

3-2011

Citation Analysis of Dissertations of Law Submitted to University of Delhi

Joginder Singh Burman
K.U. Kurukshetra

M. Sheela
K.U. Kurukshetra

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac>



Part of the [Library and Information Science Commons](#)

Burman, Joginder Singh and Sheela, M., "Citation Analysis of Dissertations of Law Submitted to University of Delhi" (2011). *Library Philosophy and Practice (e-journal)*. 579.

<http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphilprac/579>



<http://unllib.unl.edu/LPP/>

Library Philosophy and Practice 2011

ISSN 1522-0222

Citation Analysis of Dissertations of Law Submitted to University of Delhi

Dr. Joginder Singh Burman
Assistant Professor
Department of Library and Information Science
K.U. Kurukshetra-136119, Haryana (INDIA)

M. Sheela
M.Phil. Student
Department of Library and Information Science
K.U. Kurukshetra-136119, Haryana (INDIA)

Introduction

In ancient period, there was lack of mode of communication. The source of extensive of ideas was assembly. When judges write opinions, they perpetually cite cases and other authorities. Lawyers, legal scholars and judges all pepper their writings with links to earlier sources. Citations within court decision are nothing but arguments themselves and shows the decision of case. Analysis of the citations employed by Legal writers offers similar promise as a tool for exploration of legal thought. (Widdison, 2002). Yet, Bibliometrics, Citation Indexing, Citation Analysis all appear to have been practiced in the legal field long before they were introduced into scientific literature. Therefore, when two Judges who are deciding different cases, cite some of the same authorities, this does mean that those cases are, at least somehow, relevant to each other (Smith, 2007).

Citation Analysis is the applied research method by librarians, teachers and information scientist to indicate the relationship that exist between cited and citing document. Martyn (1975) says, "a Citation implies the relationship between a part or whole of the cited document or the whole of the citing documents". Thus, Citation analysis is useful for understanding subject relationships, authors effectiveness, publication trends and so on. It looks at citations to and from documents. If, there is a citation between two documents, there is some kind of relationship between these texts. This relationship can be further explored and used to learn more about the characteristics of the connected documents. (Feather and Sturges, 2003). The present study focused at deriving qualitative and quantitative analysis based on the citations collected from the end of the dissertations submitted in 2006 by the

students of LLM,University of Delhi, Delhi.

Objectives:

The study intends to identify the following objectives:

1. Form-wise distribution of documents cited by LLM Students.
2. Ranking List of Journals.
3. Authorship Pattern in citations.
4. Country-wise distribution of the journals.
5. Subject-wise distribution of the journals.
6. Year-wise distribution of Periodical literature.

Methodology

A total of 3,052 citations have been collected from Thirty Three dissertations available in the Campus Law Centre Library, University of Delhi, Delhi. The citations appended to each dissertation under the study were collected using a predefined 5" x 3" slips.

Data Analysis and Interpretation

Data collected from the source dissertations have been classified, tabulated and analyzed in accordance with the set objectives of the study. Only data belonging to the periodicals have been analyzed in depth.

Table 1. Form-wise distribution of the documents

Sr.No.	Forms of Documents	No. of Citations	%	p>Cumulative	
		No. of Citations	%		
1	Journals	779	25.52	779	25.52
2	Text Books	678	22.21	1457	47.73
3	Constitutions/Statutes/Acts	499	16.34	1956	64.08
4	Reports	283	9.27	2239	73.36
5	Web-sites	257	8.42	2496	81.78
6	Reviews	245	8.02	2741	89.81
7	Conventions/Conferences	186	6.09	2927	95.90
8	Reference Books	67	2.19	2994	98.1
9	Newspapers	27	0.88	3021	98.98

10	Magazines	16	0.52	3027	99.50
11	Not identified	15	0.49	3052	100
	Total	3052	100	100	100

Table1 shows that out of 3,052 total citations , 779 (25.52%) documents were in the form of Journal articles followed by Books i.e. 678 (22.21%) with a slightly difference. It is clearly revealed that around 50% information needs of LLM students are met by periodicals and books only. Constitutions /Statutes / Acts comes at the third with 499 (16.34%) citations followed by Reports, Web-sites, Reviews and Conventions / Conferences documents accounts to 9.27%, 8.42%, 8.02% and 6.09% respectively.15 publications could not be identified as they were not expressed properly.

Table 2. Ranked List of Journals

Sr.No.	Journal Title	Ranks	No. of Citations	%	Cumulative	
					No. of Citations	%
1	Economic Political Weekly	1	56	7.19	56	7.19
2	American Journal of International Law	2	44	5.65	100	12.84
3	CBI Bulletin	3	35	4.24	133	17.07
4	Delhi Law review	4	29	3.72	162	20.80
5	Indian Journal of International Law	5	22	2.82	184	23.62
6	Journal of Indian Law Institute	5	22	2.82	206	26.44
7	Indian Bar Review	6	21	2.70	227	26.57
8	Journal of International Economic Law	7	17	2.18	244	31.32
9	Journal of World Trade	7	17	2.18	261	33.50
10	International Comparative Law Quarterly	7	17	2.18	278	35.69
11	Supreme Court Cases	7	17	2.18	295	37.87
12	Journal of Intellectual Property Right	7	17	2.18	312	40.05
13	National Capital Law Journal	8	16	2.05	328	42.11
14	All India Report	8	16	2.05	344	44.16

15	European Journal of International Law	8	16	2.05	360	46.21
16	Criminal Law Journal	9	15	1.93	375	48.14
17	Harvard International Law Journal	9	15	1.93	390	50.06
18	Indian Journal of Public Administration	9	15	1.93	405	51.99
19	Centre India Law Quarterly	9	15	1.93	420	53.92
20	Indian Socio-Legal Journal	10	9	1.16	429	55.07
21	International Migration Review	10	9	1.16	438	56.23
22	Journal of Intellectual Property Rights	10	9	1.16	447	57.38
23	Supreme Court Yearly Digest	10	9	1.16	456	58.54
24	American Political Science Review	11	8	1.03	464	59.56
25	Cochin University Law Review	11	8	1.03	472	60.59
26	Journal of World Intellectual Property	11	8	1.03	480	61.62
27	Fordham International Law Journal	11	8	1.03	488	62.64
28	Denver Journal of International Law and Policy	11	8	1.03	496	63.67
29	Labor Law Reporter	11	8	1.03	504	64.70
30	Virginia Journal of International Law	12	7	0.90	511	65.60
31	Company Law Journal	12	7	0.90	518	66.50
32	Chicago Journal of International Law	12	7	0.90	525	67.39
33	Cardozo Journal of International and Comparative Law	12	7	0.90	532	68.29
34	Indian Police Journal	12	7	0.90	539	69.19
35	Annual Survey of Indian Law	12	7	0.90	546	70.09
36	Journal of International Arbitration	13	6	0.77	552	70.86
37	Kashmir University Law Review	13	6	0.77	558	71.63
38	Murdoch University Electronic Journal Law	13	6	0.77	564	72.40

39	Maharishi Dayanand University of Law Journal	13	6	0.77	570	73.17
40	European Intellectual Property Law Review	13	6	0.77	576	73.94
41	Supreme Court Journal	13	6	0.77	582	74.71
42	Labour and Industrial Cases	14	5	0.64	587	75.35
43	World Intellectual Property Journal	14	5	0.64	592	75.99
44	Allahabad Weekly Report Bulletin	14	5	0.64	597	76.64
45	Andhra Law Times	14	5	0.64	602	77.28
46	All India High Court Cases	14	5	0.64	607	77.92
47	Amity Law Review	14	5	0.64	612	78.56
48	Academic Law Review	14	5	0.64	617	79.20
49	Bangalore Law Journal	14	5	0.64	622	79.85
50	Africa Law Journal	14	5	0.64	627	80.49
51	Canadian Bar Review	14	5	0.64	632	81.13
52	Cornell International Law Journal	14	5	0.64	637	81.77
	Remaining 87 titles cited less than 5 times i.e. 1=42, 2 =64, 3=36, 4=0		142	18.22	779	100%

A total of 52 Journals have been identified in Tabel-2 in the field of Law. For each Journal title listed in the ranked list rank number, numbers of citations, cumulating percentage, etc. are given. These Journals are ranked in the ascending order based on the number of citations. It shows that the literature used by the researchers in the field of Law has been scattered in 52 core Journals with 637 (81.77%) citations and remaining 87 Journals account for 142 (18.22%) citations have been cited less than 5 times. It was observed that Economic Political Weekly (EPW) ranked at the top having 56(7.19%) citations followed by American Journal of International Law with 44 (5.65%) citations of the total. More than half of the total citations i.e. 390(50.06%) covers first 17 core Journals. This rank list will be useful to the librarian as well as the researcher in ascertaining the most important journals in the field of Law.

Table 3. Authorship Pattern

Sr. No.	No. of Authors	No. of Citations	%	Cumulative	
				No. of Citations	%

1	Single Author	622	79.84	622	79.84
2	Two Authors	127	16.30	749	96.14
3	Three Authors	17	2.18	766	98.33
4	Four Authors	8	1.02	774	99.35
5	More than Four Authors	5	0.64	779	100%
	Total	779	100%	779	100%

Table 3 indicates the authorship pattern reflected in periodical articles. It was observed that single author articles contributed 622 (79.84%) citations in the field of Law followed by two and three authors contributions with 127 (16.30%) and 17 (2.18%) respectively. The remaining 05(0.64%) articles were contributed by more than four authors.

Table 4. Country-wise distribution of periodicals

Sr. No.	Country-wise distribution	No. of Periodicals	%	Cumulative	
				No. of Periodicals	%
1.	USA	57	41.00	57	41.00
2.	India	52	37.41	109	78.41
3.	UK	17	12.23	126	90.65
4	Australia	03	2.15	129	92.80
5	New-York	03	2.15	132	94.95
6	Russia	02	1.43	134	96.40
7	Africa	02	1.43	136	97.85
8	Canada	01	0.71	137	98.56
9	France	01	0.71	138	99.27
10	East Timor	01	0.71	139	100%
	Total	139	100%	139	100%

Table 4 tells that the research scholars of law have cited the periodical from 10 countries in their research. Majority of the cited periodicals belongs to the three countries and out of these USA is at the top with 57(41%) periodicals followed by India with 52 (37.41%) and UK with 17(12.23%) periodical. Less than 10% periodicals were from other seven countries. This revealed that LLM students of University of Delhi, Delhi do not use only Indian periodicals but foreign periodicals also to a larger extent.

Table 5. Subject-wise distribution of Periodicals

Sr.No.	Subject	No. of Periodicals	%	Cumulative	
				Citations	%
1	Law	97	69.8	97	69.8
2	Science and Technology	15	10.8	112	80.6
3	Social Science	13	9.35	125	89.95
4	Economic	11	8.00	136	97.85
5	Education	3	2.15	139	100%
	Total	139	100	779	100%

Table 5 shows that 97 (69.78%) periodical cited by LLM students are from their own field i.e. Law followed by Science and Technology with 15(10.79%). They also cited periodicals from the field of Social Science, Economics and Education with 13 (9.35%), 11 (7.9%) and 3(2.15%) each respectively.

Table 6. Year-wise distribution of the periodical literature

Sr.No.	Period Intervals (in years)	No. of Citations	%	Cumulative	
				No. of Citations	%
1	0-5	245	31.45	245	31.45
2	06-10	133	17.07	378	48.52
3	11-20	113	14.50	491	63.02
4	21-30	99	12.70	590	75.73
5	31-40	85	10.91	675	86.64
6	41-50	56	7.18	731	93.83

7	51-60	21	2.69	752	96.53
8	61 and earlier	27	3.46	779	100

Year-wise distribution of cited periodical literature reveals that about 31.45% papers were cited within 5 years of their publication and more than 75.73% of the papers were cited within 20 years. However, the oldest cited paper was published more than 80 years back. For calculating the half-life of law literature depicted by the current study, a graph was plotted by taking period on x-axis and the cumulative number of citations of the periodical literature on y-axis. The total number of citations measured at y-axis was 779. Half of the total citations i.e. 390 (considering each citation as an indivisible unit) meet at point 'A' parallel on y-axis. A line drawn from point 'A' parallel to x-axis cuts the curved graph at point 'B' parallel to y-axis meets the x-axis at point 'C'. Again another line was drawn from point 'B'. Distance from point 'A' to 'B' or 'O' to 'C' is the half life of periodical literature in field of law which was 11 years.

Findings and Conclusion

Citation analysis is useful for understanding subject relationships, author effectiveness, publication trends and so on. It is essential for a librarian to identify the information needs and use pattern of the users. The following are some important findings of the study:-

1. Journals articles were the major source of information used by LLM students as 1/3 of the total citations were from journal articles, i.e., 779 (25.52%) followed by books 678 (22.21%) with a slightly difference.
2. Indian Journal titled Economic Political Weekly (EPW) with 56(7.19%) citations was the most used journal.
3. 97(69.78%) periodicals were from their own subject, i.e., Law.
4. 622 (79.84%) citations were produced under single authorship.
5. A large number of total cited periodical were from U.S.A with 57(41%) citations.
6. The half-life of periodical literature in the field of Law was 11 years.

Bibliography

Balachandran, K. and Kabir Humayoon, S. 2008. Bibliometrics of Intellectual Property Rights: An Exploratory Analysis of IPR (DB). *KELPRO Bulletin* 12 (1): 56-72.

Bjorneborn and Ingwersen. 2004. Toward a basic framework for Webometrics. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology* 55 (14): 1216-1227.

Chikata, R.V. and S.K. Patil. 2008. Citation Analysis of theses in Library and Information Science submitted to University of Pune: A Pilot Study. *Library Philosophy and Practice*

Feather and R.P. Sturges. 2003. International Encyclopedia of Information and Library Science. Ed 2. London: Routledge

Harvinder Kaur. 2006. Bibliometrics Study of Malayan Law Journal Articles. *Legal Information Management* 6 (1): 1-13.

Joginder Singh Burman. Doctoral research in IMTECH: Document Use Pattern. *Annals of Library Science and Documentation*.47 (4), 2000:121-130

Martyn, John. 1975. Citation Analysis. *Journal of Documentation* 31 (4): 290.

Sevukan, R. and Jaideep Sharma. 2008. Bibliometric Analysis of Research Output of Biotechnology faculties in some Indian Central Universities. *DESIDOC Journal of Library and Information Technology* 28 (6): 11-20.

Shapiro, FR. 1991. The most cited articles from the Yale Law Journal. *Yale Law Journal* 100: 1449-1514.

Shapiro, F.R. 1992. Origins of bibliometrics, citation indexing, and citation analysis: the neglected legal literature. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science*. 43 (5): 337-39.

Shapiro, FR. 1985. The most-cited Law Review Article. *JSTOR California Law Review* 73 (5): 1540.

Smith, TA. 2007. The Web of Law. *The San Diego Law Review* 44: 309-354.

Ulrich's International Periodical Directory. 2000. Vol. 38th. New York: Bowker.

Widdison, R. 2002. New Perspective in Legal Information Retrieval. *International Journal of Law Information Technology* 10 (1): 41-70.