

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and
Social Sciences

Great Plains Studies, Center for

February 1991

Review of *The Struggle for the Land: Indigenous Insight and Industrial Empire in the Semiarid World*, by Paul A. Olson

Adolph M. Greenberg
Miami University, greenbam@muohio.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch>



Part of the [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#)

Greenberg, Adolph M., "Review of *The Struggle for the Land: Indigenous Insight and Industrial Empire in the Semiarid World*, by Paul A. Olson" (1991). *Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*. 17.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch/17>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

substantially reduces the imperative to provide specific protection.

I should make my own position clearer. In spite of the above criticisms, I find myself in general agreement with the philosophical perspective expressed by several of the social scientists and ethicists--there can be no question about the right of society to hold the science community responsible for the consequences of the technical and institutional changes set in motion by research. However, once the right of society to hold its scientific community responsible for the effects of the knowledge and technology they provide is accepted, it is then possible to deal with the more tractable question of how much responsibility a wise society will impose on its research community. Technology represents a weak instrument for social and economic reform. The appropriate and more effective instruments are largely institutional. Thus, it is possible to argue that a wise society will let the burdens of responsibility rest lightly on the shoulders of individual researchers and research managers. If society insists that it be assured that the advances in agricultural technology carry minimum health risks or minimum impact on economic or social organization, society must accept the risk of losing access to the benefits generated by technical change. It is clearly society's right, and its responsibility, to make such choices. **Vernon W. Ruttan**, *Department of Agricultural and Applied Economics, University of Minnesota*.

The Struggle for the Land: Indigenous Insight and Industrial Empire in the Semiarid World. Paul A. Olson. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1990. x + 317 pages. Maps, tables, figures, and references. \$35.00 cloth (ISBN 0-80323555-0)

This book is based on the premise that solutions to the problems experienced by many resource management programs currently underway in the semiarid regions of the world can be found in indigenous systems of resource use. Developing out of a 1986 interdisciplinary symposium sponsored by the Center for Great Plains Studies, the book has contributors from agricultural development, anthropology, economics, english, environmental studies, history, law, native studies, and philosophy. Given the magnitude of the human and environmental problems in semiarid lands, a book intended to provide an indigenous counterpoint, as it were, to present use of those areas would not only be timely, but essential.

The book is divided into four parts with an introduction and conclusion. For the most part, the essays conform to the central issue of the book. Part 1 includes two essays by anthropologists John Bennett and

Anatoly Khazanov summarizing the ethnographic and ethnohistorical research on human adaptations to semiarid lands. Both authors argue forcefully that the deterioration of semiarid environments was preceded by the replacement of indigenous systems of resource management with the high energy, nonsustainable resource exploitation regimes of the industrial world.

Specific examples of the changing nature of land use resulting from contact with industrial civilization is explored in Part 2. Readers interested in Great Plains history and cultural-ecological dynamics will find Russell Barsh's essay, "The Substitution of Cattle for Bison on the Great Plains," one of the better discussions of the subject. Gary Anders' paper, "The Alaskan Native Experience with the Alaskan Native Claims Settlement Act," draws important parallels between the impact of ANCSA and the policy of allotment on the Great Plains during the latter part of the nineteenth century. Silitshena and Iverson provide detailed descriptions of the impact of colonialism on land use in central and south Africa and Australia respectively.

The chapters in Part 3 cover the impact of programs designed by outside interests to develop the natural resources on the lands of indigenous peoples. Examples are included from the North American Plains, Kenya, and the Northern Territory of Australia. Morris' article, "Hydroelectric Development and the Human Rights of Indigenous Peoples," is an excellent analysis of the deleterious impact of many energy programs on Native American communities. Hamilton's discussion of the impact of introduced resource management systems on indigenous ones in central Australia is enlightening, providing the reader with an in-depth description of the intangibles in Aboriginal subsistence practices. The impact of changing land-use policy on the Maasai is discussed by Bekure and Pasha in Chapter 9.

The final section involves discussions by Callicott on the debate surrounding the existence of a conservation ethos among indigenous peoples and Schwarz on the extent to which native American beliefs have influenced the environmental movement. While these discussions are intriguing they seem out of place with the rest of the volume. For the most part, such arguments are not particularly productive and dissipate the intellectual momentum initiated in Olson's excellent introduction and carried forward through the first three segments of the book.

Olson's concluding chapter refocuses the reader's attention to the key points set forth earlier in the volume; that there is a relationship among secure land rights for indigenes, sustainable development, and successful conservation programs. I was surprised, however, by the absence of any discussion of the conceptual redirection in recent global conservation efforts, notably the Man and the Biosphere Program. Nevertheless, this

volume has much to offer those interested in understanding the staggering human and environmental costs involved in the industrial world's insatiable appetite for energy. **Adolph M. Greenberg**, *Miami University, Oxford Ohio*.

Atlas of American Indian Affairs. Francis Paul Prucha. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1990. ix + 191 pages. Maps, notes and references. Cloth \$47.50 (ISBN 0-8032-3689-1).

Anyone who has seriously studied United States-American Indian relations will be familiar with the work of Francis Paul Prucha. Perhaps the foremost scholar in this area, Prucha has published more than 20 books over the course of three decades, including the definitive synthesis of Federal Indian policy, *The Great Father*, which appeared in 1984 (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press). Less well known is Prucha's abiding interest in maps. In the preface to his new book, an *Atlas of American Indian Affairs*, Prucha admits that he has "long been fascinated by graphic display of statistical data, especially the presentation of geographical relationships on maps". Over the years, for his own use, he has mapped data on Indian populations, cessions, agencies, schools, and so on. Now, with the publication of these black and white maps, Prucha has provided scholars with an invaluable cartographic reference to Indian affairs, both past and present.

The atlas is organized into ten sections. Each section has a brief introduction, and the sources and statistics for each map are explicated in depth in a "Notes and References" section at the end of the book. The brief first section deals with culture and tribal areas. It is good to see his inclusion of the Indian Claims Commission's map of "Land Areas Judicially Established" in this section, along with more traditional regionalizations. This is followed by a series of 13 maps showing Indian population by states from 1890 to 1980 and urban Indian population from 1960 to 1980. In the third section Prucha draws from Royce's *Indian Land Cessions in the United States* (1899, Eighteenth Annual Report of the Bureau of American Ethnology) and Hilliard's 1972 map "Indian Land Cessions," (*Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 62 (2)) to chart the reduction of the Indians' land base through cessions. Detailed maps of individual tribal cessions (for example, the Blackfeet and Teton Sioux cessions) are also included. The reservations, the remnants of Indian lands, are the subject of the fourth section. Of particular interest here is a series of regional maps showing, by nested proportionate squares, the percentage of each reservation's population which is actually Indian. Section five, showing the