

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Great Plains Quarterly

Great Plains Studies, Center for

Winter 1999

Review of *Changing Ones: Third and Fourth Genders in Native North America* By Will Roscoe

Sue-Ellen Jacobs

University of Washington

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly>



Part of the [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#)

Jacobs, Sue-Ellen, "Review of *Changing Ones: Third and Fourth Genders in Native North America* By Will Roscoe" (1999). *Great Plains Quarterly*. 1605.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly/1605>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Quarterly by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

Changing Ones: Third and Fourth Genders in Native North America. By Will Roscoe. Foreword by Randy Burns. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1998. Illustrations, tables, glossary, notes, bibliography, index. viii + 320 pp. \$24.95.

In the 212 text pages of *Changing Ones*, Roscoe demonstrates his storytelling abilities as he reweaves previously published papers with a canonical polemic that deeply engages his own and others' writings about purported Native American sexuality, sex, and gender definitions and practices. In presenting his analysis of select writings on "berdache," he generously acknowledges those who have become his adversaries by painstakingly replaying those authors' points of view against his own interpretations. For example, in the field of sexuality studies, Roscoe's disagreement with Ramón Gutiérrez ("Must We Deracinate Indians to Find Gay Roots?" *Out/Look* [Winter 1989]) and Richard Trexler (*Sex and Conquest: Gender Construction and Political Order*

at the Time of the European Conquest of the Americas, 1995) is well known, but for the sake of those who do not follow such studies, he reprises his previously published arguments point-by-point. His disagreements with specific feminist theories and their leading scholars, published originally in 1994, are elaborated here in several chapters, each a nominal revision of previously published papers.

In presenting revisions of his earlier writings, Roscoe maintains the core theories he has espoused since his work with Gay American Indians of San Francisco (*Living the Spirit: A Gay American Indian Anthology*, 1988). Indeed, in this new book, his first chapter carries nearly the same title as his theoretical essay in *Living the Spirit*: "'Strange Country This': An Introduction to North American Gender Diversity" (1998); "'Strange Country This': Images of Berdaches and Warrior Women" (1988). The stories about women told in the 1988 work are retold here in Chapter Four, "Warrior Women and Women Chiefs: Alternative Identities and Genders for Native Women," which contains the principal accounts of Plains cultural examples.

The strength of this work is its gathering together writings by a serious scholar of American Indian cultures who was the first to bring Native voices to the conversations about homosexuality, sex role transformations, and gender diversity. A steadfast ally of those who founded and expanded the work of Gay American Indians, he has extended his own involvement in their causes outside the Bay area. Having his writings brought together in an accessible book, along with a greatly expanded versions of his 1987 "Bibliography of Berdache and Alternative Gender Roles Among North American Indians," increases the work's value.

Although little about Plains culture is included, the references made are useful, and overall the volume is well worth a thorough reading.

SUE-ELLEN JACOBS
Department of Women Studies
University of Washington