

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and
Social Sciences

Great Plains Studies, Center for

Fall 2002

**Review of *Bounty and Benevolence: A History of Saskatchewan
Treaties* by Arthur J. Ray, Jim Miller, and Frank Tough**

Jennifer S. H. Brown
University of Winnipeg

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch>



Part of the [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#)

Brown, Jennifer S. H., "Review of *Bounty and Benevolence: A History of Saskatchewan Treaties* by Arthur J. Ray, Jim Miller, and Frank Tough" (2002). *Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*. 628.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch/628>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

BOOK REVIEWS

Bounty and Benevolence: A History of Saskatchewan Treaties. Arthur J. Ray, Jim Miller, and Frank Tough. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000. 299 pp. Illustrations, appendix, notes, index. \$75.00 cloth, \$27.95 paper.

This is a solid and useful contribution to the growing literature on the so-called "numbered treaties" with Native Peoples in the Canadian West. Its focus is on the five treaties negotiated with the First Nations whose homelands included parts of the present province of Saskatchewan: Treaties 4, 5, 6, 8, and 10, signed during the period from 1874 into the early twentieth century. Initially advertised with the subtitle *A Documentary History of Saskatchewan Treaties*, the volume indeed emphasizes evidence from and interpretations of written documents, some quoted at length. The authors note that the original intent was "to embody both oral and documentary evidence in a single account," but as time (and space?) prohibited this, Harold Cardinal and Walter Hildebrandt took on presenting the oral history as a separate project (*Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan*, 2000). These practical constraints are understandable but regrettable, since readers would have benefitted greatly from being able to view and compare the written (Euro-Canadian) and oral (First Nations) evidence juxtaposed in one work. The analytical challenges would also have been greater, and the analysis perhaps deepened, had the authors been obliged to unify these source materials in a single connected text.

The authors combine their skills and diverse areas of expertise in a highly productive way. A. J. Ray draws upon his broad knowledge of the Hudson's Bay Company fur trade to show how its customs and ceremonies (gift exchanges, the use of the pipe, the symbolism of coats and medals) influenced Native perceptions of and expectations about the treaties and their meanings. Miller and Tough contribute their perspectives on Native/Canadian interactions and socio-economic relations during and following the Treaty period, using the documents to present both the Native concerns (notably about subsistence and hunting rights) reflected in them and the evolving and hardening policies of the Canadian government, particularly after the Indian Act of 1876.

One could wish for greater attention to the personages, both Native and Canadian, involved in these treaties—the backgrounds of the interpreters, for example, and the sometimes complex identities and affiliations of the Indian chiefs. The issue of language barriers is briefly noted in various places, but a deeper exploration of key terms and how they were translated

or misunderstood is much needed; works like this would benefit from deeper explorations of Cree and Ojibwe as well as English terms and concepts. The Métis and scrip receive relatively little attention; a single 1876 quote from Hudson's Bay Company officer Lawrence Clarke refers negatively to "one Gabriel Dumont," though no context is provided on Dumont's activities or importance.

Nonetheless, the book belongs in the library of any researcher interested in gaining profounder understandings of the treaties signed on the Canadian Plains and in the western subarctic, of the historical matrix in which they took form, and of their consequences and the ongoing legal and interpretive challenges they present. **Jennifer S. H. Brown**, *Department of History, University of Winnipeg*.