

University of Nebraska - Lincoln

DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln

Journal of Women in Educational Leadership

Educational Administration, Department of

7-2005

Journal of Women in Educational Leadership, Vol. 3, No.3-July 2005

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/jwel>



Part of the [Educational Administration and Supervision Commons](#), and the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

"Journal of Women in Educational Leadership, Vol. 3, No.3-July 2005" (2005). *Journal of Women in Educational Leadership*. 151.
<http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/jwel/151>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Educational Administration, Department of at DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Women in Educational Leadership by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@University of Nebraska - Lincoln.

Notes from the Great American Desert

Marilyn L. Grady
Barbara Y. LaCost

In the good old days, the state that is Nebraska was identified as part of the Great American Desert. In many ways, in climate and terrain, it still bears a resemblance to a desert. As a frontier or a land of pioneers, it deserves recognition.

Invisibility may be one of the greatest challenges women face. One of the great flaws in the writing of U.S. history has been the omission of the role or presence of women from the written record—women are invisible.

In terms of women leaders, consider the women homesteaders of the Great Plains. The Homestead Act of 1862, according to Senator William Borah was, "The government bets 160 acres against the entry fee of \$14 that the settler can't live on the land for five years without starving to death" (Robbins, 1962, p. 375). During the duration of the Homestead Act, 1862-1934, hundreds of millions of acres of land were claimed. Thousands of the homesteaders were women, a hidden force on the agricultural frontier (Patterson-Black & Patterson-Black, 1978, p. 16) According to Bartley and Loxton (1991), 10 % of the homesteaders were single women. Patterson-Black & Patterson-Black (1978) examined a sample of homestead records and found that an average of 11.9% of homestead entrants were single women, the percentages varied from 4.8% in 1891 to 18.2% in 1907. Final ownership of the land could be established through a cash payment after six months' residence or through meeting the five-year residence requirement. In the sample examined by Patterson-Black & Patterson-Black (1978), 37% of the men, and 42 % of the women succeeded in making final claim to the land. Success was linked to "the vicissitudes of terrain, aridity, weather, and hostility of area cattlemen" (Patterson-Black & Patterson-Black, 1978, p. 16). Women were a major segment of the frontier population, whether as single women, wives, or daughters. Because the written record of these women's accomplishments is limited to letters or diaries, women's contributions to the homesteading story are invisible.

Fortunately, three women authors of Nebraska have chronicled settlement stories in their writings. Willa Cather (1873-1947) moved to Red Cloud, Nebraska at age 10. She graduated from the University of Nebraska-Lincoln in 1895, one of few women at that time to achieve a college

education. The subjects of the books she wrote were the Scandinavian, Bohemian, and French immigrants who attempted to cultivate the obstinate land of Nebraska. Cather wrote of women homestead heroines; Alexandra in *O Pioneers!* and Antonia in *My Antonia*. She wrote of the American pioneer experience. In 1922, she received a Pulitzer Prize for *One of Ours*.

Bess Streeter Aldrich (1881-1954) graduated from Iowa State Normal School, now known as the University of Northern Iowa, in 1901. In 1925, Aldrich was widowed. She was a single mother with four children to raise. She supported her family by writing stories of the joys and struggles of pioneering. She published over one hundred short stories and articles, nine novels, one novella, two books of short stories, and one omnibus. The women in Aldrich's work reflect the strength of pioneer women and the roles they played in the settlement of Eastern Nebraska.

Mari Sandoz (1896-1966), "Nebraska's Story Catcher," was born on a homestead in Western Nebraska to Swiss immigrants. She studied at what is now Chadron State College and at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln. She won national fame in 1935 when her biography of her father, *Old Jules*, was published after it had been rejected 13 times. She was described as the best Western writer of all especially when she wrote about the struggles of "her people." She wrote 23 books about the life and settlement of the Great Plains. Her books reflect the wide variety of women who populated the homesteads.

Cather, Aldrich, and Sandoz preserved, through their writings, the presence, work, and contributions of women during the homesteading, pioneer, and early settlement years in Nebraska. Their efforts are a fine antidote to women's invisibility. May you also write so that you help reduce the invisibility of women leaders.

References

- Bartley, P., & Loxton, C. (1991). *Plains women: Women in the American West*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
<http://fp.image.dk/fpemarx/lind/biography.htm> Retrieved June 15, 2005.
<http://info.neded.rg/stathand/parttwo/aldrich.htm> Retrieved June 15, 2005.
<http://www.csc.edu/sandoz/biography.htm> Retrieved June 15, 2005.
Patterson-Black, S., & Patterson-Black, G. (1978). *Western women in history and literature*. Crawford, NE: Cottonwood Press.

Proposals for presentations at the *19th Annual Women in Educational Leadership Conference* are being accepted! The conference will be October 9-10, 2005, in Lincoln, Nebraska. For information about the conference or proposal guidelines contact Marilyn Grady at mgrady1@unl.edu

Women in History

Bella Stavisky Abzug (1920-1998)

Meg Blair

Bella Stavisky was born in New York City on July 24, 1920. She was born to activism: her father's butcher shop was called the Live and Let Live Meat Market, in protest of WW I. Her parents were Russian Jewish immigrants, and when her father died there was no son to say Kaddish for him, so 13-year old Bella marched into Temple each day for a year to offer the prayers, a role traditionally forbidden to women.

After graduating from high school, Bella attended Hunter College in New York. Her dream was to be a lawyer. Harvard, her first choice of law schools, did not accept women, so she went instead to Columbia, where she met her husband, Martin (Maurice) Abzug. It is notable that in that day, Martin put aside his dreams of becoming a writer, and in order to support Bella's ambitions, he worked as a stockbroker.

Her first claim to fame as a lawyer came when she traveled to Mississippi while eight months pregnant to defend Willy McGee, a black man accused of raping a white woman. Local motels would not allow her to stay, so she slept in the bus station for the entire trial. Her other cases were typically labor disputes or civil rights cases, often done for free or for very little money.

Another early highlight of her life was founding the first modern women's mass peace movement, Women Strike for Peace in 1961. This group fought for a nuclear weapons test ban.

In 1970, Bella won her first term to Congress. She ran on the slogan "A woman's place is in the house: the House of Representatives!" Her campaign buttons replied: "Abzug-lutely!" Her support of liberal causes and flamboyant, often confrontational manner, did not endear her to the old-fashioned men with whom she mainly worked. She was universally recognized as being a workhorse, often recording 18-hour days. She became an expert at getting through Washington red tape and was always well prepared for whatever business was before her.

She was an ardent opponent of the Vietnam War and was the first member of Congress to support impeaching President Nixon. As chair of the

About the Author

Meg Blair, RN, MSN, CEN is currently an Associate Professor at Nebraska Methodist College in Omaha, Nebraska. She obtained a BA in English from the University of Nebraska-Lincoln in 1981, a BSN from Creighton University in 1982, and her Master's Degree in Adult Health and Illness from the University of Nebraska Medical Center in 1993. Currently she is pursuing a Ph.D. in Educational Leadership in Higher Education at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln. She has presented and published in nursing, most notably as the author of two chapters in the 7th edition of the Black & Hawks text *Medical Surgical Nursing: Clinical Management for Positive Outcomes*. She resides in Omaha, Nebraska. blair_meg@hotmail.com

subcommittee on government information and individual rights, Bella co-wrote three influential laws: the Freedom of Information Act, the Sunshine Law, and the Right to Privacy Act

In 1976, instead of running again for her seat in the House, Bella campaigned for the Senate and lost. During the next few years, she ran for Senate again and for the Mayor of New York. She lost each time, but this did not deter her spirit of activism. Instead, she turned to women's and environmental rights. She worked hard supporting the Equal Rights Amendment and was appointed special advisor to the Secretary General of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development. She co-founded the Women's Environment and Development Organization, a worldwide group focusing on greater access for women to political power.

Another example of her outspokenness came in 1977. She was appointed by President Carter to head the National Advisory Committee on Women. But, the group issued a report critical of his increased military spending at the expense of women's issues. President Carter fired her after the report was made public. Bella Abzug continued to work for women's rights until ill health forced her to have heart surgery in March, 1998. She died the day afterwards.

Although not normally connected with educational issues, Bella Abzug was a passionate supporter of women's rights, and often education went hand-in-hand with improving the economic conditions in which women lived worldwide, and education was vital to women becoming more involved in the political process. From the time she defied Jewish tradition to learn to read the Torah, Bella Abzug fought for equality of women in education. She was student body president at Hunter College where she was active in political causes with other students. During this time she opposed the Rapp-Coudert committee, that was attempting to "crush public education" and

whose agenda also included reigning in “subversive faculty” (Hyman & Moore, as cited in Cook, 2005). Some of her other notable achievements in the area of education included her work with the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing and the Beijing Platform for Action, that included strong wording regarding education of women, and work to pass both the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and Title IX of the Educational Amendments, which called for equality in all areas of education for women and girls.

References

- Abzug, B. (1995). Plenary address, Fourth World Conference on Women. Available at http://www.edchange.org/multicultural/speeches/bella_abzug_plenary.html
- Bosworth, P. (2003). Bella Abzug: She couldn't type. What she could do was beat the boys on their own turf. *The Nation*, 277(3), 20.
- Bosworth, P. (1998). Bella Abzug. *Newsmakers 1998*. Available on line at the Omaha Public Library: <http://galenet.galegroup.com>
- Bosworth, P. (1998). Bella Abzug 1920-1988. *The Nation*, 266(14), 7.
- Bosworth, P. (n.d.). Bella Abzug. *The Glass Ceiling Biographies*. Available: <http://www.theglassceiling.com/biographies/biol.htm>
- Bosworth, P. (n.d.). Bella Stavisky Abzug. *Encyclopedia of World Biography* (2nd ed.). Available on line at the Omaha Public Library: <http://galenet.galegroup.com>
- Bosworth, P. (n.d.). Bella S(avitsky) Abzug. *Contemporary Authors Online*. Available on line at the Omaha Public Library: <http://galenet.galegroup.com>
- Cook, B.W. (2005). *Bella Abzug*. Jewish Virtual Library. Available at <http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/biography/abzug.html>

*Note there is discrepancy in the literature on the spelling of the maiden name. It is referenced as both Savitsky and Stavitsky

Women in Athletic Leadership

Sandra L. Moore
Suzanne L. Gilmour
Mary P. Kinsella

Despite significant increased participation opportunities for girls and women in sports following the passage of Title IX, women remain underrepresented in secondary athletic leadership roles. Thirty-eight female and 158 male high school athletic directors responded to a 19-item Athletic Director Survey (ADS) designed to elicit information on the following: position attainment factors, attainment and retention barriers, perceptions of similar or different barriers for women and men, leadership and management skills, personal sacrifices, and strengthening female candidacy for athletic directorships. Results indicate the importance of mentoring and networking in providing women with equal access to athletic leadership positions.

Title IX of the Educational Amendments Act of 1972 prohibits sex discrimination in educational programs receiving federal funds. Title IX's applicability to athletics was clarified further when the Civil Rights Restoration Act was passed in 1978. Since these two important pieces of legislation were enacted, athletic participation opportunities for girls and women have increased significantly. The National Federation of State High School Associations (NFHS) reported that the number of girls participating in interscholastic athletics increased almost tenfold, from 294,015 in 1972 to 2,856,358 in 2003 (NFHS, 2003). The number of women participating at the collegiate level doubled in less than 20 years, from 74,239 in 1982 to 150,916 in 2001 (Bray, 2002).

In contrast, the number of women in athletic administrative positions has declined since the passage of Title IX. In 1972, the governing body for women in intercollegiate athletics was the Association for Intercollegiate Athletics for Women (AIAW). During the early years of AIAW, more than 90% of women's athletic programs were administered by female athletic directors (Acosta & Carpenter, 2004). In 2004, only 18.5% of college athletic programs were administered by females (Acosta & Carpenter, 2004). An analysis of the National Interscholastic Athletic Administrators Association

About the Authors

Sandra L. Moore, Ph.D., is an Associate Professor and Chair of the Health Promotion and Wellness Department at SUNY Oswego. She has more than 20 years of coaching experience at the high school and NCAA Division I and III collegiate level. She served as the Athletic Director at SUNY Oswego from 1992-2002. She has been actively involved in state, regional and national athletic organizations including membership on the NCAA Division III field hockey and softball committees. Her research interests include women in sport and women in leadership. smoore@Oswego.EDU

Suzanne L. Gilmour, Ph.D., is professor and Chair of the Educational Administration Department at SUNY Oswego and the Executive Director of the New York State Association for Women in Administration. She is also a superintendent search consultant and strategic planning facilitator. She has published and made national and international presentations on the topics of leadership, women in leadership, ethics, the superintendency, brain-based leadership and systems theory in organizations. Suzanne has held central office and building level administrative positions in the public schools for more than 25 years prior to beginning her career in higher education. gilmour@oswego.edu

Mary P. Kinsella, Ed. D., is Chair and Associate Professor in the Educational Leadership Department at SUNY Cortland. She is a member of the Executive Board of the New York State Association for Women in Administration (NYSAWA). Her research interests center on women in leadership and the superintendency. Mary has published several articles and presented at international, national, state and regional conferences. Prior to her academic career, Mary was Superintendent of Schools, high school principal, and held assorted other administrative positions in public schools. Before beginning her administrative career, she taught physical education and coached both girls and boys at the high school varsity level. kinsellam@cortland.edu

(NIAAA) membership indicated that significantly more men (87%), than women (13%), hold interscholastic athletic director positions (Whisenant, 2003).

The underrepresentation of women in athletic administration is well documented (Acosta & Carpenter, 2004; Hart, Hasbrook, & Mathes, 1986; Hasbrook, 1988; Hasbrook, Hart, Mathes, & True, 1990; Heishman, Bunker, & Tutwiler, 1990; Holman & Parkhouse, 1981; Knoppers, 1987; Lovett &

Lowry, 1988, 1994; Pastore & Whiddon, 1983; Stangl & Kane, 1991; Whisenant, 2003; Whisenant, Pedersen, & Obenour, 2002). Much of the early research on women in athletic leadership focused on coaches who attributed women's underrepresentation in the profession to such factors as burnout, role conflict, job dissatisfaction, lack of role models, discrimination, and the existence of an "old boys" system (Caccese & Mayerberg, 1984; Hart et al., 1986; Hasbrook et al., 1990; Knoppers, 1987, 1989, 1992; Locke & Massengale, 1978; Lovett & Lowry, 1988; Parkhouse & Williams, 1986; Stangle & Kane, 1991).

A few studies have focused on collegiate women athletic directors. Williams and Miller (1983) identified in-service/internship training in athletic administration, leadership experience in professional organizations, and prior work experience as an assistant athletic director as beneficial in securing athletic administrative positions. This finding is consistent with Danylchuk, Pastore, and Inglis (1996), who found that athletic administrators rated personal traits, previous work experience, and educational qualifications as the most important factors in attaining administrative positions.

Whisenant and Pedersen (2004a) examined communications, traditional management activities, human resource management, and networking and found that only networking had a significant impact on the success of intercollegiate athletic directors. Work balance and conditions, recognition and collegial support, and inclusivity (e.g., no sexual or racial harassment or discrimination) were also important retention factors for women in athletic leadership positions (Inglis, Danylchuk, & Pastore, 1996; Pastore, Inglis, & Danylchuk, 1996).

Whisenant and Pedersen (2004b) examined the traditional managerial skills necessary for success in interscholastic athletic management. They found that high school athletic directors spent the majority of their time in the traditional management activities of planning, coordinating and monitoring the athletic program, problem solving, and decision making. High school athletic directors spent the least amount of time in formal or informal networking. Other managerial activities included communication management (paperwork and meetings) and human resource management (staffing, mentoring, managing conflict, and motivating employees).

The female interscholastic athletic director's leadership role has not been investigated. The study built on previous research focusing on female high school athletic directors through the lens of equal access to leadership positions. Specifically, we addressed the following questions that underpin the participation of women in athletic leadership:

1. *Attainment factors:* How do athletic directors think they attained their present positions?
2. *Attainment and retention barriers:* What are the perceived barriers that women athletic directors faced in attaining and retaining their positions? Do women perceive barriers to be similar to those faced by men?
3. *Mentoring:* How important are formal and informal mentors to athletic directors in attaining and retaining positions?
4. *Leadership and management skills:* What leadership and management skills are important in order for athletic directors to be effective in their positions?
5. *Personal sacrifices:* What personal sacrifices are made to become a successful athletic director?
6. *Strengthening female candidacy:* What skills do women need to strengthen and enhance their candidacy for athletic director positions?

Method

Participants

Surveys were mailed to 705 athletic directors selected randomly from a database provided by the New York State Department of Education. A total of 189 surveys were returned initially (response rate 27%). Eight additional surveys were obtained on follow-up, making the overall response rate 28%. A number of follow-up interviews provided additional qualitative information.

Thirty-eight female and 158 male athletic directors returned completed surveys. One respondent did not indicate her/his gender and was excluded from further analysis. The overwhelming majority of respondents were in the 51-60 (36.7%) and 41-50 (35.7%) year age range. The largest percent of women (42.1%) were in the 51-60 age bracket followed by 36.8% who were between 41 and 50. The men were evenly distributed between the 41-50 and 51-60 brackets (35.4% in each bracket).

A total of 107 respondents (54.6%) indicated that they were in "athletic director only" positions; the remainder held positions that included additional responsibilities such as teaching, coaching, and other administrative duties. Fifty-six percent of the men and 50% of the women reported full-time athletic director positions. The mean full-time equivalent (FTE) was .69 for men and .66 for women.

A significant proportion of respondents (69% of the men and 76.3% of the women) reported that they were in their first athletic director position.

Men reported an average of 7.2 years in their current position although the mean for women was 5.8 years. In addition, men reported an average age of 37 when first becoming an athletic director and the mean for women was 39 years.

Athletic Director Survey (ADS)

The Athletic Director Survey (ADS), a 19-item questionnaire, was designed to answer the identified research questions. Focus questions were field tested in personal interviews with several women athletic directors. Input was solicited from members of the New York State High School Athletic Association (NYSHSAA) and the New York State Association for Women in Administration (NYSAWA). The ADS solicited demographic information (gender and age). Respondents also were asked to provide information about their current position, number of years in the current position, FTE attributed to current position, age at which they first attained an athletic director position, and whether or not this was their first athletic director position.

Data Analysis

Members of the research team analyzed the qualitative responses and categorized them into general themes. Data were further analyzed using *SPSS for Windows, Version 11.5*.

Results

Findings are organized by the following themes: attaining the athletic director position; barriers for females becoming, sustaining, and retaining athletic director positions, as well as female perceptions of these barriers being similar or different from those experienced by males; mentoring; leadership and management skills; personal sacrifices; and strengthening female candidacy for the athletic directorship.

Attainment Factors

Participants' responses are provided in Table 1. For both males and females, contacts within the system and circumstances and opportunity (e.g., "right place, right time") were two of the most common factors in helping them attain their athletic director positions. For males, teaching and coaching experience were also important; females ranked educational qualifications higher than experience.

Table 1
Attaining an AD Position: Response Percentages by Sex and Factors

Factor	Males (n = 158)	Females (n = 38)
Contacts Within System	32.3% (51)	39.5% (15)
Circumstances/Opportunity	24.1% (38)	44.7% (17)
Teaching/Coaching Experience	24.7% (39)	15.8% (6)
Educational Qualifications	19.0% (30)	23.7% (9)
Contacts Outside System	12.7% (20)	13.2% (5)
Personal Skills	7.6% (12)	21.1% (8)
Teacher/Coach in System	9.5% (15)	10.5% (4)
Ambition/Personal Goals	6.3% (10)	2.6% (1)
Lack of Qualified Applicants	5.1% (8)	5.3% (2)

Note. Because participants could indicate more than one factor, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Attainment and Retention Barriers (female participants only)

“No barriers” was the most common response to perceived barriers to attaining athletic leadership positions, followed closely by its apparent opposite: an “old boys” network. Other responses reflected the belief that women have to prove themselves capable in a male-dominated profession. The results are reported in Table 2. Similar concerns were cited for sustaining and retaining the athletic director position (see Table 3).

Responses to perceived similarities or differences in barriers experienced are summarized in Table 4. Women’s responses reflected the belief that they are viewed by others as less competent and capable than their male counterparts.

Mentoring

When asked if they had had any formal or informal mentors, a resounding 79.6%, or nearly 4 in 5 current athletic directors, indicated that they had been mentored. Mentoring was experienced almost equally with 79.1% of the males and 81.6% of the females responding affirmatively. Survey respondents indicated a variety of types or vehicles they experienced for

Table 2
Female Response Percentages by Barriers to Becoming an AD

Barrier	Percentage (n = 38)
None	34.2% (13)
"Old Boys" Network	28.9% (11)
Stereotypes of Women in Athletics	23.7% (9)
Needed to Earn Male Trust/Acceptance	21.1% (8)
Males Wouldn't Accept Female Authority	18.4% (7)
It's a Male Profession	15.8% (6)
Not Treated Equally with Males	10.5% (4)
Had to Convince Community	10.5% (4)
Overlooked for Less Experienced Male	5.3% (2)

Note. Because participants could list more than one barrier, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Table 3
Female Response Percentages by Barriers to Sustaining and Retaining AD Position

Barrier	Percentage (n = 38)
None	28.9% (11)
Had to Earn Respect of Males	26.3% (10)
More Expected of Women ADs	21.1% (8)
"Old Boys" Dominate Profession	18.4% (7)
Male ADs Don't Have to Prove Themselves	15.8% (6)
Men Not Judged Based on Gender	15.8% (6)
Lack of Support (Including Time)	10.5% (4)
Lack of Adequate Budgets	7.9% (3)
Second Guessing Decisions of Female ADs	5.3% (2)
Balancing Career, Family, Graduate Work	2.6% (1)

Note. Because participants could indicate more than one barrier, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Table 4
Female Response Percentages by Perceptions of Similar or Different Barriers as Men

Barrier	Percentage (n = 38)
Male ADs Do Not Have to Prove Themselves	34.2% (13)
Less Expected of Men and More of Women	26.3% (10)
There are Similar Barriers	18.4% (7)
Took Longer to Be Accepted as a Woman in Role	13.2% (5)
Men Assertive: Women Aggressive and Unfeminine	10.5% (4)
Women Need to Seek More Roles (Mentors, Networking)	7.9% (3)
I Need More Support	5.3% (2)
Men Not Primary Caregivers for Family	2.6% (1)
Men Get Extra Support and Time	2.6% (1)

Note. Because participants could list more than one barrier, percentages do not sum to 100%.

mentoring (see Table 5) and mentoring activities (Table 6). As an additional note, when asked if any of the male athletic directors had mentored a female, 126 (64.3%) indicated that they had not.

Leadership and Management Skills

Female athletic directors were asked to list leadership and management skills necessary for success in their current positions. Women cited organizational, interpersonal, and communication skills, as well as personal traits among the most important skills needed for both leadership and management. The results are summarized in Tables 7 and 8.

Personal Sacrifices

Time, both personal and the long hours demanded of the profession and by the job, came up as the leading personal sacrifice experienced by both male and female athletic directors. Women listed this more frequently than men (53.8% or 85 men and 73.7% or 28 women). Family and home life were listed by 105 respondents (86 men and 19 women) as having been sacrificed (see Table 9).

Table 5
Response Percentages by Sex and Formal/Informal Mentors

Mentors	Males (n = 158)	Females (n = 38)
Have Had Mentor	79.1% (125)	81.6% (31)
Former AD/Retiring AD	27.8% (44)	28.9% (11)
Current ADs in Other Schools	24.1% (38)	26.3% (10)
Principals (Former/Current)	19.6% (31)	10.5% (4)
Superintendent or Assistant Superintendent	12.0% (19)	18.4% (7)
Higher Education Programs	5.7% (9)	7.9% (3)
Formalized Mentoring Program	5.7% (9)	2.6% (1)
Current AD at Same School	5.1% (8)	0.0% (0)
Professional Development and Organizational Affiliations	4.4% (7)	2.6% (1)
Other (No response, Family, Teacher/Coach)	13.9% (22)	15.8% (6)

Note. Because participants could identify more than one form of mentoring, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Table 6
Male Response Percentages by Mentoring Activity

Activity	Percentage (n = 158)
Good Listener and Answered Questions	15.8% (25)
Confer Regularly	15.8% (25)
Encouragement	15.2% (24)
Scheduling and Budgeting Help	14.6% (23)
Communication	14.6% (23)
Help in Supervising Practices	12.0% (19)
Philosophy and Politics	9.5% (15)
Internship	5.7% (9)

Note. Because participants could list more than one mentoring activity, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Table 7

Female Response Percentages by Leadership Skills Needed for AD Position

Leadership Skill	Percentage (n = 38)
Interpersonal and Communication Skills	71.1% (27)
Personal Traits	63.2% (24)
Organizational Skills	42.1% (16)
Team Building	26.3% (10)
Goals, Objectives, Evaluation	15.8% (6)
Presence, Visibility	13.2% (5)
Knowledge, Experience	13.2% (5)
Problem Solving/Decision Making	13.2% (5)
Visionary	10.5% (4)
Political Astuteness	7.9% (3)
Role Model/Mentor	7.9% (3)

Note. Because participants could list more than one leadership skill, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Table 8

Female Response Percentages by Management Skills Needed for AD Position

Management Skill	Percentage (n = 38)
Organization	71.1% (27)
Interpersonal/Communication Skills	34.2% (13)
Time Management	34.2% (13)
Personal Traits	21.1% (8)
Strategic Planning	15.8% (6)
Problem Solving/Decision Making	15.8% (6)
Computer Skills	7.9% (3)

Note. Because participants could list more than one management skill, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Table 9
Personal Sacrifices for an AD Position: Response Percentages by Sex and Sacrifice

Sacrifice	Male (n = 158)	Female (n = 38)
Time: Personal/Long Hours	53.8% (85)	73.7% (28)
Family/Home Life	54.4% (86)	50.0% (19)
Teaching/Coaching Experience	12.7% (20)	7.9% (3)
Student Relationships		
Money	5.1% (8)	10.5% (4)
Physical and Emotional Issues	3.8% (6)	10.5% (4)
Friendships/Marriage	3.8% (6)	5.3% (2)
None	1.9% (3)	2.6% (1)
Moving/Relocating	1.3% (2)	2.6% (1)
Too Many to List	1.3% (2)	0.0% (0)

Note. Because participants could indicate more than one personal sacrifice, percentages do not sum to 100%.

Strengthening Female Candidacy (male participants only)

Participant responses are summarized in Table 10. Although a third of the respondents reported that the skills and knowledge necessary for success as an athletic director are the same for men and women, other responses indicated a perception that women do not have the necessary experience and are “too defensive” about being a female athletic director in a male-dominated profession.

Discussion

Title IX legislation, enacted in 1972, has had a positive impact on women's participation in sport, but appears to have had a detrimental effect on the number of women in athletic administration. The results of the study indicate that the “old boys” system still exists and women are not navigating it well. Although approximately one-third of the women said that there were “no barriers” to attaining and retaining their athletic director positions, the majority of respondents indicated that the barriers women encounter are real. Women report that more is expected of them, and that they have to prove themselves competent and capable in ways that their male counterparts do

not. Additionally, they noted that they have to work harder than do men to gain the acceptance, authority, trust, and respect necessary to lead.

Table 10

Male Response Percentages by Skills Women Need to Strengthen Candidacy for AD Position

Skill	Percentage (n = 158)
Same as Males	34.8% (55)
Don't Be So Defensive—Get Over It Being About Gender	16.5% (26)
More Communication Skills/Networking	15.8% (25)
More Experience Seeing the Bigger Picture	15.2% (24)
Be Self/Work Hard/Have Confidence	13.3% (21)
Organizational and Leadership Skills	12.7% (20)
More and Broader Coaching Experience	11.4% (18)
Be More Firm	7.6% (7)
Apply For More Positions in Larger Geographic Area	4.4% (7)

Note. Because participants could list more than one skill, percentages do not sum to 100%.

It is also clear from these results that mentoring is an important component of an athletic director's success, with 80% of current athletic directors indicating that they have had a mentor. However, 64% of the men reported that they have never mentored a female for an athletic director position. Mentoring can be a valuable tool in obtaining an athletic directorship. Mentoring enhances access, providing an introduction into important professional networks. The results illustrate that successful leaders often have mentors and also serve as mentors for future leaders. Men, as well as women, need to be involved in mentoring women for athletic director positions. Mentoring others, which helps ensure the success of one, also enhances the success of the larger group.

Networking appears to be an important factor in job attainment. The male athletic directors listed "contacts within the system" as the most important factor in securing their present position, and female athletic directors identified contacts as second to "being in the right place at the right time" as a job attainment factor. This finding is in contrast to Danylchuk et al. (1996), who found that for college level administrators, education and prior work experience were more important than contacts. Because searches for high school level athletic administrators tend to be more localized,

networking becomes a crucial component in job attainment, providing an informal source of knowledge of job opportunities. Consistent with Whisenant and Pedersen's (2004a) findings, networking contributes to career advancement and success. Because current networks consist primarily of men, women should be encouraged to start their own networks, or to find men who are willing to mentor them into existing networks.

Successful female athletic directors are those who are able to attain and retain their positions, participate in key decision-making dialogues with other colleagues in the region or state, and know how to navigate the "old boys" network. Mentoring and networking appear to be important tools in providing women equal access to athletic leadership positions.

Implications

Women perceive barriers to attaining and retaining athletic leadership positions and believe those barriers to be different from those experienced by men. Further study of this issue is warranted if we are to fully understand the difficulties that women face in accessing athletic directorships. Identifying systematic barriers that impair women's access to these positions has implications for administrators responsible for recruiting, hiring, and retaining qualified athletic directors. In addition, the Athletic Director Survey (ADS) does not distinguish those holding positions at large or small schools, or schools in rural or urban settings. It would be interesting to determine if the barriers women face are different or similar in accessing more competitive jobs with higher prestige and more power, and if the women who have obtained athletic director positions are segregated into less esteemed positions.

The findings of this study emphasize the importance of mentoring in accessing leadership positions and being successful in those positions. Further study should examine how mentoring relationships are established, why men are not mentoring women for athletic leadership positions, and whether women are mentoring other women. Women need to be encouraged to seek out and establish mentoring relationships.

The existence of the "old boy's network" excludes women from important opportunities for career advancement. Membership in professional organizations provides channels to job information and leadership experiences. Women need to focus on building professional networks with other female athletic directors. Professional development activities should focus on creating an awareness of the need for establishing networks and developing mentoring strategies.

References

- Acosta, V., & Carpenter L. (2004). Women in intercollegiate sport: A longitudinal, study—Twenty-seven year update, 1977-2004. Retrieved June 23, 2004 from http://webpages.charter.net/womeninsport/AcostaCarp_2004.pdf.
- Bray, C. (2002). NCAA year-by-year sports participation 1982-2001. Indianapolis, IN: National Collegiate Athletic Association. Retrieved June 23, 2004 from <http://www.ncaa.org/library/research/participation%5Frates/1982-2001>.
- Caccese, T., & Mayerberg, C. (1984). Gender differences in perceived burnout of college coaches. *Journal of Sport Psychology*, 6, 279-288.
- Danylchuk, K. E., Pastore, D. L., & Inglis, S. (1996). Critical factors in the attainment of intercollegiate coaching and management positions. *Physical Educator*, 53, 137-146.
- Hart, B. A., Hasbrook, C. A., & Mathes, S.A. (1986). An examination of the reduction in the number of female interscholastic coaches. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 57, 68-77.
- Hasbrook, C. A. (1988). Female coaches—why the declining numbers and percentages? *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation and Dance*, 59, 59-63.
- Hasbrook, C. A., Hart, B. A., Mathes, S. A., & True, S. (1990). Sex bias and the validity of believed differences between male and female interscholastic coaches. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 61, 259-267.
- Heishman, M., Bunker, L., & Tutwiler, R. (1990). The decline of women leaders (coaches and athletic directors) in girls' interscholastic sport programs in Virginia from 1972-1987. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 61, 103-107.
- Holman, M. A., & Parkhouse, B. L. (1981). Trends in the selection of coaches for female athletes: A demographic inquiry. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 52, 9-18.
- Inglis, S., Danylchuk, K. E., & Pastore, D. (1996). Understanding retention factors in coaching and athletic management positions. *Journal of Sport Management*, 10(3), 237-249.
- Knoppers, A. (1987). Gender and the coaching profession. *Quest*, 39, 9-22.
- Knoppers, A. (1989). Coaching: An equal opportunity occupation? *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation and Dance*, 60(3), 38-43.
- Knoppers, A. (1992). Explaining male dominance and sex segregation in coaching: Three approaches. *Quest*, 44, 210-227.
- Locke, L. F., & Massengale, J. D. (1978). Role conflict in teacher/coaches. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 49, 162-174.
- Lovett, D. J., & Lowry, C. D. (1988). The role of gender in leadership positions in female sport programs in Texas colleges. *Journal of Sport Management*, 2, 106-117.
- Lovett, D. J., & Lowry, C. D. (1994). "Good old boys" and "good old girls" clubs: Myth or reality? *Journal of Sport Management*, 8, 27-35.
- National Federation of State High School Associations (NFSHSA). (2003). National federation of state high school associations 2002-2003 participation summary. Retrieved June 22, 2004, from http://www.nfhs.org/scriptcontent/VA_Custom/SurveyResources/2002_2003_Participation_Summary.pdf
- Parkhouse, B. L., & Williams, J. M. (1986). Differential effects of sex and status on evaluation of coaching abilities. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 57, 53-59.
- Pastore, D. L., Inglis, S., & Danylchuk, K. E. (1996). Retention factors in coaching and athletic management: Differences by gender, position, and geographic location. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 24, 427-441.
- Pastore, D. L., & Whiddon, S. (1983, December). The employment of males and females in athletics and physical education in the state of Florida. *The Physical Educator*, 40, 207-210.
- Stangl, J. M., & Kane, M. A. (1991). Structural variables that offer explanatory power for the underrepresentation of women coaches since Title IX: The case of homologous reproduction. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 8, 47-60.
- Whisenant, W. A. (2003). How women have fared as interscholastic athletic administrators since the passage of Title IX. *Sex Roles*, 49(3-4), 179-184.
- Whisenant, W. A., & Pedersen, P. (2004a). The influence of managerial activities on the success of intercollegiate athletic directors. *American Business Review*, 22(1), 21-26.

- Whisenant, W. A., & Pedersen, P. (2004b). Traditional managerial activities and interscholastic athletic directors: Examining the differences, similarities, and connections between engagement, gender, and success of high school sports administrators. *Public Organization Review*, 4(1), 75.
- Whisenant, W. A., Pedersen, P. M., & Obenour, B. L. (2002). Success and gender: Determining the rate of advancement for intercollegiate athletic directors. *Sex Roles*, 47(9-10), 485-492.
- Williams, J. M., & Miller, D. M. (1983). Intercollegiate athletic administration: Preparation patterns. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 54(4), 398-406.

Stories of Resiliency: Successful Female Educational Leaders

Anita M. Pankake
Danna M. Beaty

Introduction

With increasing demands from a variety of sectors—both public and private—educational leaders at all levels are faced with conflicting elements that place them in positions of error even when they “do everything right.” Given the ever increasing and often conflicting demands for educational leaders in today’s climate of accountability and reform, learning to persist is essential. To stay the course in today’s educational context, individuals must be able to face adversity, overcome it, or come back from it. In others words, they must be resilient. According to Patterson (2001), “. . . resilience means using your energy productively to move ahead in the face of adversity” (p. 18). Resilience is “. . . a long-term, not a short-term, construct. Resilience doesn’t fluctuate daily, like the stock market. You’re not resilient today and non-resilient tomorrow. Resilience represents your capacity, your collective energy points, available to move ahead under adversity” (p. 18).

Resilience is developed. The literature on resilience in children is offering new insights on how resilience evolves and some of the significant developmental points in this process. Henderson (1998) noted that, “Longitudinal studies in psychology, psychiatry, and sociology show how children and adults are able to bounce back from stress, trauma, and risk in their lives, and suggest resiliency strategies for students and educators” (p. 15). In a similar vein, Bennis (1989) asserted that leaders invent themselves. The development of the self, voice, and mind is a process that begins at birth and ends with the last breath. How much development of the self, voice, and mind that occurs is determined by the individual, but is also influenced heavily by his or her background. To a large extent, we are all products of our environment. Leaders take the positive and negative circumstances and learning opportunities presented to them and construct a better product (Bennis, 1989).

Information about the experiences successful leaders perceive as vital to their development can be helpful to our understanding of resiliency. Such information can also offer insights into the ways successful leaders use

About the Authors

Anita M. Pankake, a former teacher, team leader, assistant principal and principal, is currently a Professor and Director of the Doctoral Program in Educational Leadership at The University of Texas–Pan American. Dr. Pankake holds an undergraduate and a master's degree from Indiana State University, Terre Haute, Indiana and her doctorate from Loyola University-Chicago. She has published in the *Journal of Staff Development*, *Journal of School Leadership*, *Educational Considerations*, *NASSP Bulletin*, *Educational Horizons*, *Urban Education*, *Journal of Instructional Psychology* and other professional journals. She has given numerous speeches and presented a variety of workshops focused on change and school improvement issues. She has authored two book, *The Effective Elementary School Principal* and *Implementation: Making Things Happen*, the co-editor of three books, (the most recent being *Administration and Supervision of Special Instructional Programs*) and has written chapters for several works edited by others. Her book, *Implementation: Making Things Happen*, was named the Outstanding Publication for the Year 2000 by the Texas Staff Development Council. She is currently working with Dr. Gayle Moller of Western Carolina University in writing a book for principals regarding teacher leadership. She is an active member of several professional associations including National Staff Development Council, Texas Staff Development Council and Texas Council of Women School Executives. She lives in Edinburg, Texas with her husband, David. pancake@sbcglobal.net

Danna Beaty, Ed.D. is Assistant Professor of Educational Leadership at Tarleton State University, Stephenville, Texas. Her doctorate, master's and undergraduate degrees are from Texas A & M University–Commerce. Prior to joining higher education, Dr. Beaty taught high school English and served as the Technology Coordinator and District Librarian in Winnsboro ISD, Winnsboro, Texas. After finishing her doctorate, Dr. Beaty served as the Program Coordinator of the Meadows Principal Improvement Program and taught classes in the master's and doctoral programs in Educational Administration at Texas A & M University–Commerce. Dr. Beaty has co-authored a book on school scheduling, contributed chapters to Huffman & Hipp's *Reculturing Schools as Professional Learning Communities* and Pankake, Littleton, & Schroth's *Administration and Supervision of Special Instructional Programs*. She has presented several papers at AERA based on her research on women and on professional learning communities. She continues her interest in these areas and has recently undertaken research in the area of parent involvement.

positive and negative situations as learning opportunities and the strategies they implement in addressing adversity.

We examined the reported experiences of 12 successful female educational leaders as stories of resiliency development through overcoming or coming back from adversity. Specifically, the reported experiences of these women were examined to determine:

- When did adversity evidence itself in the lives of these leaders?
- Were any of the adversity experiences common among the women in terms of when they occurred and the contexts or settings in which they occurred?
- What strategies did these women use in overcoming or coming back from these adversity experiences?
- Do the reported experiences of these twelve successful female educational leaders align with the literature on resiliency in children, adversity and failure in leadership development, and barriers to success as gender issues?

In presenting this information, a brief overview of the literature on leadership and resiliency is offered to establish the perspectives that motivated this study. Next, a description of the methods used to gather and analyze the data for addressing the question posed is presented. A cameo sketch of each of the 12 women is provided; the sketches are followed by data displays that respond to the questions posed here. In closing, a summary of the findings and an interpretation of what they mean in terms of personal and professional development for educational leaders generally and for female educational leaders are posed.

Literature Perspectives

Early experiences and developing ways of dealing with adverse situations appear to contribute strongly to the ability to constantly develop self and in turn lead others. According to Bennis (1989), leaders who take the positive and negative circumstances and learning opportunities presented to them and construct a better product are “twice-born leaders.”

Twice-borns generally suffer as they grow up, feel different, even isolated, and so develop an elaborate inner life. As they grow older, they become truly independent, relying wholly on their own beliefs and ideas. Leaders who are twice-born are inner directed, self-assured, and, as a result, truly charismatic. (p. 49)

McCall, Lombardo, and Morrison (1988) found that executives learned the most about themselves as individuals and leaders “from their mistakes, confrontations with problem subordinates, traumatic events, and career setbacks” (p. 13). Literature suggests that it is the adversity or failure incidents that leaders endure that make them stronger. Leadership development “depends not just on raw talent but also on the experiences one has and what one does with them” (McCall et al., 1988, p. 5). The handling of a crisis or extreme stress can transform potential talent into actual talent by developing the ability to deal emotionally with tough situations, such as making decisions under risk and uncertainty, being responsible for the acts of others, and occasionally terminating employees (McCall et al., 1988). This risk-taking orientation was found to be a factor in promoting leaders to the top and keeping them there.

Bass (1990) found that providing leaders, and potential leaders, with opportunities to experience adverse situations in the workplace can actually enhance their performance by converting a potential stressful situation into a challenging one. Additionally, leaders who viewed situations as challenges rather than crises were found to be more open to ideas and suggestions from others, including subordinates. This in turn led to more effective decisions (Bass, 1990).

In studying successful executives, McCall et al. (1988) found that it was during moments of adversity that leaders admitted to themselves—often for the first time—that they could no longer know every detail or control every action and that “sometimes leadership boiled down to stopping, asking questions, and listening to other points of view” (p. 35). They also found that a critical aspect of the successful leader was the ability to listen to criticism and construct it in a manner that would allow for growth and further development.

Instead of denying critical feedback that hurt, they swallowed their pride and took it to heart. Instead of blaming everything on an intolerant boss, they dug out messages about themselves. . . . They adopted the attitude that you can learn something from everyone. (McCall et al., 1988, p. 73)

Research regarding learning from mistakes and overcoming adversity is particularly important to gender issues in leadership development. Research about women’s career paths indicates a lack of persistence, low tolerance for failure, and low self-esteem (Leonard & Papalewis, 1987). In addition to the external barriers facing women entering administration, the barriers they set up themselves concerning their own abilities sometimes prove to be too difficult to overcome (Lad, 1998). The behavior of placing restrictions upon oneself is a pattern often developed during the formative years of an

individual's life. Rejecting the cultural norms has been difficult at best for women as well as men. Women often seem content to continue in the traditional roles created for them by societies past. After years of personal struggle and education, many eventually come to view their station and importance in society in a very different light. Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule (1986) spoke of this development of self, voice, and mind in their book, *Women's Ways of Knowing*. They, along with researchers such as Gilligan (1982) and Weiler (1988), examined the unique ways in which women internalize knowledge and express themselves and the developmental patterns of this process. Through this developmental process, women become more confident in their own abilities, begin to listen to their inner-voice, and are more likely to engage in risk-taking behaviors.

Luthar and Zelazo (2003) reported that decades of accumulated research indicate that a major factor in resilient adaptation is good relationships. They pointed out that,

From the earliest pioneering studies of Norman Garmezy and Emmy Werner to more contemporaneous ones, investigators have consistently pointed to the critical importance of strong connections with at least one supportive adult: in many instances a primary caregiver, who is among the earliest, most proximal, and most enduring of socializing influences. Sound interpersonal relationships in the early years can engender the growth of effective coping skills and resources, which, in turn, can aid children in coping with sundry adversities subsequently in life. (p. 544)

Luthar and Zelazo (2003) noted that neighborhood networks or home-visit interventions can help parents cope with their own stressors and thus avoid transferring their personal stresses to their children. They also claimed that teachers and informal mentors in the community can be just as valuable as support systems as can family members. They asserted that, "With enough contact and continuity over time, these relationships can compensate greatly for difficult family situations" (p. 545). It appears that relationships with individuals outside the family can positively influence the development of resiliency.

The research on resilience has taken a variety of approaches but always with a common purpose: "to identify the factors associated with better adaptation among children at risk, and to understand whatever processes may underlie those correlates or predictors of good adaptations" (Mastern, 2001, Masten & Coatsworth, 1998, cited in Masten and Powell, 2003, p. 9).

Garmezy (1985) described three major categories of protective factors: *individual attributes*, such as good intellectual skills, positive temperament, and positive views of the self; *family qualities*, such as high warmth,

cohesion, expectations, and involvement; and *supportive systems outside the family*, such as strong social networks or good schools (Masten & Powell, 2003, pp. 12-13.). These findings have been confirmed again and again, creating a common set of findings regarding what influences the development of resilience (Masten, 1999, 2001, cited in Masten and Powell, 2003).

Masten and Powell (2003) used Garmezy's (1985) categories to develop a list of attributes of individuals and their contexts often associated with resilience. These examples add specificity to Garmezy's three categories:

Individual Differences:

- cognitive abilities (IQ scores, attention skills, executive functioning skills)
- self-perceptions of competence, worth, confidence (self-efficacy, self-esteem)
- temperament and personality (adaptability, sociability)
- self-regulations skills (impulse control, affect and arousal regulation)
- a positive outlook on life (hopefulness, beliefs that life has meaning, faith)

Relationships:

- parenting quality (including warmth, structure and monitoring, expectations)
- close relationships with competent adults (parents, relatives, mentors)
- connections to prosocial and rule-abiding peers (among older children)

Community Resources and Opportunities:

- good schools
- connections to prosocial organizations (such as clubs or religious groups)
- neighborhood quality (public safety, collective supervision, libraries, recreation centers)
- quality of social services and health care offered. (Masten & Powell, 2003, p. 13)

The literature on successful leaders facing adversity and that on the development of resiliency in children provide a perspective on which to investigate the resiliency of leaders. The anticipation would be that the stories of successful leaders' ability to bounce back from adversity have the characteristics identified in the literature regarding resiliency development in children. Collecting the stories of these successful female educational leaders allowed an analysis to identify what experiences, characteristics, relationships and supportive conditions contributed to their ability to be resilient in their professional roles.

Methods

Data from two separate studies regarding experiences vital to the success of female educational leaders were combined and reanalyzed. A total of twelve (12) women (6 superintendents and 6 high school principals) were involved in personal interviews seeking information about the vital experiences that contributed to their success. The six superintendents were those studied by Pankake, Schroth and Funk (2000). The six high school principals were from a study completed by Beaty (2001). In both studies, particular emphasis was given to information related to overcoming adversity and dealing with mistakes or setbacks they had experienced in their professional and personal lives.

Interview protocols were used in each study; both protocols asked the women specifically about vital experiences in their development, about turning points in their lives, and about what role failure or adversity had played in their lives. Interviews lasted approximately 60-90 minutes each; they were audio-taped and later transcribed for ease of analysis.

Content analysis techniques were used. Key words and common themes were sought among the women's stories. Information was sought to determine if the experiences reported as vital to their development offered any common themes regarding situational contexts, age at which the experiences occurred, whether they were personal or professional, if the reported impact on the individual was positive or negative, and what strategies were used to address the adversities.

- When did adversity evidence itself in the lives of these leaders?
- Were any of the adversity experiences common among the women in terms of when they occurred and the contexts or settings in which they occurred?
- What strategies did these women use in overcoming or coming back from these adversity experiences?
- Do the reported experiences of these 12 successful female educational leaders align with the literature on resiliency in children, adversity and failure in leadership development, and barriers to success as gender issues?

Cameos of the Twelve Women

The complete stories of these women cannot be shared in the limited space of this article; a cameo or sketch of each is possible. A few lines can perhaps convey the sense of these women as leaders. The cameos are presented here in alphabetical order. All names are pseudonyms to protect the

confidentiality promised to each of these women when she agreed to share her story.

Gwen Bishop

Gwen is an attractive woman in her late fifties. Impeccably dressed, she has a presence about her that is both professional and stylish. On the day of the interview she is wearing a black and white tailored dress with minimal jewelry and her blonde hair is worn in a smooth shoulder length cut. She is well spoken and appears comfortable with herself as a leader and figure of authority, yet she creates an atmosphere that welcomes input and places others at ease. At the time of the interview, Gwen was the high school principal of a school that served over 3000 students in a large metropolitan area of Southeast Texas. She is now retired.

Mary Dell Costello

Mary Dell Costello's tall, slender build commands attention at first sight. Though her voice is soft and welcoming, her words convey experience and convictions regarding life generally and education, specifically. Mary Dell grew up in a small rural farming community. Her father was a farmer and she swore she would never marry a farmer nor would she ever be in education! After graduating from college she returned home and married a farmer in her home community. Her college work was focused on international law; she had no intentions of going into teaching and, of course, has had a stellar career as an educator. Her education career included teaching, the high school principalship, and central office positions and the superintendency. Her personal life included a happy marriage with three children. At the time of this interview, Mary Dell was entering her third year as superintendent in the current district.

Marie Hubbard

Marie Hubbard's upbringing was in a modest home, her father a skilled tradesman in the oil business and her mother a housewife. She was one of three children. She did very well in her elementary and secondary schooling. A favorite teacher in her junior high school years told her that he thought she would make a good teacher; from that point on that's what she knew she wanted to do. During her second year of college, she met a young man; they married; had their first child 11 months after marrying; and had her sixth child before her oldest child was five! She stayed at home to care for the children and cared for others' children as a way to earn money. She returned to school; finished her degree and started teaching when her youngest child entered kindergarten. Early in her work career she was identified as a leader

and invited to assume administrative positions. Her entrance into administration was delayed because of some family issues; even so, she eventually became a principal, a diagnostician, held positions in the central office, intermediate agencies and ultimately the superintendency.

Grace Kingsley

When in the presence of Grace Kingsley, one feels privileged to be given the opportunity. The name Grace is truly descriptive of her manner in all respects. Kingsley is considered by many to be a pioneer in the area of women in the superintendency. She was among the few women to occupy administrative positions at any level and one of the first to be a superintendent. She reported her mother and grandmother as the great influences in her early development. She managed to have a successful career in school administration (including being a bus driver as needed), while she and her husband raised five children.

Ellen Little

Ellen is a pretty woman in her late fifties. Her delicate features and pale blue eyes are accentuated by her fair skin and blond hair, which softly frames her face. On the day of the interview she is wearing a dress of gray silk crepe. Her jewelry and make-up both represent her seemingly simplistic style. Ellen is a warm and inviting individual to talk with who maintains a refreshingly positive perspective even when discussing adverse, and sometimes painful, situations. A former high school principal, at the time of the interview she was serving as a college professor at a private religious institution.

Grace Martinez

Grace is an attractive woman in her mid fifties. Very articulate and bright, she exudes confidence and enthusiasm. On the day of the interview she is wearing a lavender linen sheath dress. Her black hair is stylishly short and accentuates her large brown eyes, which snap as she relates her experiences of leadership and life. Grace is invigorating to speak with and puts her listeners at ease with her forthcoming and straightforward style of communication. She speaks with pride of her Mexican heritage and the important role her parent's history had in her own education. A first generation Mexican American, Grace was also the first in her family to graduate high school and go on to college. At the time of the interview, Grace was serving as Assistant Superintendent in the same district.

Katherine Patton

Katherine Patton, a woman in her early seventies, suffered no foolishness from anyone. Early in our interview with her she announced. "I'm seventy-one and I'll retire when I get damn ready! I just signed a five-year contract!" Her early years were spent in economic conditions that ranged from boom to bust; but she was generally well cared for by her parents. She dropped out of high school to marry. Her father's concern about what would happen to her if she lost her husband motivated him to pay for her to get a college degree in teaching. Her husband was in the military which afforded Katherine the opportunity to travel around the world. As a teacher, she exercised leadership in the state association for teachers and in her negotiations with the district. She held central office positions related to special education and curriculum and was finishing a decade of being superintendent. Perhaps because of the loss of two of her own children, she was passionately committed to the children in her district.

Anna Beth Pierce

Anna Beth is a striking woman in her early fifties. She is bright, energetic and very self-assured. Her speech, her stylishly cut black hair and carefully selected jewelry project an image of a well paid, well groomed professional who is socially secure in her position. At the time of the interview, Anna Beth was in her 11th year as the high school principal in a community in Central Texas known for art and cultural flair.

Alejandra Ramirez

Alejandra is a plain spoken woman in her mid forties. Attractive and intelligent, she is confident in herself as an individual and as a leader—unafraid of challenging the established norms. Born and raised in this South Texas border town, Alejandra has had the advantages of a supportive family and firsthand knowledge of the cultural aspects of the community so vital to the success of the school. At the time of the interview, Alejandra was serving as the high school principal of a high achieving campus that had a student population that was 98% minority.

Wendy Shaker

Wendy Shaker was in her fifth year as superintendent at the time we interviewed. She had served as superintendent in one other district prior to coming to her current position. The current district was just at the beginning of a period of rapid growth that was demanding a variety of changes for both the schools and the community. Her career path was fairly traditional including classroom teaching, principalship, central office, some work at the

state agency level and finally the superintendency. She has been married to the same man for nearly 30 years and has two children. Her manner is comfortable for interactions including laughter; although her office was not spacious, it accommodated all of us comfortably and was decorated nicely but included few personal items.

Pat Singleton

Pat Singleton is superintendent of a large suburban district. She is a single woman in her early sixties with a tailored appearance in her dress and a pleasant, but business-like manner in her interactions. Her entire career has been spent in one district—from teacher to superintendent. She has an earned doctorate in education. Though she never married, she did have guardianship and general responsibility for the upbringing of a relative's child. The addition of this responsibility was perceived by Pat as a significant turning point for her both personally and professionally. At the time of her interview with us, she was planning for retirement within the next two years; she has since retired from the superintendency but has remained active in educational leadership development through a variety of agencies.

Pam Smith

Pam is a soft-spoken woman in her mid forties. She is tall and her dress is somewhat reserved. Pam is very thoughtful before responding to questions, emphasizing her belief in the importance of carefully representing oneself. Dedicated to her profession, Pam has chosen not to marry. She firmly believes that the demands of the job are not supportive of a spouse and children. Pam has been in education for 26 years. She was a teacher for four years and has been in administration for 22 years. Up until the last year, Pam spent her entire career in the West Texas border community where she was born and raised. Although she does not have a family of her own, Pam is very dedicated to her mother and siblings. She grew up on a military base where her father, retired military, worked as a Civil Engineer. Her senior year in high school Pam's father passed away leaving Pam—the oldest child at home at the time—with the great responsibility of helping her mother and younger sister through the difficult period of grief and transition. At the time of the interview, Pam was serving as high school principal in a large school district in Central Texas.

Data Presentation

- *When did adversity evidence itself in the lives of these leaders?*

Three major age and stage of life periods were identified within the stories shared: pre-school through high school, early career choice and work

experiences, and early leadership experiences. It appeared that the minority women experienced adversity earlier in their lives than did the majority women. The minority women had two types of discriminations to overcome in their personal lives and careers.

All but two of the women interviewed faced challenges in their early leadership experiences; there were some common themes among them regarding the sources of the challenges. Three major sources of challenges were identified—rejection for a leadership position, community conflict, and undermining superiors. Although the source categories are similar, the stories often differed—both negative and positive—for different individuals.

Only three women in the study had reached the age/life stage of retirement. Adversity experiences, however, were still being reported. The source of the adversity had changed to personal health issues and loss of family members.

- *Were any of the adversity experiences common among the women in terms of when they occurred and the contexts or settings in which they occurred?*

Within each of these age and stage periods, some common elements of influence were found to exist. Four common elements of influence categories have been identified—family (both origin and marriage), teachers (elementary and secondary), mentors (personal and professional), and spiritual or religious beliefs. Although the elements of influence were common in category, they were not consistently positive or negative in their content or influence on the individuals involved. For example, some stories about the influence of a teacher were uplifting regarding the positive actions and influence of the teacher or teachers involved; others were about the actions and influences of a teacher that were extremely negative, even embarrassing to the profession. However, the women reported both the positive and negative experiences as vital in their development.

- *What strategies did these women use in overcoming or coming back from these adversity experiences?*

Along with having some commonalities regarding both when and how adversity experiences entered the lives of these women, they also used similar strategies in addressing the adversity experiences and bouncing back. Five strategies were identified by four or more women as actions they used in addressing and overcoming adversity in their lives. The five strategies common to the group were:

- Having or readying themselves to be of particular value to the organization by having a unique area of expertise that most often occurred through returning to school.
- Looking to mentors for guidance and even for direction in terms of career goals. This often resulted in a return to school to continue the development of a unique expertise and/or to secure a credential necessary for a career move into or higher in the leadership ranks.
- Support through family members via their willingness to relocate, sacrifice family time, not involve themselves in organizational issues—especially those of conflict.
- Seeking answers through reflection and prayer.
- Refocusing on the reason for entering education; when the job became distracted with management concerns, many of these women shared that it was then that they refocused on the children, reminding themselves of why they went into and remain in education.

Table 1 (p. 14) displays the strategies used by each of the women and which strategies were used by more than one of the women.

- *Do the reported experiences of these twelve successful female educational leaders align with the literature on resiliency in children, adversity and failure in leadership development, and barriers to success as gender issues?*

Though not perfect, elements within the stories of these women echo many of the elements regarding leadership and resiliency found in the literature. For example, the categories identified by Garmezy (1985) and expanded by Masten and Powell (2003) as protective factors were evidenced by the women in this study.

Individual Differences: All of these women possessed strong cognitive abilities. Each achieved at least two, and some three, academic degrees. They attained and succeeded in multiple executive positions in education and some in other fields as well. The majority also demonstrated executive functional skills in balancing home and work, especially those with children.

Eventually, all of these women came to self-perceptions of competence, worth and confidence, though not all developed these at the same life stage. The minority women, especially, had doubts about themselves and their abilities; these doubts often came from external environmental influences such as school, rather than home and family. Generally, strong reinforcement for competence and self-worth was present in the families of all of these women. However, many had to be alerted and encouraged by those outside the family to see their potential as educational leaders.

Table 1

Strategies Women Used for Overcoming Adversity

	Support of Husband	Support of Family	Divorced First Husband	Return to School	Find a New Job	Find a Unique Area for Expertise	Support of Male Mentor	Support of Female Mentor	Spirituality
Leader									
Gwen Bishop	X				X				
Mary Dell Costello	X								
Marie Hubbard	X					X			
Grace Kingsley	X					X			X
Ellen Little		X	X	X	X			X	X
Grace Martinez	X	X	X				X		X
Katherine Patton	X					X			
Anna Beth Pierce	X	X		X			X		
Alejandra Ramirez	X	X	X	X			X		X
Wendy Shaker	X								
Pat Singleton									
Pam Smith		X		X	X		X		

For each of these women, their leadership surfaced in all aspects of their lives—family, community, work, education. The stories of these women have the twists and turns of fictional plots; the women were constantly adapting to new situations in both their personal and professional lives—deaths, divorce, community crises, securing a job, not being hired for a desired job, returning to school later in life, and addition of children.

Some highlights of the stories the women shared were often in those situations when they were upset, disappointed and even angry. To a person, the women controlled their impulses to lash out at others. Several spoke of taking time to reflect; others entered into prayer; a few sought advice from mentors. All delayed their public responses until they had sorted through their own emotions and had an opportunity to analyze both the situations and possible reactions.

Though many of the women had moments of darkness in their personal and professional lives, they maintained a hopefulness regarding their contributions to the profession. They were also optimistic about the future of education generally. Four of the women spoke about their faith and how their beliefs carried them through difficult times and helped them to have confidence in the future.

Relationships: Wonderful stories were shared regarding growing up in loving families. One of the superintendents had a difficult childhood with an alcoholic father; but even this provided a context for challenge to success rather than reason to despair. A strong caring adult was mentioned in almost every story regarding the environment in which each woman grew up; sometimes the adult was a parent or grandparent, in other instances, the adult was a teacher or minister. Whatever the status, each of the women spoke of being cared for and nurtured.

The women spoke of a mentor in their professional lives. These were close relationships and helped the women see themselves as capable and competent and many times provided the nudge to pursue a position that otherwise would have been allowed to pass.

Community Resources and Opportunities: School certainly emerged as an influence on all of the women. Sadly, the minority women reported school experiences that were not necessarily positive and often included racial discrimination. Even so, school was important to all of the women and not just in their early years but throughout their careers.

Religion and spirituality played a strong role in these women's lives as community supports. Additionally, they often became involved in church work, community service and government and professional association work. Each of these experiences provided personal and professional growth, an opportunity to network and visibility as a leader. Masten and Powell's (2003)

neighborhood quality was an area for which little information emerged in the interviews. There were, however, stories of love for school, for reading, for travel and other endeavors that increased the quality of life for the women.

Masten and Powell's (2003) descriptions of characteristics found within each of Gamezy's protective factors provided a lens for seeing some of the life events—early on and continuing in to adulthood—of these women as assisting them in becoming resilient.

In several of the stories shared, these women seem to align with the gender literature in which women often place restrictions upon themselves. Fortunately, those in the study reported that there were circumstances and mentors that moved them out of that thinking. Like the executives studied by McCall et al. (1988), these women handled crises in both their personal and professional lives. Given their pursuit of careers in educational leadership via the superintendency and secondary principalship, they are by default risk-takers. These positions are saturated with problems, crises, and stress. They also are positions that have only a small percentage of women occupying them. According to McCall et al. (1988), to succeed in executive roles, individuals must be willing and able to overcome failure by learning from mistakes and using them as growth opportunities—that most certainly described the women who participated in this study.

Summary

The development of resiliency for the women in this study began long before they were in educational leadership positions. Experiences early in their lives appear to have offered them opportunities to deal with adversity. This evidence of overcoming events in their early development and schooling years seems to fit well with the literature on resilient children and how they develop this capacity (Bushweller, 1995; Henderson, 1998; Luthar & Zelazo, 2003; Werner & Smith, 1989). Additionally, the experiences of childhood and those presented later in their lives through work liken these women to Bennis' (1989) "twice-born leaders." Many of these women suffered in their growing years, often feeling different and isolated. Through their stories, they present themselves as individuals who have strongly developed beliefs and ideas. All can be described as inner directed, self-assured, and to some degree, charismatic.

Although adversity situations did not decrease for these women, their understanding of adversity and the capacity for dealing with it increased. According to Satran (1998), "Just as there are few pointers for women on how to get to the top, there are fewer still on responding to adversity" (p. 31). Information gleaned from the women's stories address Satran's concern. The common themes identified in the stories of these 12 successful female

educational leaders offer some insights on how women specifically, but educational leaders generally, might respond to and overcome adversity. The credit these women gave to these experiences as being 'vital' to their development seems to echo, not only the literature on developing resiliency in children, but also the importance of experiencing and overcoming mistakes and failures as a part of leadership development. Additionally, the women's stories offer verification of the importance of experiencing and overcoming mistakes and failures as a component for leadership development; and they identify some actions and attitudes that can help others.

References

- Bass, B. M. (1990). *Bass & Stogdill's handbook of leadership: Theory, research, and managerial application* (3rd ed.). New York: Free Press.
- Beaty, D. M. (2001). *Vital experiences of successful female high school principals: Adversities as they relate to success*. Doctoral dissertation, Texas A&M University-Commerce.
- Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing: The development of self, voice and mind*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bennis, W. (1989). *On becoming a leader*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.
- Bushweller, K. (1995). The resilient child: The latest research on how some kids bear the weight of a wicked work—and bounce right back. *The American School Board Journal*, 182(5), 18-23.
- Garnezy, N. (1985). Stress-resistant children: The search for protective factors. In J. E. Stevenson (Ed.), *Recent research in developmental psychopathology. Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry Book Supplement*, 4, 213-233.
- Gilligan, C. (1982). *In a different voice: Psychological theory and women's development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Henderson, N. (1998). Make resiliency happen. *The Education Digest*, 63(5), 15-18.
- Lad, K. (1998). Why there are so few women high school principals. In C. Funk, A. Pankake, & M. Reese (Eds.), *Women as school executives: Realizing the vision* (pp. 73-81). Commerce, TX: Texas A & M University Press and the Texas Council of Women School Executives.
- Leonard, Y. P., & Papalewis, R. (1987). The underrepresentation of women and minorities in educational administration: Patterns, issues, and recommendations. *Journal of Educational Equity and Leadership*, 7(3), 188-207.
- Luthar, S. S., & Zelazo, L. B. (2003). Research on resilience: An integrative review. In S. S. Luthar (Ed.), *Resilience and vulnerability: Adaptation in the context of childhood adversities* (pp. 510-549). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Masten, A. S. (2001). Ordinary magic: Resilience processes in development. *American Psychologist*, 56, 227-238.
- Masten, A., & Coatsworth, J. (1998). The development of competence in favorable and unfavorable environments: Lessons from research on successful children. *American Psychologist*, 53, 205-220.
- Masten, A. S., & Powell, J. L. (2003). A resilience framework for research, policy, and practice. In S. S. Luthar (Ed.), *Resilience and vulnerability: Adaptation in the context of childhood adversities* (pp. 1-15). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- McCall, M. W., Lombardo, M. M., & Morrison, A. M. (1988). *The lessons of experience: How successful executives develop on the job*. Lexington, MA: Lexington.
- Pankake, A. M., Schroth, G., & Funk, C. (2000). Successful women superintendents: Developing as leaders, learning from failure. *ERS Spectrum*, 18(1), 3-13.
- Patterson, J. (2001, June). Resilience in the face of adversity. *The School Administrator*, 6(58), 18-21.
- Regan, H. B., & Brooks, G. H. (1995). *Out of women's experience: Creating relational leadership*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin.
- Satran, R. J. (1998, April). Second chances. *Working Woman*, 28-32.

- Weiler, K. (1988). *Women teaching for change: Gender, class and power*. South Hadley, MA: Bergin & Garvey.
- Werner, E., & Smith, R. (1989). *Vulnerable but invincible: A longitudinal study of resilient children and youth*. New York: Adams, Bannister & Cox.

You're Fired! Donald Trump, No Child Left Behind, and The Limits of Dissonant Leadership in Education

Andrea Kayne Kaufman

Imagine a scenario in which an individual gets up every day and goes to work in fear—in fear of performing the difficult tasks at work—in fear of the colleagues who perform better. The individual is in fear of the boss who is omnipotent, larger than life and constantly judging, evaluating, and sentencing employees to a lifetime of failure. The individual knows that someone is going down, and at any moment, it is likely the individual will hear those dreaded words, “You’re fired!” This is not Donald Trump’s reality television program, *The Apprentice*. Although it follows a similar formula, this is the reality of public school teachers on a daily basis obliged to follow the fear-inducing mandates of the *No Child Left Behind Act* of 2001 (2002). Like Donald Trump, the *No Child Left Behind Act* compels the managers of schools, superintendents and principals, to use hierarchy, competition, and fear to motivate their most important employees, the teachers. The consequences of this Dissonant Leadership in business are questionable and in education, they are devastating.

In Part I of this article, I explain the theory of Primal Leadership and Dissonant Leadership (Goleman, Boyatzis, & McKee, 2002). In Part II, I enunciate the ways in which key *No Child Left Behind Act* provisions encourage and, in some cases, mandate that schools utilize Dissonant Leadership strategies. In Part III, I explain why the Dissonant Leadership strategies espoused by the *No Child Left Behind Act* undermine the purported purposes of the statute. In Part IV, I consider the ability of an education statute to mandate or encourage Primal Leadership strategies.

About the Author

Andrea Kayne Kaufman, B.A. Vassar College, Ed.M. Harvard University Graduate School of Education, J.D. University of Pennsylvania Law School, is an Assistant Professor of Educational Leadership at DePaul University School of Education in Chicago, Illinois. The author acknowledges MaryKate Follis, Karah Kohler, Gina Nessling, David Powers, and Jacob J. Kaufman for their invaluable assistance. akaufman@depaul.edu

Part I: Goleman, Boyatzis, and McKee's Theory of Primal Leadership and Dissonant Leadership

Building on Goleman's classic *Harvard Business Review* articles "What Makes a Leader?" (1998, 2004) and "Leadership that Gets Results" (2000), Goleman et al. (2002) fully develop the theory of Primal Leadership and Dissonant Leadership in their book *Primal Leadership: Realizing the Power of Emotional Intelligence*. According to Goleman et al., managers, management practices, and organizations can be characterized as utilizing Primal Leadership strategies or Dissonant Leadership strategies. Broadly, the difference between Primal Leadership and Dissonant Leadership concerns the emotional climate that is created at the organization as a result of management practices. Primal Leadership practices "prime good feelings . . . creat[ing] resonance—a reservoir of positivity that frees the best in people" (p. ix). Dissonant Leadership practices create bad feelings, driving individuals toward "antagonism and hostility" (p. 4). Instead of creating a reservoir of positive feeling, Dissonant Leadership practices lead to "chronic anger, anxiety, [and/]or a sense of futility" (p. 13) as well as making "people less emotionally intelligent" (p. 13) in other ways. In addition to creating bad feeling, the negative emotions associated with Dissonant Leadership "powerfully disrupt work, hijacking attention from the task at hand" as well as "erod[ing] mental abilities" (p. 13).

Goleman et al. (2002) identify the primary feeling of Dissonant Leadership as fear. Specifically, fear manifests in Dissonant Leadership practices in the following ways:

- A. Motivation through fear from hierarchical top-down management rather than through inspiration as the result of teamwork and collaboration (pp. 219-220; pp. 255-256);
- B. Progress out of fear of punitive repercussions rather than by professional development (p. 256); and

- C. Adversarial relations based on fear and erroneous zero-sum perceptions rather than positive relations based on safe communication and constructive conflict management (p. 256).

Motivation Through Fear From Hierarchical Top-down Management Rather Than Through Inspiration as the Result of Teamwork and Collaboration

Fear manifests in Dissonant Leadership practices when management motivates through fear in a hierarchical top-down way rather than inspiring its employees through teamwork and collaboration. Primal Leadership encourages a bottom-up strategy of teamwork and collaboration in order to intrinsically motivate people to work hard for the organization. Goleman et al. (2002) explained:

A bottom-up strategy is needed as well, because resonance only develops when everyone is attuned to the change. This means engaging formal and informal leaders from all over the organization in conversations about what is working, what is not, and how exciting it would be if the organization could move more in the direction of what is working. Taking time out to discuss these kinds of issues is a powerful intervention. It gets people thinking and talking, and shows them the way. Once the excitement and buy-in builds, it's more possible to move from talk to action. The enthusiasm provides momentum. But the movement needs to be directed: toward the dream, toward collective values, and toward new ways of working together. Transparent goals, an open change process, involvement of as many people as possible, and modeling new behaviors provide a top-down, bottom-up jump-start for resonance. (p. 220)

This bottom-up strategy inspires employees through a vision that creates a sense of mission. The vision must be "compelling" and needs to "touch people's hearts . . . [so that they] see, feel, and touch the values and the vision of the organization" (Goldman et al., 2002, p. 220). Through an atmosphere of "friendly collegiality . . . respect, helpfulness, and cooperation" (Goldman et al., 2002, p. 256), a manager can solicit "enthusiastic commitment to the collective effort" (Goldman et al., 2002, p. 256) of the organization.

Primal Leadership motivates people to act out of inspiration and Dissonant Leadership forces people to act out of fear. While Primal Leadership fills people with a common vision, Dissonant Leadership fills them with individual dread. Primal Leadership collaborates and listens to create "buy in;" Dissonant Leadership ignores individual views and uses threats and intimidation to create fear. The panic and anxiety created by using fear to demand performance may result in an instantaneous

improvement, but it is usually short-lived and cannot be sustained. Force and fear lead to burn out. As Goleman et al. (2002) explained:

If core beliefs, mindsets, or culture really need to change, people need to drive that change themselves. It cannot be forced, so when people enter in to such a change process, they need to be personally and powerfully motivated—preferably by hope and a dream, not fear. A visionary leader can impact this process positively by honoring the feelings and beliefs of the people around him, while steadfastly demonstrating the benefit of moving toward the dream. (p. 219)

Progress Out of Fear of Punitive Repercussions Rather Than by Professional Development

Fear manifests in Dissonant Leadership practices when progress is demanded by instilling a fear of punitive repercussions rather than through encouragement and professional development. Dissonant Leadership seeks change and improvement by breaking people down, Primal Leadership seeks change and improvement by building people up. Primal Leadership improves an organization by “cultivating people’s abilities” and “understanding their goals, strengths, and weaknesses” (Goleman et al., 2002, p. 256). The Primal Leadership provides “mentors or coaches” (p. 256) to develop employees to improve their performance and the success of the organization. Primal Leadership encourages managers to be “change catalysts” who do not just recognize the need for change but also “champion the new order” (p. 256). Dissonant Leadership does not champion, it bullies. Dissonant Leadership deals with change by threatening its employees with severe punitive consequences unless they perform. Dissonant Leadership does not develop employees or help them overcome obstacles. It scares them into compliance for fear of survival.

Adversarial Relations Based on Fear and Erroneous Zero-sum Perceptions Rather Than Positive Relations Based on Safe Communication and Constructive Conflict Management

Dissonant Leadership uses fear to divide people; Primal Leadership uses constructive communication to unite people. Dissonant Leadership practices create and exacerbate adversarial relations. Dissonant Leadership pits people against each other. Dissonant Leadership perpetuates the erroneous perception that individuals live in a zero-sum world in which they are competing with one another for scarce resources.

Primal Leadership assumes that stakeholders are on the same side. Eschewing fear and dissension, Primal Leadership promotes safe communication and constructive conflict resolution. Goleman et al. (2002)

explain how Primal Leaders use the power of influence and persuasion to be effective:

Leaders who manage conflicts best are able to draw out all parties, understand the differing perspectives, and then find a common ideal that everyone can endorse. They surface the conflict, acknowledging the feelings and views of all sides, and then redirect the energy toward a shared ideal. . . . Indicators of a leader's powers of influence range from finding just the right appeal for a given listener to knowing how to build buy-in from key people and a network of support for an initiative. Leaders adept in influence are persuasive and engaging when they address a group. (p. 256)

Thus, Primal Leadership organizations address stakeholders' concerns, communicate with stakeholders about competing interests, and effectively mediate differences. Conversely, Dissonant Leadership organizations ignore stakeholders' points of view, pit stakeholders against one another, and perpetuate a zero-sum dog-eat-dog mentality.

Part II: Key *No Child Left Behind Act* Provisions Encourage and in Some Cases Mandate That Schools Utilize Dissonant Leadership Strategies

The *No Child Left Behind Act*, through its key provisions, encourages and, in some places, requires schools to utilize Dissonant Leadership practices. The *No Child Left Behind Act* is the reauthorization of the *Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965*. The *No Child Left Behind Act* embodies Dissonant Leadership. The "centerpiece" of the *No Child Left Behind Act* is the requirement that all students meet proficiency requirements as well as the harsh sanctions for schools that do not meet such requirements (Wright, Wright, & Heath, 2004, p. 11). Specifically, the following key provisions in the *No Child Left Behind Act* reflect characteristics of fear-inducing Dissonant Leadership:

- A. The "Adoption of Phonics-Based Reading" provisions of the *No Child Left Behind Act* reflect the Dissonant Leadership practice of motivating through fear from hierarchical top-down management rather than through inspiration as the result of teamwork and collaboration;
- B. The "Adequate Yearly Progress" provisions of the *No Child Left Behind Act* reflect the Dissonant Leadership

- practice of achieving progress by fear of punitive repercussions rather than by professional development; and
- C. The “Parental Choice” provisions reflect the Dissonant Leadership practice of encouraging adversarial relations based on fear and zero-sum politics rather than constructive relations based on conflict management.

Adoption of Phonics-Based Reading Curriculum and Top-Down Management Through Fear

The “Reading First” provisions of the *No Child Left Behind Act* reflect the Dissonant Leadership practice of motivating through fear from hierarchical top-down management rather than through inspiration as the result of teamwork and collaboration. The *No Child Left Behind Act* takes a top-down hierarchical approach toward curricular decision-making. For example, in its “Reading First” initiative, the *No Child Left Behind Act* hierarchically sets curriculum for schools all across the country by only funding phonics-based reading programs. The purpose of the Reading First initiative is

To provide assistance to State educational agencies and local agencies in establishing reading programs for students in kindergarten through grade 3 that are based on scientifically based reading research, to ensure that every student can read at grade level or above not later than the end of grade 3. (§ 6361(1))

The statute goes on to define “Reading” as follows :

The term “reading” means a complex system of deriving meaning from print that requires all of the following:

- (A) The skills and knowledge to understand how phonemes, or speech sounds, are connected to print.
- (B) The ability to decode unfamiliar words.
- (C) The ability to read fluently.
- (D) Sufficient background information and vocabulary to foster reading comprehension.
- (E) The development of appropriate active strategies to construct meaning from print.
- (F) The development and maintenance of a motivation to read. (§ 6368(5)).

The statute also mandates “Essential Components of Reading Instruction” as follows:

The term “essential components of reading instruction” means explicit and systematic instruction in—

- (A) Phonemic awareness;
- (B) Phonics;
- (C) Vocabulary development;
- (D) Reading fluency, including oral reading skills; and
- (E) Reading comprehension strategies. (§ 6368(3))

These provisions clearly mandate research-based methods of reading instruction that include phonemic awareness and phonics. With its explicit requirement of phonics-based reading instruction, the *No Child Left Behind Act* engages in Dissonant Leadership. This reflects a top-down hierarchical approach toward setting curriculum rather than utilizing a bottom-up strategy to get input and buy-in from those on the front lines of education—principals and teachers. Not only does the federal government hierarchically require a certain curriculum, but it does nothing to achieve buy-in to this curriculum. The statute does not address the beliefs, mindsets, or cultures of principals and teachers. These soldiers on the front lines of education have views and experiences with different reading curricula. They understand the unique needs of their schools and students. Although the statute mandates the type of reading instruction it will fund, it ignores the sense of mission that teachers need to be effective. It ignores their need to be included. It ignores the buy-in that is necessary to inspire and uplift these weary soldiers. In response to having curricular decisions shoved down their throats and their points of view ignored, teachers may tune out and turn off. Indeed, the only way to ensure compliance is to threaten them with punitive sanctions—“You’re fired!”

The “Adequate Yearly Progress” Provisions and Progress by Fear of Punitive Repercussions

The “Adequate Yearly Progress” provisions of the *No Child Left Behind Act* reflect the Dissonant Leadership practice of achieving progress by fear of punitive repercussions rather than by professional development. The law includes severe sanctions for schools that fail to make acceptable progress toward proficiency in reading and math. The *No Child Left Behind Act* requires states to implement accountability systems to ensure that all schools make what it calls “Adequate Yearly Progress.”¹ The *No Child Left Behind Act* defines Adequate Yearly Progress as follows:

- (C) Definition—“Adequate yearly progress” shall be defined by the State in a manner that—

- (i) applies the same high standards of academic achievement to all public elementary school and secondary school students in the State;
- (ii) is statistically valid and reliable;
- (iii) results in continuous and substantial academic improvement for all students;
- (iv) measures the progress of public elementary schools, secondary schools and local educational agencies and the State based primarily on the academic assessments described in paragraph (3);
- (v) includes separate measurable annual objectives for continuous and substantial improvement. (§ 6311(b)(2))

The statute goes on to describe a series of penalties for schools that do not make Adequate Yearly Progress. Specifically, it provides:

- (5) *Failure to make adequate yearly progress* [italics added] after identification—In the case of any school served under this part that fails to make adequate yearly progress, as set out in the State's plan under section 6311 (b)(2) of this title, by the end of the first full school year after identification under paragraph (1), the local educational agency serving such school—
 - (A) shall continue to provide all students enrolled in the school with the option to transfer to another public school [italics added] served by the local educational agency in accordance with subparagraphs (E) and (F);
 - (B) shall make supplemental educational services available consistent with subsection (e)(1) of this section; and
 - (C) shall continue to provide technical assistance. (§ 6313(b))

If a school district or school fails to make Adequate Yearly Progress for two consecutive years, the state must identify the district or school in need of improvement. Students in the school may choose to attend a non-failing school in the school district. The school district may not use lack of capacity to deny students the option to transfer. If a school fails to make adequate yearly progress for three consecutive years, the school must also provide supplemental educational services. If a school fails to make Adequate Yearly Progress for four consecutive years, the district may replace school staff, hire outside experts, implement a new curriculum, and/or reorganize the management structure. If a school fails to make adequate yearly progress for five consecutive years, the district shall either replace the school staff, contract with a private firm to run the school, or reopen the school as a charter school (§ 6316(b)(8)(B)).

These and other penalties form the centerpiece of the *No Child Left Behind Act*. The *No Child Left Behind Act* disproportionately emphasizes

sanctions rather than incentives. In fact, the way in which this statute focuses on penalties has been suggested by education scholars such as West and Peterson (2003):

The crucial aspect of [the No Child Left Behind Act] is not so much the money authorized as the policy framework imposed . . . NCLB increased the federal share of the country's total school funding by barely 1 percentage point. The federal government's fiscal role in education has always been small, in recent years hovering around 7 to 8 percent of all public funding of elementary and secondary education, with the balance being covered by local and, to an increasing extent, state revenues . . . no it is not the federal dollar contribution but the direction given to all school spending—whether federal, state, or local—that is key. . . . Under its terms every state, to receive federal aid, must put into place a set of standards together with a detailed testing plan designed to make sure the standards are being met. Students at schools that fail to measure up may leave for other schools in the same district, and, if a school persistently fails to make adequate progress toward full proficiency, it becomes subject to corrective action. (pp. 1-2)

This statute practically institutionalizes Dissonant Leadership. Practitioners as well as scholars have commented on the particularly harsh nature of the *No Child Left Behind Act*. A *No Child Left Behind Act* handbook, for example, describes the perils of Dissonant Leadership. It warns principals and teachers of the punitive and unforgiving aspects of the Adequate Yearly Progress provisions:

How will No Child Left Behind affect you? No Child Left Behind will affect everyone employed by schools and school districts. You should expect changes as your school and school district focus on teaching all students to higher levels of proficiency. Your state and school district must report their present levels of performance to parents and the public every year. These performance levels must increase steadily until all students are being educated to proficiency. If you are a music, gym, computer, or foreign language teacher, you will be affected by No Child Left Behind. If you teach in a needs improvement school, your school must offer public school choice and supplemental educational services. If many of your students transfer, you may find that the student population has reduced at your school and your services may no longer be needed. If you are a speech pathologist, occupational therapist, physical therapist, or other therapist you may need to work academics in to your therapies. When students exercise their school choice options and transfer from unsuccessful schools, the need for related service providers may decline. (Wright et al., 2004, pp. 63-65)

This message does not celebrate the promise of educational improvement. It encourages teachers to update their resumes. It does not describe the ways in which schools, principals, and teachers will be supported so that they can turn things around. It does not encourage them to learn, grow, or make their schools better. Instead, it prepares them for the grim reality of failure. It tells schools they have to go from A to Z without getting the skills, resources, or emotional support to get there. This passage echoes the message of fear and doom that underlies the *No Child Left Behind Act*. It warns of the dangers of noncompliance and recognizes the difficulties of compliance. It warns of massive firing. It cynically expects schools and the people who work at schools to fail. The handbook reflects the reality of this Dissonant Leadership statute. The *No Child Left Behind Act* is a statute of fear rather than hope. There is practically no meaningful help provided by the statute to develop school personnel and schools so that they can be truly successful. The most significant stimulus offered by the statute for overcoming obstacles to create meaningful change is fear. The statute is generous, offering plenty of fear—fear of teachers being fired, fear of principals being fired, fear of whole staffs being fired, and fear of schools being closed forever. Because the statute offers fear as the main catalyst for educational improvement, it exemplifies Dissonant Leadership.

“Parental Choice” Provisions and Adversarial Relations Based on Fear and Zero-Sum Perceptions

The “Parental Choice” provisions reflect the Dissonant Leadership practice of encouraging adversarial relations based on fear and the perception of zero-sum politics. The *No Child Left Behind Act* contains what it calls “Parental Choice” provisions. The substance and tone of these provisions sets up parents and schools as adversaries. If a school fails to meet its Adequate Yearly Progress goals for three consecutive years, the school must provide supplemental educational services to the students from low-income families who remain in the school. Supplemental educational services include tutoring, remediation, after-school programs, and summer school provided by the failing school at no cost to parents.

The most adversarial aspect of the “Parental Choice” provisions involves student transfer. According to the statute:

(F) PUBLIC SCHOOL CHOICE—

- (i) **IN GENERAL**—In the case of a school identified for school improvement under this paragraph, the local educational agency shall, not later than the first day of the school year following such identification, *provide all students enrolled in the school with the option to transfer to another public school served by the local*

educational agency, which may include a public charter school, that has not been identified for school improvement under this paragraph, unless such an option is prohibited by State law.

- (ii) RULE—In providing students the option to transfer to another public school, the local educational agency shall give priority to the lowest achieving children from low-income families, as determined by the local educational agency for purposes of allocating funds to schools under section 6313 (c)(1) of this title (§ 6316(b)(1)).

In sum, if a school fails to meet Adequate Yearly Progress, the school district must promptly notify parents of eligible children of their option to transfer to a better-performing school or receive supplemental educational services at the district's expense (*No Child Left Behind Act*, § 6316(b)). If a Title I school fails to meet its Adequate Yearly Progress goals for two consecutive years, all children in that school may attend a non-failing school in the school district. If all schools in a district fail, children may attend a non-failing school in another school district. When a child transfers to a better school, the child may remain there until he or she completes the highest grade in that school. The sending school district is responsible for providing transportation to the receiving school until the sending school meets its Adequate Yearly Progress goals for two consecutive years (*No Child Left Behind Act*, § 6313(b)).

These provisions divide parents and schools instead of uniting them. Academic trouble motivates parents to assert their rights to move their children to other settings. Transfers are used before supplemental educational services. Thus, fear of parents being angry and not believing in the school creates a huge wedge between two of the most important stakeholders in education—parents and teachers. From the parents' perspective, the statute implies that if a school is failing, it has nothing to do with the lack of resources, the curriculum, the actions of the parent, or the specific educational needs of the child. If corrective action is needed, it must be the school's fault. That is what the statute says. Therefore, the school will pay, literally and figuratively. The school loses funding when it loses the child. The school pays to transport the child to the transfer school. Finally, the school pays for supplemental educational services. Thus, when a child leaves, the school must give up scarce resources. The results may be harmful to the children who remain. This is classic Dissonant Leadership: Parent v. School, School v. School, and Child v. Child. There are no meaningful provisions to provide the Primal Leadership that would encourage and enable all stakeholders to come together to improve their neighborhood schools.

Part III: Dissonant Leadership Contributes to the Very Problems the *No Child Left Behind Act* was purportedly Enacted to Address

Ironically, the Dissonant Leadership promoted by the *No Child Left Behind Act* contributes to the very problems the *No Child Left Behind Act* was purportedly enacted to address. The purpose of the *No Child Left Behind Act* is described as follows:

The purpose of this title is to ensure that all children have a fair, equal, and significant opportunity to obtain a high-quality education and reach, at a minimum, proficiency on challenging State academic achievement standards and state academic assessments.

Section 6301 lists 12 steps to accomplish this purpose. The steps include “meeting the educational needs of low-achieving children in our Nation’s highest-poverty schools” (§ 6301(2)) and “closing the achievement gap between high—and low—performing children, especially the achievement gaps between minority and non-minority students, and between disadvantaged children and their more advantaged peers” (§ 6301(3)). Generally, the statute seeks to provide “children an enriched and accelerated educational program” (§ 6301(8)). These steps, including improving the efficacy of public education, improving teacher quality, and closing the achievement gap, cannot be achieved in the fearful climate of Dissonant Leadership. Sadly, this statute probably exacerbates the very problems it was enacted to address.

How Dissonant Leadership Impacts Efficacy of Public Education

Dissonant Leadership embodied in the curriculum provisions of the *No Child Left Behind Act* do not improve the efficacy of public education. For one thing, micromanagement from a hierarchical top-down leadership inhibits creativity. Goleman et al. (2002) explain that “visionary leaders articulate where a group is going, but not how it will get there—setting people free to innovate, experiment, and take calculated risks” (p. 57). In this age of lower academic performance and higher state budget deficits, schools and teachers need to be free to innovate and experiment. The curricular choke hold that the federal government places on teachers makes this nearly impossible. Ironically, the *No Child Left Behind Act* does acknowledge the importance of this freedom to innovate in its provisions regarding Charter Schools. According to § 7221 of the statute, Charter Schools will be funded for the following purposes:

It is the purpose of this subpart [20 USCS §§ 7221 et seq.] to increase national understanding of the charter schools model by—

- (1) providing financial assistance for the planning, program design, and initial implementation of charter schools;
- (2) evaluating the effects of such schools, including the effects on students, student academic achievement, staff, and parents;
- (3) expanding the number of high-quality charter schools available to students across the Nation; and
- (4) encouraging the States to provide support to charter schools for facilities financing in an amount more nearly commensurate to the amount the States have typically provided for traditional public schools.

The Charter School movement is about innovation and experimentation. It is about setting schools free to provide a laboratory to study and better understand what education techniques work. Although this is the epitome of Primal Leadership; forcing teachers to adopt a set curriculum is the epitome of Dissonant Leadership.

Moreover, when employees do not believe in the organization, quality of work suffers. Goleman et al. (2002) explain the importance of this intrinsic motivation, “Although traditional incentives such as bonuses or recognition can prod people to better performance, no external motivators can get people to perform at their absolute best” (p. 42). Researchers have studied teachers’ intrinsic motivation at school with respect to the notion of trust. Specifically, Bryk and Schneider (Gordon, 2004) asked the fundamental question, “Can excellent work be coerced from principals, teachers, and students simply by withholding diplomas, slashing funds, and publishing embarrassing statistics in the newspaper?” (p. 37). They found that as states and school districts utilize strict accountability mechanisms and mandate changes in instruction, they also need to remember that school stakeholders and their relationships to one another will “make or break reform” (p. 38). For them, how teachers relate to one another, to the principal and to the parents are “central to determining whether schools can improve” (p. 38).

Bryk and Schneider (Gordon, 2004) concluded that a “broad base of trust across a school community lubricates much of a school’s day-to-day functioning and is a critical resource as local leaders embark on ambitious improvement plans” (p. 38). They explained that schools with a high degree of “relational trust,” are more likely to raise student achievement than those in which relations are poor. Improvements in such areas as classroom instruction, curriculum, teacher preparation, and professional development have little chance of succeeding without improvements in a school’s emotional climate (pp. 38-39). This is classic Primal Leadership. Bryk and

Schneider (Gordon, 2004) obtained empirical evidence that linked the relational trust of the school personnel and academic achievement. They obtained quantitative and qualitative data from ten years of work in Chicago schools during a period of sweeping reform. They explained the following characteristics of Relational Trust:

Respect. Do we acknowledge one another's dignity and ideas? Do we interact in a courteous way? Do we genuinely talk and listen to each other? Respect is the fundamental ingredient of trust. (p. 39)

Competence. Do we believe in each other's ability and willingness to fulfill our responsibilities effectively? The authors point out that incompetence left unaddressed can corrode school wide trust at a devastating rate. (p. 40)

Personal Regard. Do we care about each other both professionally and personally? Are we willing to go beyond our formal roles and responsibilities if needed—to go the extra mile? (p. 40)

Integrity. Can we trust each other to put the interests of children first, especially when tough decisions have to be made? Do we keep our word? (p. 40)

This concept of relational trust as the “connective tissue” that holds improving schools together is akin to Primal Leadership. According to Bryk and Schneider (Gordon, 2004), teachers want a principal who practices Primal Leadership. In other words, the principal communicates a strong vision for the school, clearly defines expectations, takes an interest in their personal well-being, and fairly allocates resources and assignments (p. 41). They used data from the 1997 school year, looking at levels of relational trust in schools in the top and bottom quartiles.

In top-quartile schools, three-quarters of teachers reported strong or very strong relations with fellow teachers, and nearly all reported such relations with their principals. In addition, 57% had strong or very strong trust in parents. By contrast, at schools in the bottom quartile a majority of teachers reported having little or no trust in their colleagues, two-thirds said the same about their principals, and fewer than 40% reported positive, trusting relations with parents. (Gordon, 2004, p. 44).

The evidence suggests that “while not all schools with high levels of trust improve—that is, trust alone won't solve instructional or structural problems—schools with little or no relational trust have practically no chance of improving. Trust is a strong predictor of success” (Gordon, 2004, p. 44). Even though trust seemed like the secret ingredient of success, Bryk and Schneider found that many schools discouraged trust between

stakeholders and encouraged a kind of isolation (Gordon, 2004, p. 42). Was it the school's fault, however, or did the high-stakes accountability system foster Dissonant Leadership?

How Dissonant Leadership Impacts Teacher Quality

The emotional impact of the fear generated by Dissonant Leadership undermines the quality of work. Goleman et al. (2002) pointed out,

If people's emotions are pushed toward the range of enthusiasm, performance can soar; if people are driven toward rancor and anxiety, they will be thrown off stride. . . . When they drive emotions negatively . . . leaders spawn dissonance, undermining the emotional foundations that let people shine . . . Negative emotions—especially chronic anger, anxiety, or a sense of futility—powerfully disrupt work, hijacking attention from the task at hand. (pp. 5-6, p. 13).

Conversely Primal Leadership enhances the quality of work. Goleman et al. (2002) explained:

Feeling good lubricates mental efficiency, making people better at understanding information and using decision rules in complex judgments, as well as more flexible in their thinking. Upbeat moods, research verifies, make people view others—or events—in a more positive light. That in turn helps people feel more optimistic about their ability to achieve a goal, enhances creativity and decision-making skills, and predisposes people to be helpful. (p. 14)

Thus, if the government was serious about improving education, wouldn't it want principals and teachers who believed they could make things better? Wouldn't it want principals and teachers who felt inspired, who felt optimistic, and who felt they could make a difference?

The *No Child Left Behind Act* offers teachers fear and little else. An education statute can reward educators through incentives as well as punish them through penalties. It can offer the carrot and the stick. In 1983 for example, the national education report, *A Nation at Risk: The Imperative for Educational Reform* (National Commission on Excellence in Education, 1983), called for a wide range of reforms that it hoped would reverse the downward trend of education performance. In addition to accountability measures, it urged higher pay for teachers and also greater involvement from parents and other members of the community (West & Peterson, 2003, p. 6).

Fear does not address other factors that undermine a teacher's job such as teacher shortages, lack of teacher development, low teacher salaries and benefits, limited educational resources, and large class sizes. Many have

commented that the *No Child Left Behind Act* penalizes school personnel without holding students and parents accountable. For example, West and Peterson (2003) noted:

Students themselves face neither sanctions nor rewards based on their performance. States need not establish high school graduation requirements—or standards that govern promotion from one grade to the next. While schools are held strictly accountable, students are not . . . If No Child Left Behind is designed to hold schools accountable, it places no direct burdens on student themselves. It does not require standards for high school graduation or levels of performance for passing from one grade to the next. Although nothing in the legislation prevents states from instituting such standards on their own, they are under no federal mandate to do so. Yet the student is the learner, the one person whose engagement in the educational process is essential to the enterprise. If a student is attentive, curious, enthusiastic, committed, and hardworking, much can be accomplished—even with limited resources . . . but systems that try to get teachers to work harder will not have much effect if students are unresponsive. (pp. 14-15)

The fear generated by Dissonant Leadership will undermine a teacher's job performance when the roles of other factors and stakeholders are not addressed.

Finally, teacher quality is undermined by Dissonant Leadership because it can eventually create backlash and rebellion. Hess (2003) described how this process works in education. He stated that coercive high-stakes accountability that imposes high standards, rigorous testing, and severe consequences will encounter political opposition as time goes by. Initially, tough accountability has support from broad constituencies, but, as its coercive "teeth begin to bite," the interested parties most affected revolt. Thus, "to ease political opposition, standards are lowered, exceptions granted, and penalties postponed" (West & Peterson, 2003, p. 10). Dissonant Leadership may create a backlash from principals and teachers that undermines the quality of education. It can also create a backlash from the powerful unions organized to protect those teachers. Moe (2003), for example, addressed the ways in which teacher unions undermine high-stakes accountability schemes. Because teachers unions are so powerful and teachers are in such a climate of fear, the unions will do whatever they can to protect their membership. Thus, Dissonant Leadership exacerbates the wedge between management and labor, possibly undermining the quality of education in the process.

Dissonant Leadership undermines the quality of teaching, when teachers allow their fear of test scores to takeover all aspects of their job so that they

only “teach to the test.” In 1995, Chicago’s Mayor Richard Daley supported a rigorous high-stakes testing in the city’s schools. This included tougher high school graduation requirements, rigorous testing in grades 3, 6, and 8, and an end to social promotion (West & Peterson, 2003, p. 17). West and Peterson (2003) reflected on how teachers and schools did everything they could to ensure test success at the expense of academic success. They explained:

At first glance the reform seems to have boosted test scores dramatically, by as much as half a standard deviation. At least some of this gain, however, is more apparent than real. More students were being retained in their previous class for a year, more were assigned to special and bilingual education programs (exempting them from testing), and the test day was shifted back a month, allowing for additional instruction. All of these moves helped lift the test score average, even without any real improvement in the quality of instruction. Less clear is whether these underlying gains constitute a one-time impact or whether they are evidence of a more productive school system. (p. 17)

How Dissonant Leadership Exacerbates the Achievement Gap

The provisions in the *No Child Left Behind Act* designed to address the achievement gap are shallow. The transfer provision, for example, has been futile in many large urban areas like Chicago. Only a handful of students eligible for transfer have been able to do so. Those “lucky few” who do transfer find problems at their new schools involving transportation, absenteeism, parental involvement, and feeling caught up with the course material. Moreover, the transfer provisions do not address the needs of the poorest minority students who remain in a failing school with diminished resources because their parent or guardian did not have the wherewithal to obtain a transfer.

The transfer provisions do not address the other obstacles that contribute to the achievement gap. For example, schools in affluent white neighborhoods and suburbs tend to be smaller and have smaller class sizes. Bryk and Schneider (Gordon, 2004) found that small schools tend to have more trusting environments, stronger senses of community, and be more open to change (p. 46). Moreover, as discussed above, the transfer option undermines trust, creating a wedge between schools and parents. As Gordon pointed out,

Good relationships and trust won’t compensate for bad instruction, poorly trained teachers, or unworkable school structures. . . . But by the same token, reform efforts are bound to fail if they ignore the importance of how

teachers, principals, parents, and students interact—how the people behind the headlines work together.

These poor minority kids do not have a chance if parents and schools are not working together. Thus, Primal Leadership, where stakeholders are working together, is absolutely crucial to address the achievement gap.

Part IV: Ability of an Education Statute Like the *No Child Left Behind Act* to Mandate or Encourage Primal Leadership

The cynic might say if an education statute is ineffective in promoting Dissonant Leadership practices, how can it be effective in promoting Primal Leadership practices? To explain, if Primal Leadership involves inspiring a sense of mission, developing employees' strengths and confidence, achieving buy-in from all stakeholders, how can these "warm and fuzzy" feelings be mandated by statute? This is not practical. What would such a statute look like?

Primal Leadership would not require all accountability to be discarded. Rather it would complement reasonable and measurable goals as well as the resources schools and teachers need to achieve those goals. Primal Leadership provisions in an education statute might include the following:

- In order to inspire all who are involved with schools, school leaders and school personnel are required to collaborate on developing a mission statement and then required to check-in on a monthly basis to determine whether the mission is being realized;
- In order to develop teachers and other key personnel to teach, principals will confer with teachers and top school administrators on a monthly basis to reflect on goals, strengths, and weaknesses. Principals will provide school personnel with timely and constructive feedback;
- In order to change schools in a positive way, all superintendents and principals will participate in seminars where they learn about being effective "change catalysts" (Goleman et al., 2002, p. 256). In this seminar they will learn how to recognize the need for change, how to champion change, how to make a compelling argument for change, how to build buy-in from stakeholders for change, and how to overcome barriers to change.

These are just some examples of how to incorporate Primal Leadership strategies into an education statute. While these are definitely "fuzzier" than punitive corrective action for not meeting precise accountability goals, they might be more effective. Legislating individuality, innovation, and inspiration may be difficult but it is not impossible. Those who drafted the *No Child Left Behind Act* know this. They embrace all of these "fuzzy

characteristics” when it comes to charter schools. Charter schools are prime examples of Primal Leadership. They are all about experimentation and innovation. Charter schools try all sorts of strategies to inspire teachers, parents, and students to succeed. Charter schools are individualized and provide a unique “take” on the needs of students. The Bush administration understands this and provides unprecedented support for charter schools in the *No Child Left Behind Act*. In fact, for a school that has failed to make Adequate Yearly Progress persistently, the statute states that it can be closed and reconstituted as a charter school. According to §6316(b)(8):

- (B) ALTERNATIVE GOVERNANCE—Not later than the beginning of the school year following the year in which the local educational agency implements subparagraph (A), the local educational agency shall implement one of the following alternative governance arrangements for the school consistent with State law:
- (i) Reopening the school as a public charter school.
 - (ii) Replacing all or most of the school staff . . .
 - (iii) Entering into a contract . . . with a private management company . . .
 - (iv) Turning the operation of the school over to the State educational agency . . .
 - (v) Any other restructuring . . . that makes fundamental reforms.

Moreover, the *No Child Left Behind Act* also creates incentives for states to develop more charter schools irrespective of academic failure. In the charter school provisions, the *No Child Left Behind Act* has no problem with “fuzzy,” it supports inspiration, individuality, and innovation. For example, § 7221e(b) describes the criteria for charter grants:

The Secretary shall award grants to eligible applicants under this subpart on the basis of the quality of the applications submitted . . . after taking into consideration such factors as—

- (1) the quality of the proposed curriculum and instructional practices;
- (2) the degree of flexibility afforded by the State educational agency and, if applicable, the local educational agency to the charter school;
- (3) the extent of community support for the application;
- (4) the ambitiousness of the objectives for the charter school;
- (5) the quality of the strategy for assessing achievement of those objectives;
- (6) the likelihood that the charter school will meet those objectives and improve educational results for students.

Thus, the *No Child Left Behind Act* (2002) legislates community buy-in, flexibility, and individualized curriculum quality. These are hallmarks of Primal Leadership practices. In addition, the charter provisions encourage diversity of charter schools stating that the federal and state governments “will assist charter schools representing a variety of educational approaches, such as approaches designed to reduce school size” (§7221c(d)(2)). While the *No Child Left Behind Act* encourages creativity, flexibility, and experimentation in the charter provisions, it completely restricts those activities for the regular neighbor schools. Thus, it is adept at legislating both Dissonant Leadership and to a smaller extent, Primal Leadership.

Donald Trump is certainly adept at Dissonant Leadership and Prime Time Leadership. His hit reality television show, *The Apprentice*, scored high in ratings and advertising dollars. *The Apprentice* epitomizes Dissonant Leadership. Donald Trump will begin this season again by dividing candidates into teams. Only one team can win. Only one person can be the ultimate winner who gets a job opportunity with Donald Trump. As with most Dissonant Leadership systems, *The Apprentice* is becoming tougher and the competition more grueling in its second season. As described by the NBC.com website, the candidates:

... will face far more intense tasks and the stakes will be much higher. Donald Trump and his trusted colleagues—George Ross and Carolyn Kepcher—will frame each episode, beginning with the task delivery and ending with the climactic boardroom showdown. And, each week, one person will hear those dreaded words—“You’re Fired!”²

This formula is great for ratings; it is horrible for education. Can you imagine a reality show in which teachers work together in a close environment and are acutely aware that they are constantly competing with one another? Can you imagine telling these teachers that only one of them can win? Can you imagine asking teachers to perform insurmountable tasks without any resources so that we can laugh as they struggle? Can you imagine telling a teacher who went into a low-income neighborhood to try to make a difference that we don’t want to hear any explanation for low test scores? As far as we’re concerned that teacher is lazy and incompetent and in the boardroom we let them know. Our time is short and our voices are loud as we say, “You’re Fired!” This reality show may not score well in the ratings, but it exists. It is called the *No Child Left Behind Act*.

NOTES

¹ According to 20 U.S.C. § 6311(2)(B), “Each State plan shall demonstrate, based on academic assessments described in paragraph (3), and in accordance with this paragraph, what constitutes adequate yearly progress of the State, and of all public elementary schools, secondary schools, and local educational agencies in the State, toward enabling all public elementary school and secondary school students to meet the State’s student academic achievement standards, while working toward the goal of narrowing the achievement gaps in the State, local educational agencies, and schools”

² http://www.nbc.com/The_Apprentice/about/index.html

References

- Goleman, D. (1998). What makes a good leader? *Harvard Business Review*, 76(6), 93-102.
- Goleman, D. (2000). Leadership that gets results. *Harvard Business Review*, 78(2), 78-90.
- Goleman, D. (2004). What makes a good leader? *Harvard Business Review*, 82(1), 82-89.
- Goleman, D., Boyatzis, R., & McKee, A. (2002). *Primal leadership: Realizing the power of emotional intelligence*. Boston, MA: Harvard Business School Press.
- Gordon, D. T. (2004). The importance of social trust in changing schools. In A. Russo (Ed.), *School reform in Chicago: Lessons in policy and practice* (pp. 37-46). Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press.
- Hess, F. M. (2003). Refining or retreating? High-stakes accountability in the states. In P. E. Peterson & M. R. West (Eds.), *No child left behind: The politics and practice of school accountability* (pp. 55-79). Washington, DC: Brookings Institute Press.
- Moe, T. M. (2003). Politics, control, and the future of school accountability. In P. E. Peterson & M. R. West (Eds.), *No Child Left Behind: The politics and practice of school accountability* (pp. 80-106). Washington, DC: Brookings Institute Press.
- National Commission on Excellence in Education. (1983). *A Nation at Risk: The imperative for educational reform*. Retrieved March 15, 2005 from <http://www.ed.gov/pubs/NatAtRisk/index.html>
- No Child Left Behind Act of 2001*, 20 U.S.C. § 6301 *et seq.* (2002).
- The Apprentice: About the show*. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2005 from http://www.nbc.com/The_Apprentice/about/index.html.
- West, M. R. & Peterson, P. E. (2003). The politics and practice of accountability. In P. E. Peterson & M. R. West (Eds.), *No Child Left Behind: The politics and practice of accountability* (pp. 1-22). Washington, DC: Brookings Institute Press.
- Wright, P. W. D., Wright, P. D., & Heath, S. W. (2004). *No Child Left Behind*. Hartfield, VA: Harbor House Law Press.

Voices of Women in the Field

Reflections From a Chair

Clarissa Craig

I did not grow up wanting to be a woman administrator in a community college setting . . . or a woman administrator anywhere for that matter. Until about the sixth grade when my height shot up to almost six feet, I was going to be an airline stewardess and jet set around the world. Liking science and math, my attentions then turned to being a doctor, specifically a pediatrician. How did I get here? It hasn't been a particularly circuitous path. Yet, it is one that does seem to have evolved rather than having been a conscious choice at some point. It would be interesting to compare notes with other women administrators on the subject of how they came to their roles. There are maybe five or six that I know within my community college circle of encounters. I wonder if there was a point at which they made a conscious decision to be a woman administrator. I wonder if our experiences are different from men administrators in our arena.

When I first started teaching, I was hired primarily because I had the right discipline credentials in my health care field and expressed an interest in teaching others the skill and art of the profession. I began teaching by teaching the way I had been taught. It was only a year or so before I realized that I should consider formalizing the skill and art of teaching. Much in the same way, when I first was hired as an administrator, I was hired because I had the right discipline experience for the program I would oversee, was organized, communicated well, and got along with other people. My management skills were much stronger than my leadership skills.

As I reflect on 17 years of being an administrator in a community college setting, I am grateful for the learning and growing opportunities I have had. I have been fortunate to have wonderful role models and mentors along the way. I have also been fortunate to be part of an organization with a strong focus on professional development. The organizational culture has allowed for some personal and professional "stretch" while I maintained the same position.

Being a good administrator requires being both a good manager and a good leader. It is the management side that turns many people away from the

About the Author

Clarissa Craig is the Assistant Dean for the Science, Health Care, and Math Division at Johnson County Community College in Overland Park, Kansas. She has specific oversight of the respiratory therapy program and generic health care related courses. Her 17 years of experience with the college have provided for both formal and informal leadership opportunities. She has an interest in academic leadership, particularly as it applies to the chair position in the community college. cmc532@aol.com

position. But, linking motivational theory to the situation and meeting the basic needs of those around me helps to create a harmonious environment. Additionally, there are many tasks; paper pushing, e-mail routing, fire quenching, and feather smoothing that need to occur as part of the job. In my estimation, developing efficiencies in these areas allows the administrator to concentrate on the more rewarding aspects of leadership.

Kouzes and Posner (2003) espouse five practices for exemplary leaders. I have found that these five practices provide a guiding tenant in the leading role of being an administrator.

Modeling the way means giving attention to personal values and setting an example. I am especially conscious of this when resolving difficulties, managing conflict, or trying to move the department forward. The results are often not only a reflection *on* me but *of* me. Much of this modeling is seen in how I choose to communicate. This requires reflection on what I call the “W’s” of communication: what needs to be communicated? Why does it need to be communicated and to whom? And, when and how should it be communicated? Equally important is determining whether the communication was received and understood. I believe sometimes we forget to close the communication loop.

Listening is a powerful communication tool but one that administrators may need to hone. I am not sure that what we have to say is always important. Typically, we tend to think about improving our communication skills in terms of what we relay rather than concentrating on the equally important aspect of listening with all of our senses. A conscious effort to count to five . . . or ten . . . before speaking sometimes squelches the urge to fill what seems to be a painful lull in conversation. Often this provides the welcome opening for others to initiate what is on their minds.

Inspiring a vision requires that I not only envision possibilities but that I actively encourage others to do the same. As an administrator, the weight of visioning does not lie solely on my shoulders. Being a good listener, with all my senses, opens up the possibilities. Helping others to see and embrace the

possibilities is the challenge we have as administrators. Giving some attention to shared values helps in this process.

Challenge the process is the third principle of exemplary leadership that Kouzes and Posner (2003) described. This involves seeking opportunities, taking risks and learning from mistakes. I believe that it is important that challenging the process in this way is seen as being acceptable for both me, the faculty, staff, and students. Setting the example for myself helps establish it for others.

I have to admit that I am somewhat risk adverse in my thinking. To minimize the influence of my immediate response being a negative one, I try to remember to take the opportunity to strategically think through a situation. Wells (1998) frames strategic thinking by applying three questions to a situation, "what seems to be going on?"; "what are the possibilities?"; and "what should be done?" This little exercise allows me and others to reflect on the situation without immediate dismissal or curtailing of interest.

Enabling others means fostering collaboration and strengthening others. The foundation for collaboration is based on trust. Trust is a precious commodity and one that cannot be taken for granted. Collaboration is also based on building and sustaining relationships. It is important to capitalize on joint efforts and social interactions. Collaboration is difficult to foster via e-mail. Face-to-face opportunities need to occur.

Strengthening others really comes from empowering others. To empower others requires several things. It means that others have a sense that what they are doing is important; they feel competent in what they are asked to do; they have a sense of self-determination in the process; and they feel like they make a difference. When things are not happening as you intend, a reality check in this area may be in order.

The fifth Kouzes and Posner principle is *Encourage the Heart*. This principle gives me a warm feeling just thinking about it. Encouraging the heart means that you recognize contributions and celebrate victories. Unfortunately, it is probably the one principle that I fall short on most frequently as an administrator. There is a litany of reasons I can offer as to why this occurs but they really are irrelevant. Falling short on this principle undermines any of the "good" I may have instilled through the other principles.

Here technology has helped in some ways. Calendar reminders and electronic post-it-notes are great for providing the ticklers I need. Maintaining a "goody" drawer is also helpful. A chocolate bar with a little note can make a difference, as can making the time to go for coffee with someone. Getting to know people helps to tailor the recognition to the individual.

Group celebrations are important in sustaining the sense of “community.” Periodically creating some reflective time will provide you with an opportunity to think of something worth celebrating. How the occasion is recognized is probably of less importance. Of related importance, however, is truly recognizing situations worthy of attention and not creating artificial moments for celebration. Recognizing the occasions that deserve to be noted requires attentiveness.

What I have described are my attempts at commitments to the principles of exemplary leadership. These are not specific to being a woman administrator or one whose position is within the community college. Hopefully, it has provoked some thought on what it means to be an administrator, whether from the perspective of an administrator, of an aspiring administrator or of a faculty or staff member.

References

- Kouzes, J. M., & Posner, B. Z. (2003). *The leadership challenge* (3rd ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Wells, S. (1998). *Choosing the future: The power of strategic thinking*. Burlington, MA: Butterworth-Heinemann.

FIRST THINGS FIRST: WRITING STRATEGIES

Marilyn L. Grady

Finding a Niche!

Finding a niche for your writing is essential. If you are writing for publication, then you want your manuscript to appear in print. Consider if the topic is “publishable.” Some topical areas are saturated, so writing in these areas may be futile. If journal editors do not have space in a journal, or interest in a topic, the manuscript will not be published. It also would be wise to determine “which topics are hot” and “which topics are not.”

Part of finding a niche includes identifying topic areas that are most productive and most marketable. Will it be possible to write more than one article about the topic? How many journals will be interested in the topic? It helps to assess the “dry wells” and “dead ends” early in a writing career.

Become familiar with the journals and their reputations. Some journals are extremely prestigious and have extremely low acceptance rates. Some journals have large circulations. Some journals are sponsored by professional associations. Some journals are national, some are regional, and some are state-based. Some journals accept only data-based articles. Some journals accept practitioner articles. Some journals are topically specialized. Identify the specific journals you will submit your work to before you begin to write. This will help in writing to the journal’s submission guidelines and in writing for the audience of the journal. You should identify several potential journals for your writing.

Submitting your writing to the “wrong” journal wastes your time and the time of the journal editor. Identifying a topic that is productive, marketable, publishable, and “hot,” may lead to a more satisfying writing outcome. Knowing the journals, their audiences, and their expectations is essential information for the successful author.

Book Review

The Middle of Everywhere: Helping Refugees Enter the American Community. Mary Pipher, Orlando, FL. Harcourt. 2002. 352 pages.

Patricia A. Hoffman

Overview of Related Work

Women's Ways of Knowing was one of the first widely read books to note the silence of women in style (hesitant, qualified, question posing) and content (concern for the everyday, the practical, and the interpersonal) and with it the awareness that firsthand experience is a valuable source of knowledge (Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, & Tarule, 1986, p. 17). The book allowed scholars to consider the inability of women to separate the personal realm from their public selves. Nowhere is the personal context more evident than with immigrants, many of whom are women from refugee experiences.

Although immigrants are grateful for the safe haven of America, their resettlement can also be a traumatic experience requiring patience and understanding from the communities and individuals who must interact with them. A realization of the

intense grief for the things they left behind: their place of birth, culture, language, and a familiar way of life . . . social status, personal identity, and the ability to operate effectively in the environment" can be frustrating and disempowering. (Vaynshtok, 2002, p. 27)

Many recent immigrants also come from non-majority racial backgrounds. The subtle and often unrecognized phenomenon of white privilege permeates U.S. culture. White privilege is described as an unearned advantage and conferred dominance. What is defined as "normal" or the "standard" is generally based on white, middle class values that may not reflect the immigrant experience. As McIntosh stated in her seminal article, *White Privilege: Unpacking the Invisible Knapsack* (McIntosh, 1990):

My schooling gave me no training in seeing myself as an oppressor, as an unfairly advantaged person, or as a participant in a damaged culture. I was taught to see myself as an individual whose moral state depended on her individual moral will . . . whites are taught to think of their lives as morally neutral, normative, and average, and also ideal. So that when we work to

benefit others this is seen as work that will allow “them” to be more like “us.” (pp. 31-32)

About the Author

Patricia Hoffman is Chair of the Department of Educational Studies: K-12 and Secondary Programs at Minnesota State University, Mankato where she has also served as director for the Center for School University Partnerships. She received her Ph.D. from the University of Minnesota in Curriculum and Instruction, Second Languages and Cultures where her area of research focused on English Language Learners with special education needs. Prior to her work at the university level she taught in the public schools for over 20 years in the areas of English as a Second language, special education, and foreign language. patricia.hoffman@mnsu.edu

Pipher, author of *The Middle of Everywhere: Helping Refugees Enter the American Community*, has written an intensively personal narrative exploring her own consciousness as well as giving an eye-opening treatise on the immigrant experience. As she finished the book, the terrorism of September 11th shocked America’s consciousness. For some, the tragedy was an unsettling wake-up call that Americans may be vulnerable to an enemy they do not understand. For others, it precipitated a call for increased understanding of global partners and those immigrants seeking refuge on American shores. Although some approached this conflict with a combative spirit, patriotic zeal, or a call for isolationism, Pipher chose a personal approach culled from her first hand experience with some of these newest immigrants.

Pipher did not set out to do an ethnographic study. One emerged spontaneously as she became involved in the lives of refugees, migrant workers, and other recent immigrants. As she sought to understand their reality, first as therapist and later as interviewer, she became aware of her own world view that colored and shaped her understanding of the lived reality facing these newcomers.

The juxtaposition of her Nebraska homeland with the compelling narratives makes the book engaging. For many, a vision of Nebraska, the homogeneous heartland of America, would be plain white folks, potlucks, farmland, and the flat prairie portrayed by Willa Cather. The new reality of the Nebraska described by Pipher includes mosques emerging from cornfields, dark faces bearing facial scarring from manhood ceremonies, and women veiled behind chadors. Rather than an isolated phenomenon, the scenario is one being repeated in small and large communities across the

United States and much of the world. It is no longer necessary to travel to a distant location to be faced with a culturally diverse population.

Pipher is a storyteller, and although many of the accounts are exotic and engaging, they also portray trauma and desperation. Stories of families in need of financial help, legal advice, or English lessons; parents trying to understand school attendance policies and curriculum; mothers trying to negotiate the health care system as they seek help for sick children; and a wide array of concerns that must be answered by social service agencies, schools, and the medical community are recounted.

The author intuitively perceives connections that would remain hidden if one only took a cursory look at the lives of these immigrants. She weaves the stories of sisters, mothers, sons, and daughters into the readers' hearts and minds as she creates an awareness and understanding of how lives are mutually enriched when one risks getting to know the strangers among us. Pipher reminds the reader that many of the newest arrivals are not so different from his or her own grandparents and great-grandparents who also may have faced unspeakable tragedy, yet managed to endure and even triumph in an alien culture, the United States of America.

Hidden in Plain Sight

The Middle of Everywhere has several recurring themes and is organized into three parts. Chapter 1 fleshes out the characteristics of the latest wave of immigrants by contrasting them with their predecessors who, not surprisingly, resemble the typical American. Yet even in these descriptions she reminds readers that, ironically, the nation's first immigrants were not as homogeneous as collective memory recalls.

Since 1990, many of the newest immigrants are calling the Midwestern region their home. Amato (1996) described the influx of immigrants in southwestern Minnesota. "Newcomers enter southwestern Minnesota on different trajectories. They are so different and often move through so rapidly that they are not easily observed even by those who care to look" (p. 5). Amato described the misunderstandings that occur because host communities have not been taught to understand how many people live provisionally in one place, until new possibilities or stern necessities lead them elsewhere.

Often well meaning individuals in the host communities also lack an understanding of their own status and privilege within American society. McIntosh (1990) began her essay with the statement, "I was taught to see racism only in individual acts of meanness, not in invisible systems conferring dominance on my group" (p. 31). For most Americans, the "American dream" of upward mobility is unquestioned and taken for granted because the social systems in place work to their advantage. For newcomers,

there are invisible constraints that, at worst, deny them the same advantages and, at the very least, create misunderstanding.

McIntosh (1990) contended the process of understanding must become a two-way street. The primary issues that emerge wherever the host community is located always include housing, law enforcement, social welfare, and education. Advocates who hope to succeed in integrating newcomers into the larger community must develop in-depth profiles of themselves and should facilitate a similar understanding among the newcomers.

Sleeter and Grant (2003) observed that analyzing the circumstances of one's own life will help resolve the contradictions between practical consciousness which is a "common-sense understanding of one's own life, of how the system works, and of everyday attempts to resolve the class, race, gender and other contradictions one faces" (p. 209) and theoretical consciousness or "dominant social ideologies, explanations that one learns from how the world works that purport that the world is fair and just as it is" (p. 209). These contradictions are often the source of the misunderstandings between newcomers and their hosts. Freire (1985) and Shor (1980) used a similar strategy of problem posing that helps students to become historians and use history to shape their understanding of the problems of their own lives.

In a regional description of rural Minnesota, an area of the country that is facing similar demographic shifts as those described in Pipher's book, Amato (1996) suggested communities look at their heritage, stories and critical histories of their past, as well as take a look in the mirror. In this way the complex sets of problems surrounding new immigrants can be deconstructed and policies and strategies to deal with immediate and long range needs will emerge. Amato described how seemingly small cultural differences such as hunting, driving, or courting styles may evoke greater conflicts.

Pipher's work uses similarly descriptive narratives and first hand accounts as she serves as a cultural broker. In Chapter 2, Kurdish sisters are the first newcomers the reader encounters. Pipher befriends them, teaching them to drive, connecting them with a GED program, taking them to garage sales, and acting as their cultural informant and confidant. Pipher captures their hopes, dreams, frustrations, confusion, and mental anguish as they negotiate their new environment while dealing with issues from their past. What emerges is a picture of resilient women dealing with survival. As a trained therapist, Pipher also recognizes the signs of post-traumatic stress syndrome as the sisters speak of their "journeys and losses and the great sadness they all carried in their hearts" (p. 46).

Chapter 3 describes the attributes of resilience that make it possible for refugees to survive and even thrive after dislocation and serious trauma. These characteristics include future orientation, energy and good health, the ability to pay attention, ambition and initiative, verbal expressiveness, positive mental health, the ability to calm down, flexibility, intentionality, lovability, the ability to love new people, and good moral character (pp. 69-70). Language development and acculturation processes highlight some of the difficulties that occur when North American values collide with a third world view.

An example of the difficulty of acculturation is the debt that many newcomers soon accumulate because they are not familiar with credit, charge cards, nor the advertisements and consumerism that plague American society. Many immigrants are not prepared for this onslaught; they come from cultures where barter is the norm, clothes are made at home, food is grown by the family, and entertainment is other people in the village.

When we give refugees charge cards long before we give them green cards, we set them up to be debtors. Newcomers experience a lethal combination of poverty and bombardment with ads. They do not understand the American way and almost immediately are into trouble with money decisions. (p. 88)

Gay (2000) described the paradox faced by most refugees and immigrants:

They come to the United States to escape poverty and persecutions, and to improve the general quality of their lives. In doing so, they often suffer deep affective losses of supportive networks, and familial connections . . . cultural and psycho-emotional uprootedness (that) can cause stress, anxiety, feelings of vulnerability, loneliness, isolation, and insecurity. (p. 18)

This, explains Pipher, is where cultural brokers become a lifeline to help the newcomers survive in their confusing new world. She lists five pages of mundane tasks most Americans take for granted that could cause confusion, frustration, or worse for an immigrant. Everything from how to cross a street at a traffic light, to what to put in a refrigerator, to what elections are, to what a birthday is, all may be foreign concepts. Housing, transportation, education, work, health care, and mental health issues are all part of a confusing barrage of paperwork and bureaucracy that collides with the cultural traditions of most refugees. Pipher elucidates the confusion and the chasm between cultures when she describes her attempt to help a woman from Afghanistan deal with the Immigration and Naturalization Service (INS).

I had entered the twilight zone. This was a mess for me and I am a native-born, English speaking clinical psychologist with a telephone. What was it like for a desperate refugee with no cultural broker . . . I had learned something about how our government works and Sadia was grateful she hadn't been tortured. (p. 109)

Refugees Across the Life Cycle

Part 2 begins with children, many of whom are parted from their mothers for the first time in their lives when they enter school. School can be overwhelming, scary, impersonal, confusing, or even hostile, but it is also therapeutic and the path to success. Interestingly, despite their many challenges, refugee children have lower drop-out rates than native born children and their parents often go to great lengths and make enormous sacrifices so that their sons and daughters can realize the American dream. Yet though most refugee parents desire a better education for their children, many are unable or do not understand how to be involved. "Work schedules, transportation, and language problems make contact with schools difficult" (p. 114). For many refugee children, relationships with school teachers and other adults at school offer predictability, order, and stability.

After the chaos and confusion of their lives, nothing is more comforting than routine. . . . Order, ritual, and predictability are part of this reassurance. . . . Teachers connect the dots between the world of family and of school, the old culture and America, the past and the future. (p. 115)

The enormity of what these children must learn and their differences and similarities became shockingly clear to Pipher as she began to volunteer in an English as a Second Language (ESL) class. She discovers the amount of trauma in their lives, parental and community support, family responsibilities, and developmental and acculturation levels varied from child to child. She states "It helped me to remember these kids had simple needs as well as complicated ones, needs to be hugged, helped with spelling words, smiled at, and read to. Even small acts of kindness made a difference" (p. 123).

This power of caring is a foundational pillar of the culturally responsive teaching (Gay, 2000):

Teachers demonstrate caring for children as students and as people. This is expressed in concern for their psycho-emotional well-being and academic success; personal morality and social actions; obligations and celebrations; communality and individuality; and unique cultural connections and human bonds. In other words, teachers who really care about students, honor their

humanity, hold them in high esteem, expect high performance from them. And use strategies to fulfill their expectations. (p. 46)

Older children and adolescents from refugee backgrounds often have very different cultural expectations from their American peers. They are often far more respectful of their elders and are amazed at how many American teenagers treat their parents and grandparents. "In fact the major identity struggles of refugee teens involve finding the balance between independence and their obligations to family and community" (Piper, 2002, p. 167). Gay (2000) described finding this balance as developing "cultural congruity" as students are able to successfully bridge the differences between the culture of their birth and their adopted U.S. culture.

Well meaning adults may contribute to the disconnect between cultures and to a division between children and parents. Sometimes school personnel will ask children to act as translators for their non-English speaking parents because the children are more facile with the language. This has potentially devastating consequences as power is shifted from parents to children who have become bicultural and bilingual before their mother and father.

Too often teens are caught between cultures in their desire to become like their American peers yet remain loyal to their families and cultural traditions. Chapter 6 illuminates how torn adolescents can be as they try to construct their new identity. Sleeter and Grant (2003) explained this as "resistance theory" which is overt behavioral opposition. The teenagers' resistance to dominant social norms can be interpreted as an attempt to create more meaningful lives for themselves, although most members of their community view such behavior as harmful to their group's status (p. 202).

Rather than fighting against this resistance, educators can use it as a springboard to analyze issues and conflicts (Sleeter & Grant, 2003). Pipher identifies the same issue:

Boys especially are trapped in a weird bind. Their peers teach them that "to act white": is to be disloyal to their ethnic group. Studying, making good grades, being polite, or joining school clubs are all defined as 'acting white.' So the boys must choose between social acceptance by peers and meeting parental expectations. Many conform their way into being rebellious at school. They learn not to learn. (p. 171)

The book includes a series of chronological entries that unfold the complex relationships that develop between teenagers and their adult mentors and teachers. Mentor, advocate, cultural informant, transmitter of knowledge, surrogate parent, truant officer, social worker, confidant, and friend are all roles assumed over the course of the year by an ESL teacher. She earned the

students respect and their trust. At the end of the year when she informs the students she has accepted a new position elsewhere, they are devastated. For them this unwelcome change feels like a betrayal, particularly because of their need for stability and trusting relationships.

The long term relationship Pipher establishes with many of the subjects in the book illustrates how easily the lives of refugee children become entwined with their new American friends. Often what is needed by students is help in negotiating new privileges and freedom, learning whom they can trust, and deciding which aspects of their new culture to embrace or avoid. Which language to speak in the home; how to maintain balance and order and respect for elders when family roles are being reversed; where to draw the line on friendship, dating, gender, or religion must all be negotiated by new immigrants.

Families arrive here intensely unified; they have survived great crises and stayed together. All have focused on the dream of reaching a safe good place. But once here, people develop individual dreams. These conflicting dreams create tension and sometimes break up families that have risked their lives to be together. (p. 224)

To help make sense of their new lives, Pipher asks her new friends what they want to keep from their old culture. She teaches them about resilience and transition time; she gives them tools for conflict resolution and negotiation of conflict; and she reminds them to have fun. "Fun can be deeply healing" (p. 230).

The Alchemy of Healing: Turning Pain Into Meaning.

The final chapters of the book are devoted to dealing with pain and exploring the means of healing. It is difficult to read the stories related by individuals who had been tortured, raped, or made to watch family members be killed. The inhumanity and powerlessness of their struggle is indeed difficult to comprehend. Pipher found she needed to be respectful, direct, but full of clear guidance as many of these refugees did not know what they should or should not be afraid of or whom they could trust.

Much of their healing involved finding a sense of normalcy. School, outings, birthdays, and routines of all sorts helped to establish a sense of place and connection. Gay (2000) described a similar need for rituals and routines:

People survive because they partake of the alchemy of healing. They turn their pain into a deeper understanding of themselves and of what it means to be human. . . . To say that people can grow and learn from any experience is not to justify their experience or even to say that they couldn't have leaned

from an easier life, but it is to say that healthy people learn and grow from everything, even trauma. (p. 300)

Response to Suffering and Injustice: Advocacy

As important as getting to the root cause of educational underperformance is addressing the violence, economic deprivation, and oppression found in refugees' home countries. As noted earlier, many of these newest immigrants are men and, even more frequently, women who have been victims of persecution, brutality, or torture. America's response must be threefold: addressing immediate and basic needs of housing, employment, medical attention, and transportation; addressing long-term needs such as mental health counseling, acquisition of English language skills, literacy, and further education; and addressing the root causes of social injustice that force these persons into exile in the first place.

Aburdene and Naisbitt (1992) reminded us that social activism among women around the globe has taken on a new form. As 21st Century women in first world countries are increasingly more educated and wealthier in their own right; and, rather than furthering the agendas of their husbands or continuing in their role as victim, these women are interested in advocacy and figuring out the root causes of violence against women. This includes action at home and abroad, much of which is centered on empowering the survivors as well as preventing and eradicating future violence.

Women have a critical role in both economic development and political stability across the globe. Women represent 70 percent of small business owners, produce as much as eight percent of the food in Africa, and are the key to stabilizing the world's population growth.

What supports people is to help them access their own power. Otherwise, one is not changing the world but mounting a relief effort, which is valuable indeed, but meant to remain in effect for a limited time. Long-term social transformation is an organic process; it is about power, self-reliance and prosperity. (Pipher, 2002, p. 303)

The mantra, "Think globally, act locally" has never been more appropriate. Pipher's response was to establish the *Thrive Project* with other mental health professionals. Mentors from various cultural groups were trained as cultural brokers on mental health issues. Mentors were action-oriented. If their clients were stressed by hungry children, rather than discussing stress management theory, the mentors drove them to the grocery store. The mentors helped the professionals understand that many immigrants view the world holistically and personally rather than with a compartmentalized, North-American mind-set with its boundaries between personal and professional relationships.

A personal response is most needed with victims of trauma. These individuals have experienced great loss; loss of loved ones, loss of personal power, and loss of trust. Of these, trust is often the most difficult to re-establish. Although Western society would approach these mental health issues acknowledging a need for professional counseling, the practice of sharing your personal life with a stranger is threatening and unheard of for most of the new immigrants. Although some may deal with their trauma, avoidance is also common. Avoidance takes many shapes, from memory loss, to survivor guilt, anxiety, depression or lack of energy. They may not be very adaptive and one "way refugees deal with their pain and difficulties in America is to move . . . as they find one town difficult and hear rumors that the grass is greener in other places" (p. 284). In general though the moves do not make the situation better, they postpone dealing with the inevitable.

Conclusion

As person after person tells a story, each one more riveting than the last, the reader is reminded "The refugee experience of dislocation, cultural bereavement, confusion, and constant change will soon be all of our experience. As the world becomes globalized, we'll all be searching for home" (p. 320). Rather than viewing these newest immigrants from a deficit perspective, Pipher makes the reader long to meet them and hear their stories firsthand. The collective wisdom and sense of resilience represented by the individuals who grace this book touch a chord in those of us whose ancestors also came as seekers and lovers of freedom. Pipher reminds the reader that the stories are not just meant to inspire but to become a call to action for "all morality like politics, is local" (p. 321).

References

- Aburdene, P., & Naisbitt, J. (1992). *Megatrends for women*. New York, NY: Villard Books.
- Amato, J. A. (1996). *To call it home: The new immigrants of southwestern Minnesota*. Marshall, MN: Crossings.
- Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Freire, P. (1985). *The politics of education: Culture, power, and liberation*. South Hadley, MA: Bergin & Garvey.
- Gay, G. (2000). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research and practice*. New York, NY: Teachers' College Press.
- McIntosh, P. (1990, Winter). White privilege: Unpacking the invisible knapsack. *Independent School*, 31-36.
- Pipher, M. (2002). *The middle of everywhere: Helping refugees enter the American community*. New York, NY: Harcourt.
- Shor, I. (1980). *Critical teaching and everyday life*. Boston, MA: South End.
- Sleeter, C. E., & Grant, C. A. (2003). *Making choices for multicultural education: Five approaches to peace, class, and gender* (4th ed.). New York, NY: John Wiley & Sons.

Vaynshtok, O. (2002). Facilitating learning and transition among the refugee population. *Adult Learning*, 4(13), 26-28.