

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

---

Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and  
Social Sciences

Great Plains Studies, Center for

---

Spring 2004

**Review of *Aboriginal People and Other Canadians Shaping New Relationships* Edited by Martin Thornton, Roy Todd, and David N. Collins**

J. R. Miller  
*University of Saskatchewan*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch>



Part of the [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#)

---

Miller, J. R., "Review of *Aboriginal People and Other Canadians Shaping New Relationships* Edited by Martin Thornton, Roy Todd, and David N. Collins" (2004). *Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*. 701.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch/701>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

**Aboriginal People and Other Canadians Shaping New Relationships.** Edited by Martin Thornton, Roy Todd, and David N. Collins. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 2001. xi + 222 pp. Illustrations, bibliographical references, index. \$45.00 cloth, \$22.95 paper.

This collection of essays on the state of Aboriginal peoples in Canada is a reflection of the work of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (RCAP) which reported in November 1996. The authors, all affiliated with Britain's University of Leeds, pay close attention to the opinions the RCAP report expressed, and some are markedly influenced by the Commission. Unfortunately, few of the contributors recognize the RCAP's limitations, much less the fact that the Commission's report has mostly been ignored by the government of Canada.

Of the six substantive essays, those on "Aboriginal Peoples: Health and Healing" and "Canadian Aboriginal Justice Circles: Alternatives or Compromise in the Politics of Criminal Justice" are the strongest. Roy Todd's essay on health shows more awareness of the federal government's divisive tactics in dealing with the various Aboriginal groups than most authors do, and David S. Wall's coverage of Canada's experiments with sentencing circles involving Aboriginal offenders takes a less romanticized view of these initiatives than most, although Wall does not consider the fact that the Crown (the prosecuting party) has often appealed the sentences resulting from sentencing circles. Other essays on the history of government policy (Martin Thornton), the historiography of Christian missions to Natives (David N. Collins), Aboriginal people in urban areas (Geoffrey Mercer), and Aboriginal tourism in British Columbia (Heather Norris Nicholson) suffer from more serious shortcomings. Some have little new to say, while others are marred by obvious errors. An informed reader of the essay on mission historiography will wonder if the author read the works he comments on or relied strictly on reviews for many volumes, and in other cases—such as the essays on urban Natives and tourism—there is a surprising omission of major relevant works. The many important essays by Evelyn Peters on the urban dimension as well as monographs by Patricia Jasen and Elizabeth Furniss on tourism and Aboriginal peoples are the most glaring oversights.

*Aboriginal People and other Canadians* occasionally does deliver insights from British parallels. Significantly, these allusions to British experience with the impact of the National Health Service and the use of "cautioning" of offenders appear in the two strongest essays. The lasting value of the volume as a whole, however, will probably reside in what it tells us of the prominence and influence on some scholars' thinking of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples in the late 1990s. **J. R. Miller**, *Department of History, University of Saskatchewan*.