American Literary Images Of The Canadian Prairies, 1860-1910

James Doyle
Wilfrid Laurier University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly

Part of the Other International and Area Studies Commons

https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsquarterly/1734

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Quarterly by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.
In 1879, the prolific dime novelist Edward L. Wheeler produced a narrative entitled *Canada Chet, The Counterfeiter Chief*, set in "a location as hitherto quite neglected by the pen of the novelist and veracious historian—i.e., in the British possessions to the North-west of Minnesota." If, as Wheeler suggests, American writers were indifferent to the Canadian West in the nineteenth century, this lack of attention can be related to a number of considerations, the most obvious of which is the fact that Americans were sufficiently occupied by the undeveloped regions within their own border. The westward experience in the United States was a nationalistic phenomenon, related to the visions of freedom and unique identity that preoccupied the collective thought and imagination to the exclusion of extraterritorial regions, except insofar as these regions occasionally figured in ideals of continental or hemispheric unity.

Wheeler’s comments on American neglect of the Canadian West require some qualification. Throughout the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries there was a small but steadily increasing American expression of interest in the Canadian prairies. This interest, as it emerged in economic and demographic activity and the rhetoric of “manifest destiny,” has been documented by modern American and Canadian scholars. Little attention has been devoted, however, to the image of the region as it appears sporadically in imaginative writing. The importance of this image is well established in scholarly tradition. “It is a truism of history,” as Robin Winks has pointed out, “that what people believe to be true is more important than what ‘in fact’ actually happened, since they act upon their beliefs, not on ‘the facts.’”

Henry Nash Smith, in his classic study, *Virgin Land: The American West in Symbol and Myth*, has provided the definitive demonstration of the interaction between imaginative vision and empirical experience as they refer to the West.

As *Virgin Land* illustrates, the literary images
inspired by the western frontier were not necessarily incorporated into distinguished works of art. Writers such as Thoreau, Melville, and Whitman used impressionistic or symbolic conceptions of the West in various contexts, but the detailed literary exploitation of the region was left to the traveler, the journalist, and the writer of formulaic adventure fiction. This generalization is particularly applicable to the American image of the Canadian West, elements of which are found in travel narratives, feature magazine articles, and adventure fiction in the dime and nickel novel formats. This American writing about Canada is, comparatively speaking, neither extensive nor artistically significant; but a scrutiny of some examples may add to our understanding of the American conception of the western frontier.

The study of these works should also contribute to the continuing exploration of the similarities and differences between the Canadian and American Wests. Literary critics, historians, and other scholars have approached this subject from various angles and have established many important points of affinity and distinction. As Dick Harrison has pointed out in his introduction to Crossing Frontiers: Papers in American and Canadian Western Literature, the traditional distinction between the American “wild west” and the Canadian prairies, where social institutions preceded large-scale settlement, seems valid as a working generalization upon which to base more specific historical and literary studies. But such studies, as the papers in Harrison’s volume demonstrate, almost always involve the comparison of discrete national entities. This is particularly true in the case of literary studies: American novels about the American West are compared with Canadian novels about the Canadian West. This approach is inevitable, given the pervasive nationalistic inclinations of writers on both sides of the border. But some writers have from time to time glanced across the frontier line, and their impressions should be noted as adjuncts to the comparative study of the two regions and their cultures. It should be of particular value to examine the works of writers who flourished in the great age of westward expansion, extending from the American Civil War to the end of the first decade of the twentieth century, since it was in this period that the most prominent and durable conceptions of the West were formulated and established in the North American imagination.

In the scrutiny of literary works incorporating the American image of the Canadian West, some distinctions between travel writing and fiction must be recognized. In general, travel writers appear to be more faithful than novelists to verifiable empirical experience, and more interested in description than narrative, although they are often committed to a political or social ideology—such as continental unity, to mention the most important example—which lends a subtle but perceptible bias to their representations of the western frontier. Novelists, on the other hand, have less obligation to verifiable reality than to the conventions of the literary form with which they are working, and to the expectations of their readers. In such novels as Canada Chet, geographical and political accuracy is often sacrificed to the extravagant details of violent adventure and romantic love that the urban eastern reader of this kind of escape literature expected.

DIME NOVELS

The American fictional use of western Canada appears as early as 1859 in a novel entitled Pathaway; or, The Mountain Outlaws, by John Hovey Robinson. In Pathaway, as in the handful of similar productions, the setting is only vaguely characterized as “the Northwest” in the region of “the southern branch of the Saskatchewan.” In two other dime novels, Joseph E. Badger's The Lone Chief; or, The Trappers of the Saskatchewan (1873), and its sequel, Death Trailer, the Scourge of the Plains Crees (1873), the setting is more specifically identified as “many miles north of the line that divides the United States from the British possessions,” again in the region of the Saskatchewan River. The Saskatchewan seems to have been a favored choice among settings for
Northwest adventure stories; it figures also in W. J. Hamilton’s *Mountain Cid, The Free Ranger* (1878), which is set in “the foothills of the Saskatchewan.” It was, however, the exotic sound of the name rather than any considerations of geographic authenticity that led to its repeated use, for the mythic region of the Saskatchewan created by these novelists lacks either consistent local features or a clear relationship to the larger context of North American geography, except as such elements might be useful to the plot. In fact, plot creates landscape in this kind of fiction, for the authors conjure up a variety of environments, including thick forests for tracking and Indian fighting, rivers or lakes for canoe chases, foothills and mountains to inspire sentimental expressions of romantic sublimity, and open prairie for peaceful travel. The dominant landscape, however, seems to be a kind of badlands, as in *Pathaway*, where “the ground which the parties were now traversing was cut up and rendered dangerous by yawning chasms, jagged rocks, rifts, and gulches. There were marks everywhere around...of volcanic convulsions, that had at some period of the world’s history, upheaved the foundations of the mountains.”

The vague unrealism of the northwestern frontier is reflected also in its political and social structures, or rather the lack of them, for only occasionally is the setting identified in terms of national demarcations. *Pathaway* seems to be set in the Alberta-Montana frontier, but few place-names are mentioned, and all the characters except one French-Canadian trapper are evidently American. Badger’s *The Lone Chief* and *Death Trailer* are explicitly set north of the border, but except for a brigade of French-Canadian voyageurs in *Death Trailer*, all the characters are American; and only in *The Lone Chief* is there any specific use of a northern setting, as the action takes place in a snowbound winter landscape. Edward L. Wheeler, the author of *Canada Chet*, seems to have had some interest in the idea of Canada as a separate country, but this interest was developed in a comic direction. *Canada Chet* seems almost to be a clumsy fable of the vicissitudes of Canadian-American relations, for the title character is a fiery, American-hating British loyalist who lies in wait in his secret stronghold on the Manitoba prairies, ready to seize unwary American travelers and put them to work as slave laborers in his counterfeiting shop. One of Wheeler’s later novels, *Deadwood Dick Jr.’s Desperate Strait; or, The Demon Doctor of Dixon’s Deposit* (1892) is set in a prairie town that “enjoyed one distinction: namely it did not know positively whether it belonged to the States or to the Dominion.” But the town’s location on the international boundary is the occasion only for some incidental humor, while the main plot has to do with a mad doctor’s attempt to infect various people with hydrophobia.

The Northwest of these adventure novels is little more than a minor variation on the stylized fictional American West. The landscape is that of the remote and limitless frontier; the heroes are rugged individuals, usually Americans, often modeled on Cooper’s Leatherstocking, who impose rough frontier justice on evildoers. Canadian or British institutions are seldom in evidence. Even the Northwest Mounted Police are generally excluded from these novels, for the American fictional romanticization of the scarlet force belongs to a later period, the early twentieth century, and particularly to the efforts of the popular Michigan novelist James Oliver Curwood. Wheeler, in *Canada Chet*, makes brief use of the Mounties, bringing them in toward the end of his story like the U.S. Cavalry to effect a last-minute rescue; but his ambiguous references to them as “the Mounted Police” and “mounted Manitoba volunteers” suggest that his knowledge of the force was uncertain.

Yet it is an oversimplification to say that these writers “Americanized” the Canadian West. Certainly they used stereotyped characters and social traditions with which they and their readers were comfortably familiar. But it seems that their purpose was not to suggest that the Canadian prairies were or should have been part of the United States; they implied, rather, that on the Northwest frontier,
far from eastern customs and institutions, such labels as “American” and “Canadian” lost much of their significance. On the free and open frontier, where a man’s worth was related primarily to the art of survival, national pride—like that of Wheeler’s militant Canada Chet—was sometimes even a character defect.

Some of the various Leatherstocking avatars in the fictional Northwest are identified in terms that suggest their liberation from narrow political and social structures. The reputation of Nick Whiffles, the old frontier scout in Robinson’s Pathaway, extends “up the Big Red,” “down the Columby,” “on the southern slopes of the Rocky Mountains,” and “cross the lakes to Montreal.”12 Similarly, W. J. Hamilton’s Mountain Gid, the “free ranger,” “had wandered from the shores of the Golden Horn off San Francisco, to Halifax on the east, and from the uttermost regions penetrated by the trappers to the north-west of Hudson’s Bay to the mouth of the Rio Grande.”13

TRAVEL NARRATIVES

The dime novelists’ emphasis on the vastness and openness of the western landscape may also be seen as a commitment to the idea of a continental unity dominated by the United States. The heroes of these novels are all American, and their adventures reflect such values as rugged individualism and intuitive virtue that are associated in popular culture with the frontier United States. Most American authors of narratives of travel in the Canadian West were obliged by the accepted conventions of the genre to be more explicit about geography and political and social structures, although in detailing their observations and impressions they often revealed their commitment to some form of American domination of the continent. Some travelers, on the other hand, were quite receptive to the idea of an independent Canada and were prepared to contemplate the possible alternatives to American society that Canadians might achieve in the West.

These generalizations are not meant to imply that there were a great many travelers from the United States in the northern plains. Judging from the number of published travel narratives, relatively few Americans made tours (or side trips) to the Canadian West. Before the opening of the Canadian Pacific Railway in the mid-1880s, most travelers in the “great lone land” of British North America were from England or eastern Canada; westward-bound Americans found more than enough undeveloped country and adventurous experience on their own side of the border. Even after the railway made tourism and immigration easier, there was not a great increase in literary attention to the northern provinces.

Early American travelers into the Canadian plains included government and military officials, explorers, and surveyors, all of whom seem to have assumed that the region would eventually become a part of the United States. Governor Alexander Ramsey of Minnesota visited the Red River of the North in 1851; in 1855 an Indian affairs agent ventured into what later became Alberta; and a group of explorers looking for a route through the Rockies included British territory in their 1859 expedition.14

In 1860, an editor of the New York World named Manton Marble contributed to Harper’s New Monthly Magazine a three-part narrative entitled “To Red River and Beyond,” describing his overland trek from Saint Paul to Fort Garry. Unlike the dime novelists, Marble was more interested in the processes of cultural and economic development than in the opportunities for anarchistic individualism and adventure on the prairies. Like a tourist in Montreal or some other older eastern settlement, he inspected the Roman Catholic cathedral in Saint Boniface and the English church in Fort Garry. Also unlike most of the novelists, he was interested in comparing the relative achievements of Americans and Canadians on the frontier, noting with satisfaction signs of inefficiency and slow development north of the border. At Fort Garry, he observed two workmen laboriously using a heavy ripsaw while a steam-powered circular saw stood idle nearby, and commented that such a thing would not
be allowed to happen "in an American settlement."15

Ten years later another contributor to Harper's, Brigadier General Randolph B. Marcy of the U.S. Army visited and wrote of the same region in more disparaging terms. Vehemently anti-British, Marcy argued that the slow and inefficient development in the Canadian Northwest is the fault of the shortsightedness of "English capitalists, [who,] when called upon to loose their purse strings for any purpose involving the slightest hazard, are as alien in their instincts to their descendants in the United States as if their lineage had no approximation since the flood."16 In a similar vein, Marcy condemns the English policies toward the plains Indians and accuses the British of opposing immigration into the Northwest in order to perpetuate the fur trade and the Hudson's Bay Company monopoly.

Another American visitor to Manitoba in the pre-Canadian Pacific years was Henry Van Dyke, a distinguished New York clergyman, essayist, poet, and short story writer. Like Marble and Marcy, Van Dyke noted the primitive stages of settlement and development on the Canadian prairies and reported the disillusionment of many British and English-Canadian immigrants. "Large numbers, being dissatisfied, have recrossed the line, and settled in Dakota and Minnesota. In Pembina County alone the number of Canadians is reckoned at one-half the population."17

In contrast to these travelers, the Boston novelist and historian Charles Carleton Coffin found south-central Manitoba and the burgeoning settlement of Fort Garry as worthy of praise as the farming regions of Illinois and Minnesota that he had come West to publicize. In his travel book The Seat of Empire (1871), describing his 1869 expedition from Chicago to Duluth, Coffin's only complaint is directed against "the pusillanimity of President Polk" for the resignation of American claims to the Saskatchewan Valley.18 Even without republican political and economic advantages, the northern Red River country, according to Coffin, was fostering the same prosperous and self-reliant agrarian society as was developing in the northern American Middle West.

The Riel Rebellions of 1870 and 1885 provoked some American interest in the Canadian prairies, particularly among journalists and expansionist politicians who saw the possibility of repeating the experience of Oregon in the midcontinent. But except for a few vociferous demagogues and sensationalistic reporters, Americans were cautious in their attitudes toward Canadian political developments and suspicious of the French-speaking Métis rebels. After only a few heated speeches and articles, American attention wandered from the subject, particularly after the Canadian government effected an apparently successful resolution of northwestern problems.19

Even the completion of the Canadian Pacific Railway did not at first cause a great increase in American interest in the region. As James B. Hedges has pointed out, American westward immigrants continued until about 1892 to be almost exclusively interested in the land still available in the United States; most American tourists likewise were more interested in their own country than in Canada.20 There were, however, a few exceptions, including the authors of three noteworthy book-length travel narratives on western Canada.

William Henry Harrison Murray (1840-1904), the author of several novels of adventure set on the western and northern frontiers, traveled the Canadian Pacific Railway from Montreal to Vancouver and described his experiences in an episodic, idiosyncratic, alternately facetious and bombastic volume entitled Daylight Land (1888). A strenuous advocate of continental unity, Murray saw the geographical affinity between the Canadian and American plains as proof of the inevitable union of the two countries. "Never did man see a lovelier evidence of God's design and Nature's unity," he declared in a Boston speech after returning from Canada, "than stretches, green as a sleeping sea, from Southern gulf to the white line of Northern snow, making in itself a prairie empire that would feed half a world."21 Throughout the chapters of Daylight Land
dealing with the prairie provinces, Murray emphasizes the potential of the region. “The productive area of this western Canada,” declares an American traveler in one of the many semifictional dialogues in the book, “is ten times larger than the State of Illinois. Two hundred millions of people can be supported, richly supported, north of the forty-ninth parallel.” Murray goes on to suggest that the Canadian prairies offer Americans the opportunity to abandon the consequences of past mistakes and create a new and better agrarian empire in the West. “As the soil to the south under our silly system of agriculture becomes exhausted, as it soon will be, and the average yield per acre shrinks more and more, the wheat growers must and will move northward.”

Murray's aggressive annexationist conception of the Canadian West can be contrasted to the view of another American author who visited the prairies at about the same time and saw the region, as he saw Canada as a whole, as a valid alternative to the United States. Charles Dudley Warner (1829-1900), the eminent New England man of letters and one-time collaborator of Mark Twain, recorded in his “Comments on Canada” (1890) his impressions of the railway excursion from Montreal to Vancouver. Unlike Murray, Warner carefully studied not only the landscape and settlements, but the western Canadian political and social situations. His observations of the strong British loyalism among prairie settlers and his recognition of the contribution of the transcontinental railway to Canadian national unity led him to the conclusion that in spite of American economic and cultural influences the northern country was destined to remain “for a long time on her present line of development in a British connection.”

This acknowledgment of the probable durability of Canadian independence from the United States led Warner to seek a definition of the unique western Canadian identity. His attempts, however, significantly avoid specific detail. Manitoba, he declares, has a “free, independent spirit”; “one can mark already with tolerable distinctness a Canadian type which is neither English nor American”; “there is a distinct feeling of nationality, and it is increasing.” But Warner does not elaborate on the “Canadian type” or this “feeling of nationality.” In spite of his assertions of Canadian distinctness from the United States, his ultimate conclusion is that western Canada is mainly a reflection of the western United States as it was twenty or thirty years earlier. In a series of companion essays to “Comments on Canada” entitled “Studies in the South and West,” Warner expresses the urban easterner’s approval of the spread of urbanization and industrialization in the western states; in “Comments on Canada,” as he approvingly observes the same processes in much earlier stages of development, he also expresses a nostalgic attraction for the primitive frontier.

This same ambivalence is even more evident in Julian Ralph’s On Canada’s Frontier (1892). Ralph (1853–1903), a New York journalist and novelist, toured the American and Canadian Middle West by rail and horseback, and like Warner, he admired the signs of civilization and material progress that were transforming the region, particularly in the United States. “Our wild life in this country [the U.S.],” he wrote in On Canada’s Frontier, “is, happily, gone. The frontiersman is more difficult to find than the frontier, the cowboy has become a laborer almost like any other, our Indians are as the animals in our parks, and there is little of our country that is not threaded by railroads or wagon-ways.” But if Ralph’s modern urban sensibilities applaud the disappearance of the Wild West, part of him delights in discovering the Canadian plains, much of which remains in 1892 “as Nature and her near of kin, the red men, had it of old.” Most of On Canada’s Frontier is a sentimental celebration
of America’s vanishing West, as it is reflected obliquely in the small and scattered homesteads and settlements, the rugged pioneers, and the vast stretches of undisturbed prairie in Canada.

LAND AND IMMIGRATION PROMOTERS

By the mid-1890s, the dominant American attitude toward the Canadian West was moving closer to W. H. H. Murray’s boosterism than to the nostalgic admiration of Warner or Ralph. With the advent of Wilfrid Laurier’s Liberal government at Ottawa in 1896 and the implementation of an aggressive policy of encouragement to foreign investors and settlers, the way was cleared for the American “invasion” of the Canadian West. The image of invasion was an especially popular cliché among the many American journalists and popular writers who were enlisted by private land promoters and by the Canadian Department of the Interior to publicize the northern prairies in the United States.

The first priorities of these promotional writers were to dispel American ignorance, indifference, or hostility toward Canada and to emphasize the geographical unity of the western plains and the ethnic homogeneity of the English-speaking North American people. A writer in the Cosmopolitan in 1894 referred to “the number of [American] tourists one sees in Canada provided with heavy clothing, and sweltering in a temperature of one hundred degrees in the shade,” but by 1903 another writer was prepared to claim that promotional efforts had “changed the Western farmer’s conception of the Canadian Northwest, which he formerly looked on as akin to Siberia.”

Yet while these publicists reassured prospective immigrants of the geographical continuity between the American and Canadian Middle West, they did not want to suggest that the regions were identical. Like the travelers Charles Dudley Warner and Julian Ralph, they represented the northern prairie as comparable to the American plains as they were twenty-five to fifty years earlier, before the disappearance of free land and the rise of cities. Thus an article on “The Great Plains of Canada” emphasized the “vastness and solitude and silence” of Manitoba, while other writers dwelt on the economic potential of the region. Western Canada offered “millions of acres of good wheat land waiting for occupation by the surplus population of the world”; “a vast country with abundance of the very best grain-growing, cattle raising [land]”; and agricultural resources “sufficient, if developed, to support a population of 200,000,000.”

Most of these writers emphasized, as W. H. H. Murray did, the infinite potential of the Canadian prairies, and many of them shared his belief in continental unity. “The enterprising ‘Yankee,’ as the people from the United States are called in Canada . . . cross[es] a boundary line which is largely imaginary”; “Americans and Canadians are so much alike that they fraternize wonderfully well in this new country—much better, in fact, than English and Canadians”; “the Canadians are Americans—they can’t help themselves.” Other writers, however, draw back from annexationist statements—perhaps for fear of offending their magazines’ Canadian readers, or perhaps for the more important reason that their primary intended audience is the dissatisfied American farmer, who would not want to find in Canada a mere continuation of the economic and political conditions he has found unsatisfactory. “It is not Canada’s destiny to become annexed to the United States,” wrote popular novelist James Oliver Curwood in 1905, just beginning his literary career as a contributor to magazines. “Four out of five of the Americans, while not overjoyed at being subjects of a king, would vote against annexation to the United States.”

The ideal conception of western Canada seems to be that of a new yet familiar nation, like the United States but not of it, sharing the virtues derived from the Jeffersonian ideal of a nation of yeoman farmers, while avoiding many of the modern republic’s economic and political errors.

This is essentially the view expounded by Emerson Hough (1857–1923), author of The Covered Wagon (1922) and many other popular
AMERICAN LITERARY IMAGES OF THE CANADIAN PRAIRIES

novels of the old West. In a discursive, idiosyncratic book, The Sowing: A 'Yankee's' View of England's Duty to Herself and to Canada (1909), Hough addressed the problem of settling the Canadian West, which he recognized as the last North American agrarian frontier. No annexationist, Hough was quite prepared to accept the idea of a Canadian West independent of the United States and bound by tradition and loose constitutional ties to England. Indeed, it was ethnic unity rather than political unity that interested him; in his view, English-speaking immigrants from the British isles, with their long tradition of “Anglo-Saxon” liberalism, were to be preferred over a polyglot peasantry from the despotic societies of continental Europe. A major problem, however, was that the majority of British immigrants came from the overcrowded urban slums and were unfit by physical and psychological inadequacies for the strenuous life of farming the plains.

Hough’s proposed solution, combining a scheme of selective immigration with government-run training facilities for would-be homesteaders, is politically naive and morally suspect, since it calls for a complex and rather autocratic administrative structure and is based on late nineteenth-century theories of racial superiority. But the image of the Canadian West in The Sowing is at least interesting as a semi-Utopian view of the subject that avoids both the frontier nostalgia of such writers as Charles Dudley Warner and Julian Ralph and the annexationist assumptions of other travelers and commentators. Hough’s view of the Canadian West is perhaps closest to the predominant post-Confederation view that Canadians held of themselves, since it involves an independent Canada, potentially equal or even superior to the United States, inheriting in the twentieth century the major role in the westward destiny of the English-speaking people.

CONCLUSION

After 1911, with the defeat of Wilfrid Laurier’s government and the gradual subsiding of United States immigration and investment activities in the Canadian West, Americans tended to lose interest in the subject. Until that time, however, many of them saw the Canadian prairies—in the words of the dominion government’s famous slogan—as the “last best west,” where the great American pioneering experience could be carried on beyond the “closing” of the United States frontier, into a geographical and imaginative infinity. The celebration of infinitude—of free and open frontiers receding endlessly toward an indeterminate horizon—is a recurrent image in the American writing about the Canadian West. Again and again, in the few dime novels of the Northwest, in the narratives of travelers, in the appeals of land promotion publicists and journalists, we find the exuberant—and sometimes wistful—rhetoric of spatial infinitude, echoing the most pervasive element of the “American dream.” The western vision, as more imaginative writers such as Henry Thoreau, Herman Melville, and Walt Whitman knew, can be found anywhere: in the northeastern or southern seas, in the microcosmic environs of a New England village, in the capacious sensibilities of the poetic imagination. But first and always, it is found in the North American West. And, as a few American writers saw and articulated, it could be found even in Canada.

NOTES


5. John Hovey Robinson, Pathaway; or, Nick Whiffles, the Old Trapper of the Nor’West (New York: Beadle, 1878), p. 3. This edition, with its slightly different subtitle, is the same novel as that published in 1859.


10. See Sharp, Whoop-Up Country, p. 70, for the suggestion that some Americans reacted at first with suspicion to the Mounted Police, who were seen as serving the interests of the Hudson’s Bay Company.


12. Robinson, Pathaway, p. 27.

13. Hamilton, Mountain Gid, p. 36.


20. Hedges, Building the Canadian West, p. 94.


23. Ibid., p. 145.

24. Ibid., pp. 146–47.


26. Ibid., pp. 437, 453, 455.


