

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and
Social Sciences

Great Plains Studies, Center for

Fall 2002

Review of *Urban Indian Reserves: Forging New Relationships in Saskatchewan* Edited by F. Laurie Barron and Joseph Garcea

J. R. Miller
University of Saskatchewan

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch>



Part of the [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#)

Miller, J. R., "Review of *Urban Indian Reserves: Forging New Relationships in Saskatchewan* Edited by F. Laurie Barron and Joseph Garcea" (2002). *Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*. 621.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch/621>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

Urban Indian Reserves: Forging New Relationships in Saskatchewan.

Edited by F. Laurie Barron and Joseph Garcea. Saskatoon: Purich Publishing, 1999. xiv + 315 pp. Maps, photos, references, index. C\$36.50, \$28.00 paper.

Although the four Saskatchewan urban reserves examined in this collection are not the only ones in Canada, or even in Saskatchewan for that matter, they are among the most interesting and instructive. Established between 1982 and 1996, the reserves in Prince Albert, Saskatoon, Fort Qu'Appelle, and Yorkton went through differing processes with strikingly similar results. Establishment of the Saskatoon and Yorkton reserves proceeded smoothly, but similar initiatives in Prince Albert and Fort Qu'Appelle had to overcome local opposition. Indeed, the Prince Albert urban reserve was established by the federal government over the municipality's objections. In spite of the mixed character of their births, the reserves about which editors Laurie Barron and Joseph Garcea had a group of academic and non-academic authors write share a common inspiration and a similar track record.

The editors' "The Genesis of Urban Reserves" suggests the bands' principal reasons for supporting the creation of the reserves were the pursuit of economic development and the expression of the right of self-government. Essays by authors representing the bands, however, reveal that the motivation was overwhelmingly the pursuit of economic development, self-government entering the picture mainly through the bands' energetic efforts to protect their autonomy from other levels of government during negotia-

tions leading up to the reserves' creation. In particular, exemption from municipal taxation and bylaws was strenuously pursued and largely achieved in all cases. The other encouraging thing these four reserves have in common is their success. Bands seem satisfied that their development objectives are being met, and both municipalities and Native leadership are happy with the harmonious relations that have developed in all four cases.

Urban Indian Reserves is, like most collections, a mixture of strengths and weaknesses. The academics' chapters are poorly written, while those by municipal representatives, band leaders, and a senior researcher for Indian Affairs are usually clear and readable. More disquieting is the fact that the entire volume has a never-is-heard-a-discouraging-word quality, with contributors apparently avoiding hard questions. "Racism," although frequently mentioned, and in one essay implicitly treated as the only conceivable reason for non-Native opposition to urban reserves, is never documented, quantified, or analysed. The chapter on "Legal and Jurisdictional Issues of Urban Reserves" does not raise potential problems such as the applicability of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, or the Canada Labour Relations Act, or other federal regulatory regimes. A chapter on "Social Issues" alludes to the Federation of Saskatchewan Indian Nations' hostility to organized labor, but that is as close as we get to probing an important issue. Will Indians and Canadian citizens be covered by the Charter, federal labor code, and environmental regulations on urban reserves?

As the editors point out, the collection is an early exploration of a continuing western Canadian phenomenon. Given the success of the four urban reserves described here, there is every reason to expect another volume in due course, and much reason to hope it will be more penetrating in its analysis and more pleasing in its prose. **J. R. Miller**, *Department of History, University of Saskatchewan*.