted to convey this in the film. My reason for using a video shot as oppose to a still shot was the sense of movement her clothes and shawl in backdrop contributed to the overall aesthetic of the shot. The way the camera flows, capturing the position of her hands and fingers with a subtle movement, highlighting the wrinkles and emphasizing the depth of knowledge and dexterity of these hands.

Gul Bibi, in the village of Garam Chashma, Chitral.

Domestic activities, including crafts, forms the basis of understanding female identity in Chitral. It is also clear that these skills are significant beyond the basic economic needs of families and individuals and influence social spheres at the community level.

I would demonstrate this through an ethnographic example: During my time in Madaklasht, I was introduced to a family (four daughters and their elderly mother) where the women were the main bread earners. I went with the purpose of interviewing them but as I entered their main living room these four women and a child were all engaged in knitting, sewing and

crochet work. What struck me was all five members of the family including the child were deeply absorbed in their work. I wasn't too interested in what they were making but was overwhelmed by them working in cooperation. "Domestication is an emergent process of cohabiting, involving agencies of many sorts."⁶ To me there was shared knowledge being produced by their hands. The dominance and strength of their fingers within their domestic environment and landscape showed their dependency to the things they were making and the materials that they accessed. In this case, it showed the relationship they had with their material; wool, sheep and techniques were all part of the making the process. As Ingold argues that: "culture and social life appear to be caught in an ongoing dialectic in which each, in a sense constitutes the other, through a mediation of human agency."⁷ I decided to film them just the way they were working, - Hence the juxtaposition of the video clip in the beginning of film was used alongside Dr. Faizi reciting a short proverb to illustrate the point in a poetic way:

*"Oh, my daughter! Your fingers are pretty not the rings in it,
The rings you wear are not pretty than your fingers,
How will you become my daughter if you don't have a needle in your hand."*

Furthermore, Trevor Marchand mentions that "Skilled handwork involves fast and fluid exchanges and of various kinds of sensory information, motor action feedback, semantic knowledge and reflective thought on goals, present and tasks completed."⁸ This can provide an enhanced understanding of the experiences and sense of harmony to what the artisan can see, hear, feel and does with the tools and materials.

This is reflected in the photograph below, which illustrates the complexity of brain-hand-tool relationship. The image illustrates an artisan immersed in crocheting a tablecloth and at the same time she is making *chai* while sitting next to the stove. It shows her method of working, her technique the dexterity of her fingers and subtle movement. It also depicts her surroundings and the domestic working environment. The blue floral pattern, cracked white paint on the walls, the large steel teapot and the small hand drawn motifs on the brown cupboards all add depth to how making and skill are viewed. I decided to use a still image as oppose to a video here because it leads the viewer to a deeper understanding of the maker's domestic environment. Her concentration and intensity of the skill also come through in a convincing manner.

6. Erik Mckenna, *Pets, People, and Pragmatism*. Fordham Scholarship Online (2013).

7. Tim Ingold, *Companion Encyclopedia of Anthropology: Humanity, Culture and Social Life*. (London, Routledge, 1994), 738.

8. Trevor Marchand, *The SAGE Handbook of Social Anthropology*, (London, Sage Publications, 2012), 264.

Zareen Bibi, in the village of Madaklasht, Chitral, Northern Pakistan.

Engagement with the Elderly

I did not anticipate focusing solely on the voices of elderly but this developed through my time in Madaklasht, as I found that the people who had the knowledge about the skill and its significance were the elderly artisan community. The young did not have this knowledge and were not interested in discussing the dynamics of craft skills, hence I spent a lot of time listening to elders, and felt a connection with them, which is the reason why the film is based on their narratives.

With old age, physical flexibility tends to diminish while practical knowledge and wisdom are likely to increase. Elderly have the social and emotional knowledge and play a role as keepers of culture, passing on values, meaning, and wisdom through their stories. Catherine Degnan mentions that a distinctive narrative style that is employed by older people has to do "with the movement between past and the present and their integration into each other."⁹ This is something I observed with all of my participants but I would demonstrate an example from one in particular.

The conversation with Alizhar Khan, who is the last felt maker in Madaklasht had a significant impact on me. I was not able to include his entire conversation, as the novelty of the interview situation impacted on his memory making him digress. Degnan confirms this, "how anxiety-producing situations can sometimes threaten the normal ordering of one's relationship with the world."¹⁰ In this case, the complexity of language and use of audiovisual equipment affected Alizhar's narrative. It became challenging at times, as the community in Madaklasht speak a dialect of Persian that originates from Tajikistan. I could understand fragments of the discussion, but there were times when Alizhar would blend Persian with Khowar (language spoken in Chitral). This made it confusing and stressful at times to keep up with his narrative. Also, the fact that he had a poor memory attributed to his narrative crumbling at times. Thus, I decided to use certain shots and clips of the conversation to

9. Catherine Degnan, "Temporality, Narrative, and the Ageing Self", *The Cambridge Journal of Anthropology*, (2005), 54

10. Ibid., 57.

construct a narrative on the loss of skill, which integrated nicely alongside the other stories. Degnan challenges the stereotype that is often attached to older people that they are “lost in the past”¹¹ and have a yearning for olden days. While I agree with this, it is critical to point out that the concept of nostalgia is deep rooted in South Asia and in particular with the Pakistani identity. As pointed out by Chaudhry¹² that in a country like Pakistan where industrialization and modernization are affecting the traditional and cultural society elderly people used to live in, it makes it difficult for them to cope with the pressures of capitalism Alizhar who was in his late 90s found it difficult to compete with new skills “under the influence of dominating modern relationship with global markets.”¹³ Thus the changes of technology and globalization are difficult for Alizhar to manage. Hence, I have tried to echo his emotion in the film.

Alizhar narrated his story in front of his 65 years old *namad* (felt rug) which lay abandoned in his room. It was a sign of his craftsmanship, and his identity and pride were all wrapped up in this rug. He touches upon themes of migration of his community and the significance of felt. Furthermore, he gives a brief account of what the felt was used for and the value it had in the past. In the end, he sums up the importance how everyone should have one skill. I chose to record his voice over a video clip where he was showing the rolling process of felt. My aim was to illustrate his passion and admiration he had for felt making, together with his frail voice, frustration, mannerism and the movement of his hands and fingers while rolling and unrolling the *namad*.

Alizhar Khan, Feltmaker, Madaklasht, Shishi Kho Valley, Northern Pakistan.

11. Ibid., 61.

12. Abid Ghafoor Chaudhry, “Active Ageing and Elders Health: An Anthropological Perspective of Older Persons”, *Anthropologist*, (2015), 714-718.

13. Ibid., 717.

Photography as a Method

One of the reasons for using still image alongside video was the opportunity that a still visual allowed me to communicate complex situation and enabled me to explore multisensoriality of the senses much more effectively than video. Edwards has noted how “an anthropological photograph is any photography from which anthropologists could gain useful, meaningful visual information.”¹⁴ She further highlights that photographs operate as social objects in the telling of history.¹⁵ During my fieldwork all the photographs were captured using a Digital SLR camera. This allowed me to go through the images and study specific photographs once I was back in Edinburgh thus enabling me to experience and investigate new ways in which images could produce alternative phenomenology. Sarah Pink highlights the relationship between images and power and how consumption of digital images can bring our attention to and invoke the feeling of movement in new ways.¹⁶ By drawing on the theory of multisensoriality, movement, and place, she suggests focusing on the production and consumption of images. This can be demonstrated by the following example.

Two of the key spaces where women spend most of their time in Madaklasht are at home or in the fields. During my fieldwork, I was keen to photograph an old house and incorporate a still image in the film to give it a sense of timelessness. My reason for locating an old house as oppose to a new house, was because of the concept and temperament that was coming out of my interviews; such as, the idea of loss, remembering of the past, and living the present-day situation. The embroidered cloth in the background with cooking pots helps to portray a sensual engagement and serves as a background for their craft practice. Langfield and Maclean have argued, the senses are ‘the strongest vessels of memory,’ particularly in those who have emigrated.¹⁷ The community from Madaklasht were using their material memory to form a pattern of domestic organization of a home and place that resembles their ancestors from Badakhshan in Tajikistan. Hence this image created ‘a certain ambiance of familiarity in a new place.’¹⁸

I used this image in the beginning of the film, as an opening scene; which helps build and show a glimpse of Madakalashti culture. The image represented a home environment of the artisans, where they spend most of their time engaged in domesticated activities but the absence of people in the image was the main reason why I chose it during the editing process. The aesthetics, in terms of lighting and colours and the everyday living objects, was the invisible feature, which made it open to interpretation by the viewer.

13. 14. Elizabeth Edwards, *Anthropology and Photography 1865–1920*, (London: Yale Univ. Press, 1992),

27. 15. Elizabeth Edwards, “Photographs and the Sound of History”, *Visual Anthropology Review*, (2005),

(2011), 12. 16. Sarah Pink, “Sensory digital photography: re-thinking ‘moving and the image’” *Visual Studies*,

17. Pam Maclean and Michele Langfield, “But Pineapple I’m still a Bit Wary Of : Sensory Memories of Jewish Women Who Migrated to Australia as Children 1938-39”, Research School of Social Sciences, The Australian National University, (2000), 84.

18. Ibid.,100.

Traditional House in Madaklasht, Shishi Kho Valley, Northern Pakistan

Showing Making

Wiener critiques the “western visual representation within the progress of Marxist theory in 20th century”¹⁹ and Kirsten Hastrup²⁰ has argued that invisible aspects of human reality can only be communicated through textual abstraction. In my opinion, I do understand the power of words and the capacity they have to communicate “existential spaces of cultural experience.”²¹ However, a film can at times exceed theory, as images have the power and ability in addressing subtle issues of social agency, bodily practice and the role of the senses.

During my interview with cultural historian Dr. Fazi, he mentioned: “*that many phrases in Khowar and Persian language reveal the cultural importance of the woollen fabric.*” This was reflected in the process of *Shu* making, where I asked Dr. Faizi to narrate the process in Khowar as oppose to English, this gave authenticity to the process and enabled the viewer to access their world in their language.

Since *Shu (Woollen cloth)* is an integral part of the tradition of the community living in Madaklasht. As a living craft of Chitrali culture, I was advised by Dr. Faizi to document the *Shu* process of Madaklasht in particular as the quality and classification is the highest in Chitral valley. I decided to visually document the process simultaneously alongside other interviews. However, due to the lengthy process of the making, there were several stages that I was not able to show due to the restricted time limit of the film. Thus, I decided to streamline and highlight certain parts of the process focusing on the sensorial aspects.

I will demonstrate how I chose to document and show the making through ‘skilled vision’ in the next section.

19. James Weiner, “Televisualist anthropology: representation, aesthetics, politics”, *Current Anthropology*, (1997) 197.

20. Kirsten Hastrup, *Film as ethnography*, (Manchester University Press 1992),

21. Ibid., 11.

Film through ‘Skilled Vision’

Cristina Grasseni²² points out how a video camera aided her attempt to gain an insight into skilled vision of a community of cattle breeders and how filming may help the researcher to think about how the ways of seeing are framed by practice. She further mentions that skilled vision is "sensuous knowledge"²³ or "corporeal"²⁴ but is also "positional, political and relational."²⁵ Similarly, during the filming of the *Shu* process the camera and its frame influenced my approach of how I viewed and understood the various methods. The viewfinder on my camera was simultaneously training my eye and focusing on the embodied movements of the body, ultimately influencing and restricting what I could capture. For example, during the process of spinning, I filmed an artisan spinning wool to make thread. I filmed this process through different angles but each time I filmed my perception of the process was changing on how my vision was observing the process. The artisan kept repeating the same method of spinning but the viewfinder served as a means to "unpack" the skills of the artisan and provided a sense of richness of the embodied experience of work.²⁶ Furthermore, my skilled vision is also used in the editing process where I viewed the collected footage several times to understand the sensual engagement and embodied practice. This again changed my way of seeing and understanding the process as the digital media acted as an archive.

David MacDougall mentions that film can be a method of “resensitizing us to the physical presence of objects which an urbanized audience has attenuated and commodified.”²⁷ Therefore in the case of the visual documentation of *Shu*, film enables to “resensitize us to the skills that are largely lost and devalued in a consumer culture.”²⁸

Montage

Suhr and Willerslev highlight that ‘film can evoke hidden dimensions of ethnographic reality’²⁹ and that the “juxtaposition of different perspectives through montage is a key cinematic tool for evoking the invisible.”³⁰ Similarly, my experience in the use of montage gave me multiple perspectives on the community and their craft. The process of filming allowed me to show invisible spaces and experience the complexity of skill and craft that goes beyond just the making. Wilma Kiener³¹ reinforces how “editing solves the problem of showing what—while being absent—is a necessary part of the whole.” Montage, she argues, “makes visible the social and psychological effects of the globalizing and the postcolonial

22. Cristina Grasseni, *Made to be seen: Perspectives on the history of visual anthropology*. (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2011).

23. Paul Stoller, *Sensuous Scholarship*. (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 1989).

24. David MacDougall, *The corporeal image: film, ethnography, and the senses*. Princeton, Princeton University Press, 2006).

25. Cristina Grasseni, *Made to be seen: Perspectives on the history of visual anthropology*, (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2011), 29.

26. Geoffery Gowlland, “Unpacking Craft Skills: What Can Images Reveal about the Embodied Experience of Craft?”, *Visual Anthropology*, (2015) 295.

27. David MacDougall, *The corporeal image: film, ethnography, and the senses*. Princeton, Princeton University Press, 2006), 57.

28. Geoffery Gowlland, “Unpacking Craft Skills: What Can Images Reveal about the Embodied Experience of Craft?”, *Visual Anthropology*, (2015) 295.

29. Christian Suhr, “Can Film Show the Invisible? The Work of Montage in Ethnographic Filmmaking”, *Current Anthropology* (2012), 282.

30. Ibid., 285.

31. Wilma Kiener, “The absent and the cut”, *Visual Anthropology*, (2008) 394.

world.”³²

Thus, in the opening sequence where I decided to use a 15 seconds time lap photography showing the village of Madaklasht. The clip captures the movement of the sun over the mountain peaks, the running river, and the shifting clouds. Although the use of time lapse in this sense is nothing special, for a 10 minute film this technique allows the viewer to experience a faster travelling speed of the local landscape and environment, enabling a visual experience that differs from normal perception. For this clip, I set the camera on a rooftop at a nearby house and left it there for several hours. Hence what you see is an arrangement of several shots reflecting the familiar and unfamiliar reality of this region. The sound sequence of birds twittering resembles the sounds of the places that surround Shishi Kho, Chitral, and Madaklasht on a daily basis. Although the clip may seem surreal and slightly false, it is the experience of perfection against the imperfect image of Pakistan that I wanted to project to the viewer.

Suhr and Willerslev highlight that the perception of human eye can never see from one position but through "an intertwinement of two positions"³³ however, the backside of the object can never be seen from our present position. Merleau-Ponty reinforces this when he writes: "when I look at the lamp on my table, I attribute to it not only the qualities visible from where I am but also those which the chimney, the walls, the table can see."³⁴ This makes the human vision with two eyes always one step ahead of a single perspective of a camera lens.

However, I attempt to challenge and enhance ordinary seeing through the multiple angled shots that I have used throughout the film. Here, the process of editing enabled me to use a program where I could split the screen in four and focus on the different angles of the making. For example, in the weaving sequence for *Shu* making, I displayed four different angles of the weaving process. This style brings attention to the movement of the hands and feet of the weaver, the different positions of the loom and the sounds attached to it.

The above method represents how the technique of montage can juxtapose two-dimensional pieces and combine them into multispatial and multitemporal viewing experiences, which ultimately bring us to a closer experience of embodiment and practice. Thus "montage offers the possibility of breaking the boundaries of ethnographically "thin" 2-D by delivering views of multidimensional "thick.""³⁵

32. Wilma Kiener, "Traveling images - towards an ethnographic cinema of montage", (2006), *Paper presented at Colloque du Cinéma Ethnographique à l'Anthropologie Visuelle, Musée de l'Homme, Paris*

33. Christian Suhr, "Can Film Show the Invisible? The Work of Montage in Ethnographic Filmmaking", *Current Anthropology* (2012), 288.

34. Merleau Maurice Ponty, *Phenomenology of perception*, (New York, Routledge, 2002), 79.

35. Christian Suhr, "Can Film Show the Invisible? The Work of Montage in Ethnographic Filmmaking", *Current Anthropology* (2012), 288.

Sher Ali, Shu weaver from Chitral, Northern Pakistan

Film and Memory

Connerton highlights how "our experience of the present very largely depends upon our knowledge of the past"³⁶ and enables us to understand our present reality. However, Roxana Waterson³⁷ points out the limited attention both film and memory has had in anthropology since David MacDougall's essay on "Films of memory,"³⁸ I therefore decided to intertwine and explore the dynamics between memory and craft.

Waterson argues that importance of filmed testimony, which is part of the present, can give clues of the speakers manner and self-presentation.³⁹ I agree with this point, as in the case of Hamal Begum (embroiderer) her style of speech, the pitch, tone and tempo of voice, pauses, hesitations, facial expressions, body language, gesture all illustrated her emotion and state of mind. This is shown in her narrative through contrasting close up video shots of domestic textiles and making.

Warin and Dennis highlight how food, embroidery, the construction of memory and identities are strongly interconnected. They mention "food and cloth are often the locus of recollections and memories of family or community past"⁴⁰. This is reflected in the discussion I had with Hamal Begum where she underlined the value of livestock herding in her community; through which they produced wool for craftwork, butter, cheese and milk for their daily living. She integrates livestock herding with issues such healthcare and dowry and compared them to the olden days.

I particular want to discuss the short clip of the embroidered mantelpiece cloth, which was filled with western style medicines and other household items including family photographs. The colours, patterns, and intricacy of the embroidered cloth represented the ways in which memories of habitual, multisensual and corporeal activities of everyday practices are

36. Paul Connerton, *How societies remember*. (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1989), 2.

37. Roxana Waterson, "Trajectories of Memory: Documentary Film and the Transmission of Testimony", *History and Anthropology*, (2007).

38. David MacDougall, *Films of memory*, in *Transcultural Cinema*, Princeton University Press, 1998).

39. Roxana Waterson, "Trajectories of Memory: Documentary Film and the Transmission of Testimony", *History and Anthropology*, (2007), 61

40. Megan Warin and Simone Dennis, "Threads of Memory: Reproducing the Cypress Tree through Sensual Consumption", *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, (2005), 167.

embedded in one's personal environment. Here Macdougall mentions that images of objects have a physical link with remembered past.⁴¹ Thus, I decided to integrate visuals of the *Plaesk*⁴² (rug) making, close up video of the textures of the rug, along with a local women knitting. All represented the cultural significance of traditional livestock herding while exploring the habits of the hands and body of remembering the past.

Sound as a Method

Paul Henley highlights the study of soundscapes to be underdeveloped in anthropology even though sound can contribute significantly to the meaning and experience of a film.⁴³ In the Madaklashti culture, which is heavily infused by legends and myths of Central Asia and the subcontinent, music has been an important element to their natural and cultural surroundings. Mohammed Irfan points out that in the valley of Hindu Kush “the love for music is very old and equally common.”⁴⁴ I chose to interweave this as a backdrop enabling the viewer to connect with the Chitrali and Madaklashti culture.

I will discuss two sounds used in the beginning; a short song sung by folk musician Gulnaz Tanha playing the *daf*,⁴⁵ and one in the end playing the flute. For me, hearing Gulnaz sing in his frail voice alongside his *daf* created a celebratory aspect. By incorporating his song I was able to experiment and take film beyond the visual hegemony. During the song, I was able to juxtapose other visuals alongside his song. The one scene in particular that I want to discuss was of an elderly artisan Gul Bibi. In the scene you see her applying *surma*⁴⁶ in her eyes and then putting back it her small-embroidered pouch. It was the stark contrast of the folk song, alongside the texture of different types of material, needlework and the roughness of her skin, hands and fingers that signified the harsh and challenging life of the community. Furthermore, I purposely did not insert any subtitles for the song as I felt it might detract the viewer from the overall experience.

Gul Bibi, applying Surma at Garam Chashma Village, Chitral, Pakistan

41. David MacDougall, “Films of Memory”, *Visual Anthropology Review*, (1992), 30.

42. *Palesk* is a hand woven rug in contrasting natural shades of local goat hair and is woven on an upright wooden frame loom.

43. Paul Henley, “Seeing, Hearing, Feeling, Sound and the Despotism of the Eye in “Visual” Anthropology”, *Visual Anthropology Review*, (2007), 59.

44. Mohammed Irfan, *Proceedings of the Third International Hindu Kush Cultural Conference*, (Karachi, Oxford University Press, 2008), 144.

45. *Daf* is a large Persian frame drum, popular in classical and folk music.

46. Organic eye cosmetic used widely by men and women in South Asia and the Middle East.

The sound of the flute used at the end was played by the local artisan Mir Azam. It offers an alternative perception for the viewer; as Randy Thom points out power of sound, "we're not aware that it's affecting us in the way that it is."⁴⁷ Thus, by using the combined effect of the aural and visual I was not just trying to illustrate a part of their tradition but attempting to take the viewer on a vicarious experience, which would provide them with multiple perspectives that push the boundary of film.

Conclusion

My reason for undertaking fieldwork to produce a short sensory film, as oppose to writing a library dissertation, was to communicate and showcase an updated and improved understanding on how themes on material culture can be handled. This project could not be made possible without the voices of the artisan community. The field experience gave me the opportunity to convey their thoughts and emotions as primary references, exactly as they were voiced. Library research and traditional theory alone could not have achieved this. In conclusion, I have attempted to showcase a sensuous and phenomenological aspect of skill and making that is instilled in the everyday practice of Madaklashti community. Using a multidisciplinary approach, this study has engaged in themes of aesthetics, dexterity, global capitalism, practice and memory, all of which makes it significant to the discourse of craft within the field of anthropology.

I have demonstrated the power of audiovisual and montage can have in creating and communicating ethnographical knowledge. It challenges the conventional notion of authorship, as the anthropologist/filmmaker, subject and audience/reader constitute together "the study of image-making". As "a film not only possesses an indexical trace of what occurred in front of the camera, and sound recorder, but also an indexical trace of how the filmmaker undertook to encounter others. It is the trace of an encounter."⁴⁸ Hence, this widens the debates around representation.

The film *Kasb-e-Hunar (Skilled Enclave)* is an effort to visually capture and highlight the value of skill, passed from preceding generations. It provides an insight into the multifaceted dimension of their craft skill intertwined with key global issues. These methods illustrate the subtleties and complex relationship between the artisan and their craft, as it pushes "anthropological research to be more accessible for audiences outside academia but also enrich it from within, allowing it to elaborate upon a sensorial understanding of culture and society".⁴⁹

47. Randy Thom, *Soundscape: the School of Sound Lectures*. (Wallflower Press, 2003), 157.

48. Bill Nichols, "Can Film Show the Invisible? The Work of Montage in Ethnographic Filmmaking", *Current Anthropology* (2012), 298.

49. Giulia Battaglia, *Arts and Aesthetics in a Globalizing World*. (Bloomsbury Publishing, 2014), 252.

Bibliography

- Battaglia, G. Reflections upon the Meaning of Contemporary Digital Image-making Practices in India in Kaur, R. & P. D. Mukherji *Arts and Aesthetics in a Globalizing World*. Bloomsbury Publishing. 2014.
- Connerton, P. *How societies remember*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 1989.
- Charny, D. Thinking of Making in *Power of making: the importance of being skilled*. London: V & A Publishing and the Crafts Council. 2011.
- Chaudhry, A. G., Ahmed, A., Khan, S. E., Zeeshan, M., Bhatti, A. G., & Farooq, H. Active Ageing and Elders Health: An Anthropological Perspective of Older Persons. *Anthropologist*, 714-718. 2015.
- Degen, C. Temporality, Narrative, and the Ageing Self. *The Cambridge Journal of Anthropology*, 50-63. 2005.
- Dormer, P. *The art of the maker*. London: Thames & Hudson. 1994.
- Edwards, E. Photographs and the Sound of History . *Visual Anthropology Review* 27–46. 2005.
- Edwards E, ed. 1992. *Anthropology and Photography 1865–1920*. New Haven, CT/London: Yale Univ. Press. 1992.
- Gowlland, G. Unpacking Craft Skills: What Can Images Reveal about the Embodied Experience of Craft? *Visual Anthropology*, 286-297. 2015.
- Grasseni, S. Skilled Visions: Towards an Ecology of Visual Inscriptions in Banks, M. & Ruby, J. (ed.), *Made to be seen: Perspectives on the history of visual anthropology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 2011.
- Henley , P. Seeing, Hearing, Feeling, Sound and the Despotism of the Eye in "Visual" Anthropology . *Visual Anthropology Review* 54–63. 2007.
- Hastrup, K. Anthropological visions: some notes on visual and textual authority. In *Film as ethnography*. Crawford, P. I. & D. Turton. Manchester University Press. 1992.
- Irfan, M. The Phoenix and Khowar Music. In Din.I. *Proceedings of the Third International Hindu Kush Cultural Conference*. Karachi. Oxford University Press. 2008.
- Ingold, T. 'Introduction to Social Life' in T. Ingold (ed.) *Companion Encyclopedia of Anthropology: Humanity, Culture and Social Life*. Routledge: London. 1994.
- . *Being alive: Essays on movement, knowledge and description*. London: Routledge. 2011.
- Kiener, W. Traveling images - towards an ethnographic cinema of montage. *Paper presented at Colloque du Cinéma Ethnographique à l'Anthropologie Visuelle, Muse e de l'Homme, Paris*. 2006.
- Kiener, W. The absent and the cut. *Visual Anthropology* 393–409. 2008.
- Lehmann, A. S. Showing Making: On Visual Documentation and Creative Practice. *The Journal of Modern Craft*, 9-24. 2012.
- Langfield, M, & P. Maclean. But Pineapple I'm still a Bit Wary Of : Sensory Memories of Jewish Women Who Migrated to Australia as Children 1938-39. *Speaking to Immigrants: Oral Testimony and the History of Australian Migration*. Eds. A. J. Hammerton & E. Richards. Canberra: History Program and Centre for Immigration and Multicultural Studies, Research School of Social Sciences, The Australian National University. 83-109. 2000.
- Macdougall, D. Films of Memory . *Visual Anthropology Review* 29–37. 1992.
- . Films of memory, in *Transcultural Cinema*, Princeton University Press. 1998.
- . *The corporeal image: film, ethnography, and the senses*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. 2006.

- Marchand, T. H. Knowledge in Hand: Explorations of Brain, Hand and Tool in Fardon, R., Harris, O., Marchand, T. H., Nuttall, M., Shore, C., Strang, V., & Wilson, R. (2012). *The SAGE Handbook of Social Anthropology*. London: Sage Publications. 2012.
- McKenna, E. 'Understanding Domestication and various Philosophical views', in E. McKenna, *Pets, People, and Pragmatism*. Fordham Scholarship Online. 19-43. 2013.
- Merleau-Ponty, M. *Phenomenology of perception*. New York: Routledge. 2002.
- , *Phenomenology of perception*. London: Routledge. 1962.
- Nichols, B. Comments In Suhr, C. & R. Willerslev Can Film Show the Invisible? The Work of Montage in Ethnographic Filmmaking. *Current Anthropology* 282–301. 2012.
- Pink, S. Sensory digital photography: re-thinking 'moving' and the image. *Visual Studies*, 4-13. 2011.
- Sennett, R. *The craftsman*. Yale University Press. 2008.
- Stoller, P. *Sensuous Scholarship*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1989.
- Suhr, C. & R. Willerslev Can Film Show the Invisible? The Work of Montage in Ethnographic Filmmaking. *Current Anthropology* 282–301. 2012.
- Thom, R. Designing a Movie of Sound In L. Sider, D. Freeman, J. Sider, *Soundscape: the School of Sound Lectures*. Wallflower Press. 2003.
- Warin, M. & S. Dennis Threads of Memory: Reproducing the Cypress Tree through sensual consumption. *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 159–170. 2005.
- Waterson, R. Trajectories of Memory: Documentary Film and the Transmission of Testimony. *History and Anthropology* 51–73. 2007.
- Weiner, J. Televisualist anthropology: representation, aesthetics, politics. *Current Anthropology*. 197-235. 1997.