

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and
Social Sciences

Great Plains Studies, Center for

August 1995

Review of *Apache Mothers and Daughters: Four Generations of a Family* by Ruth McDonald Boyer and Narcissus Duffy Gayton

Beth Ritter
University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch>



Part of the [Other International and Area Studies Commons](#)

Ritter, Beth, "Review of *Apache Mothers and Daughters: Four Generations of a Family* by Ruth McDonald Boyer and Narcissus Duffy Gayton" (1995). *Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences*. 344.

<https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/greatplainsresearch/344>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Great Plains Studies, Center for at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Great Plains Research: A Journal of Natural and Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

Apache Mothers and Daughters: Four Generations of a Family. Ruth McDonald Boyer and Narcissus Duffy Gayton. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1992. xx+393 pp. Genealogy tables, maps, bibliography, and index. \$24.95cloth (ISBN 0-88061-2447-4).

Apache Mothers and Daughters is the narrative saga of four generations of Chiricahua Apache mothers and daughters. Against a poignant background of Chiricahua raiding and warfare, imprisonment, relocation, reservation confinement, and forced acculturation, this intensely personal history of four remarkable women's lives unfolds. The book's strength lies in its masterful weaving of solid ethnohistoric research with the oral history provided by Narcissus Duffy Gayton (and other informants) about herself, her mother Christine Kozine, her grandmother Beshád-e, and her great grandmother Dilt-h-cleyhen.

Narcissus's family are *Tchi-hénè* or "Red Paint People," one of the three major bands of the Chiricahua Apache Tribe whose traditional territory stretched over the southwestern region of modern New Mexico. The volume is divided into four parts which summarize the historical periods represented by the lives of these four women. Dilt-h-cleyhen, eldest daughter of Chiricahua leader Victorio, was born in 1848; her section is aptly titled "Warfare and Flight." Part two, "Turmoil and Imprisonment," is devoted to her daughter Beshád-e, born in 1870. Christine Kozine, born in 1904, is Dilt-h-cleyhen's granddaughter and Narcissus's mother; her section is entitled "Days of

Adjustment and Acculturation.” The final section, “Today’s Apache Woman,” focuses on the life and times of Narcissus Duffy (Gayton), born in 1924.

The work gives a human dimension to the history of the Chiricahua, which has often been presented primarily in terms of U.S. and Apache military history. After decades of armed struggle and life on the run, the Chiricahua were incarcerated in Florida in 1886, later transferred to Alabama as prisoners of war, and eventually relocated to Fort Sill, Oklahoma. In 1913 they were allowed to leave Oklahoma to settle on the Mescalero Apache reservation in New Mexico. This is the context in which the women of Narcissus’s family lived, loved, died, and passed on their unique traditions to the next generation.

Apache Mothers and Daughters is a story of a family’s and a people’s persistence and survival. Because the history is focused on the lives of four women, a portrait of the diverse roles women have played in traditional and contemporary Chiricahua life emerges. We see Chiricahua women as warriors, providers, mothers, wives, professionals, and tribal leaders. Told from the Chiricahua perspective, this is a powerful tribute to the stamina and perseverance of *Tchi-hénè* women. Affectionate detail reveals the profound respect the authors afford their subjects.

The work is also rich with ethnographic detail regarding Chiricahua life. The authors particularly emphasize the ways Chiricahua traditions differ from Mescalero (such as the Chiricahua tradition of wearing moccasins with “turned up toes”). Good accounts of Chiricahua cradleboard making, puberty ceremonies, and creation stories are also included. The authors provide an interesting account of the Silas John Cult, a revitalization movement with which Beshád-e and Narcissus were briefly involved. Also of interest is the unfavorable representation of Geronimo, whose reputation (according to the authors) remains largely negative among many Chiricahua.

Apache Mothers and Daughters is essential reading for those interested in the history and ethnography of the Chiricahua, as well as in gender studies. Scholars will find its maps, photographs, and genealogical charts particularly useful. This is a welcome addition to Native American ethnographic literature. **Beth R. Ritter**, *Department of Anthropology and Department of Geography, University of Nebraska-Lincoln*.